

SENATE OF PAKISTAN



REPORT NO. 19

REPORT OF THE SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS AND COORDINATION

ON

**A CALLING ATTENTION NOTICE RAISED BY SENATOR RANA
MAQBOOL AHMED AND KAMRAN MURTAZA IN SENATE SITTING
HELD ON 4TH AUGUST, 2023 REGARDING 'RECENT MALFUNCTIONING
OF THE AC SYSTEM IN OPD, EMERGENCY WARD AND ESPECIALLY
CHILDREN OPD IN PIMS AND POLYCLINIC HOSPITAL RESULTING IN
DEATH OF PATIENTS. THE UNPROFESSIONAL ATTITUDE OF THE
CONSULTANT FIRM HIRED BY PAK PWD REGARDING REPLACEMENT
AND UP-GRADATION OF HVAC PLANT ROOM'.**

PRESENTED BY

Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand

Chairman

Standing Committee on National Health Services, Regulations and Coordination

SENATE SECRETARIAT

REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES, REGULATIONS AND COORDINATION ON A CALLING ATTENTION NOTICE RAISED BY SENATOR RANA MAQBOOL AHMED AND KAMRAN MURTAZA IN SENATE SITTING HELD ON 4TH AUGUST, 2023 REGARDING 'RECENT MALFUNCTIONING OF THE AC SYSTEM IN OPD, EMERGENCY WARD AND ESPECIALLY CHILDREN OPD IN PIMS AND POLYCLINIC HOSPITAL RESULTING IN DEATH OF PATIENTS. THE UNPROFESSIONAL ATTITUDE OF THE CONSULTANT FIRM HIRED BY PAK PWD REGARDING REPLACEMENT AND UP-GRADATION OF HVAC PLANT ROOM'.

I, Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand, Chairman Standing Committee on Standing Committee on National Health Services, Regulations and Coordination, have the honor to submit, on behalf of the Committee, this report on a Calling Attention Notice regarding 'recent malfunctioning of the AC system in OPD, Emergency ward and especially Children OPD in PIMS and Polyclinic Hospital resulting in death of Patients. The unprofessional attitude of the consultant Firm hired by Pak PWD regarding replacement and up-gradation of HVAC plant room' moved by Senator Rana Maqbool Ahmed and Kamran Murtaza and referred to the Committee on 4th August, 2023 and referred by the House to the Committee for consideration and report.

2. The composition of the Committee is as under:-

1. Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand	Chairman
2. Senator Prof. Dr. Mehr Taj Roghani	Member
3. Senator Fawzia Arshad	Member
4. Senator Dr. Zarqa Suharwrdi Taimur	Member
5. Senator Sana Jamali	Member
6. Senator Dilawar Khan	Member
7. Senator Rubina Khalid	Member
8. Senator Jam Mahtab Hussain Dahar	Member
9. Senator Bahramand Khan Tangi	Member
10. Senator Hafiz Abdul Karim	Member
11. Senator Muhammad Asad Ali Khan Junejo	Member

12. Senator Sardar Muhammad Shafiq Tareen	Member
13. Senator Syed Faisal Ali Subzwari	Member
14. Minister for National Health Services, Regulation and Coordination	Ex-Officio Member

3. The Committee took up discussion on the Calling Attention Notice in its meeting held on 5th October, 2023, under the chairmanship of Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand, with the following in attendance:

1. Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand	Chairman
2. Senator Prof. Dr. Mehr Taj Roghani	Member
3. Senator Fawzia Arshad	Member
4. Senator Dr. Zarqa Suharwardi Taimur	Member
5. Senator Sana Jamali	Member
6. Senator Rubina Khalid	Member
7. Senator Jam Mahtab Hussain Dahar	Member
8. Senator Muhammad Asad Ali Khan Junejo	Member
9. Senator Sardar Muhammad Shafiq Tareen	Member
10. Minister for National Health Services, Regulation and Coordination	Ex-Officio Member
11. Senator Kamran Murtaza	Mover

4. Senator Kamran Murtaza the Mover of Calling Attention Notice stated that the working papers received from PIMS and Polyclinic has disputed the issue of Air Conditioning in these hospitals. The Chairman Committee said that the working papers has provided a brief regarding the patients who died that day and submitted that these patients were in a vulnerable health condition the doctors conducted triage and unfortunately these patients meet their natural death. The Executive Director PIMS briefed the Committee and submitted that we have conducted an inquiry, on 25th June the incident was reported we had a total of 7 deaths that day in which 4 of them were brought dead to hospital by the Police all their relevant medico legal documents are attached with the working paper and rest of the three patients died within half an hour to one and half hour of their arrival and the preliminary diagnosis was the sepsis which has a very high mortality rate. The ED PIMS further submitted that the cause of death cannot be ascertain unless an autopsy is conducted in medico-legal case. The Chairman Committee said that there

should be an inquiry about the vitals and treatment through which these patients went through in the hospital.

5. Senator Fawzia Arshad and Prof. Dr. Mehr Taj Roghani showed their displeasure on the delay regarding installation of Air Conditioning system in the Hospital by the Pak PWD. The Chairman Committee asked that 100% of funds has been granted to the Pak PWD but the firm hired by the PWD hindered the project. The Executive Engineer Pak PWD submitted that original pc-i was of 725 Million subsequently the execution of the said project was handed over to the then ministry of CADD, after getting the award Pak PWD mentioned that the original pc-i and the actual requirement on the site is way more for which revision of pc-i from the very inception is evitable. After revision of pc-i the finance supplementary Act, 2022 removed exemption on the equipment required for the project on which we received directions from the Ministry of Planning and Division that second revised may be submitted, we have submitted the second revised pc-i the approval of which is awaited. The Executive Engineer Pak PWD further submitted that revision of pc-i, opening of LCs (who is to open), and the menace of covid-19, the lock down caused delay in execution of the said project, along with that 95% of the projected has been completed so far. The Additional Secretary Ministry of NHSR&C added that the mode of contract and execution is mentioned in the pc-i. The Executive Director PIMS the contract was between the PWD and the contractor PIMS has nothing to do with execution and conditions therein. The Additional Secretary further added that the expansion mode increased the award. The Executive Engineer said that right wing of the Hospital is commissioned and fully functional while left wing is to be completed within fortnight, Chairman Committee get assured from the PWD that by first week of November the Project should be completed. Senator Rubina Khalid suggested that those who are at fault fine should be imposed and actions be taken against them.

6. The Chairman Committee asked about the causes of delay in the project, Senator Prof. Dr. Mehr Taj Roghani asked how the unprofessional attitude of the contractor led to revision of PC-I and undue delay in execution of the project. Senator Jam Mahtab Hussain Dahar wanted the responsibility fixed, who is responsible, the contractor or Pak PWD, how much price escalation occurred and added that when a contract is awarded two persons get the onus, the contractor and the consultants. The executive Director, PIMS said that the project was initiated by the Ministry, Pak PWD has to implement it and PIMS has no role in the execution of the said project. The Executive Engineer Pak PWD submitted that after the feasibility study it was established that revision of PC-I is evitable after inclusion of new areas and equipment. Chairman Committee asked that who is responsible for improper estimation and feasibility study. Senator Kamran Murtaza the mover asked why not was feasibility study conducted before award of the Contract, whether extension has been granted to the contractor or not. The Executive

Engineer replied that no extension has been granted yet and numerous warning notices has been issued to the contractor. The Contractor shared details about the project, LC delayed, work in a running hospital, covid-19 and shipment of equipment in Karachi port were confiscated and went in adjudication with custom intelligence predominantly delayed the project execution. The contractor further added that there is no price escalation admissible to us till date, cost of the project increased due to scope increase, imposition of sale tax and no availability of funds for one year and two months.

7. The Minister for National Health Services Regulations and Coordination said that poor planning, poor execution, poor monitoring and the whole circle is poor for which no one is taking the ownership. The Minister further said that we will ensure the execution and make out of it a lesson learnt. The Executive Director submitted that penalty will be impose on the contractor for delay, and 100% of the work will be completed by 5th of November. The Additional Secretary Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination said that Director General Pak PWD is responsible for the execution of the project and imposition of fine if necessary. The Director General Pak PWD submitted that within two weeks the project will be completed. Senator Dr. Zarqa Taimur Suharwardi said that the element of accountability and imposing of penalty could possible lead to the execution of the project. The Chairman Committee said that the Director General should take a decision in principle regarding 100% execution and punish if somebody deserve to punish, punish them.

8. The Chairman Committee inquired about the three patient's details died on 25th June, the Assistant Professor General Medicine PIMS shared details about these patients and submitted that these patients were brought to the Hospital for a short period of time and were treated as P-1 though the documents has marked them as P-2. The Executive Director added that the marking of P-1 or P-2 is done by the clerk or nurse, the unconscious or patient on stretcher is always shifted to resuscitation room where our team take charge of the patient and relevant department never leave the patient alone, these patients were never keep waiting or left unattended. The Assistant Professor PIMS further added that two patients were brought unconscious that's why we could not take proper medical history. The Executive Director PIMS said that with the help of the Ministry we are in the process of new recruitment through which performance of the Hospital will be much better in the near future. The Minister for National Health Services Regulations and Coordination said that the problem is in the processes, we have developed an internal audit system and we have instructed the hospital to make their clinical audit system through which things will be better in favor of public health. The Minister for National Health Services Regulations and Coordination further said that we are to overhaul the PMDC, though popular decision is somewhat different but we have to take the right decision, to strengthen PMDC we need to take some rigorous decision in which we need popular as well as political support.

9. Following detailed discussion, the Committee disposed of the Calling Attention with a commitment that the Director General should take a decision in principle regarding 100% execution and punish if somebody deserve to punish and The Minister for NHSR&C further vowed that we are in the process of overhauling PMDC, though popular decision is somewhat different but we have to take the right decision, to strengthen PMDC.



(Muhammad Shafiq)

Secretary Committee

(Senator Dr. Muhammad Humayun Mohmand)

Chairman, Committee

