

SENATE OF PAKISTAN

House of the Federation



REPORT OF THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS & COORDINATION

REPORT NO. 1 OF 2019

ON THE POINT OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE RAISED BY SENATOR KALSOOM PARVEEN REGARDING "SUBSTANDARD MEDICINES AND FAKE DEGREES OF DOCTORS" AS REFERRED BY THE HOUSE IN ITS SITTING HELD ON 31ST AUGUST, 2018

PRESENTED BY

SENATOR MIAN MUHAMMAD ATEEQ SHAIKH
CHAIRMAN

SENATE SECRETARIAT

REPORT OF THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS & COORDINATION ON THE POINT OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE RAISED BY SENATOR KALSOOM PARVEEN REGARDING "SUBSTANDARD MEDICINES AND FAKE DEGREES OF DOCTORS" RAISED IN THE SENATE ON 31ST AUGUST, 2018.

1. Senator Mian Muhammad Ateeq Shaikh, Chairman, Senate Standing Committee on National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination, have the honour to submit, on behalf of the Committee, this report on the subject matter of Point of Public Importance raised by Senator Kalsoom Parveen regarding "Substandard medicines and fake degrees of Doctors".

2. The Composition of the Standing Committee is as under:-

1) Senator Mian Muhammad Ateeq Shaikh	Chairman
2) Senator Dr. Ghous Muhammad Khan Niazi	Member
3) Senator Ayesha Raza Farooq	Member
4) Senator Dilawar Khan	Member
5) Senator Dr. Asad Ashraf	Member
6) Senator Dr. Ashok Kumar	Member
7) Senator Dr. Sikandar Mandhro	Member
8) Senator Liaqat Khan Tarakai	Member
9) Senator Prof. Dr. Mehr Taj Roghani	Member
10) Senator Sana Jamali	Member
11) Senator Sardar Muhammad Shafiq Tareen	Member
12) Senator Manzoor Ahmed Khan Kakar	Member

3. The Senate Standing Committee in its meeting held on 28th September, 2018 and 28th November, 2018 was briefed by the Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination. Taking cognizance of the matter, the Committee decided to constitute a Sub-Committee in terms of Rule 183 (1) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Senate, 2012, to look into the issue in detail and report back to the Standing Committee.

4. The Composition and TOR's of the Sub-Committee are as under:-

COMPOSITION:

i. Senator Dr. Ashok Kumar	Convener
ii. Senator Dr. Asad Ashraf	Member
iii. Senator Sardar Muhammad Shafiq Tareen	Member



TERMS OF REFERENCE:

- i. Discussion on illegal fake medical practitioner and substandard and falsified medical products being used in Public/Private Hospitals.
- ii. Details of Doctors on Deputation working in Federal Government Hospitals in the country.

5. The Sub-Committee convened its meeting on 14th January, 2019 and 20th February, 2019. Representatives from the Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination, Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan (DRAP), Federal Government Polyclinic (FGPC), Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS), Pakistan Medical & Dental Council (PMDC), National Institute of Rehabilitation Medicine (NIRM), District Health Office (DHO), Federal General Hospital (FGH) attended the meeting. The Sub-Committee finalized its report and the Convener presented the same before the Standing Committee during its meeting held on 05th April, 2019.

6. The Standing Committee unanimously adopted the report of the Sub-Committee and decided to present the same before the House.

7. I am grateful to the members of the Sub-Committee for their efforts in addressing the issue and finalizing recommendations for resolution of the same.

8. The report of the Sub-Committee is placed at Annexure-A.



(JAMIL AHMED KHOSO)
Secretary Committee



(SENATOR MIAN MUHAMMAD ATEEQ SHAIKH)
Chairman

SENATE OF PAKISTAN
House of the Federation



REPORT OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE
ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS & COORDINATION

ON THE POINT OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE RAISED BY SENATOR KALSOOM
PARVEEN REGARDING "SUBSTANDARD MEDICINES AND FAKE DEGREES
OF DOCTORS" AS REFERRED BY THE HOUSE IN ITS SITTING HELD ON
31ST AUGUST, 2018

PRESENTED BY

SENATOR DR. ASHOK KUMAR
CONVENER

SENATE SECRETARIAT

REPORT OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS & COORDINATION ON THE POINT OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE RAISED BY SENATOR KALSOOM PARVEEN REGARDING THE SUBSTANDARD MEDICINES AND FAKE DEGREES OF DOCTORS IN THE SENATE ON 31ST AUGUST, 2018.

The Senate Standing Committee on National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination, in terms of Rule 183 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Senate, 2012, constituted a Sub-Committee in its meeting held on 28th November, 2018. The Composition and Terms of Reference of the Sub-Committee are as under:-

COMPOSITION:

- | | |
|--|----------|
| i. Senator Dr. Ashok Kumar | Convener |
| ii. Senator Dr. Asad Ashraf | Member |
| iii. Senator Sardar Muhammad Shafiq Tareen | Member |

TERMS OF REFERENCE:

- i. Discussion on illegal fake medical practitioner and substandard and falsified medical products being used in Public/Private Hospitals.
- ii. Details of Doctors on Deputation working in Federal Government Hospitals in the country.

2. The Sub-Committee convened its meeting on 14th January, 2019 and 20th February, 2019. Representatives from the Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination, Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan (DRAP), Federal Government Polyclinic (FGPC), Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS), Pakistan Medical & Dental Council (PMDC), National Institute of Rehabilitation Medicine (NIRM), District Health Office (DHO), Federal General Hospital (FGH) attended the meeting.

TOR No. I: DISCUSSION ON ILLEGAL FAKE MEDICAL PRACTITIONERS AND SUBSTANDARD AND FALSIFIED MEDICAL PRODUCTS BEING USED IN PUBLIC/PRIVATE HOSPITALS.

3. The Sub-Committee was briefed in detail by the Ministry and its attached departments i.e. DHO, DRAP, PIMS, FGPC, PMDC, FGH and NIRM on the above subject.

4. On the issue of fake medical practitioners, Mr. Arshad Nawaz, Director (Admin) PMDC informed that PMDC is a regulatory body and it registers the faculty and students of Medical and Dental institutions and maintains the register of medical and dental practitioners. The Committee pointed that despite of availability of excessive funds and resources, the Council still failed to maintain proper check against the doctors who have not registered themselves or practicing after expiry of their registration period. It was revealed from the data provided by PMDC that registration of many of doctors working in different hospitals in Islamabad has been expired since very long but hospital authorities have not taken action against them. The Committee observed that the hospital authorities have failed to take action against such doctors. The Committee pointed out that PMDC should have initiated a public awareness campaign against the fake and illegal doctors but it failed.
6. The District Health Officer (DHO) informed the Committee that the District Health Department is authorized to take action against the illegal/fake doctors. However, due to non-availability of data of illegal/fake doctors no action is taken so far. Now the date is to be collected and will shortly start campaign/raid on the clinics/hospitals being run by illegal/fake medical practitioners in Islamabad.
7. On the issue of substandard and falsified medical products in public/private hospitals, the DHO informed that at the ICT level Health Department Islamabad is regulating the sale of drugs and at the provincial level, the provincial health departments through their Drug Inspectors monitor the sale of drugs. It is informed that there are 890 drug sale points in Islamabad and only one Drug Inspector is looking after the inspection of all these drug points. The recruitment for three more inspectors is under process. This department is monitoring the sale points in markets; however, the pharmacies operating in private and public hospitals are managed by the pharmacists of those hospitals. In case of any complaint, the inspections are conducted and action is initiated as per law. During the period 2017-18, this department initiated action against a number of 25 private sector hospitals/clinics and 07 public sector hospitals of Islamabad.
8. Dr. Hafza Karam Elahi, Additional Director (DRAP) informed the Committee that the Federal Inspector of Drugs are bound to conduct post market surveillance to check the quality of finished drugs available in the market and in the Federal Public Hospitals. The Inspector takes the samples of drugs and sends them to the Central Drug Laboratory to verify the quality of drugs. At the provincial level, the Provincial drug inspectors are responsible to monitor the sale of drugs in the market and hospitals of their area. In case the samples do not qualify, the inspectors take action against the defaulters. The Committee was informed that there are only 22 Drug Inspectors throughout the country to check 889 Drug manufacturing units. The Committee directed to functionalize the drug laboratory at NIH which is pending for a

long time. The Committee showed grave concern over availability of only 1 drug inspector for the Islamabad Capital which includes more than 890 medical stores and emphasized on zone wise posting of drug inspectors in ICT.

9. The Drug Inspector Islamabad informed the Committee that during 2017-18, nine (9) stores in Islamabad were sealed due to selling of unregistered medicines and penalty of imprisonment upto 7 years was made in cases. For registration and regularization of private medical stores in the capital, the Committee emphasized to make process fast which may be helpful in generation of revenue for capital. The Committee pointed out the unregistered pharmaceutical stores doing business in the precincts of PIMS and Polyclinic which are earning lots of revenue and profit. The drug inspector informed that due to litigation and stay orders, the cases for regularization of pharmacies and medical stores is being delayed.

10. The Convener of the Committee took notice of the improper arrangements for storage and transportation of medicines by the manufacturers and the public / private hospitals. The Committee unanimously recommended that DRAP should take notice of the matter and take action against the manufacturers and hospitals on account of improper / insecure storage and transportation of medicines.

11. In addition to above, the representatives of PIMS, FGPC, NIRM and FGH informed that their institutions procure the medicines under the prescribed policy which is regulated through purchase committees of their respective institutions and have been following the PPRA Rules in letter and spirit. The Inspector of Drugs is called to draw samples of their drugs for the purpose of tests and analysis from government drug testing laboratory. If any suspected drug is found to be of the substandard quality an action is taken against its manufacturer as per the Drug Act.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- i. PMDC must update the data of the registered doctors and issue notices against the doctors who failed to renew their registrations. The detail of doctors whose registration period is expired may be shared with the concerned private / public hospitals immediately for further action.
- ii. PMDC will ensure to start public awareness campaign against the illegal / fake doctors throughout the country and will display their details at their website. In addition to it, PMDC will write to the concerned public / private sector institutions regarding the doctors who have not renewed their registrations.

- iii. The Federal Government Hospital authorities may ensure to check the PMDC registrations of each doctor working in the hospitals and in case of expiry of their registrations they may be directed for renewal of their registrations within a period of months.
- iv. Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination and DRAP will initiate campaign for proper storage and transportation of all medicines at federal and provincial levels by the manufacturers/contractors/vendors supplying medicines to the Federal and Provincial hospitals/institutions.
- v. Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination will ensure to functionalize the drug laboratory at NIH and will take steps for recruitment of more drug inspectors for the Islamabad capital in order to proper surveillance of the entire area of ICT.

TOR NO. II: DETAILS OF DOCTORS ON DEPUTATION WORKING IN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HOSPITALS IN THE COUNTRY.

12. The Committee was informed that different number of Doctors have been working in different Federal Government Hospitals on direct deputation and under the wedlock policy. The detail is as under:-

S.	Name of Hospital	Number of Doctors	Remarks
1.	PIMS	22	Deputed from various provincial health departments and AJK.
2.	FGPC	22	-do-
3.	NIRM	07	-do-
4.	FGH	05	-do-
5.	Health Department, Islamabad	02	-do-

13. The Committee observed that most of the Doctors have been working in the Federal Government Hospitals since last 4 to 5 years. After the expiry of deputation period, the case of most of the Doctors for their extension is under process / undecided. The Committee took notice of the pending cases for extension of the deputation period of the Doctors. The cases should have been initiated on proper time without any delay. Furthermore the committee observed that most of the deputation cases taken under the wedlock policy are not checked / verified by the concerned

administrative authorities to check the status of the spouses whether both spouses are working in Islamabad or otherwise.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- i. Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations & Coordination will ensure to finalize the cases of extensions in deputation pending since very long.
- ii. Ministry will ensure to re-verify all the cases of the doctors working on deputation basis under the wed-lock policy.



(JAMIL AHMED KHOSO)
Secretary Committee



(SENATOR DR. ASHOK KUMAR)
Convener