

## SENATE OF PAKISTAN

### SENATE DEBATES

*Tuesday, October 06, 1998*

The Senate of Pakistan met in the Senate Hall (Parliament House) Islamabad, at thirty five minutes after 05 in the evening with Mr. Chairman (Mr Wasim Sajjad) in the Chair.

-----  
*Recitation from the Holy Quran*  
-----

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِیْمِ

من عمل صالحاً فلنفسه۔ ومن اساء فعليها۔ وما ربك بظالم للعبيد

ترجمہ: جو نیک کام کریگا تو اپنے لئے۔ اور جو برے کریگا تو ان کا ضرر اسی کو ہوگا۔ اور تمہارا پروردگار بندوں پر ظلم کرنے والا نہیں۔

### QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Mr. Chairman: Question Hour now. Question No. 30, Safdar Ali Abbasi sahib.

30. Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi: Will the Minister for Health be pleased to state:

(a) the details of laboratory equipments available in the Federal

Government Services Hospital, Islamabad, including of those which are out of order;

(b) the type of laboratory tests being carried out in the FGSH, and

(c) the number, names and qualification of laboratory Technicians working in the said hospital ?

Makhdoom Muhammad Javed Hashmi: (a) There are 37 Electro-Medico equipments in Pathological Laboratory 22 machines are in working order and 15 machines are out of order (details as per Annexed-A)

(b) The Laboratory of FGSH is a clinical Laboratory and routine investigation on different samples collected in the hospital are analysed. Details of the different tests carried out in this Laboratory are as under:--

1. Histopathology Section:

Fine needle aspiration and exfoliative cytology.

2. Hematology Section:

(a) Blood complete picture including peripheral film examination.

(b) Tests related to bleeding disorders like;

(i) Bleeding time.

(ii) Clotting time.

(iii) Prothrombin time test (PT).

(iv) Activated partial thromboplastin time test (APTT).

(v) Fibrinogen level and fibrinogen degradation products.

3. Microbiology Section:

Culture and sensitivity of different ordinary micro-organisms, from different samples like Urine, blood and other body fluids etc.

4. Serology Section:

- (a) Widal test for diagnosis of typhoid fever.
- (b) Brucella test for brucellosis.
- (c) ASO Titer.
- (d) RH Factor (Rheumatoid).

5. Chemistry Section:

Routine chemical analysis are performed on the blood/sera like.

- Blood Sugar Levels.
- Cholesterol levels including other components of lipid profil.
- Liver function test (L.F.T.).
- Renal (kidney) function tests (R.F.Ts.).
- Cardiac Enzymes (for Heart attacks etc.).

6. Blood Bank Section:

- Blood Grouping and Rh. Factor.
- Cross match with antiglobulin test.
- H.I.V.
- Screening. Hepatitis B. Surface antigen screening.

7. Miscellaneous:

The following tests done on Urine and Stool are also including:

- (i) Urine Routine examination.
- (ii) Urine for peganacy test.
- (iii) Stool routine examination.

(c) There are 23 sanction posts of Laboratory Technicians in this Hospital. Names and qualification of the Officials are as under:

S. No.	Name of the Laboratory Tech.	Education Qualification
1.	Mr. Muhammad Saleem.	Matric. with Diploman in Lab. Tech
2.	Mr. Najabat Ali.	--do--
3.	Mr. Muhammad Hanif.	--do--
4.	Mr. M. Aftab Ahmed.	--do--
5.	Mr. Muhammad Ishaque.	--do--
6.	Mr. Shakir Hussain.	--do--
7.	Mr. Iftikhar-ul-Hasan.	(i) B.A. with Diploma Medical Tech.
8.	Mr. Adil Anwar.	F.A. with Diploma in Lab. Tech.
9.	Mr. Zafar Iqbal.	Matric Diploma in Lab. Tech.
10.	Mr. Zaka Ullah Butt.	--do--
11.	Mr. Naseem A. Qureshi.	--do--
12.	Mr. Rab Nawaz	--do--
13.	Mr. Muhammad Mumtaz.	--do--
14.	Mr. Adnan Sodaghar.	--do--
15.	Mr. Muhammad Saleem.	--do--
16.	Mr. Muhammad Asghar.	--do--
17.	Mr. Khurshid Anwar.	--do--
18.	Mr. Aslam Khan.	F.Sc. with Diploma in Lab. Tech.
19.	Mr. Ejaz Ahmed Bhuttu.	B.A. Diploma in Lab. Tech.
20.	Mr. Javed Iqbal.	Matric with diploma in Lab. Tech.
21.	Mr. Muhammad Ramzan.	--do--

22. Mr. Safdar Saleem.

B.A. Diploma in Lab. Tech.

23. Mr. Abdul Wahab.

Matric with Diploma in Lab. Tech.

SENATE STARRED QUESTION NO. 30

(A) The details of Laboratory equipment available in the Federal Government Services Hospital Including those which are out of order.

LIST OF EQUIPMENT AVAILABLE IN F.G.S.H. LABORATORY INCLUDING  
OUT OF ORDER

The detail of laboratory equipment which are available in this hospital is under for its different sections like histopathology, Hamatology, Clinical Pathology, Microbiology etc. are as under:-

S.No.	Section	Name of equipment/instrument	Quantity	Status
1.	Histopathology Section	Tissue Processor (automatic)	01	O.K.
		Knife Sharpener (automatic)	01	O.K.
		Knife Sharpener (Manual)	01	O.K.
2.	Haemology Section	Sysmex Haematology (auto-analyzer)	01	O.K.
		Coagulation Analyzer	01	Out of order
3.	Chemistry Section	Chemistry Batch analyzer (Semi automatic)	02	Out of order
		Spectrophotometer (Manual)	04	Two out of order

		Electrolyte Analyzer (Fully automatic)	01	Out of order
		Blood Gas Analyzer (One Manual) (One Fully automatic)	02	Both out of order
4.	Microbiology	Autoclaves	02	(01) O.K (01) out of order
		Ovens	03	(01) O.k (02) Out of order
		Incubators	03	02 out of order One working condition
5.	Miscellaneous	Distillation Plant	02	(01) O.K (01) Out of order
		Photographic Microscope (Fully automatic)	01	Out of order
		Simple Microscope	09	(06) O.K (03) Out of order
		Fluorescence Microscope	01	O.K.
		Nova 10 Electrolyte Analyzer	01	Out of order
		Hot Air Oven	02	(01) O.K (01) out of order
		Lab System Analyzer	02	(01) O.K (01) out of order

Electronic Weighing Machine	01	Out of order
Ordinary Weighing Machine	01	Out of order
Haemotology Analyzer Sysmex 1000	01	O.K
Auto Sharpener for Histopathology	02	O.K
Tissue Processor for Histopathology	01	O.K
Autoclave	01	Out of order
Microtome	03	O.K
Spectrophotometer 910	01	Out of order
Incubator	03	(01) O.K (02) Out of order

Mr. Chairman: Any supplementary question? Yes, Safdar Ali

Abbasi Sahib.

ڈاکٹر صدر علی عباسی، جناب میں وزیر صاحب سے یہ پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ تھوڑی سی اس میں جو باہر کی خبریں ملتی رہتی ہیں، اس میں Poly Clinic کے ٹیسٹ کے بارے میں معلوم ہوا ہے کہ ٹیسٹ کے بارے میں کچھ تسلی بخش رپورٹس نہیں آ رہی ہیں۔ اور کافی لوگوں کا خیال ہے بلکہ کافی ڈاکٹروں کا بھی خیال ہے کہ رپورٹس جو آتی ہیں normally اگر وہ آپ کسی اچھی laboratory سے کرائیں تو ان میں فرق ہوتا ہے۔ اس سے diagnosis میں ڈاکٹروں کی مشکلات بڑھ جاتی ہیں۔ تو میں وزیر صاحب سے یہ درخواست کروں گا کہ گو کہ جواب تو آیا ہے اور اس میں بڑی اچھی باتیں کی گئی ہیں لیکن میں ان سے یہ درخواست کروں گا کہ وہ مہربانی کر کے

اس کو دوبارہ دیکھیں کہ یہ جو رپورٹس مختلف آرہی ہیں میڈیکل رپورٹس کے حوالے سے، جو تھوٹیش ہے، اس کو دور کرنے کے لئے کیا اقدامات کر رہے ہیں۔

Mr. Chairman: Yes, Minister for Health.

مخدوم محمد جاوید ہاشمی، جناب چیئرمین! پہلے تو میں ان کی اس بات کے بارے میں کہوں گا، اگرچہ انہوں نے بھی کہا ہے، ایک جنرل بات کی ہے انہوں نے کہ ایسی ٹہریں آتی رہتی ہیں۔ لوگ کہتے رہتے ہیں، اگر کوئی particular بات ہوتی کہ فلاں جگہ پر results صحیح نہیں آئے۔ اگر وہ ایسا کچھ فرماتے تو میں یقیناً اس کی تحقیق بھی کرتا اور جو improvement ہو سکتی ہے اس کے لئے بھی کوشش کرتا۔ لیکن جہاں تک اس ادارے کا تعلق ہے، بہت حد تک اس میں results صحیح آتے ہیں۔ کہیں اگر کوئی کمی رہ گئی ہو، وہ ہمیں بتائیں گے تو انشاء اللہ ہم اس کو صحیح بھی کریں گے اور improvement کی بھی کوشش کریں گے۔

Mr. Chairman: Yes, Dr. Abbasi Sahib.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی، جناب میں وزیر صاحب کا شکریہ ادا کرتا ہوں کہ انہوں نے یہ بات assure کی ہے۔ لیکن میرے پاس اس وقت ایسی کوئی چیز نہیں ہے، لیکن میں کوشش کروں گا کہ آپ کو particular references بھی دوں۔ لیکن میں پھر آپ سے درخواست کروں گا کہ آپ دوبارہ اس چیز کو دیکھ لیں اور پولی کلینک کے سٹاف کو یا ان کی laboratory کو اگر آپ دوبارہ دیکھ لیں تو مہربانی ہوگی۔

مخدوم محمد جاوید ہاشمی، انشاء اللہ جی ہم ان کی اس بات کو پورا وزن دیں گے۔

Mr. Chairman: Thank you. Next question is No. 31, Safdar Ali Abbasi sahib.

31. \*Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi: Will the Minister for Health be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the persons posted in the FGSH Islamabad Laboratory do not fulfil the prescribed qualifications; and

(b) whether it is also a fact that the quality of Laboratory tests conducted in FGSH is poor as compared to those of private hospitals/laboratories, if so, the steps taken by the government to increase efficiency of the technicians ?

**Makhdoom Muhammad Javed Hashmi:** (a) It is not correct that the persons posted in the FGSH Islamabad Laboratory do not fulfil the prescribed qualifications. All of them are qualified.

(b) The quality of Laboratory tests conducted in FGSH is good as those of private hospitals/laboratories.

**Mr. Chairman:** Any supplementary question?

**Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi:** No supplementary.

**Mr. Chairman:** No supplementary. O.K. Next question No. 32, Anwar Bhinder sahib.

32. **\*Ch. Muhammad Anwar Bhinder:** Will the Minister for Health be pleased to state:

- (a) the number of Drug Courts established in each province;
- (b) the number of cases pending in each court as of 1-1-98; and
- (c) the number of cases decided by each court from 1-1-98 to 30-6-98 ?

**Makhdoom Muhammad Javed Hashmi:**(a) Presently three Drug Courts are working in the country as under:--

(i) At Lahore-- For Punjab, Islamabad Capital Territory and Azad Jammu and Kashmir.

(ii) At Karachi-- For Sindh and Balochistan.

(iii) At Peshawar-- For NWFP.

(b) The number of cases pending in each Drug Court as on 1-1-98

is as under:--

(i) Drug Court, Lahore. 3645 cases

(ii) Drug Court, Karachi. 245 cases

(iii) Drug Court, Peshawar. 66 cases

(c) The number of cases disposed of during this period is given

below:--

(i) Drug Court, Lahore. 817 cases

(ii) Drug Court, Karachi. 2 cases

(iii) Drug Court, Peshawar. 20 cases

\*Mr. Chairman: Any supplementary question on his behalf? No supplementary question. Next is question No.33, Dr. Abdul Hayee Baluch sahib.

33. \*Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister for Food, Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to state whether there is any proposal under consideration of the Government to provide basic facilities for the cultivation of palm oil seeds and coconut in District Gawadar, Balochistan?

Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: Pakistan Oil Seed Development Board (PODB). Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock is executing an Oilpalm Development Pilot Project in Balochistan in areas of Uthal, Hub, Pasin, Gawadar, Jewani and Ormara through Agriculture Department, Government of Balochistan and in Sindh in the districts of Thatta, Badin, Hyderabad (Tando Muhammad Khan), Mirpurkhas, Sanghar (Tando Adam).

Oilpalm pre-germinated seeds shall be imported under the project and

kept in nurseries in Sindh and Balochistan. Each oilpalm seedling shall undergo nursery growth for two years. Once the oilpalm plants are established, these will be planted on private farms on commercial scale and production technology provided to the growers. Presently 385,000 pre-germinated oilpalm seeds are being imported for this purpose and target of 700,000 seedlings of oilpalm shall be completed in proceeding years. The project envisages oilpalm plantations on 12,000 acres during seven years.

Mr. Chairman: Any supplementary question? Yes, Dr. Abdul Hayee sahib.

ڈاکٹر عبدالحمی بلوچ۔ کیا یہ حقیقت ہے کہ بلوچستان کا ساحلی علاقہ آب و ہوا کے لحاظ سے پام آئل اور اس طرح کی جو چیزیں گھی کے لئے استعمال ہوتی ہیں ان کی کاشت کے لئے بہت موزوں ہے۔ اگر ایسا ہے تو کیا گورنمنٹ اپنی ضرورت پوری کرنے اور مزید زر مبادلہ کمانے کے لئے ان چیزوں کی کاشت کی طرف کوئی توجہ دے رہی ہے یا نہیں۔  
جناب چیئرمین۔ جی وزیر خوراک و زراعت۔

جناب عبدالستار لالیکا۔ جناب والا! معزز ممبر مجھے ملتے رستے ہیں۔ میں ان کی بڑی قدر کرتا ہوں۔ انشاء اللہ تعالیٰ ہم ان کی خواہشات پر پورا اتریں گے۔ ہم ان کو یقین دلاتے ہیں کہ جہاں آپ نے کہا ہے اس کے لئے 385 لاکھ پودے منگوا لئے ہیں جن کی ہم نرسری کریں گے اور مزید بھی ہم تقریباً سات لاکھ پودے منگوائیں گے۔ ان کا علاقہ واقعی ان پودوں کے لئے موزوں ہے اور ہم یہ کاشت کریں گے۔

جناب تاج حیدر۔ جناب عالی! سندھ میں ہم نے Coastal Development Authority تشکیل دی ہے جو کہ ہمارے ایک سابقہ سینیٹر کی سربراہی میں چل رہی ہے اور they are doing very valuable work. وزیر صاحب پودوں کی امپورٹ کے بارے میں جو فرما رہے ہیں اس کے لئے کسی نہ کسی اتھارٹی کی ضرورت ہوتی ہے کہ وہ ان کو grow کریں اور ان کو آگے بڑھائیں۔ بلوچستان میں اس قسم کی کوئی اتھارٹی نہیں ہے۔ وزیر صاحب جو figure دے

رہے ہیں کیا وہ صرف سندھ کو pertain کرتی ہے اور بلوچستان میں اس کا کیا انتظام ہے؟

جناب عبدالستار لالیکا۔ جیسا کہ ممبر صاحب بتا رہے ہیں کہ ایسی اتھارٹی کو ایک سابقہ سینئر صاحب چلا رہے ہیں لیکن اسی Coastal Authority کے ذریعے ہم بلوچستان کو بھی tackle کریں گے۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی ڈاکٹر صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر عبداللحئی بلوچ۔ جناب وزیر صاحب سے ضمنی سوال یہ ہے کہ زراعت کے ساتھ ساتھ بلوچستان میں اس کا infrastructure نہیں ہے، پانی کے storage کا بھی مسئلہ ہے کیوں کہ اس کے بغیر آپ کا منصوبہ ناکام ہو جائے گا۔ میں ان کی خدمت میں گزارش کروں گا کہ پانی کی storage کی طرف بھی توجہ دیں اور اس کے ساتھ ساحلی روڈ جو گوادر سے لے کر کراچی تک جاتی ہے، وہ بھی بڑی اہمیت رکھتی ہے تاکہ زراعت اور infrastructure ساتھ ساتھ چلیں اور ملک ترقی کرے۔

جناب عبدالستار لالیکا۔ جی ڈاکٹر صاحب تو وہ باتیں کر رہے ہیں جو ہم علیحدہ بیٹھ کر کرتے ہیں۔ ان کو منظر عام پر لا رہے ہیں، مینگول ہو، میرانی ہو، کوسٹل روڈ ہو، ڈاکٹر صاحب یہ تو ہم علیحدہ بیٹھ کر باتیں کیا کرتے تھے، یہ کیوں یہاں لا رہے ہیں؟ میں تو پہلے ہی ان کا حامی ہوں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ شکریہ۔ جی ڈاکٹر صدر عباسی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر صدر علی عباسی۔ جناب والا! میں وزیر صاحب کی توجہ اس طرف دلاؤں گا کہ بعض اخبارات میں یہ خبریں بھی تھیں اور اگر وزیر صاحب سمجھیں تو بیشک اس کو contradict کریں کہ Pakistan Oil Seed Development Board ختم کیا جا رہا تھا تو اس کی اب کیا یوزین ہے؟

جناب عبدالستار لالیکا۔ عباسی صاحب یہ کبھی نہیں ہو گا۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ شکریہ جی۔ اگلا سوال نمبر 34، ڈاکٹر عبداللحئی بلوچ صاحب۔

Mr. Chairman: Next question No.34, Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch Sahib.

34 . \*Dr . Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister for Food , Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to state:

(a) the name, grade, qualifications and other experience of the Executive Officer (Admn.) working in the Agricultural Prices Commission;

(b) whether any relaxation of experience was obtained from the Establishment Division in the case of the the said officer, if so, its extent ; and

(c) whether it is also a fact that a post was upgraded for the said officer, if so, its reasons ?

**Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: (a)**

(i) Name: Muhammad Liaquat Munir Rao

(ii) Grade: BPS-20

(iii) Qualification: M.Sc. (Geography) from Punjab University in first Division with Merit position.

(iv) Experience:

(a) Prior to joining Agricultural Prices Commission (APCom)

Served as:

(i) Assistant Project Coordinator (B-17). Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.

(ii) Lecturer in Algeria.

(iii) Assistant Director (B-17) Literacy and Mass Education Commission (LAMEC).

(iv) Dy. Director (B-18) LAMEC.

(v) Resident Director (B-19) (current charge) LAMEC.

(b) After Joining APCom.

Served as:

- (i) Executive Officer (BPS-19)
- (ii) Private Secretary (BPS-19) to Federal Minister for Population Welfare on Deputation from APCom.
- (iii) Private Secretary (BPS-19) to Federal Minister for Housing and Works on Deputation from APCom.
- (iv) Presently serving as Executive Officer. (BPS-20).

(b) Relaxation of three and half year in length of service was obtained for initial appointment. For appointment to the upgraded post, no relaxation was obtained from Establishment Division as it was not required.

- (c) Yes, it is a fact.

The post of Executive Officer in BPS-19 was sanctioned to assist the Chairman (BPS-22) in administrative and financial matters.

The work of the Commission over time expanded, inter alia requiring the hiring of Consultants for various studies and conducting of surveys of crops and execution of development projects and other assignments by the Government. These activities increased the work load of administration requiring close coordination of technical and administrative staff. Besides various Committees comprising of senior officers from technical and administration side are constituted for various purpose. As there was no BPS-20 Officer on administration side whereas heads of four out of five technical Divisions of APCom are in BPS-20 the representation of administration was felt weak and Executive Officer was handicapped in playing an effective role both within and out side the organization. Accordingly the Commission in 1996 requested the Government for upgradation of the said post alongwith incumbent

(Mr. Muhammad Liaquat Mūnir Rao) who was otherwise eligible for regular promotion in BPS-20, and had a very good service record. Needless to mention that the post of Executive Officer was upgraded from BPS-19 to 20 after seeking approval from Finance, Establishment Division and the Prime Minister. The incumbent of the post was thereafter considered for posting to the upgraded post by the Selection Board duly approved by the Prime Minister. After clearance by the Selection Board the proposal was approved by the Minister Incharge in the light of Government instructions on the subject.

Mr. Chairman: Supplementary question.

ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی بلوچ، اس سلسلے میں میرا وزیر موصوف سے ضمنی سوال یہ ہے کہ ایک پوسٹ انہوں نے وہاں پر رکھی ہے۔ اس کی منظوری اسٹیبلشمنٹ ڈویژن سے نہیں لی گئی ہے۔ اس کے لئے جو experience چاہیے وہ متعلقہ بندے کے پاس نہیں ہے۔ میں ان سے یہ گزارش کروں گا کہ اس سے اس ڈیپارٹمنٹ میں بے چینی پائی جاتی ہے۔ جو ہمدار لوگ ہیں اور senior most ہیں وہ متاثر ہو رہے ہیں۔ اس لئے گزارش ان سے یہ ہے کہ اس پر توجہ دیں اگر وقتاً اس آفیسر کو کوئی خصوصی مراعات دی گئی ہیں اور اس کی اسٹیبلشمنٹ ڈویژن سے بھی منظوری نہیں لی گئی ہے اور required تجربہ بھی نہیں ہے ان کے پاس تو اس ڈیپارٹمنٹ کو بہتر چلانے کے لئے کہ جو واقعی senior most لوگ ہیں ان پر توجہ دیں۔ اور سب افسران کے ساتھ at par treatment ہو۔ تاکہ ان کے درمیان جو بے چینی ہے وہ دور ہو سکے۔

Mr. Chairman: Minister for Food.

میاں عبدالستار لالیکا، جناب اس پوسٹ کے لئے placement bureau نے 28-6-79 کو منظوری دی تھی۔ اس کے تحت یہ پوسٹ fill کی گئی ہے اور اسی کے تحت ساڑھے تین سال کی condonation دی گئی تھی۔

جناب چیئرمین، ننگرہ جی next question جی نمبر ۳۵ سیف اللہ خان پراچہ صاحب۔

35. \*Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Industries

and Investment be pleased to refer to the Senate Starred Question No. 170 replied on 13-12-1994 and state:

(a) the quantity of imported and indigenous FLUORITE ORE in metric tonnes used by Pakistan Steel Mills since 1994-95, with year-wise break-up;

(b) the details of the efforts made so far by Pakistan Steel Mills to use indigenous FLUORITE ORE; and

(c) the steps proposed to be taken to further promote the use of indigenous FLUORITE ORE in Pakistan Steel Mills ?

Dr. Khalid Maqbool Siddiqui: (a) Pakistan Steel procured imported and indigenous Fluorite ore since 1994-95 as under:--

Year	Imported	Indigenous
1994-95	Nil	1490 MT
1995-96	4400 MT	738 MT
1996-97	Nil	Nil
1997-98	Nil	Nil

(b) In order to use indigenous fluorite Pak Steel had a long term contract with M/s. Balochistan Development Authority for supply of local fluorite ore since 1982. During this period problems of quality and quantity were experienced and finally supplies were discontinued by B.D.A. in 1988-89.

Later, Pakistan Steel released tender notice in press during 1988, 1990 and 1992 for exploring indigenous fluorite. However, there was no response from local sources.

In March, 1995 M/s. Precious Minerals Quetta showed interest and an order for 1000 MT was issued. Subsequently, orders of petty quantities were

also issued to other parties which are listed below:--

S. No.	Name of Firms	Period	Quantity
1.	M/s. Rock Mineral Quetta.	July, 1995	210 MT
2.	M/s. Precious Mineral, Quetta.	Dec, 1995	1080 MT
3.	M/s. Sumeral Impex.	1995-96	311 MT
4.	M/s. Kamkar Associate.	1995-96	88 MT
5.	M/s. Khan Minerals.	1995-96	242 MT
6.	M/s. Iqra Refractory Minerals.	1995-96	23 MT
7.	M/s. Unique Enterprises.	1995-96	248 MT

As local supplier were unable to supply Fluorite according to Pak Steel's specification and in order to patronize and encourage local suppliers, we reduced the content of calcium fluorite from 85% to 75% but even then no supplier was able to provide indigenous fluorite as per specifications. In general, indigenous Fluorite are supplied by local parties in previous years was below specifications. However, Pakistan Steel accepted all the materials on deviation deviated results varied in the range given below:--

Year	Required as per specification		Deviated Results	
	Calcium Fluorite	Silica	Calcium Fluorite	Silica
1994-95	85% Min	5% Max	69%--89%	5.9%--24%
1995-96	85% Min	5% Max	70%--75%	20%--25%

(c) Pakistan Steel is in touch with Balochistan Development Authority (BDA) for supply of the requisite quality of Fluorite.

Mr. Chairman: Answer is taken as read. Supplementary question.

former fluoride ore کے لئے پاکستان کے fluoride ore کے لئے former  
 Prime Minister Junejo Sahib نے خود کوٹہ میں آ کے فیصد کیا کہ پاکستان سٹیل مل local  
 fluoride ore لے گی۔ تاکہ وہاں کے قبائل کو روزگار مل سکے۔ مگر کیا وزیر صاحب یہ بتائیں گے  
 کہ باوجود اتنی high level کی instructions کے پاکستان سٹیل مل والے import کرنے میں  
 زیادہ دلچسپی رکھتے ہیں۔ کیا وزیر صاحب اس پر control کریں گے۔

جناب چیئرمین، جی جناب وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جناب اب بجائے import کرنے کے local fluoride  
 کے لئے اس کے standard میں بھی concession دے دی گئی ہے۔ اور میں آپ کی وساطت  
 سے فاضل ممبر صاحب کو کہوں گا کہ local جتنی production ہو، ہم وہ ساری لینے کو تیار ہیں۔

جناب سیف اللہ خان پراچہ، جناب supplementary.

جناب چیئرمین، جی فرمائیے سیف اللہ خان پراچہ صاحب۔

جناب سیف اللہ خان پراچہ، جناب وزیر صاحب بڑے مہربان ہیں I am very  
 grateful to him مگر ان کو کچھ زیادہ دلچسپی یعنی پڑے گی اس سلسلے میں۔ کیونکہ this decision  
 was taken by a Prime Minister. اگر کوئی change ہوتی ہے تو only at the level of the  
 Prime Minister it can be changed. تو آپ مہربانی کر کے کچھ مزید اس کی limits کو  
 lower کریں۔ تاکہ مقامی لوگوں کو یہ روزگار مل سکے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، اس سلسلے میں اگر فاضل ممبر صاحب تجاویز دے دیں تو  
 اس کے مطابق کر لیں گے۔ لیکن پہلے بھی کافی concessions اس میں دی ہیں۔ اور میں ان کو  
 یقین دلاتا ہوں کہ انشاء اللہ local production جتنی بھی ہو گی وہ لینے کے بعد باہر کی بات کی  
 جا سکے گی local production کو ہی ترجیح دی جائے گی۔

جناب چیئرمین، جی تاج حیدر صاحب۔

جناب تاج حیدر، جناب بلوچستان کا bromite OGDC use کرتی ہے oil and gas  
 drilling tender کے ذریعے اور OGDC نے یہ کر رکھا ہے کیونکہ وہ تو پہاڑوں سے کھود کے لایا

جا رہا ہے۔ OGDC خود اسے purify کرتی ہے۔ They have put up a small plant کہ جس میں bromite کو purify کر کے record specification پر لایا جاتا ہے۔ کیا آپ ایسا کر سکیں گے سنیل میں کہ ایک چھوٹا سا plant وہاں لگا دیں تاکہ اس کی grade according to specification کی جاسکے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، ہم اس کو examine کر لیں گے۔

جناب چیئر مین، جی جناب ظفر اللہ خان جمالی صاحب۔

میر ظفر اللہ خان جمالی، جناب میرا supplementary یہ ہے۔ جناب وزیر صاحب نے فرمایا کہ جو تجاویز ممبر صاحب دیں گے ہم ان پر عمل کریں گے۔ I hope tomorrow اسی پر عمل کریں گے، پارٹ اے۔ Part B is OGDC کے لئے بہتر رہے ہیں۔ OGDC تو خود اپنی صلاحیتیں نہیں کر سکتی تو باقی کی کیا صلاحیت کرے گی۔

جناب چیئر مین، جی منسٹر فار پارلیمنٹری افیئرز۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جی میں نے یہی سہا کہ جو تجاویز آئیں گی ہم ان پر غور کریں گے۔

جناب چیئر مین، شکریہ جی۔ نمبر ۳۶ ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی صاحب۔

\*36. Dr. Muhammad Ismail Buledi: Will the Minister for Science and Technology be pleased to state whether it is fact that a number of appointments have been made on contract basis despite the ban on fresh recruitment, if so, its reasons?

Syeda Abida Hussain: Yes. The following two persons have been appointed:

1. Mr. Javed Hayat has been appointed as Naib Qasid (BPS-1) in the Ministry of (Main) on contract basis for a period of two years w.e.f. 13-7-1998 with the approval of Prime Minister.

2. Mr. Muhammad Ijaz has been appointed as Assistant (BPS-11) in the Centre for Applied Molecular Biology (CAMB), Lahore, an autonomous body under the Ministry on contract on the directive of Prime Minister.

Mr. Chairman : Supplementary question?

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، جناب میں نے سوال کیا تھا کہ نئی بھرتیوں پر پابندی ہے اور گورنمنٹ نے دو آدمی بھرتی کئے۔ نمبر 1 جاوید حیات اور نمبر ۲ محمد اعجاز۔ ان کو وزیر اعظم کے کہنے پر بھرتی کیا ہے۔ تو وزیر صاحب مجھے یہ بتائیں کہ یہ دو آدمی کس بنیاد پر بھرتی کئے گئے ہیں جبکہ پورے ملک کے لئے پابندی ہے۔ تو یہ دو آدمی contract پر کس طرح بھرتی کئے گئے ہیں؟ اگر دو آدمیوں کے لئے گنجائش ہے تو سب کے لئے ban کو ختم کیا جائے جبکہ پورے ملک میں بے روزگاری ہے۔ اس کا تسلی بخش جواب دے دیں۔

جناب چیئرمین، منسٹر برائے پارلیمانی امور۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو ، جناب والا! جہاں تک جاوید حیات کا تعلق ہے اسے گریڈ 1 میں بطور نائب قاصد رکھا گیا ہے اور اس کا background یہ ہے کہ اس شخص کا والد یہاں ڈرائیور تھا جو فوت ہو گیا اور اس کی والدہ نے جو ڈرائیور کی بیوہ تھی، اس نے وفاقی محتسب کو درخواست گزاری کہ میں بیوہ ہوں، میرا کوئی ذریعہ معاش نہیں ہے، میرا خاوند فوت ہو گیا ہے تو میرے بیٹے کو اس محلے میں نوکری دے دی جائے۔ تو اس بارے میں باقاعدہ process کرنے کے بعد اسٹیٹمنٹ ڈویژن کو لکھا گیا تو انہوں نے لکھا کہ وزیر اعظم ہی یہ ban remove کر سکتے ہیں۔ تو پھر وہ کیس وزیر اعظم کے پاس بھیجا گیا۔ انہوں نے اس کی اجازت دی اور اس نوجوان کو نائب قاصد رکھا گیا۔

اور دوسرا شخص جو ہے اس کو بھی پرائم منسٹر سیکریٹریٹ کی اجازت کے ساتھ رکھا گیا ہے۔ گریڈ گیارہ میں contract basis پر رکھا گیا ہے۔ تو ban میں وزیر اعظم کی اجازت سے بہر صورت contract پر رکھا جاسکتا ہے۔ اور انہی حالات میں رکھا گیا ہے۔

جناب چیئرمین، جی ڈاکٹر بلیدی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، جناب ایسے بہت سارے نوجوان ہیں جن بچپن کے والد فوت ہو چکے ہوتے ہیں اور وہ بچپن سے درخواستیں لے کر بدر پھرتے رہتے ہیں۔ ان کو کوئی پوجھتا نہیں ہے۔ تو اگر یہ سوت ہے تو میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ وزیر اعظم ایسا آرڈر جاری کریں کہ جن کے باپ فوت ہو جاتے ہیں ان کے بدلے ان کے بچوں کو رکھا جائے۔ جناب یہ خصوصاً ایک بندے کے لئے کیا گیا ہے جبکہ پورے ملک میں پابندی ہے۔ یہ کس لئے کیا گیا ہے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو ، یہ جناب وفاقی محتسب صاحب نے لکھا تھا کہ اس کو رکھ لیا جائے اور اس کو رکھ لیا گیا۔

(اس موقع پر مغرب کی اذان ہوئی اور چیئرمین صاحب نے پندرہ منٹ کے لئے مغرب کی ناز کے لئے اجلاس ملتوی کر دیا)

(بعد از وقفہ ناز مغرب کارروائی کا آغاز زیر صدارت جناب چیئرمین (جناب وسیم سجاد) ہوا)

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی سوال کون پوچھ رہا تھا جی عبداللحئی بلوچ۔ فرمائیے۔

ڈاکٹر عبداللحئی بلوچ۔ جناب والا! میرا ضمنی سوال یہ ہے کہ یہ اپنی جگہ حقیقت ہے کہ بھرتیاں چور دروازے سے ہو رہی ہیں۔ کٹریکٹ بنیادوں پر senior most آفیسر لے جا رہے ہیں ، ریٹائرڈ لے جا رہے ہیں۔ پھوٹے ملازمین اپنی مرضی اور پسند کے لئے جا رہے ہیں۔ ہم ان سے یہ پوچھنا چاہیں گے کہ یہ ملک قانون کے مطابق چل رہا ہے یا آپ کی مرضی اور منشاء کے مطابق چل رہا ہے اور اگر بھرتیاں ہو رہی ہیں تو پھر ان کی اخبارات میں تشہیر کیوں نہیں کی جاتی۔ سینکڑوں ہزاروں کی تعداد میں بھرتیاں ہو رہی ہیں۔ کٹریکٹ بنیادوں پر مختلف اداروں میں مختلف جگہوں پر بھرتیاں ہو رہی ہیں۔ ہمارا آپ سے یہ سوال ہے کہ یہ عمومی طریقہ کار نہیں ہے۔ آپ اس کو اخبارات میں کیوں نہیں دیتے ، اس کی تشہیر کیوں نہیں کرتے۔ جناب چیئرمین صاحب! یہ لوگوں کی عام شکایت ہے کہ بھرتیاں ہو رہی ہیں اور ساری بھرتیاں چور دروازے سے ہو رہی ہیں۔ جیسے پچھلی حکومت نے بغیر اختیارات کے بھرتیاں کیں۔ ان کا بھی یہی سلسلہ ہے۔ جناب والا! میں آپ کے توسط سے یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ آپ ان بھرتیوں کی تشہیر کیوں نہیں کرتے اور آپ نے یہ جو بلا جواز، بلا مقصد پابندی لگا رکھی ہے۔ لاکھوں نوجوان بے روزگار دکھے کھا

رہے ہیں۔ یہ آپ پاندیاں کب اٹھائیں گے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی یسین خان وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب والا! یہاں تو یہ سوال سائنس اور ٹیکنالوجی کے عاص محکمے سے متعلق ہے۔ وہ میں نے بتایا ہے کہ جناب! وہاں صرف دو بھرتیاں ہوئی ہیں۔ ایک گریڈ ایک میں اور دوسری گریڈ 11 میں اور میں نے ان سب کا back ground ابھی آپ کی خدمت میں عرض کر دیا ہے کہ ایک کیس میں تو وفاقی محتسب نے لکھا اور ان کے لکھنے پر معاملے کو حل کیا گیا۔ گریڈ ایک کی ان کو کٹریٹ بنیادوں پر نوکری دی گئی ہے، مستقل بنیادوں پر نہیں دی گئی ہے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ شکریہ جی۔ جناب اسماعیل بیدی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بیدی۔ جناب والا! میں یہ وزیر صاحب سے پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ کیا مستقبل قریب میں کوئی پروگرام ہے کہ جو انہوں نے ملازمت پر پابندی لگا رکھی ہے وہ کب تک ختم کریں گے۔ جب سے مسلم لیگ کی حکومت آئی ہے تو اس وقت سے ملازمتوں پر پابندی ہے۔ کیا ایک سال، دو سال یا پانچ سال کے اندر کوئی پروگرام ہے کہ اس کا کچھ کیا جائے گا، ملک میں جو لوگ بے روزگاری کی وجہ سے پریشان ہیں اس حکومت کا کوئی ایسا منصوبہ ہے کہ بے روزگاری کو ختم کیا جائے۔ اس پابندی کو ختم کر کے بھرتیاں شروع کرنے کا کوئی پروگرام ہے کہ نہیں ہے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی جناب وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب والا! میں نے اس سے پہلے عرض کیا کہ اس سلسلے میں کچھ کہنا مشکل ہے کہ یہ فیصلہ وزیر اعظم صاحب نے کرنا ہے۔ جب وہ فیصلہ کریں گے تو پھر اخبارات کے ذریعے سارے عوام کو مطلع کر دیا جائے گا۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی اگلا سوال نمبر 37 ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بیدی صاحب۔

37. Dr. Muhammad Ismail Buledi: Will the Minister for Science and Technology be pleased to state:

(a) the name, grade and qualification of the Admn. Officer working in the National Institute of Electronics, Islamabad; and

(b) whether it is a fact that the testimonials of the said officer have been found fake, if so, the action taken against him?

Syeda Abida Hussain: (a) Name: Mr. Imtiaz Ali Khan Mizari.

Grade: 18

Qualification: B.A., LL.B.

(b) No. The allegations of producing fake documents have proven to be false on the basis of an inquiry conducted for the purpose of verification/authentication of the documents/testimonials of the officer.

جناب چیئرمین۔ کوئی ضمنی سوال۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی۔ جناب والا! یہ جو میں نے سوال میں کیا تھا کہ اس ایڈمن آفیسر کے جعلی کافذات ہیں تو یہاں انہوں نے جواب دیا ہے کہ ایک کمیٹی مقرر کی گئی تھی اور اس کے کافذات درست پائے گئے۔ میں وزیر صاحب سے کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ جواب غلط ہے۔ مجھے وہ رپورٹ دی جائے جو کمیٹی نے انکوائری کی ہے۔ مہمہ کافذات وہ مجھے رپورٹ دے دیں تاکہ میں وہ دیکھ لوں کہ واقعی انہوں نے انکوائری کی ہے اور کس طرح انکوائری کی ہے۔ میں اب تک یہ کہتا ہوں کہ اس کے کافذات جعلی ہیں اور وہ اس کی دوبارہ انکوائری کریں یا جو کمیٹی کی انکوائری رپورٹ ہے وہ مجھے بتائیں تاکہ میں مطمئن ہو جاؤں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی جناب وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب چیئرمین صاحب! اس سلسلے میں ایک انکوائری

کمیٹی مقرر کی گئی تھی۔ بریگیڈیئر (ریٹائرڈ) ایم سرور خان جو Director Development ہیں وہ اس کمیٹی کے چیئرمین تھے اور جناب نہال احمد ڈیپٹی ڈائریکٹر اس کے ممبر تھے۔ انہوں نے ان سارے کافذات کے بارے میں تحقیقات کی ہے اور وہ اس نتیجے پر پہنچے ہیں کہ یہ کافذات درست ہیں اور fake نہیں ہیں اگر وہ دیکھنا چاہیں تو میں اس سلسلے میں محکمے سے انکوائری کے بارے میں پتہ کروا

کے ان کو مطلع کر دوں گا۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ شکریہ۔ جی مسعود کوثر صاحب۔ جناب والا! جہاں تک جواب کا تعلق ہے۔ اس میں کہا گیا ہے کہ انہوں نے انکوائری کی ہے۔ جناب والا! میں مختصر سا سوال کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ آیا متعلقہ یونیورسٹی سے یہ بات کنفرم کی گئی ہے کہ یہ جو fake سرٹیفکیٹ ہیں 'یہ دراصل genuine ہیں اور fake نہیں ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب والا! اگر آپ سوال دیکھیں تو سوال یہ ہے۔

(a) the name, grade and qualification of the Admn. Officer working in the National Institute of Electronics, Islamabad; and

(b) whether it is a fact that the testimonials of the said officer have been found fake, if so, the action taken against him?

اس کے بارے میں جو میں نے Directors اور Deputy Directors عرض کئے ان کی کمیٹی نے inquiry کی ہے۔ اس کی تفصیل کے بارے میں بیدی صاحب نے ارشاد فرمایا تھا 'وہ میں محکمہ سے لے کر ان کو دے سکتا ہوں یا ان کے علم میں لاسکتا ہوں اگر اس میں کوئی قانونی بیج نہ ہوئی تو۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی سید مسعود کوثر صاحب۔

Syed Masood Kausar: Sir, my question was very simple and he has not answered the question. Have they sent these so called or alleged fake certificates to the concerned university to find out whether they are fake or genuine, and this was the question I asked him, if you have the record with you

اس میں کچھ لکھا ہوا ہے کہ انہوں نے یونیورسٹی سے verify کیا ہے کہ نہیں کیا ہے۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب میں اس وقت یہ نہیں کہہ سکتا کہ یونیورسٹی نے انہوں نے پوچھا ہے لیکن انہوں نے inquiry کی ہے 'inquiry میں کیا procedure اختیار کیا

ہے اس کے بارے میں میں نے کہا کہ وہ تو رپورٹ سے ہی چٹا چل سکتا ہے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی جناب جی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر عبدالحمید بلوچ۔ جناب میرا وزیر موصوف صاحب سے ضمنی سوال ہے کہ یہ

عام شکایت ہے کہ fake ڈگریاں عام ہو گئی ہیں، پیسے سے لوگ لے جاتے ہیں اور نقل تو ویسے بھی قیمتی سے ختم نہیں ہو رہی ہے اور اب ڈگریاں بیچی جا رہی ہیں۔ میں وفاقی حکومت سے پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ اس کا سدھار کب کریں گے۔ یہ جو ملک میں ڈگریاں بیچی جا رہی ہیں، ان کی خرید و فروخت شروع ہو چکی ہے، جعلی ڈگری دی جا رہی ہے، تو وفاقی حکومت اس کا کیا سدھار کرے گی۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی منسٹر صاحب۔

میاں محمد یلین خان وٹو۔ جناب اس کا سدھار کیا جا رہا ہے اور جہاں سے بھی اس کورپشن کے بارے میں 'امتحانات کے بارے میں یا ڈگریوں کے بارے میں کوئی شکایات پہنچتی ہیں تو اس سلسلے میں سخت اقدامات کئے جاتے ہیں۔ صوبائی level پر بھی تمام حکومتیں اس سلسلے میں اقدامات کر رہی ہیں اور پوزیشن پہلے سے بہت بہتر ہو رہی ہے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ شکریہ۔ جی کوئی اور ضمنی سوال۔ جی مسعود کوثر فرمائے۔

سید مسعود کوثر۔ منسٹر صاحب بڑے اچھے آدمی ہیں۔ یہ ہر جواب دیتے ہیں۔ کیا یہ

جائیں گے کہ جو حکومت نے اقدامات کئے ہیں اور provinces اور Federal Government میں کتنے ایسے cases پکڑے ہیں اور ان پر کیا action لیا ہے تاکہ چٹا چلے۔ یہ تو ویسے ہی ہاؤس کو ایک عام قسم کا جواب دے کر بیٹھ جاتے ہیں۔ یہ بڑی افسوسناک بات ہے کہ اتنے سنجیدہ مسئلے کو آپ کے وزیر موصوف صاحب اتنا lightly لے کر جواب دیتے ہیں۔ اس سے نظر آتا ہے کہ ان چیزوں میں ان کی کوئی دلچسپی نہیں ہے۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ جی منسٹر صاحب۔

میاں محمد یلین خان وٹو۔ جناب والا! اس وقت جو آپ کے سامنے سوال ہے

اس سے ضمنی سوال نکھنا چاہیئے۔ اب یہ سارے صوبوں کے بارے میں اگر کوئی جنرل سوال کریں

گے تو میں اس میں جنرل جواب دے دوں گا۔ اب اگر آپ specific چیز پوچھنا چاہتے ہیں تو پھر اتنا غیب کا علم اس خاکسار کو تو نہیں ہے۔ آپ سوال کر دیجئے میں پورا جواب لے کر آپ کی خدمت میں حاضر کر دوں گا۔

جناب چیئر مین۔ شکریہ۔ اگلا سوال نمبر 38 اسماعیل بیدی صاحب۔

38. Dr. Muhammad Ismail Buledi: Will the Minister for Foreign Affairs be pleased to state the number of persons working in the Pakistan missions abroad with their province-wise break-up?

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: There are at present 888 officers/officials of Ministry of Foreign Affairs working in the Pakistan Missions abroad. Their province-wise break-up is enumerated as under:--

Province	Officers	Officials	Total
Punjab	134	368	502
Sindh	44	98	142
	21 (R)	37 (R)	
	23 (U)	61 (U)	
NWFP	43	101	144
Balochistan	11	16	27
FATA	12	20	32
AJK	5	36	41
Total:	249	639	888

جناب چیئر مین۔ ضمنی سوال، اسماعیل بیدی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بیدی۔ جناب میں اس جواب سے مطمئن اس لئے نہیں ہوں کہ ایک صوبہ ہونے کے باوجود بیرون ملک سفارتخانوں میں بلوچستان کی کوئی نمائندگی نہیں ہے۔ بلکہ میں یہاں تک کہتا ہوں کہ وہاں ایک چیئر اسی 'چوکیدار اور ڈرائیور بھی ہمیں بلوچی دکھائی نہیں دیتا۔

ہم نے کچھ ممالک visit کئے، مظاہر بھی ہم گئے، کچھ اور ممالک لندن وغیرہ گئے اور وہاں میں نے یہ انکوائری کی تو مجھے ان کے ذریعے پتا چلا کہ بیرونی ممالک میں جتنے سفارتخانے ہیں وہاں بلوچستان کی نمائندگی nil ہے۔ ویسے بھی صوبائی خود مختاری اور یہ احساس محرومی جو جنم لے رہا ہے اور لوگ اس کا احساس کر رہے ہیں کہ 'are we Pakistani or not?' اگر ہم بلوچی پاکستانی ہیں تو کم از کم یہ ہمارا حق بنتا ہے کہ ایسے اداروں میں یا ایسے سفارتخانوں میں بیرون ملک ہماری نمائندگی ہونی چاہیے۔ بلکہ جو ہمارے بلوچ بھائی بیرون ملک رہتے ہیں وہاں جو سفارتخانے ہیں، ان میں سفیر، First Secretaries, Second Secretaries ہیں، ان کے پاس جاتے ہیں تو وہ ان کو دھکے دے کر نکال دیتے ہیں کہ آپ کو کیا حق ہے کہ آپ یہاں آتے ہیں۔ تو ہم احساس محرومی میں اس طرح مبتلا ہیں۔ یہاں جو وزیر صاحب نے بیان دیا ہے کہ بلوچستان میں 11 افسران ہیں اور 16 اہلکاران، ٹوٹل 27۔ مجھے افسوس ہے کہ 11 show کے بھی انہوں نے 12, 20 and 32 show کئے ہیں۔ ایک صوبہ ہونے کے باوجود یہ 11 show کئے ہیں۔ وہ بھی وہ لوگ ہیں جو اثر و رسوخ اور سفارش سے وہاں کے ڈومیسائل لے کر اپنے آپ کو بلوچی show کر کے بھرتی ہوئے ہیں۔ تو میں وزیر صاحب سے یہ کہتا ہوں کہ اس کو فارن کمیٹی کے حوالے کریں اور ہمیں باقاعدہ بلا کر یہ بتایا جائے کہ بلوچوں سے کوئی فرسٹ سیکرٹری، کوئی سینڈ سیکرٹری، کوئی سفیر انٹریشنل لیول پر اگر ایک بھی مجھے دکھایا جائے تو پھر میں مانتے کے لئے تیار ہوں ورنہ یہ پورے بلوچستان کی آواز ہے کہ ہمارے ساتھ زیادتی ہے۔ میرا حق بنتا ہے۔ میں اس ہاؤس میں ہوں اور ان کی نمائندگی کر رہا ہوں۔ بیرون ملک میں جو ہمارے بلوچی بھائی رہتے ہیں وہ اس کو محسوس کر رہے ہیں کہ کسی بھی ادارے میں ہماری نمائندگی نہیں ہے۔ آیا اگر ہم پاکستانی ہیں اور ---

(مدخلت)

جناب چیئرمین، آپ سوال پوچھیں نا۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی، جناب سوال یہ ہے۔ میں کہتا ہوں کہ figures غلط ہیں اس کی انکوائری ہو۔ یہ جو 11 افسر ہیں یہ بلوچی نہیں ہیں۔ وہ ڈومیسائل سفارش پر لے کر بھرتی ہوئے ہیں۔ انہوں نے اس بات کی بھی نشاندہی نہیں کی ہے کہ وہ فرسٹ سیکرٹری ہیں، سیکشن افسر ہیں یا کوئی کلرک ہیں۔ کم از کم یہ بھی اس میں clear نہیں ہے۔ تو میں وزیر صاحب سے کہتا

ہوں کہ اس کی انکوائری کریں یا فارن کمیٹی کے حوالے کریں تاکہ ہمیں وہ مطمئن کریں۔ اس سے ہم بالکل مطمئن نہیں ہیں اور ہمارے پورے صوبے کا حق مارا جا رہا ہے۔ لہذا میں ان سے کہتا ہوں کہ ہمیں مطمئن کیا جائے۔

جناب مسرتاج حزرینہ، جناب چیئرمین! جواب تو وہی ہے جو سوال پوچھا گیا تھا کہ افسر کتنے ہیں۔ Grade-wise نہیں پوچھا گیا تھا اس لئے وہ نہیں دیا گیا۔ لیکن آپ دیکھیں گے کہ اس میں بلوچستان سے کل 11 افسر ہیں۔ بلوچستان کا ٹوٹل کوڈ ریکورڈمنٹ میں ساڑھے تین فیصد ہے۔ پوسٹنگ میں کوڈ نہیں ہوتا۔ افسروں کا تناسب ۴.۴ ہے۔ یعنی جو کوڈ ہے اس سے زیادہ ہے۔ جو صاف ہے گریڈ ایک سے سوہ تک اس میں ۳.۵ کے مقابلے میں ۲.۶ ہے لیکن مجموعی طور پر ۳.۴ ہے یعنی کوڈ میں ذرا سی کمی ہے اور وہ بھی وقت کے ساتھ ساتھ پوری ہو رہی ہے۔ ظاہر ہے کہ اس وقت سیر بھی ہیں بلوچستان سے اور باقی بھی ہیں۔ وہ اگر سوال پوچھیں گے تو میں تفصیل دے دوں گا لیکن افسروں کا کوڈ کم از کم اس کے مطابق ہے۔ اب ظاہر ہے کہ وہ ہرمن میں تو نہیں ہو سکتے ہیں لیکن اگر وہ پوچھیں گے کہ کہاں کہاں ہیں تو اس کی distribution ہم بتا دیں گے اور جو صاف کے لیول پر کمی ہے وہ ہم انشاء اللہ جلدی پوری کریں گے۔

جناب چیئرمین، جی جناب بلیدی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی، جناب چیئرمین! اس جواب سے میں مطمئن نہیں ہوں۔ یہ جو 11 انہوں نے دیا ہے یہ بلوچی نہیں ہیں۔ میرا اعتراض یہ ہے۔ وہ مجھے کس طرح مطمئن کریں گے۔ وہ مجھے بتائیں یا کمیٹی کے حوالے کریں۔

جناب چیئرمین، آپ کو پتہ نہیں ہے کہ وہ کون ہیں اور کہتے ہیں کہ یہ نہیں ہیں۔ اگر آپ کو پتہ ہے تو 11 کے نام بتائیں۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی، میں نے انکوائری کی ہے۔ پنجاب کے ہیں، سرحد کے ہیں، اسلام آباد اور لاہور کے ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین، وزیر صاحب! ان کی شکایت یہ ہے کہ یہ 11 جو ہیں یہ بھی بلوچستان کے نہیں ہیں۔

جناب سرتاج عزیز، یہ سوال پوچھیں کہ ان میں اصل پیدائشی کتنے ہیں اور ڈومیسائل کتنے لوگوں نے لیا ہے تو جواب دے دیں گے۔ پتہ لگ جائے گا۔

جناب چیئرمین ، سرمال ان کی شکایت دیکھنے والی ہے۔ جی جمالی صاحب، he can, may be give us more information on this.

Mir Zafarullah Khan Jamali: Sir, first of all I would like to correct the honourable Minister, the quota for Balochistan is not 3.5. Its 5.3 according to new census, so that is the first point. We should not make wrong statement in the House. In future he may please be correct that.

اگر اس کو ہم لے لیں تے census کو تو میرے خیال میں وہ ان کے کوٹہ سے short fall ہیں۔ میرا دوسرا سٹیٹمنٹری ان سے یہ ہے کہ یہ جو ۱۱ آفیسر لگانے ہوئے ہیں بلوچستان سے۔ ہمیں وزیر صاحب یہ بتا دیں کہ ان میں سے لوکل اور ڈومیسائل لینے والے کتنے ہیں اور ان میں بلوچستان کے کوٹہ سے اسمیڈر کتنے ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، جی۔

جناب سرتاج عزیز، اس لئے میں نے کہا ہے کہ جب تک fresh notice نہیں دیں گے۔ I don't have the information now. جو دوسرا سوال ہے۔ نئی census ابھی complete نہیں ہے۔ یہ تو جو recruitment پچھلے سالوں میں ہوتی رہی ہے اس میں یہ 3.5 percentage ہے اور جب اس census کی implementation ہو جائے گی تو اس کے مطابق کوٹہ revise ہو جائے گا۔

جناب چیئرمین ، ایک منٹ جی '۲' ۴ ضمنی سوال آ رہے ہیں۔ جی جمالی صاحب۔

میر ظفر اللہ خان جمالی، میری census سے مراد تھی کہ NFC Award میں یہ ہمیں ۵.۳ دیتے رہے ہیں۔ as Finance Minister, how can he rebuke it at 3.5 now. Will he please clarify that, as a Finance Minister that we have been getting our share at 5.3 and how does we get it at 3.5?

جناب چیئرمین ، واپس نہ لے لینا۔ ان کا کچھ پتہ نہیں ہے ' access payment ہو گئی ہے۔

میر ظفر اللہ خان جمالی، جناب with due respect ان کو یہ تک پتہ نہیں ہے کہ بلوچستان سے سفیر کتنے ہیں۔ ان کو یہ تک پتہ نہیں ہے کہ بلوچستان سے لوکل اور ڈومیسائل رکھنے والے کتنے ہیں۔ ابھی میں سمجھتا ہوں - I have all the respect for him but at least when we ask a question They should not make wrong کم از کم ہمیں اس کا جواب دیا جائے۔ statement on the floor of the House۔

جناب مسرتاج عزیز، جواب تو وہی دیا جائے گا جس کا سوال پوچھا جاتا ہے۔ سوال میں یہ پوچھا گیا تھا the number of officers and staff working وہ ہم نے تفصیل دے دی ہے اور یہ جو لسٹ ہے کہ کون کون سے افسر بلوچستان سے ہیں اور ان کے ڈومیسائل original کتنے ہیں اور adopted کتنے ہیں، یہ اس کے رota day پر بتا دوں گا۔

جناب چیئرمین ، فریش نوٹس دیں۔ جی جناب صوبیدار خان مندوخیل۔

جناب صوبیدار خان مندوخیل ، جناب چیئرمین ! میں معزز وزیر صاحب سے یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ تو بڑی آسان بات ہے کہ آج بھی اگر اپنے سیکرٹری کو کہہ دیں کہ بلوچستان کے کتنے لوگ ہیں اور کون کون سے لوگ ہیں تو کل تک وہ ہمیں بتا دیں گے۔ وزیر صاحب یہ وعدہ کر لیں کہ کل ہم آپ کو ہاؤس میں بتا دیں گے۔ کیونکہ جہاں تک ہمیں پتہ ہے کوئی سفیر نہیں ہے۔ ایک دو مجھے پتہ ہیں کہ سمارت خانوں میں ہیں، باقی کچھ بھی نہیں ہیں۔ اگر چیڑا اسی ہوں، یا ڈرائیور ہوں تو بات الگ ہے لیکن بلوچستان کی میں آپ کو اینٹورنس دیتا ہوں کہ اسے بالکل نظر انداز کیا گیا ہے۔ کسی چیز میں بھی نہیں ہے نہ یہاں لوکل میں کوئی بلوچستان سے ہے نہ باہر ہے۔ وزیر صاحب سے یہی گزارش ہے کہ وہ کل ہمیں بتا دیں کہ کتنے لوگ سفیر ہیں اور آفیسر کتنے ہیں۔

جناب مسرتاج عزیز ، میں کل ضرور تفصیل دے دوں گا۔ مجھے دو سفیر تو معلوم ہیں۔ ایک جرمنی میں ہیں، ایک انڈیا میں ہے۔

جناب چیئرمین ، نام کیا ہے ان کا؟

جناب مسرتاج عزیز ، اشرف جہانگیر قاضی ، اور جرمنی میں بھی بلوچستان کے درانی

ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی۔

ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی بلوچ ، جناب چیئرمین : میں وزیر موصوف کو بتا سکتا ہوں۔ آپ دیکھیں کہ بلوچستان کے ساتھ ظلم یہ ہے کہ جو کوٹہ ہے وہ 81 کی مردم شماری کے مطابق ، ہماری صاحب نے صحیح کہا ہے کہ 5.3 فیصد ہے اور یہ اب تک ہمیں 3.5 فیصد کے حساب سے دیتے ہیں۔ حساب کتاب میں تو ویسے یہ ماہر ہیں لیکن جب ہماری باری آتی ہے۔۔۔۔۔

جناب چیئرمین ، یہ حساب کتاب والے تو اب آئے ہیں۔ اب یہ ٹھیک حساب کتاب کریں گے۔

ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی بلوچ ، اپنے لئے تو ماہر ہیں اور ہمارے لئے کہتے ہیں کہ 3.5 فیصد ہے۔ 81 کی مردم شماری کے مطابق ہمارا کوٹہ % 5.3 ہے۔ احساس محرومیت بلوچستان کے نوجوانوں میں کیسے نہیں بڑھے گا کہ اب تک آپ ہمیں 1971 کی مردم شماری کے مطابق 3.5 فیصد دے رہے ہیں۔ سب سے بڑا ظلم یہ ہے اور جو کوٹہ سسٹم ہے اس پر عملدرآمد بھی نہیں ہو رہا ہے۔ آپ دوسری جگہ کو پھوڑیں ہمارے لوگ مڈل ایسٹ میں بہت ہیں۔ مزدوری کے لئے جاتے ہیں۔ آپ یقین کریں وہاں کی اسمبلیوں میں انہوں نے کوئی ایسا آدمی نہیں رکھا ہے کہ کوئی ان کا پرسان حال ہو۔ سادے لوگ ہیں۔ ان پڑھ لوگ ہیں۔ جناب والا! یہ جانتے ہیں کہ اتنے لوگ خارجہ مشن میں ہیں اس میں کوئی صداقت نہیں ہے۔ اس پر توجہ دیں اور یہ جو آپ ہمیں پیکر دے جاتے ہیں اس سے کوئی فائدہ نہیں ہے۔ لوگ آپ کی ان پالیسیوں سے مایوس ہیں اور بلوچستان کے لوگ صحیح معنوں میں کوٹہ پر عملدرآمد کے ساتھ ساتھ اپنی نانندگی چلا سکتے ہیں تمام ڈویژنوں میں بشمول خارجہ۔ آپ اپنی پالیسیوں کو بدلیں اور یہ جو بلوچستان کے ساتھ سوتیلی ماں کا سلوک ہے اس کو ختم کریں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، شکریہ۔ جی جناب عالی صاحب۔

Dr. Jamiluddin Aali : There are, at present 888 officers/officials of Ministry of Foreign Affairs working at present. Now, does it include , and I am sure it does not include locally recruited people, who are very large in number in places like UK, USA and Saudi Arabia. But they have their domiciles and in UK, USA some might have taken local citizenship but in Saudi Arabia nobody can take local citizenship.

So, would the Minister be pleased enough to clarify whether this Ministry officials include their local staff and can he , in time, obtain, supply, required information province-wise. Secondly, I do not know why there is no total of Sindhi people. You would see it enlists rural and urban Sindhi officials and officers..

جناب چیئرمین ، اوپر ٹوٹل کیا ہوا ہے اور اس کا بریک اپ دیا ہوا ہے کہ 21, 23

اور پھر ---

ڈاکٹر جمیل الدین عالی ، اچھا یہ اس کا بریک اپ ہے -

OK. I am sorry for that but then I would like to know the question which has been put but I would also like this to be included in the answer that he might turn to give some day, as to how many officers of Urban Sindh and Rural Sindh are there, grade-wise. You have already talked of the grades and what is important is the grade and not the officials and their quantity. They are very junior people. Question and all the avenues come out of the seniority of the people of certain province or otherwise. So, I think if the Minister is not equipped with the figures today, he may, with your permission, next day place on the table of this House the required figures.

Mr. Chairmana : Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: I have received some information. There are four Ambassadors from Balochistan out of eleven. One is Mr. Hassan Sarmad in Warisaw. Khawar Rashid Pirzada in Madrid, Gul Hanif in Bonn and Ashraf Jehangir Qazi in India.

جناب چیئرمین، اور دوسرا سوال انہوں نے پوچھا ہے کہ یہ 888 لوکل سٹاف جو آپ بھرتی کرتے ہیں کیا وہ اس میں شامل ہے کہ نہیں ہے۔

جناب سمرتاج عزیز، یہ لکھا ہے کہ working in the mission abroad تو that means they are included.

Dr. Jamiluddin Aali: It possibly indicates or wishes to indicate that they have gone from here.

ایک تو locally based ہوتے ہیں اور ایک باہر سے لے لئے جاتے ہیں تو does the Minister want to say that these 888 include the people who have been locally recruited there also in their respective places or have they all gone from here? That is the point.

جناب چیئرمین، اور locally جو recruit ہونگے ان کا domicile کیا ہوگا، ان کا تو لنڈن اور برلن ہوگا۔

ڈاکٹر جمیل الدین عالی، نہیں جی ان کا domicile جو وہ لے کر گئے ہیں۔ All

of them have not become citizens of the respective countries. That is what I was

trying to explain, Sir. 'پانچ' دو دوسرے سے بھی رہتے ہیں وہ بھرتی کر لئے جاتے ہیں۔ I can name the people.

پانچ دو دوسرے سے بھی رہتے ہیں وہ بھرتی کر لئے جاتے ہیں۔ I can name the people.

Mr. Chairman: O.K. Minister Sahib, do you have this information?

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the quota applies only to initial recruitment. It does not arise to posting and subsequent.

تو اس میں جو وہاں پر local recruitment ہوتی ہے وہ locally اس کے مطابق ہوتی ہے

I can't include that.

ڈاکٹر جمیل الدین عالی : نہیں ان کا ڈومیسائل جمع کر کے بتادیں ہمیں۔

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: I can give the information.

Mr. Chairman: Anyhow, please look into this.

یہ information اکٹھی کر کے دے دیں گے۔

جناب چیئرمین ، جی بیدی صاحب۔ آخری سوال۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، اشرف جہانگیر کا تعلق بلوچستان سے نہیں ہے۔ میرا حکیم

ہے ، میرا سوال ہے میں محرک ہوں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، نہیں اشرف جہانگیر قاضی جو ہیں وہ قاضی عیسیٰ کے بھتیجے ہیں آپ

کیسے کہہ سکتے ہیں کہ نہیں ہیں۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، وہ ایک ہے یہ چار بتا رہے ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، ایک تو مان گئے ناں۔ اچھا گل صنیف کہاں کے ہیں۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، ہاں۔

جناب چیئرمین ، اور غاور پیرزادہ ' I do not know دو تو مان گئے ہیں جمالی صاحب

تو بلوچی ہیں۔

ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی ، یہ تو صحیح ہیں لیکن یہ جو دو دوسرے ہیں یہ پتہ نہیں

کون ہیں۔

+ 4 . Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Food,

Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to refer to the Senate Starred Question No.

+ The Question Hour is being over and the remaining questions and their

answers will be placed on the Table of the House.

75 replied on 23-1-1996 and state:

(a) whether a copy of my report submitted to the Minister concerning my visit to China from November 26 to December 3, 1995, as a Member of the Senate's Delegation, will be placed on the Table of the House; and

(b) the details of the steps taken/to be taken on each recommendation made in the said report?

Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: (a) Its submission is not feasible.

(b) Reply to each of the under mentioned recommendation is as follows:

(1) Acquiring new rice seed from china. --- PARC obtained seed from China and initially evaluated varieties at Kala Shah Kaku and out of that some of the high yielding rice varieties have been indentified and during the current season these have been planted at District Shikarpur, Sindh under Sindh conditions and if found useful these may be commercialized.

(2) Acquiring new rice seedling sowing technology of broadcasting of rice seedlings.

(a) Chinese experts and literature were consulted. In this technology seedlings are grown in bunches in pots. Thereafter these are pulled alongwith soils on roots and then broadcast manually at random or in rows alongwith rope.

(b) This technology was evaluated at NARC and Kala Shah Kaku Research Station. This technology was not found suitable for our agro-climactic conditions.

(3) Acquiring fish varieties from China suitable for high

evaluation areas of Pakistan.-- No exclusive attempt has so far been done to bring exotic fish from China for high evaluation area as it needs through research investigation on suitability of a fish in our high evaluation cultural environments. However, in high evaluation cool water areas of Pakistan. The exotic trout brought from Europe and lately Canada is not only thriving but also performing well both in natural water and cultural environment. PARC has developed suitable low cost feed for trout which is being used in Northern Areas and NWFP Trout farm.

(4) Techniques of Embryo transfer to sheep, and -- The technology has been tested in Pakistan. It has its own side effects. A better technology of Embryo recovery and transfer in sheep has been developed in Pakistan.

(5) whether it is a fact that Government of China has shown interest in acquiring assistance from Pakistan from upgrading buffalo stock in China through Neeli Ravi and Kundi varieties of Pakistan buffaloes, if so, the steps taken to assist China in this regard.-- Government of China shown their interest in upgrading their native buffaloes. Two PARC's scientists visited China and gave training to Chinese Scientists.

Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Food, Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to refer to the Senate Starred Question No. 74 replied on 2-10-1996 and state the steps taken so far, or to be taken by the Government on the twelve proposals mentioned in the reply to the said question?

Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: Proposals of the Members:

1. Revival of the Snow increasing project during winter months in Balochistan.-- Revival of snow increasing Project in Balochistan is not possible under present circumstances due to lack of expertise and resources and the technology has not been practiced on large scale anywhere in the world.

2. Introducing Fruit Grading and better packing.-- Fruit grading and packing is being practiced as per indigenous methods. The grading is done manually and packing is in wooden crates with newspaper lining. Grading rings and mechanical graders were also introduced particularly for Citrus and Apple but are hardly used by farmers, however, these are used for export purpose. Card board packs have replaced wooden packs in many countries, and were also introduced in Pakistan. However, the high price have restricted its use. The Pakistan Packages Ltd. arranged Local manufacture of card board packs and succeeded in ringing down the prices which may encourage its use. It is satisfying to note that for fruit export, card board packs are commonly used and it is increasing day by day. The adoption of technology for local market is slow because the suppliers do not get premium price for improved grading and packing.

3. Sale of goats, sheep and cattle on the basis of live weight on hooves.-- Considerable progress has been made for the sale of Livestock on hooves. Policy paper was prepared and discussed in several meetings. Finally draft has been handed over to provincial livestock secretaries for approval and implementation.

4. Introducing Japanese big sized Loquat fruit in Pakistan.-- Budwood of 5 varieties of Japanese loquat were received through PGRI NARC. Five plants from each variety were side grafted. The grafted plants thus available were war.

Morimoto-2 Ikeda -4, Nojina waso-2, Kusu Noki-5 and Ama Kuse-3 , Limited number of plants are available at NARC for further propagation and testing.

5. Introducing seedless or mini-seed Ellechee fruit in Pakistan.-- Some plants of leading varieties of Litchi i.e. Purbi, Badana, Bombai, Serai and Gola were introduced earlier and are under evaluation. Further efforts are also under way to introduce more germplasm from Thailand, Malaysia and China for widening the Selection base and trials shall be planned in all potential areas. However, presently the private sector is mainly involved in the introduction of Litchi fruit in the country.

6. Promoting Kikar forest growth in Sindh on marginal agricultural lands for providing firewood and kikar mining timber.-- The forest department is basically responsible for promotion of Kikar forest growth in Sindh. PARC's activities are restricted to research on forest growth *Acacia nilotica* (Kikar) was tested together with other local and Australian species under saline conditions in a project implemented through Atomic Energy Agricultural Research Centre, Tandojam with financial assistance from Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research (ACIAR) and found promising for planting on degraded lands. An Australian species *Acacia ampliceps* has also shown good performance on salt affected lands.

7. Introducing suitable fish for raising in agricultural irrigation ponds in high areas of 5000 to 6000 feet above sea-level in Balochistan.-- On the proposal of Honourable Senator, the Directorate of Agriculture and Fisheries Research Institute (AFRI) have conducted a detailed survey of dams in and around Quetta. The salient features of survey are:

- (a) A meeting was held with Senator Saifullah Khan Paracha in

his office at Quetta on 3rd May, 1997, attended by Director General, Arid Zone Research Centre (AZRC) and Director, AFRI. Some dams pointed out by Senator were surveyed for Khagg fish. It was concluded that these ponds could be stocked with grass and silver carps and 150 silver carps were transported by air to Quetta and stocked in Senator's fish ponds.

(b) Hana lake and Spin Karez lakes are under the control of Pakistan army. These Karez could be used to culture silver or grass carps.

(c) During the survey, the reasons of unpalatability and bad smell could not be identified.

(8) *Ascertaining the availability of raising Mahaseer and Rahu fishes in High of 5000 to 6000 feet above sea-level in Balochistan.*-- The Honourable Senator was informed by PARC that the NWFP Government has already started a project to study its biology and to establish a hatchery for the propagation of Mahaseer at Chakdara. It is learnt that the said hatchery has completed. The larvae/fingerlings from Chakdara hatchery would be transferred to Balochistan as and when these become available.

(9) *Introducing high milk yielding goat varieties in high areas of 5000 to 8000 feet above sea level in Balochistan.*-- Comments from the experts were that high yielding alpine goat breeds like Toggenberg and Saanen could not be introduced in Balochistan because:

(i) The alpine goat breeds required high quality green grass/Fodder and feed, not available in many parts of Balochistan.

(ii) The alpine goats suffer from viral encephalitis and Arthritis and there is a danger that this disease could spread to Pakistan with the introduction of alpine goats.

It was proposed to Senator that instead we should improve the milk potential of local goats by cross breeding with Pakistan Dairy goats like Bestal and Dera Din Panah. Coordinator (S&W) put up a feasibility report to Director General, Livestock, Balochistan for implementation. PARC was willing to provide technical inputs.

(10) *Promoting embryo transfer in cattle.* -- PARC has trained 3 veterinarians (2 months duration) from Balochistan for embryo transfer technology in cattle. Livestock department of Government of Balochistan has established Embryo Transfer Lab in Quetta and working on ET in cattle. However, yet this technology is not cost-effective and not likely to be adopted by the farmers in near future.

(11) *Encouraging fruit growers in Pakistan to report unusual fruit varieties found in existing orchards through giving of rewards of large amount.* -- Pakistan is blessed with varied climatic and soil environments. Therefore, a variety of fruits are being produced including, deciduous, evergreen, herbaceous and succulents depending upon the demand and availability of productive varieties. However, there is still potential of introducing many fruit types being grown in various parts of the country for example Kiwi, Yellow Prune, Olives and Nectarines have successfully been introduced and are bearing excellent fruits. The fruit shows are already organized by the provincial and federal agencies where promising varieties are displayed and record maintained.

(12) *Research on the new Chinese technology of broadcasting rice seedlings in fields instead of seedling transplant and finding out the resulting increase in rice yield.* -- New Chinese technology of broadcasting rice seedling was tested in Pakistan but it is not feasible in our environment. However, Chinese rice

transplanters have successfully been demonstrated at four locations in the Punjab. The transplanter is not only helpful in maintaining the plant density per unit area but also saves labour and time for transplanting the crop.

6. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Food, Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to refer to the Senate Starred Question No. 75 replied on 23-1-1996 and state:

- (a) the details of actions taken so far for acquiring the new rice seedling sowing technology of broadcasting of rice seedling from China; and
- (b) whether tests on this technology were carried out under our conditions, if not, its reasons?

Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: (a) Chinese experts and Literature were consulted. In this technology seedlings are grown in bunches in pots. Thereafter these are pulled alongwith soils on roots and then broadcast manually at random or in rows alongwith rope.

(b) This technology was evaluated at NARC and Kala Shah Kaku Research Station. This technology was not found suitable for our agroclimatic conditions due to:-

- (i) Seedling are not up-right when dropped.
- (ii) High cost of seedling management and transportation to field.
- (iii) High seedling mortality in hot dry weather.
- (iv) It is not efficient/labour saving.
- (v) Not convincing for farmers.

7. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Food, Agriculture and Livestock be pleased to state:

(a) the details of modern biotechnology, molecular breeding and genetic engineering being carried out in Pakistan;

(b) the details of modern biotechnology, molecular breeding and genetic engineering carried out so far on Rice, Cotton and Wheat ;

(c) the reasons, in details, not for releasing the Transgenic Plants so far; and

(d) the steps being taken by the Government to bring about Biosafety Rules ?

Mian Abdul Sattar Laleka: (a) Biotechnology research in Pakistan is currently undertaken by a number of research establishments both at the Federal and Provincial level (Annexure- 1). Research work conducted at the institutes is appendix in annexure-II.

(b) The Centre of Excellence for Molecular Biology, Lahore and Nuclear Institute for Biology and genetic engineering, Faisalabad are using biotechnology and genetic engineering techniques for improving the varieties of Rice and Cotton. Details of their research works conducted in the past is as under:-

(i) Rice.-- Transgenic plants of Ouwna native variety Basmati 370 were obtained containing cry IAC gene by bombardment of variation tissue with DMA coated tungsten particles.

-- PCR amplification analysis, southern hybridization, western hybridization and insect bioassays with second instar larvae of rice folder exhibited the presence and expression of pesticidal gene. T 3 generation of the plants have been obtained which are being analysed.

(ii) Cotton -- Transgenic plants of Gossypium hirsutum variety

MNII-93 were obtained containing cry JAB gene by Agrobacterium mediated transformation method.

-- Transgenic plants showed toxicity to third instarlarva of *Belioverpa armigera*.

-- T2 generation of transgenic plant has been obtained which is being analysed.

(c) Earlier there was no biosafety rules, therefore, it was not possible to reduce the transgenic plants, now the committee for biosafety rules has been set up. This will help in future in research.

(d) Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development. Government of Pakistan has constituted a national committee on biosafety.

Two meetings have already been convened to present recommendations of the Government to consolidate its view point on the draft protocol to be presented in August this year at Toronto, Canada.

(Annexures have been placed in the Senate Library).

8. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Foreign Affairs be pleased to refer to the replies given in the Senate on 27-6-1997 to my starred question No. 36 and be pleased to state:

(a) the details of the meetings held after 18-1-1996 of the Houbara Bustard Cell;

(b) the steps taken by the Government for implementation of the recommendations made by the Cell so far, and

(c) the details of the requests so far made by the Government of Pakistan to Saudi Arabia and Gulf countries, regarding the conservation and

propagation of this bird ?

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: (a) The Houbara Bustard Cell of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, since its creation, have met only twice, that is on 31-8-1995 and 18-1-1996. Unfortunately, no further meeting could be held. However, a meeting of the National Council for Conservation of Wildlife was held under the Chairmanship Makhdoom Syed Ahmed Mahmood, Minister of State for Environment, Local Government and Rural Development on 26-3-1998. Amongvarious subject, netting/export of falcons, conservation of Houbara Bustard were also discussed and following decisions were taken:

(i) The council decided that uniform fee of Rs. 20,000.00 per falcon may be imposed as export fee by all the provinces.

(ii) The export of falcons should be limited to 250 as approved by the Cabinet.

(iii) Use of raptors as live decoys for netting of falcons should be completely banned.

(iv) Selected winter habitats of falcon may be declared out of bound for netting.

(v) Informal dialogue may be initiated with the Ambassadors of Gulf States through the Foreign Office to stream-line the procedure.

(vi) Cities permit fee for falcons increased to Rs. 4000 per bird.

(vii) The dignitaries who come to Pakistan for hunting may be requested to invest for improvement of habitats of endangered species including welfare of local communities.

(b) Recommendations of Houbara Bustard Cell are being implemented in latter and spirit. These have been explained in our answer of

Question No. 105 and 24.

The measures are repeated here for the convenience of the House:--

(i) The permits are issued to very few selected dignitaries from very close and friendly countries/states after through consideration the highest possible level in the country.

(ii) The duration of hunting is restricted to only ten days in a year.

(iii) Indiscriminate hunting by fire arms is not allowed. It is only permitted by use of falcons.

(iv) Poaching is strictly forbidden.

(v) The permission is given only for selected few areas which are notified to local administration so as to ensure no transgression.

(c) Dignitaries who come for hunting are always willing to help the Government of Pakistan in its efforts in terms of development/improvement of local infrastructure/utility services, establishment or enhancement of local facilities, including sanctuaries and hatcheries, etc.

HH Sheikh Zayed Bin Sultan Al-Nahyan is planning to develop a sanctuary/breeding Centre in District Rahim Yar Khan and the funds for the same will also be provided by the dignitary.

Similarly, details of welfare projects in Balochistan being run by the Saudi Arabian Government is enclosed at Annexure-A. Rest of the dignitaries have also been requested to inform the Ministry in regard to contributions made by the respective dignitaries concerned. Replies are awaited.

Annexure-A

DETAILS OF WELFARE PROJECTS IN BALOCHISTAN

DETAILS OF WELFARE PROJECTS IN BALOCHISTAN

1.	Construction of a Mosque and School at Dalbadin in the year 1985.	Rs. 4,000,000
2.	Construction of Water Tank and Water Pump for the above project.	Rs. 866,000
3.	Furniture for the above mentioned School.	Rs. 400,000
4.	Monthly expenses/Salaries of the Staff.	Rs. 160,00
5.	Development of Dalbadin Airport in 1986	Rs. 143,675,112
6.	Miscellaneous works in Jamia Dalbadin in 1996-97: (a) School Block. (b) Repair and Renovation in School and Mosque. (c) Conversion of Toilets Block in Rest House.	Rs. 7,000,000
7.	Tubewell, Pump Room Turbine, Overhead Tank at Dalbadin Institution.	Rs. 4,950,000
8.	Construction Mosques for 150 persons and allied buildings at following areas completed in 1997. (a) Naukundi (b) Naushtar (c) Yakmuch	Rs. 10,000,000
	Total:	Rs. 171,051,112

Mr. Chairman: End of Question Hour. Leave Application:

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

جناب چیئرمین، مس فضلہ جو نیو ملک سے باہر جا رہی ہیں اس لئے انہوں نے حالیہ مکمل

اجلاس کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے، منظور ہے۔ جی۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب چیئرمین، جناب محمد اجمل خٹک صاحب ذاتی مصروفیات کی بنا پر یکم اکتوبر کو اجلاس میں شرکت نہیں کر سکے اس لئے انہوں نے اس تاریخ کی ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ منظور ہے۔ جی۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب چیئرمین، جناب شاہ نواز جونجو صاحب نے ذاتی مصروفیات کی بنا پر مورخہ 5 تا 7 اکتوبر کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ منظور ہے۔ جی۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب چیئرمین، قاضی محمد انور صاحب ذاتی مصروفیات کی بنا پر 5 اکتوبر کو اجلاس میں شرکت نہیں کر سکے اس لئے انہوں نے اس تاریخ کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا آپ ان کی رخصت منظور فرماتے ہیں۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب چیئرمین، جناب مظاہر حسین صاحب نے اطلاع دی ہے کہ وہ اسلام آباد سے باہر ہونے کی وجہ سے آج اجلاس میں شرکت نہیں کر سکیں گے۔ جی رضا ربانی صاحب۔

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, I am on a point of privilege and I would like to seek your permission under the proviso to Rule 61 which says that a member wishing to raise the question of privilege shall give notice in writing to the Secretary before the commencement of the sitting on the day the question is proposed to be raised. If the question raised is based on a document, the notice shall be accompanied by the document or a copy indicating the specific breach of privilege of the member or the House or its Committee.

Mr. Chairman: What is the matter?

Mian Raza Rabbani: Now I am coming to the proviso sir which says:

"Provided that the Chairman may, if he is satisfied about the urgency of the matter, allow a question of privilege to be raised at any time during the course of the sitting after the disposal of questions.

Mr. Chairman: What is the matter?

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, this is a very serious matter and it pertains to the functioning and powers of the Senate of Pakistan and it stems and flows from a statement given by the honourable Minister for Parliamentary Affairs which was published in the daily "News" of 24-9-98. This privilege motion sir, if you allow me I will read it out. It says:

"That a breach of privilege of the members of the Senate and the contempt of the Senate of Pakistan has been committed by the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs in his statement published in the national press, particularly in the daily "The NEWS", Islamabad dated 24th September, 1998 attached as Annexure 'A'. The breach of privilege has been committed as the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs has prevented, hindered the members of the Senate from the performance of their duties and responsibilities in the House. Further he has cast shadows on the dignity and independence of the Senate of Pakistan. This statement amongst other acts of the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs amounts to obstruct or impede the members of the Senate in the discharge of their duties and functions. The said statement and the action directly or indirectly obstructs or impedes the House and its members from the performance of their functions and results in bringing the Senate to ridicule by

bypassing its authority. Therefore, on consideration amongst others of the aforesaid facts, this privilege motion may be taken into consideration. Now, sir, this privilege motion has been signed by 11 honourable Senators and these honourable Senators belong to the combined Opposition i.e. ANP, BNM (Hayee group), BNP and the PPP. In this statement that has been issued by the Minister to which till date there is no contradiction whatsoever, of its being published in the Press, he has spoken about bypassing the Senate and taking a number of bills and in particular the Ehtesab Bill to a joint sitting of Parliament...

**Mr. Chairman:** I think, if you give a proper motion, we can consider it. It is not a matter that can be disposed of just in one sitting. It requires arguments and I don't think it is that urgent that I should take it up today. So, if you file a motion in the Secretariat, we will take it.....

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Right sir, I will file it just now.

**Mr. Chairman:** Now next item.

آپ بھوڑیں، آج important چیزیں آرہی ہیں، کل وقت نہیں رہے گا یہ پھر لے لیں گے۔

Now before we take up other matters, there are two matters i.e. Item No. 3 regarding foreign policy, Item No. 4 regarding the address of the President. I think, they have now sort of being overtaken by other events. So if both sides agree, we can dispose of these matters and clear the agenda.

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Item No. 4, there has to be a vote of thanks.

There is an amendment which is pending.

جناب چیئر مین۔ تو کر دیں۔ یہ ایسے ہی چھ مہینے سے پڑا ہوا ہے۔

میاں رضا ربانی۔ جناب اس کو اس debate کے بعد لے لیں۔ جو vote of thanks....

Mr. Chairman: You show grace and withdraw amendment.

میاں رضا ربانی۔ نہیں جناب! amendment withdraw نہیں ہو سکتی۔ جناب! تین اور چار کو کل کے لئے رکھ لیں۔

(مداخلت)

جناب چیئرمین۔ I know but جو issues آپ لانا چاہ رہے ہیں وہ already discuss ہو چکے ہیں 'Foreign Policy' ہو رہی ہے۔

میاں رضا ربانی۔ جناب اس کو یوں کر سکتے ہیں کہ Friday کو رکھ لیں۔

(مداخلت)

جناب چیئرمین۔ نہیں، نہیں وہ ٹھیک ہے لیکن یہ ہے کہ چھ مہینے سے ایک معاملہ چل رہا ہے اور ایسے ہی اجنڈا flop ہو رہا ہے۔

میاں رضا ربانی۔ جناب اس کو Friday پر رکھ لیں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ کیوں جی اعتراض صاحب۔ I am also told that your amendment

has not been received in this session پچھلے سیشن میں آئی تھی تو there is no

amendment, technicality کی بات ہو رہی ہے۔ What I am saying اس کو عرصہ ہو گیا ہے، اس کو ختم کریں۔

چوہدری اعتراض احسن۔ جناب half day ہو گا Friday کو۔ We will dispose of.

کوئی تھوڑی سی بات کرنا چاہے گا تو وہ بھی کر لیں گے۔

ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی بلوچ۔ جناب چیئرمین صاحب! ہمیں تو خارجہ پالیسی پر موقعہ بھی نہیں ملا۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ ابھی موقعہ نہیں ملا۔

ڈاکٹر عبدالحئی بلوچ۔ نہیں جی۔

چوہدری اعتراض احسن۔ جناب جی صاحب کو Friday کو خارجہ پالیسی پر وقت دے دیں۔

Mr. Chairman: O.K. We will look into it on Friday. Next item is the

adjournment motion

کیسے کرنا ہے، کیا طریقہ کار ہو گا، راجہ صاحب۔

راجہ محمد ظفر الحق۔ جناب Suspension of rules کر دیں پھر اس کے بعد شروع کریں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ جی۔

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, I beg to move under Rule 236 of the Rules of Procedure and .....

جناب چیئرمین۔ کس چیز پر rules suspend کر رہے ہیں۔

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, rules are there.

Mr. Chairman: When they are not objecting it. Nobody is objecting to it.

وہ کہتے ہیں کہ ہم object نہیں کریں گے۔ میں بھی object نہیں کر رہا۔ جب وہ نہیں کر رہے تو۔۔۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب چیئرمین! میں استدعا کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔

جناب چیئرمین۔ ہاں جی فرمائیے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ زیادہ مناسب یہ ہے کہ ہم اعتراض نہیں کرتے اور rules suspend کر دیئے جائیں بجائے اس بات کے کہ ہم rules کو ان کے against by consensus move کرتے ہیں۔ وہ motion move کر دیں، ہم اس کو object نہیں کرتے، suspend ہو جائے تاکہ rules کے مطابق ہی سارا سلسلہ چلے۔

Mr. Chairman: O.K. If that is your desire, it's all right. Move please.

Mian Raza Rabbani: I beg to move under Rule 236 of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Senate, 1988 that the requirement of Rules 75,77 of the said rules be dispensed with in regard to the Adjournment



کچھ لکھا ہوا ہے۔ ناصح کو کچھ کہہ بھی نہیں سکتے، خیر مقدم بھی کرتے ہیں اس بات کو مزید میں بڑھانا نہیں چاہتا کیونکہ آج دوسرے موضوع پر گزارشات کرنی ہیں لیکن امید تھی کہ کچھ یہ فرماتے۔ کہ وہ حضرت ناصح

گراویں دیدہ و دل فرش راہ

کوئی مجھ کو یہ تو سمجھا دو کہ سمجھاویں گے کیا

آج اگر لائسنس صاحب 63-G کا کوئی حوالہ دے رہے ہوتے تو میں یقیناً ان کی کچھ قدر کرتا لیکن جو بات اب ان کے بس میں نہیں ہے اس پر مزید کیا بات کرنی اس لئے میں گزارشات "آبزور" کی سنوری سے متعلق اور وزیر اعظم کے اوپر جو الزامات ہیں کرپشن کے ان کے بارے میں اپنی باتیں کروں گا جناب چیئرمین۔

I have at this moment the 'Observer' of London, dated 27th September, 1998. It flashes a story boldly "Pakistan's Prime Minister probed over secret fortune" Inside there is a full display with photographs on the explosive police report that is threatening to undermine Pakistan's embattled Prime Minister. And there is also a photograph of a luxury vehicle, an expensive luxury vehicle standing at the door step of the Prime Minister's residence. Is it Pakistan? Is it Raiwind? Is it Islamabad? Is it Lahore, Model town? No, Mr. Chairman, it is London, Park Lane Mayfair. It is quite amazing. It shocks one right away. But Mr. Chairman both these stories apparently emanate from, according to the government, an absconder, they wish to damn the source on the ground that he is allegedly an absconder from the law. They want to condemn him and what he says on the ground that he is not a trustworthy source because he tries to escape and avoids the law; not that Mr. Prime Minister is averse to meeting absconders, one sees his photographs whenever he visits London, meeting a gentleman whom his own government in 1992 and whom today the courts are declaring as an absconder, so surely, there is no weight in that argument. But

Rehman Malik's letter to the President and alas! the President did not care even, it seems, to read it, did not care even to look into it. The constitutional head of this state allowed these serious, grave allegations of corruption at the highest level to go un-noticed by him. A short statement was issued by the Presidency and by the President that somebody had thrown this report inside the window of the Presidency. I would like to see a person who can get as close to the Presidency as to be able to throw a feather what to say a packet, inside the Presidency and run away. It is not an ordinary man's house Mr. Chairman. What are they trying to tell us, what is the President trying to tell us, they make just a joke of this. They want to make a joke of it by saying he is an obsconder. The President says, I didn't take notice of it because somebody came and threw it inside my window. He is not living, he is not living, alas ! in a house in G-10 or F-10 or even F-6/3. He is living in the Presidency and you can't go close enough to the Presidency to be able to throw a cricket ball at the guards outside the gates. So, there is necessarily an attempt Mr. Chairman, to avoid this report. What was this report about, the letter that is the basis of the story in "the Observer" has been circulated and it points at enormous corruption by the Prime Minister. It points at money laundering. It points at owning, possessing, purchasing properties outside the country which the Prime Minister alas! has not declared and it speaks about an enormous agrandisement and increase in the wealth of one family, more justly or unjustly infact, but more appropriately known as the Sharif family. It mentions how the fortunes of the family have multiplied not merely in geometric terms but beyond the means of any calculus or any computer. How they have multiplied in the last 15 years when Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif has had the good fortune of rising and rising and

rising, politically taking a dip once, but rising again and his fortunes have continued to rise with him. How does the government respond to the story in "the Observer". The Observer has said that he has certain properties and there were corruption allegations. Mr. Hussain Nawaz Sharif, the son of the Prime Minister, responded, as probably he should, he is a young man, that he would sue the 'Observer'. The Prime Minister himself responded on the 1st of October, two days after his son had threatened to sue the 'Observer', the Prime Minister said that there is no need to sue the 'Observer' because 'Observer', by publishing this spurious story has lost all credibility. It stounds me, how publishing a story against a corrupt man is going to deny 'Observer' its credibility.

Today comes up a third great man and that is the spokesman of the Ittefaq Group, Mr. Haroon Pasha. He says, "I am flying to London and if the 'Observer' does not contradict the story, we will sue them". Normally, people ask for an apology, Mr. Chairman. A contradictory story, a story contradicts the first story can always be published. But what you seek is abject, unqualified apology. Any lawyer will tell you that nothing short of abject unqualified apology burges a defamation. Nothing short of that. But they have found middle ground, because they obviously want to negotiate. They obviously know that there are many skeletons in their cupboard and Mr. Chairman, take another contradiction. There was a letter published, attributed to a lady Miss Samina Pervaiz, to address to a gentleman called Guy Black, who was the Director of the Press Complaints Commission in London. Pakistani newspaper carried that letter written by Miss Samina Pervaiz from the High Commission in London on 30th September, 1998. It was given out that this letter has been sent.

On the next day, the Information Minister, Mr. Mushahid Hussain

stated and this was reported in the "DAWN" of 1st of October, 1998 that no letter has yet been sent, it would be sent. The Government would be writing to the Press Commission. This is not all, Mr. Chairman. The Information Minister has said that no report had been received by the President, the Information Minister says so in this report, in the "DAWN", this is on the 1st of October. But on the 29th of September, the Law Minister has admitted that Rehman had written a letter to the President, we will go through the material and analyse it and they would let the press know the reality. The President thought otherwise of course. They say one thing but assuming that the President acts on the advice of the Prime Minister as per the Constitution. The President is advised otherwise, quite contrary to the position that they take in the press. The contradictions continue to above, they continue, there are so many holes in their dress that their nakedness comes straight out of it. The Emperor wears no clothes, Mr. Chairman. His Ministers, his Advisors have torn every shred of cloth on his body. When it comes to Parklane, look at the contradiction. First day, the Government spokesman says, the Prime Minister owns nothing on Park Lane. Enters Mr. Khalid Anwar and Khawaja Asif, same press conference, they say, he owns one flat on Leasehold. I will come to the Leasehold aspect. They want to get out of it by saying its on lease. But they say one flat on Lease. Well, something is admitted. Same day, thanks God, for the young man, Mr. Hussain Nawaz, same day says that the Prime Minister obtained two flats in Park Lane London.

So from one we graduated two and this is the family's flat. The young man would know because the young man was shown in the world press, particularly the national press, as having received his father outside the

Park-lane property and there can be no denials, now, when on the 10th of September the press reported and captioned this photograph, Hussain Nawaz greets his father, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif outside the family's flat in London, and Mr. Chairman, the ownership of the flat is established. The only thing is they did not deny it. They snigger but Mr. Khalid Anwar knows well and he is pleading and the Supreme Court held that and I give you the reference PLD-1998, Supreme Court, page 388, Mr. Shaikh Rashid, the Supreme Court of Pakistan held that if a story or an allegation or an attribution is made in the National Press and it is not denied, and this was not denied Mr. Chairman, and it is not denied then it is deemed to have been admitted and it is a fact on which action can be taken. Sauce for the goose must be sauce for the gander. You can not say that there is one law for Benazir Bhutto and a different law for Nawaz Sharif, never will the Supreme Court of Paksitan say so. You may go to the Supreme Court and argue one thing in 1993 and quite the contrary in 1996 but that is a matter of a very personal conscience. I will not go into it, no more farther. I know it hits the point but Mr. Chairman, it was denied. What is the implication? This is the verdict of the Supreme Court and the worthy and honourable Law Minister knows that judgement because he was Counsel in that case.

Now you may say the press can write whatever, the press could write whatever about Benazir Bhutto also then you did not object when I was saying this is not legally admissible evidence then you said, no, let the press write and if you do not contradict, you are damned.

پکڑے جاتے ہیں فرشتوں کے لکھے پر ناحق  
آدمی کوئی ہمارا دم تحریر بھی تھا

it will apply to both.

Now comes Mr. Haroon Pasha, the crowning 'Lahorie', he comes in, he walks into this, that is the most amazing thing. His statement today and I will be dealing with his statement at some length later but the Law Minister says in his press conference, jointly held with Khwaja Asif and if Khwaja said it and he did not contradict it, it is absolute about to the honourable Law Minister, he says, one flat. I will come to the lease hold bill. The son says two flats. Mr. Pasha of course, has to take the cake because he certainly goes back on it completely and says no, no, the Prime Minister has no flat but why. Mr. Chairman, why Mr. Pasha used the word to believe that Mian Nawaz Sharif has no apartment on Parklane in the Mayfair district of London opposite the high path close to the Haston Hotel, look at the value of the property, close to the Darchester in the same building where the most prestigious Mercedes Benz and of course, the honourable Prime Minister has a proclivity for Mercedes, you know that. Everybody knows his great preference for that vehicle. The Mercedes Show Room directly above that, he has four apartments, the numbers have been given. They say, Rehman Malik is lying, if Rehman is lying or is Hussain Nawaz lying or is the Law Minister lying or is Haroon Pasha lying or are the Income Tax Returns and the nomination papers filed by the Prime Minister in NA-12 on the 21st of December, 1996, lying? Where is the truth and where is the lie Mr. Chairman? The truth is that the Prime Minister, I will not use for him, the word "lie", it has misrepresented, that is the soft, more parliamentary word for saying, what I really mean.

Mr. Chairman, the defence is that he does not own this property. It is on lease. Mr. Chairman, you know, every house in cantonment in Lahore is on lease. That is not owned, every house, every building almost in central London,

and when we were doing law there, you will recall, when we did property law, that was the first thing professors would tell us about lease holds, when they were talking of lease holds, how lease holds are property. Any interest in property is property, is ownership. Lease does not halt them. Surely the honourable Law Minister also knows and the House may like to know, what does our Constitution say about property. If you think, if the House thinks, if my honourable colleagues think for a moment, that in the eyes of law and the Constitution, the word "property" will not include a leased building or a rented building, let them be somewhat informed about the definition of the word "property" incidently carried in the Constitution in Article 260. According to the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, "property" includes any right, title or interest in property, movable or immovable and any means and instruments of production, any title or interest in property, movable or immovable, Article 260 Mr. Chairman. That is not all, even before the 1973 Constitution or any other constitution had really adverted to this issue, I am sure it is well known.

The famous case Mr. Chairman, of Ali Bhaai, Abdullah Bhaai, PLD 1964, Supreme Court, page 106, the judgement of that great Civil Lawyer and Jurist and Judge, Justice B.Z. Kekaos sitting with equally great Judges Karnelious and Hamood-ur-Rehman defined lease as property.

Mr. Chairman, are we to be fooled by this that it is a lease, it is not ownership? Are Pakistanis to be told that every plot, every building, every house around this area, in the area of central London is on lease and leases are sold, leases are transferred, leases are registered, leases are property. But then Mr. Chairman, on the 21st of December, 1996, alas! the Prime Minister filed

nomination forms in the elections to the NA-12 constituency, Prime Minister himself in person signed it, verifies this on oath, a very interesting document, a very interesting document indeed, he swore that everything said in it was correct. He swore that I, my spouse or dependent children or dependent parents or a business concerned mainly owned by the aforesaid have not made any default in payment of taxes for over six months. I will come to that and kindly see, this is a very interesting document. At page 3, it is the Prime Minister's taxes, assessment year-1994-1995, this is signed by him.

The richest man, atleast in Parliament, may be in Pakistan, may be in Asia, when units declared, I will come to his wealth, is it declared elsewhere in this form, it is an amazing form. I am sure this can be studied in the classes of Political Science. A new thing, this will have to be a subject to be introduced, how to make all that money and not pay taxes, in classes of Commerce in the Commerce Colleges, in classes of Finance, in classes on Political Science. It is an amazing document. Now, he has enormous wealth to which I will come. Where also he conceived to which I will come but 1994 to 95 assessment year, Income Tax paid nil. 1995-96 assessment year, Income Tax paid 477/- rupees. 1996-97, please, I beg of you, Senators sitting on that side, for God's sake, this is the thing, after all you are being led by this gentleman, 1996-97, I am reading from a document signed by Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif, of whose wealth you are well aware, I am sure, it needs no introduction, 1996-97, Income Tax paid nil and this relates, mind you, Mr. Chairman, to the financial year 1995 to 1996, so at that time he can not say, I was Prime Minister, I was not taking any salary. How was he living? How was he supporting himself? Who was paying for his food? Who was paying for the petrol in the cars he was going on, who was paying for the

petrol in the helicopter that he hired, the enormous wealth, the palaces that he has. There is obviously an enormous attempt to deceive this nation, this country, this House, this Parliament.

When turn over, Mr. Chairman, he claims to have paid some wealth tax. That is a double deception. If you declare income and your income tax was at that time 45%. If you pay wealth tax, it is two and a half percent. So, by transferring the whole thing into the wealth tax sector, you bring your tax down completely and you say, I pay tax. I am talking of income tax. income tax, income tax. The wealth he has and here also there is deception, I have the statement filed by Haroon Pasha. Today, Haroon Pasha lists 17 properties, in the nomination papers there are 8 properties. Has he been acquiring his properties during the last one year as Prime Minister? I am quite certain not because he vowed he would not acquire any more property, what he has acquired again I will come to that. But I assume that he was telling the truth that he will not acquire any more property or do any further business while he is Prime Minister. 17 properties, told Haroon Pasha today and 8 properties listed in his nomination papers. Is he not fit for disqualification on the basis of his nomination papers?

The wealth, the assets that he gave are a little shade more truth, a shade closer to what must be reality Mr. Chairman, but there too, I think he puts Mr. Pasha in a great limbo. Then Mr. Pasha who says I can be held for contempt and I can be bludgeoned and...

جناب چیئر مین - Interfere نہ کریں - I am expecting آج اور کل جب بھی بات ہو

تو ایک دوسرے کی بات میں interference نہیں ہونی چاہیئے۔

Ch. Aitzaz Ahsan: Mr. Chairamn, when he comes to giving his

share holdings, he has shareholdings, now this is the gentleman who does not pay a penny in Income Tax, has shareholdings in one spinning mill, kindly note this, it is amazing. One spinning mill, 5 textile mills

جس گھر کے پاس ایک ٹیکسٹائل مل ہو۔ اگر وہ ٹھیک چلائیں۔ لوٹا ہوا مال نہ سمجھیں۔ چیز میں صاحب ان کی دس پشتوں کی آسے قسمیں بن جاتی ہیں۔

Five textile mills, 3 sugar mills, bigger giants in the textile mills. Then Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif in his own statement, 2 steel mills including the big mother of all steel mills, the Ittefaq Foundary. One paper mill, one engineering mill, and the income tax he pays Rs.477/- and nil and nil. And Mr. Chairman, that is why Pahsa is forced. He is a clever man. He denies after knowing, he is in the knowledge, he knew

وہ گھر کا بھیدی ہے۔ وہ جانتا ہے کہ ٹیکس میں کیا کچھ لکھا ہوا ہے۔ Return کیا ہیں۔ وہ چھپا رہا ہے لیکن لائسنس صاحب اور جو ہمارے برخوردار حسین نواز شریف صاحب ہیں، کچھ ان میں توڑی سی بات توڑی سی سچائی foot hold وہاں لگادی، بھاپ سے فیئر کی پراپرٹی پر لگادی۔

opposite the most expensive proeprty in London.

Mr. Chairman, God has been kind to me. I have no Mercedese cars, I have no helicopter, I have no textile mill, I have no spinning mill, I have no shares in any steel mill, I have no share in any industrial units. I don't have anything of that kind. Earlier I thought because when one side thought they pay something like 3,000 or 4,000 in income tax and I calculated that I pay so many times but I don't know. I think, well zero you can multiply with anything, infinity. but even if we take 477 rupees as tax, I pay something like 3000 per cent, 3000 times not per cent. 3000 per cent is 30 times but 3000 tiems the tax the Prime Minister pays. I may be a simpleton for paying so much tax. But either I am a

simpleton which I might well be or the Prime Minister is a tax dodger, we must decide that.

Mr. Chairman, then there is another undenied story and I go back to that

I hope the press, don't mind that Ghalib's پکڑے جاتے ہیں فرشتوں کے کلمے یہ ناسخ فرشتے attribution and my attribution to

but this is the "Time" Magazine. Time Magazine was displayed when it gave a story against Benazir Bhutto. Not only that but that story was given about Mohtarma. I travelled and I wrote to the MD, PIA. I travelled on PIA on the 18th of June and they had stock of "Time" of the 18th May still going, giving it to every passenger to read. PIA had spend so much because they believe in the authenticity of Times Magazine. Well this is the Times Magazine of 3rd of August, Sharif and his relatives owe an estimated \$ 216 million in unpaid bank loans. Then Sharif family owes dollars 25 millions in bad taxes. Still top government officials were informed early about the impending freeze of foreign currency account and according to the Finance Ministry more than 200 million dollars were transferred out of the country just before the Pakistani blasts. It did not help Sharif's credibility that even after his austerity drive began. His own son Hussain persisted in his habitual demand that he be presented with fresh cut flowers and fresh french mineral water, whenever he flies in Pakistan International Airlines. I had thought that only, I believed that only the Prime Minister, the father has grandeur of greatness and Majesty, dillusion of grandeurs of greatness of Majesty, that is what I have thought, untill I read this. I have thought that the Prime Minister of Pakistan Mian Nawaz Sharif who had brought in to introduce the "Shahenshahiat Bill" calling it the Shariat Bill, but "Shahenshahiat Bill" who wanted to be the "Shahenshah" in the name of the

Shariat, was alone in his family with his own dillusion. But they apparently are heritable. Sir Rehman Malik's report as I said deals with the multiplication of the Sharif family from Rupees 35 crore in 1983 to more than Rupees one thousand crores today. Is there any other industrialist. I ask industrialists sitting on the treasury benches. Have you been able to make, has anybody been able to make this fortune multiply like this. He owes according to the report 40 crores in taxes. He has been dealing personally in illegal "hawalas" of the Sharif family remitting US dollars 758 thousand during one year loan. And he has funnelled obviously foreign currency all this time And how does the Prime Minister respond that is very interesting. That is also a telling

thing. Avery telling thing وہ محاورہ ہے جناب 'داڑھی والا اور تنکے والا' میں پورا نہیں بولتا، وہ میرے بھی وزیر اعظم ہیں۔ اور سمجھ گئے ہوں گے۔ داڑھی اور تنکے والا محاورہ London Observer says yesterday, the observer put the allegations to Sharif, as he left his Mayfair flat. He should has said that this is wrong, false and go to sue you if you published that.

جھوٹ ہے This does not belongs to me. It belongs to my friend ہے بارون پاشا نے دوست کا بنا دیا۔ غالباً سعید فتح کا، جس کا بھی ہو اس کا بنا دیا۔ Friend, یہ کونسا friend ہے، کیا ہے لیز اس کی؟ کہاں ہیں وہ documents غلط ہے۔ یعنی اب وہ ختم ہو گیا۔ وہ off shore company بھی ختم ہو گئی ہے۔ اب دوست تو سامنے آئے گا۔ یہ تو آپ نے تسلیم کیا Yesterday the 'Observer' put the allegations to Sharif as he left his Mayfair flat. He declined to comment, he did not deny, he did not deny and demanded "Where is Mr. Malik?"

Did you know him"? یہ کوئی سوال ہے یا کوئی جواب تھے۔ یہ داڑھی میں تنکا۔ ایک دم you know where is... بتاؤ، ابھی۔ اور صدر صاحب بھی کہتے ہیں کہ وہ حاضر ہو جائے، حاضر ہو گیا تو اس کو آپ کہاں بھیجیں گے۔ وہ کیوں حاضر ہو۔ یہ سب کو معلوم ہے۔ کسی نے کسی خاتون سے پوچھا کہ آپ کا نام کیا ہے۔ اس نے جواب دیا کہ میرا نام بھولی ہے۔ اس نے کہا کہ پھر میرے ساتھ چلیں۔ اس نے کہا کہ اتنی بھی بھولی نہیں ہوں۔ رحمن ملک اب اتنا بھی بھولا نہیں کہ صدر صاحب کے trap میں آجائے گا۔

Now there are other scams. This is a government, Mr. Chairman, of the corrupt, by the corrupt, for the corrupt. Look at how they operate? Soon after they take over on the 17th of February last year, Mr. Nawaz Sharif was at it, minting money, eating away from the vitals of the Federation of Pakistan. But immediately on the 11th of April, SRO No. 274(I)/97 was issued. Customs duty on what, on the flat rolls products, iron and non alloy steel of all gauges and widths was reduced from 45% to 25%. In the mean time imports were arranged for their mills, bills of entry were filed on the 24th of May, on the 28th of May, SRO No. 386(I)/97 was issued, customs duty was raised back to 45%. A window was created to make what is estimated to be about 350 crores amount on their imports, that their sales were 350 crores, the loss to the treasury of Pakistan was 350 crores and the Sharif family was richer in three or four weeks by 350 crores. More recently, you know the case of the cars. On the 28th of May, there was the atomic blast. It was welcomed by the people generally and people were prepared to tighten their belts. Then comes the 13th of June when the honourable Finance Minister gives his budget, everybody's belt is being tightened, let belts be tightened. Nobody's belt was tightened. They reduced duties on luxury cars. This was after the blast. Six weeks later they increased the duty on luxury cars saying because there have been a blast, because there have been a nuclear explosion and government was going to face sanctions, hence, it was necessary to increase the duty. And what has happened in the mean time, it is an open secret. The vehicles that were off-loaded, they came in different names but the makes take the foot prints to two or three, in fact, basically one colleague and business partner of the Prime Minister. And they started immediately after the 17th of February, within a few days, Mr. Chairman, they had cancelled the Lahore Airport Terminal contract and they have given the Lahore

Airport Terminal contract. What was the need? The need was the Sharif need that ..... They started immediately manipulation of banks. Their own men were appointed. Then they started immediately. This is in May. In May Hudebia Engineering and Ramzan Sugar Mills, both mentioned as their properties, not by Haroon Pasha but by the Prime Minister in his own nomination form and I assume tax return. Both had arranged for compromises with the Habib Bank and the Bankers Equity Limited. Both have done that. No other account holder, no other loanee, no other person who had obtained the loan from any public sector bank in this country has received that facility, none other, none other, not the big guys who are the friends of Mian Nawaz Sharif, not the "Sahgals" not the "Monnos", nobody. But Hudabia and Ramzan Sugar Mills were the blue eyed babies of the banks. They were only thinking about themselves and the family with a capitalist. By July that year the wheat scandal, where wheat contracting had been shifted from Pakistan to Washington, had broken out. Many names were involved in that. Again before the end of July and this is within 5 months the Prime Minister and his brother, the brother Sharif more like the brothers Karamazone, they were transferring, they had transferred 15 acres of prime land in Murree, to whom, to anybody, to somebody unknown, to somebody by a proper bid or something. How did they transfer that and whom they did transfer it to. Mr. Chairman, they transferred it to a gentleman called Mujeeb-ur-Rehman. The link between Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and the two offshore companies, sorry, this was on the wheat, I just mentioned two offshore companies namely Star Trading and Star Shipping, both belong to Saeed Sheikh the best of the buddies of the Prime Minister. This is the press reporting. There was 'DAWN' reporting how a loss of 563 million to the national exchequer by allotting illegally 15 acres of Murree land at

throw away prices to Messers REDCO, Mujeeb-ur-Rehman was its Director. And all this time the great Raiwind estate is being acquired and is being developed. Every road in Pakistan at least in the Punjab and certainly in the district of Lahore leads to Raiwind, every road. The roads to Raiwind are lit through out the night and they are four lane highways, this motorway shames before the road to Raiwind. Why, because an old gentleman lives there. But what about the fathers of other people, the fathers and the daughters and the sons who wade through the flush and mire, or the children who have to walk through water to go to school. Is Raiwind the whole of Pakistan. Today they say why the people raise this slogan or that slogan. Unfortunately the time Mian Nawaz Sharif remains, those slogans that we oppose will continue to rise. Somebody asked me "Saraikistan", what can I do, there is "Raiwindistan". You make "Raiwindistan", there will be an opposite and equal reaction. He goes nowhere, every Sunday I see him going to Lahore. Is he not the Prime Minister for the rest of Pakistan. Can't he spend a weekend in Sukkur, can't he spend a weekend in Multan, can't he spend a weekend in Peshawar, can't he spend a weekend in Quetta. He runs back to the father that is where the power is. That is the centralization of power and Neuton said, there is an equal and opposite reaction to every action; to every action there is an equal and opposite reaction. The more you take power concentrated in Raiwind, the more the centrifugal forces will take over. That is what is happening today. That is where the federation is being threatened by this man. He has become a threat to the Federation of Pakistan. What has been said today by somebody, I wish they were debating that, but I saw a reaction. People are worried, people are looking towards forces, towards personalities they should not be looking towards. But this is all reaction. People are really down, there were 40 bull-dozers. When there was not a

one for the LDA (Lahore Development Authority), 40 bull-dozers were working there. That *butcher khana*, canal distributory was bricklined, water was stopped when farmers at downstream needed water. The callous manner in which they are doing it. There are six different sources of electricity to that farm.

Now, there are others who are also making *hay*, the great decoity recently taking place. I would not go into it at the moment, but I think a new magazine in Islamabad has highlighted that rather competently, the tribune.

Mr. Chairman, a new book has recently come out. I am going to wind up. But a new book has recently come out. It's called "Who Owns Pakistan?" By a gentleman called "Shahidur Rehman". Now, Mr. Shahidur Rehman comes up with some amazing figures and statistics and they all, I think, are quite authentic. But the pace of the most significant factor, the most significant point in that book is the rise and rise and rise of the House of Ittefaq, not over the last 50 years. Haroon Pasha says, "Our father set up the Ittefaq Group in 1937". Yes, as a furnace, as a small furnace, very good, how nice, he sweated into it, very good, that was a greatness, I will acknowledge that, but where was that house in 1947, where was that house in 1957, where was that house in 1967, where was that house in 1977, who owns Pakistan, there are 50 houses. In every decade, house of Ittefaq is nowhere. Suddenly in 1987, it erupts, it is the second or third biggest house. In 1997, it is the biggest house and the biggest defaulter of nationalized public sector banks and the biggest tax defaulter in the country. Is this money well made, honestly made, properly made.

Last, Mr. Chairman, just a couple of words about Haroon Pasha's statement today because that seems to have come in and, sir, you know, he seems to have spoken the last word on behalf of the house of Ittefaq.

Unfortunately for the House of Ittefaq , let me tell you , the more they speak, the more they talk on this, the more they have statements on it, they will make mess of themselves and will have the more flak on their face. I tell you, this is their own doing because, whoever is trying to say anything on their behalf, trying to make a cover up---. Now, when you try to make a cover up, then you know, the crime tells. It shows, that is a simple principle, anybody who has dealt with any manner or kind of criminals which alas! Mr. Chairman you and I and Lawyers necessarily and Justice Javed Iqbal necessarily have to do and Qazi Anwar Sahib and Raza Sahib and anybody will tell you that it is very difficult to cover up particularly when there are five or six voices. Everybody wants to help the Prime Minister. Everybody is pulling him down by the legs. Everybody wants his name to be registered. No, he does not have a flat, he has only one flat. He has two flats. Oh, his friends have flats. Now this statement which calls Mr. Malik is an absconder says that the Ittefaq Group, now look at the contradiction, I mean, I will second by the fact the number of contradictions, I mean they could at least have got somebody better to write it. Somebody more knowledgeable, somebody more understanding, somebody I am sure the Law Minister would have done a much better job of it, unless he has done it and I will be very disappointed if he has done it. If this can be attributed to him but at one point he says that in the house of Ittefaq there were seven people and it broke into 7 groups. I think the 'Observer' was misled into two brothers or six brothers by the father. Actually the big presence in this whole group over shadow in presence is the father but it says that about the background of the group on 25th of September, 1991, a Memorandum of understanding was signed by the seven constituent families of the Ittefaq Group whereby the assets and liabilities of

the companies were taken over as separately owned companies by respective families. Loans required by the companies in the ordinary course of business thus became the responsibility of new individual owners who proceeded with setting up their own business in accordance with their whims and needs. In a nutshell, the group stood divided into seven different units. The purpose here is obvious, he wants to reduce both the property and the liabilities of the Prime Minister and said this is only the Sharif Group or family, he is not liable for anything because he says that the net worth of the companies that fell to the lot of Nawaz Sharif was only 250 million. Mind you in his statement, he lists much more than that it is about 150 crore but it is upto him and he says that an immediate family members include his parents, two brother and their descendants. This network has been duly accounted for incorporate and personal tax returns. In this it is 150 crore but it is even the parents and the brothers, it is just him, his wife, Mohtarma Kulsum Nawaz Sharif and the children and here they say alright, well, your problem, not mine but later on he says this so-called illegal list has also been placed by me before the Lahore High Court which is currently adjudicating upon the matter of family distribution. This is one statement. Then Mr. Chairman, he says, obviously therefore, because it is subjudice, the matter there is only group and i.e., Ittefaq group. Although they are trying to describe it as the Sharif family and the Sharif group, within the group that has no backing apparently according to his own statement so far unless the law, he admits a charge, a charge No.5, the most significant thing is Pasha admits that rupee loan were leaning on foreign currency accounts. He denies that Suleman Zia had anything to do with it but the other persons named by Rehman, they are admitted, it is admitted and about the persons the Lahore High Court had something very

specific to say with regard to the other persons, this is Raja Afrasiab, Mr. Justice is now in the Supreme Court and this is not matter that Mr. Pasha refers to but he .....

(interruption)

حاجی جاوید اقبال عباسی، جناب آپ نے ایڈروں کے لئے بیس منٹ مقرر کئے ہیں۔

جناب چیئرمین، نہیں، نہیں، پہلے جو دو سیکورٹیز ہیں، اعتراض صاحب اور اس طرف سے جو بھی ہوں گے ان کے لئے ٹائم نہیں ہے۔ بعد میں بیس منٹ اور دس منٹ۔

حاجی جاوید اقبال عباسی، ایک اور request ہے۔ جس طرح ہم نے تحمل مزاجی سے سنا ہے۔ ان کو بھی سنی پڑے گی۔

Mr. Chairman: In fact, I must say, I appreciate this.

کہ سخت باتیں کی ہیں اعتراض احسن صاحب نے۔

Ch. Aitzaz Ahsan: I appreciate that too.

Mr. Chairman: I hope the same spirit will be shown by everybody. If Safdar Abbasi is saying yes, then every body means yes.

(interruption)

Ch. Aitzaz Ahsan: I still appreciate that, because I think, many of those things are due for them and quite stunning for them. After some time another fake Foreign Currency Account Number such and such was opened in Citi Bank Lahore at the name of one Mrs. Sikandar Masood Qazi by depositing dollar bearer certificates amounting to US \$ 0.150 million. In the said account later on DBCs amounting to US \$1 million were also deposited. Now there are the accounts. They were securing facilities and loan guarantee. Now Pasha says, this is very interesting, on this basically, with this I will be concluding, I will just

respond to what he says here and he says that Lahore High Court full bench vindicated the position of the Sharif family and that, all this was declared lawful and legal.

Now there are obviously two judgements of the Lahore High Court on this specific issue. One is reported, the other report, it is referred here in this judgement but apparently the report is not available. It is about certain writ petitions that were filed and decided in favour of the Sharif group. After that, this subsequent, this judgement says so, this is PLD 1998, Lahore, page 90. At page 93 they referred to that earlier judgement but kindly see what these proceedings were? Through these proceedings the petitioner Hudabia Engineering Pvt. Ltd. was seeking the applications of the immunity contained in Section 5 of the Economic Reforms Act, 1992 and the Court ruled that, after having the use of the word "complete" in sub-section 3 of Section 5 of the Act instead bona fide as in Section 9 clearly brings into bold relief, the difference in the extent of protection and between the foreign currency Account and other Banking transactions and they came on a consideration of the various provision, of the protection of Economic Reforms Act, 1992, we have reached the conclusion that so far as Foreign Currency Accounts are concerned, the holders thereof have complete immunity from enquiry and scrutiny and complete secrecy must be maintained in respect of those accounts which can not be violated by any agency or functionary. That being so, neither the Income Tax authorities nor FIA had any jurisdiction to hold any enquiries in respect of the transactions in the foreign currency accounts nor could the same be made basis of criminal prosecution. What does this mean? This judgement does not mean that there is no criminality, what it means is that there is no liability. Kindly see the

difference. It does not mean that there is no criminality. You will understand the difference. Mr. Chairman, it means because of the immunity, there is no liability. The person cannot be prosecuted, there is an immunity. Now, this is what the court has held. If they say and if my learned friend gets up and relies on a previous judgement, this is a later judgement. If that judgement was in their favour, if it was indeed in their favour, what was the purposes of this judgement? Why would they go out and obtain a judgement saying "there is criminality but took as immunity.

کیا تو میں نے ہے پر

you can not prosecute me. This is what the Ittefaq group obtained from the Lahore High Court full bench and this is now that criminality is without the cover today. I have not really looked into it but what should really happen because apparently it would be without the cover today but at the time when the judgement was given, this judgement, the later judgement was on immunity.

Finally, Mr. Chairman, I would like to really seek from the government very categorical statement, a very categorical statement. No this and that. No he or how. No prevarication, no ambiguity, no you know, keeping a proviso, the country wants to know one thing, the country wants to know very clearly, first of all, No. 1, who is right regarding the Parklane properties. Is it the spokesman of the government of first day, the Law Minister, Mr. Hussain Nawaz, Mr. Haroon Pasha or of course, why not Mr. Rehman Malik. They prevaricate so much, he must be right, he must be correct. Then secondly, I want to raise these three or four questions and conclude. Mr. Chairman, first I said who is right on the Parklane properties, the spokesman, the Law Minister, Mr. Hussain Nawaz, Pasha or Mr. Rehman Malik. No. 2 which is correct, Pasha's statement about the

properties and the other aspects covered by it or the income tax statement of the Prime Minister or the nomination form signed by the Prime Minister. Please tell us this is correct, that is false.

I may point out that under Section 80(a) of the Representation of the People Act, 1976, for a false declaration in the nomination forms besides disqualification, there is a punishment of six months imprisonment. And mind you, the Parklane property is not mentioned in the nomination forms. Mr. Khalid Anwar has said, he owns one flat, owns in the sense, he said, lease but lease, I have shown from Supreme Court, in our Constitution is an interest in property which is property. No. 3. I would like to know categorically, does the Government consider a lease hold property in Mayfair as property or not, that particularly if owned by a Pakistani citizen who wherever he may be, wherever he may be, is governed by the laws and the Constitution of Pakistan.

Dr. Muhamamd Safdar Ali Abbasi: Saifur Rehman.

Ch. Aitzaz Ahsan: Saifur Rehman, I have an amazing statement. He says I pay no taxes. He does not live here. He lives here and he pays no taxes

No. 4. One would like to know, Mr. Chairman, in what manner and from which income when he paid no income tax whatsoever, does the Prime Minister or did, now he can say the State supports him, I am not talking of these years, now the State must support him, his telephone calls, his petrol bills, everything but on what income, when he paid no income tax, did the Prime Minister support his family, himself and meet his expenses and from what income did he in those years when he paid no income tax, increase the value of his wealth.

I would also want to know Mr. Chairman, that if it be said that no crime was committed and let them say that but if it be said that no crime was committed then why was such a judgement from a full bench of the Lahore High Court sought which did not, which does not vitiate this judgement criminality, that only gives immunity. Thank you very much.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you Mr. Ahsan. Khalid Anwar Sahib will be Speaker from this side. So, I hope now all of you will have the same patience to listen to him. I will be grateful to the honourable members for listening to Mr. Aitzaz Ahsan with patience.

Mr. Khalid Anwar: I am happy to hear Dr. Safdar Abbasi.

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Safdar Abbasi is a changed-man. He is a mature politician.

Mr. Khalid Anwar: I have always had a good reservation for him.

Sir, I must say right at the inception that whenever my learned friend rises to speak I have a sense of pleasurable anticipation. I think to myself, if it is possible, is it conceivable that for once he will behave gracefully. For once he will behave with dignity. For once he will select the truth and eschew a false and sadly he never lets figure. He never ever lets figure. He began to say by attributing certain statements to me and he said and this was even before he started raving and ranting in a gentle fashion. He said before that, is so and so lying, is so and so lying and is so and so lying. he said:

The Law Minister made a statement that one flat was linked with the Prime Minister. Now the fact of the matter is sir, that on that evening Khawaja Asif and I had a joint press conference. Initially, I addressed the members of

the prsss and then Khawaja Asif replied to the questions. I made no statement about any flat whatsoever, none whatsoever. Now it is possible the honourable senator was present I did not see him, may be hiding behind. He was looking somewhere, lurking somewhere, that he is categorical, he is a dogmatic, I made a statement. The fact is I did not make any statement about any flat whether in relation to ownership, whether in relation to lease hold rights, whether in relation to him. But this, of course has not deterred the honourable Leader of the Opposition. He has made his allegations with usual vows. He has made them wrecklessly, without reference to the facts, without respect for verity, without even a consideration for various civiltude. His performance was completely in line with what we anticipated, what we expected from him. Sir he referred, rightly at the inception, very grandly to a Mercedes car. He forgot. He has a selective memory, he forgot that Mohtarma imported two duty free Mercedes. One Mercedes 500 another Mercedes 600. Mian Nawaz Sharif did not import a single duty free car. He was entitled to import two of them. He did not import a single car. And he went one step further. After taking over as Prime Minister, he stopped this totally. Today neither the President of Pakistan nor the Prime Minister nor the Army Chief nor any one else in the country can import a duty free car. This was just one of the important reforms, introduced by the Prime Minister. Of course the honourable Senator does not know anything about it. All that he can talk about is a photograph. Sir I am going to speak at some length about the "Observer" newspaper because one point struck me very forcefully, that although the reason for this discussion, is that article in the newspaper. But for some mysterious reasons, the honourable Senator talks of every topic under the sun. But that article, he does not read, what the contents of that article are,

he does not referred to. He talks of income tax but again with his customary selectiveness, he forgets to disclose to us what is the income tax paid by Mohtarma. What is the income tax paid by Mr. Zardari. Those are closely guarded secrets within the bosom of the honourable Leader of Opposition. He grandly discloses to us the amount of the income tax, he pays. He boasts about it. He makes glorious statement about it. I could see at a guess that perhaps in one year I have paid more income tax than he has paid in 10 years. But these are minor points, let us not spend time on them. What is important is this sir, what did the "Observer" write? Was it true? Was it false? What does the honourable Senator said. He says a suite should have been filed. He says any lawyer, every lawyer would say that it is not enough to ask for contradiction from the newspaper. He says, what is required is an abject apology. Now these are the exact words used by him. And abject apology if therefore, we accept the version of the honourable Senator, every time a false statement is made by a newspaper. Any lawyer will advise his client to file a suit, ask for an abject apology. Sir, I have with me a book. It runs 296 pages. It is a collection of articles, newspaper articles. In praise of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto, let me read out a sampling of headlines, not the text." The Toronto Sun" , Time runs out for that girl , reason corruption. Was suit filed? No. The Washington Post, "Beleaguered Benazir Bhutto. Corruption charges grow sharper against premier re-elected, vowing to get rid of Pakistan's politics of draft". Was suit filed? No. "The Guardian" Weekly, "Born survivor falls from date. Few in Pakistan mourn second passing of Benazir Bhutto". The article refers to political disgrace. Was a suit filed? No. The "Telegraph", A reference to Benazir Bhutto and Asif Zardari, The "Telegraph" says and it is the headline, " The Oxford graduate who failed in

History". Was a suit filed? No. I travel further sir. The "London Times", The sword falls. The Bhutto clan has played a large part in its latest downfall". Was a suit filed? No. The "Gazette", Montreal, "Few tears for Bhutto". "Pakistanis celebrate Bhutto ouster." Was a suit filed? No. I travel further sir. "Ousted Bhutto may face political ban". This is the "Globe". "Controversial Husband's business dealings seen as key reason for fall of Pakistan's Prime Minister". Was a suit filed? No. "Ottawa Citizens", "Bhuttos never learn. Pakistan's Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto has been removed for the second time on charges of corruption". Was a suit filed? No. Sir, how long can I take up time for this. Let us be clear about one fact. Let us be crystal clear about one fact. For example, the "Ottawas Sun" says, "Plunder, loot can't buy despot's love". Was a suit filed? No. Sir, let us be clear, Dr. Safdar Abbasi, I thought is in agreement. Sir, let us be clear on one basic point. He who gets up and thunders, he who gets up and raves and rants, every lawyer, any lawyer will say, "Nothing less than an abject apology or a suit". Where was he? Where was his client when all these stories were in? What were they doing? Is he not a lawyer? Does Mohtarma not consult him? Kindly enlighten us about the facts. But no, on this he is silent. Sir, I should not take up too much time about this. My learned friend made a passing reference to the cases decided in 1993 and 1996-97. I do not know why he makes a habit of re-arguing every case in the Senate which he has lost in a Court of Law. Sir, this is not the function of the Senate. Sir, now the shame and humiliation of those defeats has rankled in his soul. Every time a topic comes up he drags these cases out. Sir, they are not relevant for the present purposes. I will not make any further reference to them. I think, I should come straightaway sir, to the most important point which is the "Observer's" story. That's what he

has studiously avoided throughout his discourse. That's what I want to talk about. Sir, there are two stories. The first comes on 6th of September, the second on 27th of September. What does it refer to. Honourable Members will be horrified and I think, I include honorable members on that side of the House also. The first story had that to say, that the survival of the world's second largest Islamic state, namely Pakistan is in danger this is what the 'Observer' said. Sir, why is it? The moment Pakistan went for a nuclear explosion, why is it, the entire western world is raising questions, why is it that these newspapers suddenly have started to speculating about the survival of Pakistan? God willing this country will survive as long if not longer than those people who are its enemies. This is what 'Observer' had the audacity to say. This is the allegation made. Sir, does it not say something about this newspaper, it says nothing whatsoever about the Islamic republic but it does say something about the lack of probity of that newspaper. They are casting doubts on the existence of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Sir, they laid the foundation on 6th of September, and then on the 27th of September comes the story. Let us just confine ourselves to start with to the this headline. This is the headline 'explosive police report is threatening to undermine Pakistan's embattled Premier'. This is a thick headline, it is a banner headline, it is flashed all over the newspaper. What does it say, that there is a police report. There is a police report. It is an explosive police report and is threatening to undermine the government.

Now sir, let us look at the fact. There was no police report. Both statements are false. There wasn't a report and it wasn't by the police. It is difficult to compress so much falsehood in one brief sentence. They say that there is an explosive police report. There is no report. It is not by the police.

What we do have and I have it in front of me sir, is a letter. It is a letter written by Mr. Rehman Malik to the President of Pakistan and let us see that what does Mr. Rehman Malik writes in that letter. He says, he is writing in what capacity, not as a police man, he says, I am writing it as a humble and ordinary citizen of Pakistan. These are the exact words used by Mr. Rehman Malik. I read out a paragraph of the document. "Without making any loud claims of patriotism, I, Rehman Malik, Additional D.G. FIA Islamabad, as a humble and ordinary citizen of Pakistan". Now, this is a document which was supplied to the 'Observer' before they wrote that article. It was in their possession and they described it as an explosive police report. The author says, I am writing as a humble and ordinary citizen of Pakistan'. When the 'Observer' in its wisdom says, this is a police report. And let us see, now, I think, all of us know a little bit of the history of Mr. Rehman Malik. He was a notoriously corrupt official. For him a new post was created, Additional Director General FIA. He was appointed to that post. He concocted almost 200 cases against Mian Nawaz Sharif and his family. For that he was rewarded. He was given the "Sitara-e-Shujjat". This is the reward he was given. He is a man who procured a contract for 50,000 tonnes of Bitumen export to Afghanistan in the name of his brother-in-law. He is a man who concocted a false case, a criminal case against someone who had a civil dispute with his sister. He is a man who prosecuted dozens of innocent people, flung them into jail and tried to extort money out of them. And now, what does Mr. Rehman Malik says, he says, "as a humble and ordinary citizen of Pakistan, I feel it my sacred duty", a policeman talking of sacred duty, it's a sacred duty, "to bring to your kind notice some of the most startling facts and misdeeds", and then he goes on to say, now this is very interesting, he has already taken us into

confidence that this is a sacred duty, but he does not stop there. He feels he deserves some praise and this is how he praises himself, "in my defence, I have no better evidence or proof except my specially brilliant service record available at all times". Well done Mr. Rehman Malik, well done! your specially brilliant service record available at all times. Even this praise is insufficient in the eyes of Mr. Rehman Malik. What did he say? "It bears solid testimony to my independent and", note this, "most neutral approach", he is the most impartial of men, he is most unbiased of men, most neutral approach. 200 criminal cases against Mian Nawaz Sharif, not a single case against Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto, but still, most neutral approach. Well done.

Now, sir, after going through the rest of this document, sir, he then attaches, what he considers are his 'discovery' and during the course of dealing with those discoveries, I will also, for the first time, specifically, make a statement about those flats. Before I travel to the flats, sir, I need to make some comments on the "Observer" article.

Now, sir, here is "The Observer", it is a newspaper. Admittedly, this report, this story, is a single false story. "The Observer" does not claim that it has carried out an independent investigative report. It does not make that thing. It relies solely and exclusively on Mr. Rehman Malik's statement, that is all. It accepts all his statement at face value and we will see in a moment that not only does it accept the statement at face value, it goes one step further. It proves on Mr. Rehman Malik's version. For example, Mr. Rehman Malik claims that he is the Additional Director General. "The Observer" says, they give him approach, "The Observer" says, he is the Director General. Even he does not make this claim for himself. He satisfied them with the claims that he is an Additional

Director General, but in the story "The Observer" describes him as the Director General. Mr. Rehman Malik in his letter to the President says, "I have been suspended". He admits, he has been legally suspended. "The Observer" would not accept that. After all he is their sole source. "The Observer" says, "he is defecto under-suspension, what "The Observer" saying is, in the eye of law he is not being suspended but defecto he is under suspension. On both points, Mr. Rehman, in his letter contradicts "The Observer", on both points; he contradicts 'The Observer'. But this is an illustration of the Observer's impartiality.

Let us travel further, sir, 'The Observer' says, now I come to the Prime Minister, 'The Observer' says about him, he has six brothers, now, sir, we all know that the Prime Minister has three brothers: 1, 2, 3. But 'The Observer' says, no, six, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6. Perhaps, we can invite the Observer's reporters to Pakistan to have put them in a primary school in Pakistan, so they understand the difference between 3 and 6. 'Observer' does not know the difference between 3 and 6 that is absolutely categorical. They say the Prime Minister has 6 brothers. Now here is a newspaper writing about the Prime Minister of Pakistan don't know how many brothers he has but the matter does not end there. They go farther. They don't even know the party to which he belongs. Sir, this is surely the most extraordinary aspect of this article. They are writing an article, it prefixes to be an expose, they do not know which party Mian Nawaz Sharif belongs to. They have described his party as being the Islamic Democratic Alliance Party. They say Nawaz Sharif and his Islamic Democratic Alliance Party returned to lead the country in February last year. They are still living 6 years earlier in the days of the III. Here is a newspaper, they do not know which is the

ruling party in Pakistan and they are telling us things in confidence which no one else knows that Pakistan is about to collapse. It is about to disappear. It is teetering on the verge of Martial Law and they don't know the title of General Jehangir Karamat. He is a General, a full General. They describe him as Lt. General Jehangir Karamat. Sir, this is an indication of the care with which this story has been researched and written. They don't know the title, the designation of the Army Chief. They don't know the party to which the Prime Minister belongs. They don't know how many brothers the Prime Minister has but they do not set aside with it. Let us go farther what do they say about Raiwind. Now my learned friend vexed eloquently about Raiwind. He had a great deal to say about Raiwind but they say very important matter, even he did not deem it fit and proper to read out what the 'Observer' has written about Raiwind. Now sir, the Raiwind house is a house to which the members of the press have been invited, numerous reporters have been there. This is an ordinary house. There are dozen of houses which are far grandeur in Pakistan. I would not be surprised if the learned friend's house is grandeur. So what do they say about Raiwind's house. They described it as a palatial Raiwind State. They don't stop there. They say Nawaz Sharif has a palace, the Saudi Shaikhs could only dream of it. If Raiwind is a palace the Saudi Shaikhs could dream of it, then I think about the Saudi Shaikhs we all have a grossly inflated idea about their life style. To all that house a palace which Saudi Shaikhs could only dream of, it is a height of absurdity, is a height of false and that is the reason my learned friend quoted more prudent, not to read the text. He thought it is better to suppress this fact. He thought it is better to draw curtain across this to hide the reality. Sir, I have given you numerous instances of the errors, the patent errors, the manifest falsehood in this

report. Let me give you one more, let me give you one more. They referred to the Interim Prime Minister of Pakistan, Mr. Moin Qureshi, they described his name as being Mr. Ahmed Qureshi. So, the Prime Minister of Pakistan's name also is not known to the 'Observer' but they know everything which is hidden. They know everything which is going on beneath the surface they go on to praise Mr. Rehman Malik, I come back to Mr. Rehman Malik, they say about him. He is a high profile policeman. Now sir, when this story, and I am going to deal with certain specific allegations of this story in a moment. About the flats, about the loans, about the bank accounts, about the case, my learned friend referred to in a moment. Now sir, when this story surfaced. There is a court of practice of the press in England. They say and I am just going to read out two of relevant clauses.

"Newspapers and Periodicals must take care, not to publish inaccurate; misleading or distorted material", that is a manifest violation of that clause. They are specifically prohibited from publishing inaccurate, misleading or distorted materials. And then it goes on to say "Newspapers while free to be partisan must distinguish clearly between comment, conjecture and fact". Facts we found none in the story, conjecture is yes, mala fide is yes, dishonesty is yes, inaccuracy is yes. And it ends up by saying "a fair opportunity to reply to inaccuracies must be given". Now it is a mandatory word, "must be given". A fair opportunity to reply to inaccuracies must be given to individuals or organizations when reasonably called for. We ask them, we made a request to them, look these are the facts. This is what you alleged. Please rectify it. Please correct it. They have not done so up to now. A complaint has been filed against it to the Press Complaints Commission and that complaint is pending. So, it is

not this that we have been sleeping over these things. We have taken prompt action. We have taken effective action and we have acted immediately. We have yet to await the result of that Press Commission's report or investigation or enquiry.

Sir, I need to talk about some of these specific aspects because I don't want to take up too much time. Let me talk, let me begin by talking about the flats. So much was said by my learned friend. Let me say something about that. The allegation was that the flats are owned by the family of the Prime Minister. Now sir, when an allegation is made, there are two ways to investigate. Two ways to inquire into its veracity. One is, you look at the source of the story and we have seen that its source is Rehman Malik. The second way is, you examine the story for internal inconsistency. But you know as a professional, you examine it, you analyse it to try and work out, does this have the ring of truth or is it nothing else but a tissue of fabrication. That is the second way. Mr. Rehman Malik's integrity or the lack thereof, I have discarded enough about it, let me come to the second way.

Let us examine the story now. Sir, at the time, I am going back in time to the year 1996 and the story was about "Rockward Mension in Surrey." That was a story which was made in the newspapers, that was a story which was made in headlines, which was discussed and debated in Parliament also. Now sir, one thing was very significant, they totally denied any connection with Rockward Mension. They totally denied any connection as against this, the family of the Prime Minister has been openly living in that flat or using it from time to time for many many years, at least going back to 1994 or 1995. Now sir, if there does something wrong, its human nature, he tries to conceal it. If a man's conscience

is clear, if he feels in his heart he is innocent, he will do it openly. The significant is that Mian Sahib or his son have been openly using that apartment. No attempted conceal surely does indicates, surely does say something about the innocence, surely does say something about the lack of illegality, the lack of corruption in relation to that flat. It says something about Mian Sahib.

Today as Prime Minister of Pakistan he can travel to London and stay at most expensive hotel in London. He openly goes and stays there with his sons. He saves the national money. He holds the press conferences there. He calls people there. He meets people there. Surely this is an indication of innocent mind, a mind at peace that it has done nothing wrong.

This argument sir, I found it very interesting, not accepted in toto while honourable member sitting on the other side was speaking. Yes, you will be very surprised, I think, honourable members sitting on this side will also be surprised and what I am going to disclose in the moment. This argument, these facts were adopted and accepted by Senator Raza Rabbani. There was a debate in Parliament. On 21st of August, 1996, there was a debate in Parliament, that debate was about Rockwood Mension, Surrey. The allegation was, it belonged to Benazir Bhutto and Asif Zardari and Senator Raza Rabbani got up to reply and he gives an illustration that is very interesting. He says "I would like to bring to your notice and through you, I would like to bring to the notice of this House that there are two properties in London in which, and I am just stating this as a fact there are two flats in London which are or has been under the occupation of Mr. Hussain Sharif who happens to be the son of the Leader of the Opposition. Now those properties are 17 ----- That very property about which the honourable Leader of the Opposition was talking, was shouting, was telling about one hour

earlier Senator Raza Rabbani is referring to that very property, this the year 1996. He is referring to the fact that the son of the Prime Minister who was then the Leader of the Opposition was staying there. He then mentioned the names of the companies through which they have been purchased. These properties have been purchased through Nescaw Limited, here is a typographical error but one can make out he is referring to this. And then he goes on to say, these properties were purchased again in a similar manner and then he goes on, it is a long speech and I am not going to read all the speech. And then he goes on to say, and this is the argument he is developing and then I will read out the relevant passage. He says that mere fact that some one is living in a flat does not mean he owns the flat. This is an argument. His argument was with reference to this very apartment, this is what he said, yes, it has been nexus and I have shown that the flat in which his own son is living, the two flats in which his own sons are living has been purchased. Where is the lease agreement he has asked. We do not know, there is no lease agreement, first he asked a rhetorical question, where is lease agreement. Then he said there is no lease agreement and then he says there is 99 or may be 80 years lease mortgage. He knew a remarkable amount regarding the properties Mr. Chairman. He knew the son of the Prime Minister is living there. He knew the names of the Company which has purchased it. He knew about the mortgage, he knew about the lease, all these facts and then what is the conclusion he arrived at. There is no lease agreement with anybody. But kindly bear me out that this does not mean he has more flats. This is the conclusion. This does not mean the Prime Minister's son has bought that flat. This is what he said in categorical language. But that does not mean he has bought that. I am not saying he has bought that. I am not saying he has bought that. He knows all

the facts. He knows the lease, he knows the name of the company which owns it. He knows the fact that the Prime Minister's son is living. He says, I am not saying that he has bought that. I am not saying that he has bought that. I am just showing that although he lives there, yes, we are not drawing any conclusion and here when there is no nexus, no nexus whatsoever it is being insinuated that Rockwood Mansion is a property of Mr. A or Mr. B. Sir, what could be clear as that. He carried out an investigation in the year 1996, Benazir is the Prime Minister, the Peoples Party is in power, they have all the paraphernalia of the State at their disposal, they carried out an investigation, a thorough investigation. They come to conclusion that Mian Nawaz Sharif is not the owner of the flats and today they make these reckless allegations, these false allegations on the floor of the House. They should be ashamed of themselves.

Sir, I am very glad that Dr. Sahib has come.....

*(interruption)*

Mr. Khalid Anwar: I congratulate him. He is welcome. I need to clarify it further. I come to the ....

*(interruption)*

Mr. Chairman: August, 1996.

Mr. Khalid Anwar: I think, it is 23rd of August.

Now sir, I need to travel to the bank loans and while I am talking about bank loans, I will be saying something about the flats also which is relevant in that context.

Let us begin with the bank loans, what are the bank loans? The facts are these. Until the year 1994, the Ittefaq Group had never ever been in default.

They had never been in default. They had paid all their loans promptly. They were amongst the most credible, the most trustworthy companies in the country. Banks were happy to lend to them and naturally banks preferred to lend money to a company which has not defaulted in the past. Then what happens?

In 1994, the moment the Peoples Party Government comes to office, what do we find, orders are issued, instructions are issued to the banks, withdraw the credit loans. The moment this happens, naturally they go into default. Sir, if you look at the largest companies in the world whether it is General Motors, whether it is Hovard, whether it is British Petroleum, whether it is M.Co., I am talking of the joint companies, whether it is Toyota, all of these depend on bank loans. This is an elementary fact of business life. In fact, without bank loans not only would industry not flourish but even banks would fail. Why? If I go as an ordinary individual and I deposit 10 thousand rupees in a bank in PLS account, the profit I get is, because the bank earns a profit by lending money to companies at 18 %, 19 %, 20 %. So, if banks stop lending money, none of us would get a return on the money we deposit in banks. Unfortunately, an impression has sought to be created as if taking a bank loan is tantamount to committing a crime. But this is the heart, this is the cause, this is the essence of the banking system. Banks lend money, that is how they earn profit. And the Ittefaq group had a clear record, they were not defaulters. Then all of a sudden the rug is pulled from under their feet. The banks are told you recall the loans. There is no company in the world if all its credit lines are cancelled overnight which would not become a default. That is why we say these are engineered defaults because there is no justification for withdrawing a credit line if a company has not committed a default. Now in this case, this is exactly

what happened. They suddenly withdrew this and how did the Ittefaq group respond. They have filed suites for damages claiming 9 billion rupees as damages which is certainly far more than the amount of the loans. Now when Mian sahib became Prime Minister for the 2nd time, when he became Prime Minister for the 2nd time, he had two charges, one was to adopt strictly legal route, which is this. The banks have filed suites against him for recovery. His company has filed a suite against them for damages. Why? Because even a nationalized bank is supposed to decide on the basis of merits. If we look at the charter of the National Bank of Pakistan, it is a statutory bank created under an ordinance in the year 1949. It is crystal clear that decision have to be made on merits and not on the basis of politics. But in the PPP time, decisions were being made on a political basis. So, I think that Mian Sahib was right. He was justified in going to court of law. And he could have adopted that course of action up to now. He could have said, let the court decide, the banks acted in a mala fide manner under directions from a political government, they caused my company's losses, the banks are making claims, let the court decide. Now this was a legal route. He eschewed that. He decided in the wider national interest as Prime Minister of Pakistan, he decided, let me forget my counter claims. He voluntarily turned over possession of his flag ship company, of his single most important company and two other companies to the banks and said, take over possession. Sir, that is an action which is unprecedented in the history of Pakistan. He did something which the law did not require him to do. He did it out of a sense of patriotism, of ethics, of morality and it is very important, kindly bear this in mind, he did not stop there, he said, suppose at the end of the day, if the bank sell all the assets and there is still something outstanding, the Directors will still be personally

liable. This was an unprecedented gesture. It is a sad fact that instead of appreciating it, we have insults being heard across the floor of the House. We have false allegations being made. The agreement between the Ittefaq Group and the bank has been filed in court. It is part of the court record. It is in the public domain. Anyone can examine, look at it, view at it. See what is the enormous financial sacrifice which is invoked. I think, he deserves to be commended for this. Now sir, how did the Peoples Party Government handle this situation. What they did was, I think, this needs also some consideration. I am now talking about the year 1994. On the 10th of November, 1994 and the 12th of November, 1994, two FIRs were filed, engineered by the illustrious Rehman Malik. These were filed against two companies, Hudabia Paper and Hudabia Engineering. Now what is the allegation? Because my learned friend referred to that in passing. What is the allegation? That the dollars which were furnished as security were put in fake accounts in the name of one Suleman Zia. There were dollars put and it is alleged that these are fake accounts. How does the Lahore High Court sees this. Let me read out an extract from the Lahore High Court judgement. It says. "We are fully convinced that baseless cases were filed upon the petitioners, the Sharif family, by an agency, that is to say the FIA, which otherwise had no legal authority to do so". Baseless cases. These cases were registered three years ago during which period considerable harrassment, tension and ignominies were unduly suffered. On the face of the allegations no offence is made out. It's a decision on the merit. Mark that, on the merit. On the face of the allegations no offence is made out. No wrongful loss has been caused. The element of cheating is totally missing. These were the allegations.

Now, sir, what is interesting about this is, that's why I've said this

particular aspect add two dimensions to it. One, that the case was false, it was fraudulent, it's dismissed. The second is a reference to Salman Zia. The second is the reference to those dollar accounts. Now the allegation made by the Peoples Party government was this. They said that these dollars formed security for the loans which were given to these two companies. So the security for these loans was given to these two companies. The security are the dollars and they are funnelled through Salman Zia and others. Now the interesting aspect is that Rehman Malik, who engineered this false case in this report which he has filed with the President of Pakistan and that was a total concoction, it was thrown and through a window, I think my learned friend has a very active and fertile imagination. Now the point really is this that in that report there is a complete U turn. Now it is said that those dollars which are deposited with the bank as security, 350 thousand dollars, are taken out of that account of Salman Zia and used to buy a London flat. This is what it contained in that 200 page report filed with the President of Pakistan.

Now let's just examine it. Either the dollars were lying there as security for the loans or they were used to buy flats. You cannot have it both ways. But the allegation made is that they are both the security, they are both lying with the bank and they are also used in order to buy flats. And note the figure, 350 thousand dollars. Because in that very report it says the value of the flats is three million pounds. Now that, I must say, really requires a financial genius of the highest order to buy flats worth three million pounds or five million dollars for 350 thousand dollars. I know one person who has that financial genius but I won't refer to him. Now sir, the point really is this.... What I'm analysing is the internal contradiction. The same money is used as collateral deposited with the

bank in Lahore and through magic carpet it flies to London and is used to buy flats. Sir, these were two FIRs filed in the year 94, which were dismissed, which were quashed. Mr. Rehman Malik didn't stop there. On the 22nd of April, 95, three more cases were filed. These are FIRs 2, 3 and 4 of 1995. Now sir, there is even more music. What did it allege in these FIRs is that the Ittefaq Group obtained loans by use of force and deceptory. Presumably, they put a pistol to the head of a bank and said give us the loan. Force and decept, this is the allegation made. This is the allegation made. Now, of course, it is dismissed in due course. It is quashed. but what is interesting is the way the 'Observer' tracks it out. The way the 'Observer' twists it. The 'Observer' says and it is really a masterpiece of report. The Observer says, Nawaz Sharif was forced to hand over his assets to the banks. Rehman Malik said Nawaz Sharif forced the banks to lend money to him and the 'Observer' says Nawaz Sharif as sitting Prime Minister of Pakistan is forced, this is the word used in that report, is forced to hand over his companies to the banks, who forced him, how was he forced. The 'Observer' doesn't take us into confidence. Isn't it the height of absurdity? Isn't it a totally ludicrous to say that the sitting Prime Minister of Pakistan is forced to hand over his companies, all his assets to banks, including banks owned by the government of Pakistan. What are we to derive, what inference are we to derive that the presidents of the banks are more powerful than the Prime Minister of Pakistan who appoints them, who dismisses them. Sir, this is an indication of the mala fide of the report, of the total lack of credibility which can be attached to this report sir. Sir, these are the banks, I have dealt with the flats.

Let me say something about the tax demands about which also my learned friend had a great deal to say. What are the facts, they are quite different.

This tax demand goes back to a point of time 1988-89, the tax demand as far back as that, assessment orders had been passed. There was no demand outstanding, then the Peoples Party government comes. The Income Tax officers told you reopen the assessment, the assessment is reopened. The Income Tax officers are told now you create a fresh demand. He creates a fresh demand. The Income Tax officer is told impose the penalty. He imposed the penalty. Now, sir, this is what transpired, this is what took place at that point of time. Now, to say that this tax demand is a genuine demand is a total absurdity. No one in his senses can examine or imagine that this is a genuine demand after assessment is illegally reopened after the change of government.

Sir, there is one other important aspect, this relates to a list of 28 properties. Now, Mr. Rehman Malik, and this is another of his ingenious discoveries, says, "I have discovered 28 properties owned by the Ittefaq Group." This is Mr. Rehman Malik's great discovery. What are the facts. The facts are these sir those 28 properties and Mr. Haroon Pasha has clarified this, are listed in a document which he filed in the High Court. These are those properties belonging to the 7 brothers at the point of time when they were arriving at a division and distribution of their assets and that very list is picked up bodily and Mr. Rehman Malik presents it as a great discovery by him personally of dishonesty which is involved on the part of the Group.

Sir, these are some of the salient features of this article. Of the contents of the article I want, before sitting down sir, to make a few brief observations because I did note that the honourable Leader of the Opposition when he was speaking strayed very far indeed from the 'Observer' article. And he thought it fit and proper to discourse on honesty, about honesty in government, about

integrity in government, about fiscal probity in government. Let me make just one small illustration. Textile quotas used to be auctioned under the Peoples Party Government, they have been auctioned under the Muslim League's Government. Let us just compare the figures, put them side by side. They speak for themselves. The total amount recovered by the Peoples Party Government during 1994 and 1995 from the export from the auction proceeds of textile quotas was Rs.45 crores. The present Government has recovered Rs.193 crores, just one item, just one item. Rs.148 crores more recovered from the auction of those identical textile quotas. Would they kindly refund the money to the Government of Pakistan. We are poor people, we need the money. 148 crores, just one item. Conceive of the extent of the daylight robbery which was going on. Let us come to the wheat import. What do we find? 200 crores savings on trade of wheat because of a change in the bidding system to make it more transparent. 200 crores, just one item.

Let me talk about the coals import. The trade, the saving is 15 crores. Sir, we have a large amount of facts of statistics which we can place before the House. The time is passing, it is getting late and I think, all of us are really tired and exhausted. Sir, may I say one thing in conclusion before I sit down, that these are allegations which have been made and they have been recklessly made and I want to give you, in conclusion, an illustration of the type of allegations which are made. General Naseerullah Babar made a statement, made a speech last year, in which he handed out photostat copies of cheques purportedly issued, allegedly issued by three of the biggest companies; Toyota, Hyundai and Daewoo and he said, "these cheques indicate that illegal commission had been paid". Sir, I have with me the photostat copies of the cheques, I have with me

the letter written by these companies. Let me, for example, read out one issued by Daewoo dated August 29, 1997. It says, "the cheques referred to a company called "Daewoo International" , we confirm that no such company exists. They were a manifest forgery. No such company at the name of 'Daewoo International' exists. It is not part of the Daewoo Group.

Hyundai, now the cheques are issued to a company, called Chaudhrian Ink. and the allegation was that the company is owned by Mian Sahib or his family. Hyundai says, "we do not have any knowledge of a company called 'Chaudhrian' and Toyota also makes a similar denial. Now, apart from the denial, apart from the denial, I looked at those cheques and the cheques indicate the fraud on the face of it. You may ask, why, how. The reason is very simple, in Pakistan typically, we compute amount in lakhs and crores, abroad it is done in millions. The difference is this that if , therefore, an amount of one million is being paid abroad, the amount will be.....Now this is something which on the face of the document proves the fraud. We know that the companies have also disowned this and these are reputable companies but the fact is that the documents indicate the frauds on the face of it. It is inconceivable that in Japan they are also using the system of lacs and crores, it is inconceivable that this system is being used in Kuwait but General Naseerullah Babar another financial genius who has apparently in connivance with Mr. Rehman Malik, illegally acquired artifacts a great archaeological value. He did not know enough about it. So he applied his own methodology, his own knowledge, his own method of dealing or creating forgery in preparing these documents. Sir, throughout this very unhappy and unsavoury episode, we are dealing with a situation in which this entire debate and you will appreciate sir, all of us will appreciate the fact that

we have happily suspended the rules. This debate needs never have taken place. Rule 75 (d) prohibits it. We have cooperated and we have done it because we thought that the nation deserved a full accounting, the nation deserved a full debate and open debate and I am very glad and I am very pleased that it has taken place and for this also I would like to send Dr. Safdar Abbasi again, once again because I have been listened to with patience just as the honourable Leader of the Opposition was also listened to with patience. So, the debate will carry on tomorrow but all I want to say in conclusion before I sit down sir, on these facts this is not evidence on which you could convict the target. It is no evidence at all in the eye of law. It is fine to use this as an excuse for making reckless allegations without bearing in mind the fact that these allegations detract from the credibility of the country. I would have thought that a sense of patriotism would have allowed them, would have urged them not to embark on these false and dangerous water at a time when the country is facing an economic crisis, a financial crisis because of a courageous decision taken by this government with the active support of the nation to become a nuclear power. Sir, I am sure that was a right decision and Insha Allah we will prevail notwithstanding all the false profits, all the cassandras who say, who argue, who alleged that Pakistan is on the verge of destruction. It will not happen.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you.

اب کرنا کیا ہے۔ اب ہاؤس کو مزید چلانا ہے یا صبح پر کرنا ہے۔ ٹھیک ہے صبح کرنا ہے۔

The House is adjourned to meet again at 10.00 a.m tomorrow morning.

-----  
 [The House was then adjourned to meet again at 10.00 a.m

on 7th October, Wednesday, 1998.]