

## SENATE OF PAKISTAN

### SENATE DEBATES

Thursday, November 05, 1998

The Senate of Pakistan met in the Senate Hall (Parliament House) Islamabad, at thirty minutes after four in the evening, with Presiding Officer (Chairman) Muhammad Anwar Bhinder in the Chair.

#### Recitation from the Holy Quran

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِیْمِ

یا ایها الناس اتقوا ربکم و اخصوا یوماً لا یجزی والد عن ولده ولا  
مولود هو جاز عن والده شیاً ان وعد الله حق فلا تغرنکم الحیوة  
الدنیا ولا یخرنکم بالله الغرور ○ ان الله عنده علم الساعة وینزل  
الغیث ویعلم ما فی الارحام وما تدری نفس ما اذا تکسب غداً وما تد  
ری نفس یا ای ارض تموت ان الله علیم خبیر ○

ترجمہ : اے لوگو! اپنے رب کی پکڑ سے بچو اور اس دن سے ڈرو جس دن نہ کوئی باپ اپنی اولاد کے کام آئے گا اور نہ کوئی اولاد اپنے باپ کے کچھ کام آنے والی بن سکے گی۔ بیشک اللہ کا وعدہ شدنی ہے تو دنیا کی زندگی تمہیں دھوکے میں نہ ڈالتے پاوے اور نہ اللہ کے معاملے میں فریب کار تمہیں دھوکے میں رکھے، قیامت کا علم اللہ ہی کے پاس ہے اور وہی بارش اتارتا ہے اور وہ جانتا ہے جو کچھ رموں میں ہوتا ہے اور کسی کو بھی پتہ نہیں کہ کل وہ کیا کھائی کرے گا اور نہ کسی کو یہ علم ہے کہ وہ کس سرزمین میں مرے گا۔ بے شک اللہ جانتے والا خبردار ہے۔

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Mr. Presiding Officer: Question Hour. Question No.40, Syed Iqbal Haider.

#40. \* Syed Iqbal Haider: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the amount of loans written off or rescheduled since 1st January 1997 by Habib Bank Ltd. (HBL), National Bank of Pakistan (NBP), National Development Finance Corporation (NDFC), Pakistan Industrial Credit Investment Corporation (PICIC), Industrial Development Bank of Pakistan (IDBP), Investment Corporation of Pakistan (ICP) and Agricultural Development Bank (ADB), indicating also the number and names of the borrowers, separately in each case?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: The information is being collected from State Bank of Pakistan. As soon as it is received, the reply will be placed on the table of the House.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Supplementary question.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir, the answer has not been given. Why the answer has not been received? Sir, this is happening repeatedly in my case. My mission in life is to expose defaulters and "looters" and every time whenever I ask a question about those defaulters and "looters" of my country, the government always tries to avoid giving any answer.

جناب والا! میرے ساتھ پچھلے سیشن میں بھی یہی ہوا۔ یہ سوال تو بار بار repeat ہوا ہے۔ پہلے بھی

#

Deferred from 90th session.

یہ نہیں آسکا تھا۔ جناب وزیر خزانہ بتائیں کہ وہ کب تک defaulters کی سرپرستی کرتے رہیں گے۔ انہوں نے کہا ہے کہ as soon as جواب مل جائے گا تو ہم آپ کو بتا دیں گے۔ وہ soon as کب ختم ہو گا۔

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: In fact, we have not been able to provide this information. He rightly says that there are his few other questions which have not yet been answered partly because the information asked for is a very detailed in character. For example, in this case he has asked to give the number and names of the borrowers against which the scheduling had taken place. So, I would request that I may be given some more time and I would like to assure him that nothing will be held back from the House and whatever information comes available to us, we will immediately pass it on to this esteemed House.

سید اقبال حیدر۔ جناب والا! اس سوال کو lapse نہ ہونے دیں۔

Let it come in the next date and there is also one mistake committed by the Secretariat. I had asked for the figures on the province-wise basis that how many defaulters' loans have been rescheduled or written off, province-wise.

انہوں نے province-wise کا لفظ کاٹ دیا، چنانچہ اس کی کیا وجہ ہے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: There is a distinction between the starred question and unstarred question. So far as this question is concerned where you asked for the answer, it should not be very very lengthy. The procedure is that if you want some lengthy details then you should give starred question and Mr. Paracha gives usually and you know he is master of that and we have starred questions only for Mr. Paracha.

سید اقبال حیدر۔ جناب مجھے یقین ہے کہ انہوں نے شاید written off loans زیادہ نہیں کئے ہوں گے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: But there are so many institutions.

سید اقبال حیدر۔ جناب والا! پانچ ہیں۔ اب دو تین denationalize ہو گئے ہیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: This question will be repeated for the next turn.

Mr. Taj Haider: Sir, it is a very frightening situation. The answer that the Advisor Finance has given really frightens because if the number of written off loans is so large or rescheduled is so large as the State Bank of Pakistan is not able to compile the statement. I mean, is it so that the number is so large.

یعنی اس میں اتنے زیادہ write off کئے گئے ہیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, that is what he has said. Next question, Syed Iqbal Haider, No.41.

#41. \* Syed Iqbal Haider: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the total amount of outstanding loans due and payable to each of the nationalised banks and DFIs by the borrowers as on 30th June, 1997 and 30th June 1998, with province-wise break-up;

(b) the number of borrowers of a sum exceeding Rupees One Million, exceeding Rupees Ten Million and exceeding Rupee One Hundred Million, separately with province-wise break-up; and

(c) the amount, if any, recovered by each of the nationalised banks or DFIs from such borrowers since 1st July, 1997 with province-wise break-up?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: The information is being collected from State Bank of Pakistan. As soon as it is received, the

reply will be placed on the table of the House.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Supplementary question?

سید اقبال حیدر۔ جناب میں نے اس میں صرف یہی پوچھا تھا کہ loans outstanding on 30 June 1997 اور 30 جون 1998 اور آج ہم نومبر میں بات کر رہے ہیں۔ یہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ ان کے پاس figures نہیں ہیں 'loans outstanding on 30th June' یہ کیسے ممکن ہے۔ میں کیا کہوں، حکومت کی نا اہلی کھول یا کوتاہی کھول یا مجرمانہ غفلت کھول یا defaulters کی سرپرستی کھول۔ آپ یہ information کیوں نہیں دیتے۔ یہ تو آج کل computer پر ہوتی ہے اور تمام بینکوں کے پاس computers ہیں۔ سٹیٹ بینک کے پاس computers ہیں۔ تمام بینکوں کے پاس کمپیوٹر ہے۔ اس لئے اس کو بھی اگلے اجلاس تک defer کھینچنے گا۔

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Sir, this question asks for very detailed response, not only ought to provide information on the province-wise break up in this case, but we have been asked to classify loans into three categories; one million, ten million and hundred million and this kind of detailed information has to be aggregated together for each of these institutions. I would like to assure the honourable member that this task is at hand and certainly during the session we will ensure that this information becomes available.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Mr. Abdul Rauf:

ملک عبدالرؤف، جناب والا! میں وزیر خزانہ صاحب سے یہ گزارش کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ آیا یہ حقیقت ہے کہ بینک والے جان بوجھ کر قرضہ جات وصول نہیں کرتے۔ اس کے ثبوت میں میں یہ بتانا چاہتا ہوں کہ میں نے خود Recovery Chief, Lahore کو ایک خط لکھا کہ فلاں انڈسٹری چل رہی ہے۔ آپ اس سے recovery کریں۔ انہوں نے اس کا ابھی تک کوئی response نہیں دیا۔ میں یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ جان بوجھ کر یہ وصولی نہیں کی جا رہی یا قرض والے لوگ یہ رقم واپس دیتے نہیں ہیں؟

Mr. Presiding Officer: Actually when the answer is not there, no supplementary can be asked but anyhow, since you just wanted to clarify a position, therefore, the Advisor for Finance should respond it.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Sir, the position is certainly not that we don't want to get any recoveries and if the honourable member wants to indicate a particular case that is under consideration then I would like to assure him that we will move in whatever way possible. If there is somebody voluntarily willing to make a repayment then we would certainly want to ensure that payment will take place.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Next question, Ilyas Ahmed Bilour.

اس کا جواب نہیں ہے تو ڈاکٹر اسماعیل صاحب آپ کیا کہیں گے۔ اچھا فرمائیے۔  
ڈاکٹر محمد اسماعیل بلیدی، جناب دونوں سوالوں کے جواب یہاں نہیں ہیں حالانکہ یہ بہت اہمیت کے حامل سوال ہیں اور حکومت ان defaulters کو اس ایوان میں ظاہر نہیں کرنا چاہتی۔ اگر ہم بحیثیت ایک سینیٹر ایک سوال کریں اور چھ مہینے کے بعد بھی منسٹر کا جواب یہ ہو کہ ابھی تک معلومات اٹھی کی جا رہی ہیں تو آپ ابھی طرف سے یہ رولنگ دیں کہ آئندہ ہمارے ساتھ اس طرح نہ کریں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Both the questions be repeated for the next day. Next question Ilyas Ahmed Bilour.

40. \* Mr Ilyas Ahmad Bilour: Will the Minister for Commerce be please to state the steps taken by the government against the anti-dumping duty on Pakistani exports of unbleached, grey fabrics imposed by 16 European countries?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Efforts were made at the diplomatic

level, letters were written by the Commerce Minister to his counterparts and joint legal efforts were made by the textile mills concerned and our missions in Brussels. The result of all the above was that the provisional anti-dumping duty on Pakistani grey cloth was removed on 5th October, 1998.

Mr. Presiding Officer: No. 40. Supplementary question?

سید اقبال حیدر، جناب ایک ہی serial number دو دو سوالات کا کیسے ہو سکتا ہے۔  
میرے سوالات بھی ۴۰ اور ۴۱ ہیں۔ بلور صاحب کے بھی ۴۰ اور ۴۱ ہیں۔ بہر حال نمبروں سے کوئی  
سروکار نہیں لیکن انہوں نے جو information دی ہے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Iqbal Haider Sahib so far as your questions are concerned 40 and 41, there is a clarification that these questions were deferred from the 90th session and the next numbers are for the current session.

سید اقبال حیدر، میری شکایت ہی یہی ہے کہ میرے سوالات کے جوابات نہیں دیئے  
جاتے اور ایک ایک سیشن نہیں ایک ایک سال تک ان کے جوابات نہیں آتے۔

Sir, the point is that the question was raised that what steps have been taken by the Government against Anti-dumping duty on Pakistani exports of unbleached grey cloth. So the answer is that the result of all the above are that the provisional anti-dumping duty on Pakistani grey cloth was removed on 5th October, 1998. My question is that what about those actions against those exporters who are indulging in dumping within Pakistan, though it is not directly related to this question, I concede to that but sir, it is also an equally important issue that the exporters from the developing countries are openly indulging into dumping in Pakistan and what action do you take to impose penalty and to prevent this exercise?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: First of all this anti-dumping duty

has been levied on Pakistan price. The first time was November 1996 and our government fought for it and ultimately we have been able to get it removed on 21st of May, 1997. Within a span of very short period of two and a half month, we were again served a fresh notice and if the honourable member knows there is something called Euro-cotton lobby. Certain countries in the European Union who have very strong cotton wave and they just sponsor the complaints against not only Pakistan, Mr. Chairman, it was against China, Indonesia, India, Egypt, Turkey and Pakistan. So we thought if the provisional duties were between 32.5 to 19.3 % for cooperating non-cooperating companies.

So, we took the diplomatic efforts. I wrote letters to all, I used the WTO forum in May and I talked to my counterpart and the fact remains that once again we were able to get it by majority vote at the highest level of the Council of Ministers of the European Union and these duties were dropped. So, I think we should be happy.

As far as the question of the honourable member is concerned, what Pakistan is doing for the exporter who dump their goods in Pakistan, I appreciate his question. I have already worked on this. They have proposed a law which almost is in the final stage and we will also be having prerogative as a country to impose anti-dumping duties, if it is true that the goods are dumped in Pakistan.

Mr. Presiding Officer : Next question, Mr. Ilyas Ahmad Bilour.

Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi : Sir, Supplementary on 41.

Mr. Presiding Officer : No, no I have called on to next question.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی : جناب ۴۱ بہت important سوال ہے۔ جناب اس میں پاکستان کے پورے debt کا سوال ہے۔ جناب آپ نے بہت جلد کیا ہے اس میں عرض کروں

It is very important question sir. Please kindly آپ پر دوبارہ آجائیں۔ گا۔

Mr. Presiding Officer : Yes, in view of its importance, I allow .

Dr . Safdar Ali Abbasi : Thank you very much Sir . Sir supplementary.

جناب میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ پاکستان اپنی زندگی کے سب سے بڑے debt crises میں پھنسا ہوا ہے۔ اس پر تقریباً دو ٹریلین روپے کا debt پڑا گیا ہے جس میں ایک ٹریلین تقریباً foreign debt ہے اور تقریباً ایک ٹریلین domestic debt ہے۔ اس وقت جو صورت حال نظر آ رہی ہے ہماری گورنمنٹ peanut کی خاطر ادھر ادھر دوڑتی پھر رہی ہے کہ کہیں سے کچھ مل جائے کہ ہم اپنا جو سلسلہ چل رہا ہے اس کو چلا سکیں۔ میں وزیر صاحب سے یہ پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ یہ جو اتنا بڑا debt accumulate ہو گیا ہے۔ Does the government have any policy? میں پالیسی کی بات کر رہا ہوں میں یہ نہیں ان سے پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ جی آپ IMF کے پیچھے پانچ بلین ڈالر کے لئے کیوں بھاگ رہے ہیں۔ Do you have any policy to combat this enormous debt? پھر میں یہ بھی نہیں کہوں گا کہ جی کس گورنمنٹ نے کیا اور کس نے نہیں کیا regardless of that, does the government has any policy to consent the nature of this debt sir?

Mr. Presiding Officer : Yes please.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha : Honourable Chairman, let me say that this debt accumulation that has occurred, has taken place primarily because government of Pakistan has been carrying budget deficit and current account deficit for the last fifty years and in fact that it is this government which for the first time was able to bring down the budget deficit last year quite substantially and also the current account deficit very substantially last year. It is this policy of trying to bring down the deficit in our budget and in our current account which will ultimately lead to flightening out of the debt accumulation . What we should be focussing on is really the debt to GDP ratio and I am pleased to report

for the first time last year there was a significant reduction in the domestic debt to GDP ratio.

The other efforts of the government will continue to make to reduce the burden of debt, what of course be concerned with privatisation which would involve retirement of some of our debt obligations and this is a front from which we continue to be pursuing. I would suggest that although the amount involved is very substantial, what we should be looking at is effort and trying to contain the future increase because this is debt which has already been incurred.

Mr. Presiding Officer : Mr. Abbasi.

ڈاکٹر صدر علی عباسی : جناب اس وقت گورنمنٹ کی پوزیشن کیا ہے۔ گورنمنٹ والے اسلامک ڈیولپمنٹ بینک کے ساتھ highest rate of interest پر ابھی negotiate کر کے آئے ہیں۔ یہ اور بات ہے کہ IDB سے انہوں نے interest rate commit کیا ہے۔ اس کے باوجود بھی ان کی credibility zero ہو چکی ہے۔ کوئی انہیں کچھ دینے کے لئے تیار نہیں ہے۔ ابھی انہوں نے LIBOR 5% with IDB commitment کیا ہے تو Can Paksitan sustain that sort of interest on its debts? دوسری بات پرائیونائزیشن کی - کیا پرائیونائزیشن کیسی پرائیونائزیشن، کون ان سے خریدنے آئے گا۔ دو دن پہلے خبر چھپی ہے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please put the question.

ڈاکٹر صدر علی عباسی - میں question پر آتا ہوں۔ تھوڑی سی explanation کی مجھے اجازت دی جائے۔ ابھی پرائیونائزیشن کمیشن کی طرف سے آیا ہے کہ پی ٹی سی ایل نے جو Goldman Fact کے ساتھ معاہدہ کیا ہے اس میں تین لاکھ ڈالر انہوں نے گولڈن فیکٹ کو دینا تھا۔ to continue that privatisation گورنمنٹ کے پاس تین لاکھ ڈالر گولڈن فیکٹ کو دینے کے لئے معاملات کو آگے بڑھانے کے لئے نہیں تھے۔ میں ان سے پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ کس پرائیونائزیشن کی یہ بات کرتے ہیں۔ اس گورنمنٹ کی کیا credibility ہے کہ پرائیونائزیشن ہوگی۔ آپ کی چیز خریدنے کون آئے گا؟ آپ نے کیونکو کے ساتھ کیا کیا ہے؟ آپ نے جب کو سے

ساتھ کیا گیا ہے؟

جناب پریزائیڈنگ آفیسر۔ سوال آ گیا ہے۔ Advisor for Finance۔

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Let me put on record the fact that last year the stock of commercial debt rather than increase was actually reduced and this was made possible by the fact that the current account deficit and the balance of payment was dramatically improved last year. So, we are trying to make an attempt to improve the maturity structure of our debts and to the extent possible we would want to incur long term debts. Even the Islamic Development Financing, that he has talked of, is long term in character. Any debt in excess of three years is characterized as long term debt. The maturity of the Islamic development Bank's debts is five years.

Now, as far as the privatisation programme is concerned, I accept the fact that there have been some difficulties and especially in the regional context where capital markets are very shy and the overall situation is that foreign investors in particular are shy not only in the context with Pakistan but regionally it is, in fact, going to be a difficult task and that is the reason why we have strengthened the structure of the privatisation and infact tomorrow, we are going to have the first substantive meeting of the Privatisation Board where many of these matters will actually be considered.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Mr. Taj Haider.

جناب تاج حیدر۔ جناب کیا یہ حقیقت ہے کہ بیلنس آف payment میں جو reduction ہوا ہے۔ اس کی سب سے بڑی وجہ یہ ہے کہ انٹرنیشنل آئیل پرائسز نے کٹش کیا ہے اور انہوں نے اپنا پٹرولیم سرجارج اسی لیول پر رکھا ہے۔

and they are earning extra on petroleum surcharge and transferring this burden

on the people of Paksitan.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Advisor for finance.

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** I am talking about the reduction in the budget deficit last year which has occurred and that has occurred primarily because of a very substantial containment of public expenditure.

*(interruption)*

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** Let me present the facts then you ask me questions.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Order please. No interruption, please.

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** Let me give you the facts and figures. The reason why we were able to contain the budget deficit is because our public expenditure declined from something like 22% to 19% of the GDP and that itself was a major factor in contributing towards the improvement. Certainly, we have had more revenues from the petroleum surcharge last year but this was of course by less growth in other revenues. In overall terms, revenues have last year been effected dramatically by the phenomenon.

As far as the current account deficit is concerned, certainly, some contribution has been made, both last year and this year, by the reduction in the oil prices but I would like to suggest that there has been an improvement also in the current account. On the invisible side remittances showed significant growth last year and on the capital account we had substantially enhanced growth of private foreign investment. Our foreign currency account position also had improved last year. So, the overall improvement in the current account deficit and in the overall balance of payment is partly due to the improvement that took place

in international prices but other factors operated in our favour and contributed to the underlying improvement in the current account deficit.

جناب پریڈائیڈنگ آفیسر۔ پہلے زاہد خان، پھر آپ کو وقت ملے گا۔ جی زاہد خان صاحب۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان - میں معزز مشیر خزانہ سے پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ مچھلے دنوں اخبارات میں آپ کی طرف سے استعفیٰ آیا ہوا تھا وہ کن اختلافات کی بنیاد پر تھا، اس کو کیوں نہیں accept کیا گیا اور اب کیا صورتحال ہے؟

جناب پریڈائیڈنگ آفیسر۔ It is not a supplementary۔ جی صدر عباسی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر صدر علی عباسی - میں صرف یہ کہنا چاہوں گا کہ انہوں نے جتنی باتیں کی ہیں ان سب کو چیلنج کیا جا سکتا ہے۔ جناب پہلے بھی جب سرتاج صاحب وزیر خزانہ تھے تو ہم نے یہ demand کی تھی، انہوں نے accept کیا تھا کہ پاکستان کی جو economic policy ہے اس پر بحث کی جائے۔ میں اس وقت صرف اتنا کہوں گا کہ جو بھی اعداد و شمار اس وقت پیش کئے گئے ہیں یہ سارے اعداد و شمار چیلنج ہو سکتے ہیں۔ انہوں نے بات کی current accounts deficit کو کم کرنے کی، 27% ان کی export کم ہوئی ہے جس کی وجہ سے آج یہ جو تھوڑا بہت upset کرنا چاہتے ہیں کیونکہ export کے کم ہونے کی وجہ سے پاکستان کی انڈسٹری کی جو حالت ہے وہ آپ کے سامنے ہے۔ We can challenge, whatever he is saying لیکن میں اس کو چھوڑتا ہوں پھر بحث لمبی ہو جائے گی۔ جیسے میں نے پہلے بھی درخواست کی تھی اور سرتاج صاحب نے accept بھی کر لی تھی تو براہ کرم جب وقت ملے تو کم از کم گورنمنٹ کی اپنی فائنل پالیسی پر بحث کر لی جائے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is between the Leader of the House, Leader of the Opposition and yourself. Next question, Mr. Ilyas Ahmed Bilour.

42. \* Mr. Ilyas Ahmad Bilour: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the time by which the recovery of agricultural income tax will be started?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: Tax on agricultural income is a Provincial subject. The Federal Government is not considering any proposal for the levy of such tax.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Any supplementary please?

Syed Iqbal Haider: Supplementary is that why there is an upper hand discrimination. All other citizens are subjected to payment of Income Tax by the Federal Government. Why should agriculturists be left at the hands of provincial government, when discrimination is prohibited? Is there any proposal of the government to make agriculture income tax as a Federal tax.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Will you study the schedule? Schedule of the Constitution.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir then they can amend the constitution.

یہ شریعت کی باتیں کرنے والے ذرا مساوات محمدی کو اپنا کر دکھائیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Any other supplementary. Answer is the constitutional provision itself. The constitutional provision says that agricultural income tax is a provincial subject.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir, I know but, are they making preparation for amending the Constitution. Why should any section of the public be exempt from payment of Income Tax?

Mr. Presiding Officer: You mean to say that constitution should be amended for that matter.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir, for that matter, is there any proposal of the government to amend the Constitution to ensure that all are treated equally and

nobody is exempted from payment of Income Tax.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Whatever is there, it is a proposal for legislation. So far as the legislative proposal is concerned, that is the prerogative of the member himself. That is your prerogative. You can move a constitutional amendment.

**Shaikh Rafique Ahmed:** I disassociate myself from this question.

**Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar:** Mr. Chairman, if the honourable member is so serious, why does not he move a constitutional amendment in this House.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Yes, Mr. Aftab Ahmed Sheikh

**Mr. Aftab Ahmed Sheikh:** Mr. Chairman, it is since long that we are reading in papers that the Federal Government has been asking the provincial governments to impose this tax. So I have myself read in the paper and the provinces are not willing to impose this tax. I agree that this is a provincial subject. But there has been directions from Federal Government and the provincial government has not yielded to those directions. Is there any step in contemplation of the Federal Government to see that directions are complied with because they want this step to be imposed but the provinces are not agreed. So I just wanted to ask whether any step is in their view to compel the provinces to impose this agricultural tax?

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** But I think in Punjab and Sindh this tax have been imposed. This have been imposed. Yes, yes you are right, that is in Sindh, that is Punjab, that is Frontier, that is there. So what is the problem, there is no problem, it has been imposed already, yes that has been imposed.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Am I right Sartaj Sahib, yes.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Next question, Mr. Anwar Kamal Marwat.

Mr. Anwar Kamal Khan Marwat: Question No. 43.

43. \* Mr. Anwar Kamal Khan Marwat: Will the Minister for Commerce be please to state whether the Government permits export of Cement, Plastic Products, Steel Products, Electronics, Textile and Leather goods to Afghanistan, Central Asian Republics and Iran through land route, if so, whether duty rebate on the export of the said products is allowed?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Export of all these items to Afghanistan, Central Asian Republics and Iran is allowed through land route. Duty drawback is not allowed on exports of these items to Afghanistan and through Afghanistan to Central Asian Countries. Rebate is however, allowed if exports are made to Iran by land route and through Iran to to Central Asian Republic.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Any supplementary please.

جناب انور کمال خان مروت - جی جی اس میں یہ ہے کہ ایران اور سنٹرل ایشین

countries کے لیے انہوں نے کہا ہے کہ rebate allowed ہے but it is not allowed for Afghanistan and the Central Asian Countries. تو کیا اس کی وجہ میں پوچھ سکتا ہوں

کہ افغانستان کے لیے Rebate کیوں نہیں ہے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Minister for Commerce.

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Mr. Chairman, the main reason not to allow the exports rebate to Afghanistan or export to Central Asian States via Afghanistan is that it has been subject to a lot of misuse. The goods are either

shown on paper to be exported and they never leave Pakistan or even if they are exported the freight is so cheap. Across the border goods are going and coming back that becomes all waste of money on part of the exchequer. So that's why the rebate on this particular Afghanistan or Central Asian States via Afghanistan is not allowed, however, the duty draw back is allowed to Central Asian States export via Iran and also to Iran.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Mr. Anwar Kamal Marwat,

Mr. Anwar Kamal Khan Marwat: Supplementary

یہ ہے کہ وہ کہتے ہیں کہ freight اس میں allowed نہیں ہے کہ اس کا بہت کم کرایہ ہے I think freight تو ایران کے لیے بھی almost وہی ہو گا because Iran is also a neighbouring country and Afghanistan is also a neighbouring country. It would be true about Central Asian Countries but it can not be true about the Iran and Afghanistan because both are your border countries.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Minister for Commerce.

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Sir, with regard to the Iranian border, there is very strict compliance on both sides and there is no loose arrangements, so the goods do not come back, if they go to Central Asian States via Iran, or even if they go to Iran itself. In Afghanistan there is loose control over the other side, usually goods are supposed to come back and they do come back in parts. So that's why the prices there are even more expensive. The exporters always want an economic competitive price. It is still competitive and itself inclusive of duty draw back and he can still sell the goods at the current price in Pakistan, so there is no justification for duty draw back, even on that sense. Economic sense does not prevail to give duty draw back to goods to be exported to Afghanistan.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Yes, Major Mukhtar Ahmed.

**Maj. (Retd.) Mukhtar Ahmed Khan:** It is strange that such thing is happening and yet, I mean there is almost discrimination. What measures have they taken, what steps have they taken to stop this? You are responsible for that so tell us, this is no answer that just because that this sort of things have been happening and that's why we do not allow it. What are the steps that you have taken to prevent this?

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Minister for Commerce

**Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar:** Sir once in Afghanistan there is complete peace and there is a government of proper control over the borders and everything, I am sure that the Government will be quite happy to give duty drawback. It is not a discrimination. The events have forced the government to withdraw this duty drawback and not to allow this. So once the peace is there, we are very happy to give this rebate.

**Mr. Bashir Ahmed Matta:** This situation had been prevailing since a long time that the government was not wiser previously to put these restrictions. Is there something more? Have they now received some other instructions from some other quarters to coerce Taliban due to other reasons than trade. The Foreign Minister is sitting here, he would be in a better position to answer it. This situation, that he is describing this has been prevailing since a time immemorial, as long as the age of Pakistan. I mean for the last 50 years, but no body talked in this voice then now they are thinking in this way it is to coerce Taliban and this coercion is because they have certain instructions from other quarters. Why don't they admit it openly.

Mr. Presiding Officer: This is not a supplementary, that is the comment, yes.

Syed Aqil Shah: Sir, how are you calling five supplementary questions, please let us know.

جناب پریزائیڈنٹ آفیسر - جناب سلیمنٹری سوال کا یہ ہوتا ہے کہ کوئی انٹاریشن اس سوال کے متعلقہ پوچھی جاتی ہے۔ انہوں نے خود اس کو comment کرنے کے جواب دیا ہے۔ اس کو سلیمنٹری فارم میں پوچھیں۔

Mr. Bashir Ahmed Matta: With due respect I just want to put the question whether they have imposed this restriction under instructions from outside or not.

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is a supplementary.

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Mr. Chairman, certainly not. This government doesn't believe in taking dictation from anywhere. It is a pure economic decision. It is a pure decision to curb the goods coming back to Pakistan and wasting the taxpayer money in this way which is just a complete waste nothing else. So this government is not used to taking dictation from anywhere.

Syed Aqil Shah: What checks have been imposed?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Mr. Chairman, the biggest check is in itself not allowing the duty drawback and allowing the price to be the same what is prevalent in Pakistan. The same goods are sold at the same rates in Pakistan or in Afghanistan. So, it is in itself an economic check. So we cannot have the control of other side which is an independent country.

Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Sir, this year we are having a very

bumper crop of Rice Irri 6 and Irri 8 from Balochistan and Sindh. It was proposed that this irri 6 and irri 8 rice be allowed to be exported to Afghanistan, Iran and Central Asian countries, if the exporters give the money in dollars. Will the minister kindly consider this proposal, it came from the Chief Minister Balochistan to minister Lalika.

**Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar:** Sir, as long as the dollars are received for the export of irri 6 and irri 8 to Afghanistan or Central Asian states, since it is a basic commodity, there is no duty drawback. Pakistan has no problem. Sir, in fact, our government was more liberal than in June 1998 we have allowed first time the kitchen items to be exported to Afghanistan and Central Asian States via Afghanistan, obviously subject to no duty drawback.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Syed Iqbal Haider, No.44.

44. \* **Syed Iqbal Haider:** Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the number of criminal cases registered by the nationalised commercial banks and DFIs in the courts of law since 1st March, 1997 against the defaulters in payment of loans/outstanding amounts with province wise break-up;

(b) the number and names of the defaulters arrested, indicating also the amount outstanding and amount recovered from each; and

(c) present status of the cases pending against each?

**Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs:** (a) 172 cases were registered against the defaulters by Banks/DFIs involving an outstanding amount of Rs. 13491.33 million. The Province wise break-up is given as follows:-

Province Banks	DFIs				Total	
	No.	Amount	No.	Amount	No.	Amount
Punjab	106	5902	4	644	110	6546
Sindh	43	5423	7	766	50	6189
NWFP	7	118	3	273	10	391
Balochistan	1	2	1	363	2	365
Total:	157	11445	15	1946	172	13491

(b) 25 defaulters were arrested, involving the outstanding amount of Rs. 3147million against them. An amount of Rs. 43 million has been recovered from them.

(c) 15 defaulters have been released on bail. the others are still under arrest.

**Syed Iqbal Haider:** Sir, I am glad that one of my question has been answered . Thanks God. Sir, the question was, number of criminal cases instituted against the lutairas and defaulters in whole of Pakistan by all the DFIs and the nationalized banks put together have instituted only 172 cases. And sir, here the word 'criminal case is missing. I don't know that does it mean criminal case or civilsuit also. Sir the money involved in these 172 cases is 13491 millions i.e. 13 billion rupees recovery. Now see the answer given in (b) on one side 13 billion rupees are due by these 172 cases only. Secondly, amongst these 172 cases, they could only arrest 25, what a shameful state of affairs. And on top of it the amount recovered, instead of 13 billion rupees outstanding, only 43 million. Sir, is this the way that you are going to recover or are you promoting the culture of defaulters? Is this the way your institutions are working ? It is a matter of shame.

Mr. Presiding Officer: So far there is no supplementary.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir, my supplementary question, is what efforts are you making for arresting other defaulters and what efforts are you making for recovery of the 13 billion rupees of Pakistan from *lutairas*.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, Advisor for Finance.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Let me first clarify honourable Chairman, that these are criminal cases on the basis of FIR that they lodged and essentially relate to large loan defaulters who had criminally defrauded the banks. Now, let me emphasise to the honourable member that an assessment of this should not be done simply on the basis of the direct recovery because one of the purposes of this exercise is to act as an exercise in deterrence and it is what you should be focussing on it is not just the direct recovery that is important but what happens is when you are going for stronger enforcement and collection, you collect voluntarily a lot more from other people and the record on that basis is good as I have indicated in earlier sessions, we have had the highest collection upto now of outstanding debts of almost 13 billion over the last 15 months. We are of course, cognizant of the fact that there is still need to recover directly from these people, something like 13 billion and due process is on going and we would like to assure the House that we will make attempts to recover whatever is legitimately due from these defaulters. We cannot, of course, interfere with the legal process, we have to accept its integrity and proceed accordingly.

جناب پریزائیڈنگ آفیسر۔ جی ڈاکٹر عباسی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب والا! مجھے اس بات پر ہنسی آ رہی ہے۔ frankly -

ایڈوائزر صاحب یہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ یہ کیسز ہم نے deterrence کے طور پر داخل کئے ہیں۔ ان کو

شاید figures ملتی ہیں کہ نہیں ملتی ہیں لیکن اخبارات بھرے پڑے ہیں۔ یہ dead portfolio جو ڈیپلٹرز کی طرف 43 بلین تھا۔ جب ان کی حکومت آئی ہے وہ بڑھ کر ۲۰۰ بلین پر پہنچ گیا ہے اور یہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ ۲۰۰ بلین میں سے ۱۲ بلین کے لئے انہوں نے کیسز لاج کئے ہیں اور ۱۳ بلین میں سے ڈیپلٹرز جو arrest ہوئے ہیں وہ تین بلین کے لوگ arrest ہوئے ہیں اور ۲۲ recovery ملین کی ہوئی ہے۔ جناب! یہ pathetic صورتحال ہے۔ جناب! اس کی وجہ یہ ہے کہ حکومت کے پاس کوئی پالیسی ہی نہیں ہے۔ ایک دن ان کی پالیسی اگست ۷۹ میں بنتی ہے کہ سٹیٹ بینک concession دیتا ہے کہ آپ جمع کرائیں۔ وہ پالیسی درمیان میں رہ جاتی ہے اور وزیر اعظم صاحب اپنی political expediency کی خاطر ٹی وی پر آتے ہیں اور اعلان کرتے ہیں کہ میں ڈیپلٹرز کے پیچھے جا رہا ہوں۔ وہ وزیر اعظم جو خود ۱۰ ارب کا ڈیپلٹرز ہو۔ وہ کیا کسی ڈیپلٹرز کے پیچھے جائے گا پھر وزیر اعظم کا اعلان اپنی جگہ پر۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Put the supplementary please.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب! میں یہ حکومت کی پالیسی آپ کو بتا رہا ہوں کہ اس کی وجہ سے سب کچھ ہوا ہے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Policy cannot be discussed in the by laws, ask the supplementary.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب! یہ recovery کیوں نہیں ہو رہی ہے۔ جناب میں بول رہا ہوں۔ جناب! آپ میری بات تو سنیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: No, no, Abbasi sahib, that is the established principle that you can't discuss the policy, as a whole, you can make a supplementary.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب! اسی لئے تو میں کہہ رہا ہوں۔ پہلے سٹیٹ بینک ایک پالیسی دیتا ہے۔ اس کے جواب میں وزیر اعظم صاحب پھر وہ پالیسی فیل ہو جاتی ہے۔ وزیر اعظم صاحب ٹی وی پر آتے ہیں اور اعلان کرتے ہیں کہ میں ڈیپلٹرز کے پیچھے جا رہا ہوں۔ میں

یہ کہہ رہا ہوں کہ اس سے بڑا اس ملک میں کوئی ڈیپلٹر ہے۔ وہ دس ارب کا ڈیپلٹر ہے۔ وہ کیا ان کے پیچھے جائے گا۔ میں آگے بات پر آتا ہوں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: So far you have not put supplementary question. Please put the supplementary and don't make a speech.

Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi: Sir, if you could wait and just listen to me I will put a supplementary.

Mr. Presiding Officer: No, no, there are so many questions, you put a supplementary directly.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب! میں کر رہا ہوں۔ جناب! جتنا آپ وقت ضائع کرتے ہیں، اتنی دیر میں تو میں بات کر چکا ہوتا معذرت کے ساتھ۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: I am grateful to you for these remarks.

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی۔ جناب! میرا سوال یہ ہے کہ جو حکومت کی پالیسی کی inconsistencies ہیں۔ اب انہوں نے incentives دوبارہ دے دئے ہیں۔ میں ان سے یہ پوچھتا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ پالیسی کی inconsistencies ہیں، غدار! جب تک آپ ان کو ختم نہیں کریں گے تب تک آپ کوئی recovery نہیں کر سکتے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is a criticism. Now, Mr. Jehangir Badar.

Mr. Jehangir Badar: My question is direct that who is the biggest defaulter in Pakistan? This is very simple question.

Mr. Presiding Officer: You should give a fresh notice for that I think.

جناب جہانگیر بدر۔ جناب! آپ انہیں جواب دینے دیں۔ please شیخ صاحب۔ میں آپ کے بارے میں کبھی نہیں بولا۔ آپ مہربانی کریں۔ شکریہ۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Do you think this question arises from this?

جناب جمالیگر بدر۔ دکھیں جی۔ ایک صاحب اپنے محکمے کے وزیر ہیں اور یہ بنک کے جتنے قرضے ہیں۔ ان کے محکمے میں آتے ہیں۔ وہ ان کو recover بھی کرنا چاہتے ہیں بیسہ کہ انہوں نے بتایا۔ انہوں نے کیسز بھی اس پر درج کئے ہیں اور اس پر یہ بتایا جائے کہ ان کیسز پر یہ تو ان کو معلوم ہو گا کہ who is the biggest defaulter in Pakistan بتائیں تاکہ قوم کو پتہ تو چلے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please take your seat. Yes please.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: The question, as it was asked, asked for the name of the defaulters arrested indicating also the outstanding amount recovered from each. I can only give you a factual answer. I can not speculate or conjecture the position of arrested defaulters by size of loan that has been given in statement. No.2 if they want to raise a question, they are welcome to, I will obtain the necessary information and provide it to them.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Mr. Aftab Ahmed Shaikh.

آپ نے سلیمنٹری پوچھ لیا ہے؟

جناب جمالیگر بدر، جناب چیئرمین! یہ پچھلے دفعہ بھی کرسی چھوڑ کر بھاگ گئے تھے۔ جناب میں آپ کا بڑا احترام کرتا ہوں۔ آپ اتنے بڑے پارلیمنٹیرین ہیں۔ آپ میری بات سن لیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please take your seat. Mr. Aftab Ahmed Shaikh Sahib. That is not the way. Mr. Aftab Ahmed Shaikh, I have allowed him to ask supplementary. No sir, no, I will not allow. Please take your seat. Mr. Aftab Ahmed Shaikh.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: I am willing to give information if they put a fresh question. I don't have it.

(interruption)

Mr. Presiding Officer: He is asking for a fresh notice.

(interruption)

Mr. Presiding Officer: Matta Sahib, the position is that whatever is the supplementary on that, I have given my ruling that this is not a supplementary and if you want to put this question, please put a separate question for that and he will answer it. Mr. Aftab Ahmed Shaikh.

Mr. Aftab Ahmed Sheikh: My submission is Mr. Chairman, I will invite your attention to question 44 part (b), the number and names of defaulters arrested indicating also the amount outstanding and amount recovered from each. Now the answer is 25 defaulters were arrested involving the outstanding amount of 3147 million against them. My submission is that the question is very explicit, clear and names have been demanded and names have not been given.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Names have not been demanded. Yes, Advisor for Finance.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: I have the list of names, if you want, I can provide it.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please read it. I think when he will read it, it will become the property of the House. Let the list be read.

(interruption)

Mian Raza Rabbani: He is concealing from the House.

[ At this stage Azan was heard ]

Mr. Presiding Officer: The House is adjourned for 20 minutes for

Maghreb prayers.

(The House was adjourned and reassembled after twenty minutes)

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please call the Advisor to Finance. He had to read the list. Yes please.

Mr. Aftab Ahmed Sheikh: The number and names.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Total number of persons arrested, numbers and names of the defaulters arrested.

جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ جی ہاں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، انہوں نے ہمیں دیا ہے غالباً۔

25 defaulters were arrested involving an outstanding amount of 3147 Million against them and an amount of 43 Million has been recovered from them

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: Yes.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes. The number is 25 and the names of the defaulters arrested indicating also the amount outstanding and amount recovered from each

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: Yes Sir.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes you are right.

Mr. Aftab Ahme Sheikh : Now, 25 defaulters as they say have been arrested. How much amount recovered individually from each defaulter?

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes each defaulter, yes.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: One, and then what are the names of these 25 defaulters?

Mr. Presiding Officer: 25 defaulters, yes, you are right.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: The answer is incomplete

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes this answer is incomplete unless he gives us some details. Yes you are right.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: If the details are given and the amounts are given against each

Mr. Presiding Officer: Advisor for Finance

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: I have the statement in front of me, honourable Chairman and I will give the detail.

Mr. Presiding Officer: But Aftab Sheikh wanted to point out before you came to the house, he says that the names of the persons who have defaulted No. 1 and No.2 the amount outstanding against each.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha : The position is, I will go in descending order and if you allow me I place this record here and it can be seen. I have recovered the biggest defaulters and if we have time, we can recover outstanding.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Aftab Sahib would you like to read the names. Do you want those names should be read? Yes please read it.

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: No. 1 in terms of ties the largest defaulter and let me clarify your honourable Chairman that this is the largest defaulter in the category of those who are arrested, now an attempt of course was made to capture the largest defaulters. So it is quite possible that he made the default but I can't confirm that. The first is golden textile mills Ltd., the amount outstanding

was 7001.04 Million rupees, amount recovered , upto now there is no recovery.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** That is the organisation not the man.

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** I can give you the name of the individual , it is Mr. S. Talib Hussain. The second largest is Al-Azhar Textile , name of the defaulter is Mirza Akbar Baig and the amount outstanding is 508.181 million. The amount recovered is 2.063 million The third largest defaulter Hyderabad Electronics, name of the defaulter is Zakria Isfahani , the amount outstanding is 406 million and there is no recovery upto now. The fourth largest is First Tawakul Mudarba and the name of the defaulter is Abdul Qadir Tawakil and Rafique Tawakul. The amount outstanding is 256.359 million, the amount recovered is 16.369 million. Fifth is Tawakkul Ltd. the same individuals, the amount is 203.966 and amount recovered is 12.737. Sixth in the list in terms of size is M/s Chaudhry Biarope. The defaulters are Ch. Muhammad Azam and Ch. Muhammad Akbar. The amount outstanding is 184.307 million. There is no recovery. No.7. in size is M/s Tristar Shipping Lines and Mr. Tariq Masood Bakpati, Mr. Mansoor Khalid Bakpati. The amount outstanding is 141.494. Eighth in order is M/s M.B. and S.S. sons Company the individual is Mr. Suhail Siddique Stall. The amount involved is 154.680 million. There is no recovery yet. The ninth in this order is Mr. Fazal Mahmood and Co. Fazal Mahmood Aurangzeb, Fazal Qadir are the defaulters . The amount involved is 129.529 million. Recovery that has taken place uptill is 10 million. I can carry on, the amounts now are below hundred million.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Yes.

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** I have covered all the defaulters who have been arrested in this list, who are large with amounts above 100 million. If you

like I can read the list.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Please go on reading.

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** Now, I will give you in random because I have not classified the size because these are relatively small. Raja Traders, Raja Abdul Ghaffar. Amount outstanding is 0.77 million. Recoverd 0.2. Then comes Shakeel Enterprises. The defaulter is Shakeel Akhtar. 1.016. Then Sajjad Ahmed 0.119 million, recovery 0.100. Rao Associates. Rao Tariq Mahmood, Abdul Qadir Tawakul 4.276, recovered 0.388. Then comes Alpha Associates. Muhammad Shahid 0.253 million full recovery has taken place. Thakur Private Limited. Mr. Rizwan Azmat 84.818 million. Amount recovered 1.02 million. Abbasin International Karachi, defaulter M. Sharifuddin 53.961 million. Then Crescent Mills Spinning Javed Amin 26.307 million, no recovery. Sumpus Paper Port Mills, M. Maqbool 22.59 million, no recovery. Thalias Enterprise, Riaz 23.371 million, no recovery. Then comes Shaista Khan Coal Mines. And Mr. Shaista Khan 1.653 recovery 0.25 million. Then M/s. Nephew and Nephew, Mr. Abdul Waheed 36,606. The amount recoverd is zero. M/s Fateh Apparel, same Mr. Abdul Waheed 41.760. No recovery. This is the grand total 25 arrested. The grand total is 3.147 the outstanding amount and the amount recovered todate 43.155 million and this recovered will be placed in front of the House.

جناب جہانگیر بدر۔ جناب والا! میرا استحقاق مجروح ہوا ہے۔ میں نے جب انہیں سوال دیا تو سوال کے جواب میں اس وقت یہ فہرست نہیں پیش کی گئی۔ یہ میں آپ کے نوٹس میں لانا چاہتا ہوں۔ دوسری بات یہ ہے کہ یہ فہرست جو پیش کی گئی ہے یہ ان ڈیفالٹرز کی ہے جن کے خلاف مہدات درج ہوئے، جو arrest ہوئے۔ میرا سوال ہے کہ کیا اس کے علاوہ ایسے ڈیفالٹرز بھی ہیں ان سے زیادہ بڑے کہ جنہوں نے ان سے زیادہ بڑی رقم دینی ہوں اور ان کے خلاف مہدات نہ قائم کئے گئے ہوں اور انہیں گرفتار

and amongst them who is the biggest, this is my question. نہ کیا گیا ہو ان کے نام بتائیں۔

**Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha:** I have given the honourable member the information that was asked. The question that was originally framed by the honourable member related to the largest defaulter per se. What I have given is the names and amount outstanding and recovered against defaulters who have been arrested, which was part of the question. Now, if you want additional information on who is the largest defaulter per se we will constitute that and request him to frame a special question on that and we will provide him with the necessary information.

جناب جہانگیر بدر، جناب چیئرمین! میرا سوال یہ ہے کہ nobody is above law, no one is above the law, this is the fundamental law of Pakistan, this is in every Constitution of the world آپ یہ بتائیں کہ اس کیسے، اس ٹارمولے کے تحت آپ کو یہ کیسے حق پہنچا کہ آپ ایک discretion استعمال کرتے ہوئے چند لوگوں کو تو گرفتار کریں اور باقیوں کو بھول جائیں اور ان کا ذکر بھی نہ ہو اور ذکر کیا جائے تو آپ ان کے نام نہ بتائیں۔ یہ بتائیں یہاں پر۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر، اس کے متعلق انہوں نے کہا ہے کہ آپ الگ سوال دے دیں تو فرست مہیا کر دیں گے۔

جناب جہانگیر بدر، جناب یہ صرف اتنا بتادیں کہ do they believe that no one is above the law, are they applying this fundamental principle of Constitution into their banking cases or not?

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Even if they don't admit, I think, everybody is equal before the law. Mr. Rajwana.

**Mr. Muhammad Rafiq Rajwana:** Sir, would the learned Advisor be pleased to tell that in this list the defaulters who were arrested in lieu of the

registration of criminal cases, but what about the defaulters against whom the decrees have been passed and the number of those defaulters who have been detained in civil prison because of the non-satisfaction of the decretal amount passed by the Banking Courts. Can he tell the number of those defaulters who have been detained in civil prison?

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Sir, the same will be provided the necessary information.

Mr. Presiding Officer: I think, so far as the Banking Courts are concerned, those are not criminal charges. That is a civil liability and for that you would be required to give a fresh notice Now, Mr. Shafqat Mehmood.

جناب شفقت محمود، تقریر میں defaulters کو arrest کرنے کا ایک اندیسا دیا گیا تھا اور اس کے بعد پھر کارروائی ہوئی۔ اس تقریر میں وزیر اعظم پاکستان نے یہ بھی کہا تھا کہ میں نے اپنے loans adjust کرنے کے لئے فلاں فلاں میں اور فیکٹریاں بنکوں کے حوالے کر دی ہیں تاکہ میرا adjust ہو جائے۔ کیا ایڈوائزر بتائیں گے کہ وہ جو فیکٹریاں دی گئی تھیں اس کے ساتھ وزیر اعظم کے loans adjust ہو گئے ہیں؟ اگر نہیں ہوتے تو اس کا current status کیا ہے؟

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, would you like to answer this question?

Dr. Hafeez A. Pasha: Again this is in the nature of a fresh question.

(interruption)

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، جی جناب شفقت محمود صاحب۔

جناب شفقت محمود، جناب وزیر اعظم پاکستان نے قومی نشریاتی رابطہ پر قوم کو خطاب کرتے ہوئے ایک اعلان کیا اور ساری قوم کے سامنے کہا کہ جناب میں اپنی فیکٹریاں اپنی جائیداد اپنے loans adjust کرنے کے لئے بنکوں کے حوالے کر رہا ہوں۔ میں یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ اتنا بڑا اعلان جو ساری قوم کے سامنے کیا گیا تھا اس کو چار یا پانچ مہینے ہو گئے ہیں، مجھے

بتایا جائے کہ کیا ہوا ہے اس کا؟

جناب چیئرمین: شفقت محمود صاحب اس میں تو arrested آدمی جو ہیں ان کے

متعلق پوچھا گیا ہے۔ آپ سوال کو دیکھیں۔۔ You may give a fresh notice for that. جی جناب

رضا ربانی صاحب۔

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Sir, my supplementary, through you, to the honourable Advisor is that after the statement of the Prime Minister that he is handing over some of his assets and companies to the banks, a Committee was formed by the Lahore High Court to which these assets were to be given so that it could carry out an evaluation. Is it not a fact that in the month of August, as late as August, the Committee made an application to the High Court of Punjab, stating therein that the assets had not yet been handed over to them and that a direction should be given to them to hand over the assets. This was reported in the national dailies and particularly so in the "DAWN" if I remember correctly of the 14th August, and till date there has been no contradiction of this report from either the Ministry, or the High Court that there has been a misrepresentation by the Prime Minister. So, therefore, according to the judgement of the Supreme Court, it is to be taken that, that reporting was correct. So, will the Minister or Advisor confirm this fact?

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** You have a vast experience and you know that this question was about arrested persons, was he an arrested person?

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Sir, this question basically relates to bank loan defaulters.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** No, there is a special category about arrested persons. This information is not about all the defaulters.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, please bear with me. The larger parameter of this question is bank loan defaulters. The specific point on which the question is focussed is recovery of loans and making it further specific is those who were arrested and against whom cases are pending. Now the ambit of supplementaries, as defined in the Rules, is that it will pertain to the basic concept of the question. That is what supplementaries are for. If the answer, as given is to be taken then that it is, the end of the matter but here this pertains essentially to the same subject matter and when it pertains to the same subject matter and the Minister is present therefore, he has to answer. He can not keep on asking for fresh notice on each and every question.

Let us come to the Chapter on question. It is dealt with there. The supplementaries are dealt with there. This Rule 55,

"When a question has been answered, any member may ask such supplementary questions as may be necessary for the elucidation of the answer." Now here we are talking about bank loan defaulters. Now the people want to know that whether a category of bank loans defaulters has been arrested and a category is not being arrested. Is there discrimination or is there no discrimination but the Chairman shall disallow any supplementary question which, in his opinion, either infringes any provision of these rules relating to the subject matter and admissibility of question or otherwise is an abuse of the right of asking question.

Now, I fall back here again when a question has been answered. Any member may ask such supplementary questions as may be necessary for the elucidation of the answer. Yes, this now is necessary. It is now necessary for the honourable Advisor to elucidate whether there is discrimination that 25

people or the number given are being prosecuted and the other loan defaulters, because there is a list of the State Bank of Pakistan, will the Advisor deny this list. This is a list of the State Bank of Pakistan of loan defaulters ending for the quarter 31st March, 1998 in which the house of Itefaq is mentioned, in which Redco is mentioned as a defaulter. Now it is for the elucidation of the answer given here that these supplementaries are being asked that what is the criteria that why when a list which has been produced by the State Bank of Pakistan shows the House of Itefaq as a defaulter, shows Redco as a defaulter at No.3, 4 and No.8, then why this discrimination, that why cases have not been instituted against them? Why proceedings are not being undertaken against them. Falling back on Rule 55, he cannot ask for fresh notice because these are questions related to, pertaining with, directly or indirectly linked with the question that has come and the statement that he has made. Therefore he is bound to elucidate his answer under Rule 55.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** It is always the practice in the rules that a particular question is always specific. That is always asked on a specific issue. The question as framed by the honourable member Syed Iqbal Haider was in respect of the default in the payment of the loans and the persons arrested and that information have been given in the answer. If any body or any member wants fresh information about the other defaulters who have not been arrested then he should give a fresh notice. Question hour is over now.

---

*The Question Hour is over and the remaining questions and answers were taken as read and were placed on the table of the House*

45. \* Syed Iqbal Haider: Will the Minister for Commerce be pleased to state the total amount as on 31st December 1997 of the inter corporate circular debt due or payable by or receivable by the Ministry or any of the companies and corporations owned or controlled by the Ministry, separately, indicating also the names of the debtors and creditors?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: The inter-corporate circular debt as on 31-12-1997 payable or receivable by the Trading Corporation of Pakistan, Rice Export Corporation of Pakistan, Cotton Export Corporation and the Civil Centres Company is as follows:-

**Trading Corporation of Pakistan** Rs. in million

Payable	2,512.220
Receivable	2,160.864

Details at Annex-I

**Rice Export Corporation of Pakistan** Rs. in million

Payable	-----
Receivable	60.693

The amount is receivable from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs

**Cotton Export Corporation of Pakistan** Rs. in million

Payable	10,000
Receivable	7.568

Detail at Annex-II

**Civic Centres Company**

Rs. in million

Payable	704.900
---------	---------

Receivable 1,052.747

Detail at Annex-III

ANNEX-I

## TRADING CORPORATION OF PAKISTAN

Amount

(Rs. in million)

### DEBT PAYABLE:

Payable to Federal Government	1.166
Payable to the Corporations	1.048
Payable to the Banks	2,453.098
Payable to Companies and others	<u>56.908</u>
Total	<u>2,517.220</u>

### DEBT RECEIVABLE:

Receivable from Federal Government	409.861
Receivable from Provincial Government	5.997
Receivable from Corporations	1,732.753
Receivable from Companies and others	<u>12.250</u>
Total;	<u>2,160.864</u>

ANNEX-II

## COTTON EXPORT CORPORATION OF PAKISTAN

### AMOUNT PAYABLE

Cotton Trading Corporation Rs. 10.000  
million

(under liquidation)

AMOUNT RECEIVABLE:

National Insurance Corporation

Rs. 7.568 million

ANNEX-III

CIVIC CENTRES COMPANY (PVT) LTD.

PAYABLES

	Amount (Rs. in million)
State Enterprises Display Centre	153.000
Karachi Development Authority & Employees Old Age Benefit Installation	198.000
Punjab Cooperative Board for Liquidation	11.900
M/s Paksitan BAnking Council (State Bank of Pakistan)	342.000
<b>Total:</b>	<b>704.900</b>

CIVIC CENTRES COMPANY (PVT) LTD. RECEIVABLE

	Amount (Rs. in million)
Utility Stores Corporation	291.716
Pakistan Telecommunication Corporation Ltd.	327.671
Water and Power Development Authority	182.722
Karachi Electric Supply Corporation	41.241
Sui Northern Gas Pipelines Limited	80.891
Sui Southern Gas Company Limited	101.146
Pakistan Post Office Department	15.929
Karachi Water & Sewerage Board	1.627

Directorate of Immigration and Passport	3.517
Pakistan International Airlines	0.250
Pakistan Railway Advisory and Consultancy Service	1.678
Capital Development Authority	1.399
Habib Bank Limited	1.342
National Bank of Pakistan	<u>0.503</u>
<b>Total:</b>	<b>1,052.747</b>

47. \* Mr. Habib Jalib Baloch: Will the Minister for Commerce be pleased to state:

(a) the details of profit/loss of the cement industry in public sector during the last five years, separately, and the steps taken by the Government to improve the situation; and

(b) the incentives demanded by " All Pakistan Cement Manufacturers Association " for the export of Cement and the incentives provided by the Government so far?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: (a) the details of the profit/loss of the cement industry in the public sector during the last five years are given at Annex-I.

The Government has taken the following steps to improve the situation:

(i) Surplus staff have been reduced by offering them Voluntary Separation Scheme (VSS) Golden Handshake Scheme (GHS).

(ii) Wet process kilns which are not economically viable have been closed.

(iii) The Government have reduced the price of furnace oil ( one of the major input for the manufacture of cement) from Rs. 6,297 per ton to Rs. 5,500 per ton.

(iv) The Government have increased duty drawback on the export of cement and clinker from Rs. 300 to Rs. 600 per ton and from Rs. 270 to Rs. 300 per ton respectively.

(b) All Pakistan Cement Manufacturers Association have demanded the following incentives:-

(i) Export of surplus cement and increase of custom duty on import of cement.

(ii) Duty Drawback on all duties/taxes. Duty drawback rates should not be linked with *f.o.b.* price of cement and clinker. Duty drawback should be allowed on surcharge and additional surcharge paid on electricity.

(iii) Availability of a separate berth for loading of cement at Karachi or Port Qasim.

(iv) Subsidy in Sea freight @ US \$ 5 per ton. Freight equalization incentives to plants in NWFP and Punjab of Rs. 250 per ton against export of cement & clinker.

(v) Export to India by Rail.

(vi) Charging of Excise Duty on Ex-factory basis and reduction of Excise duty from 4% to 25% or at a fixed rate of Rs. 1,250 per ton.

(vii) Permission for import of furnace oil by the Association.

(viii) Ban on setting up of new cement plants.

(ix) Elimination of Provincial tax on export of cement.

(x) Some kind of relief on export of cement to Afghanistan.

The Government have provided following incentives so far:-

(i) Permission of export of cement and clinker.

(ii) Duty drawback @ 12.5% of the *f.o.b.* value subject to maximum of Rs. 300 per metric ton of cement and at the same rate subject to maximum of Rs. 270 per metric ton of clinker was allowed *w.e.f.* 11-7-1997. It was allowed at a fixed rate of Rs. 300 and Rs. 270 per ton of cement and clinker respectively on 17-4-1998. Subsequently, it was increased to Rs. 600 and Rs. 300 and per ton on cement and clinker respectively on 27-5-1998.

(iii) The facility such as transit shed, open backup area of 200 meters x 600 meters, one window operation etc. are available at Port Qasim.

(iv) The issue regarding flow of scarce financial resources to new cement manufacturing units is under consideration in consultation with Finance Division.

(v) The issue regarding waiving of Provincial taxes on the export of cement is under consideration of the Provincial Government.

**STATEMENT SHOWING PROFIT/(LOSS) BEFORE TAX OF STATE CEMENT CORPORATION OF PAKISTAN (SCCP) CEMENT UNITS FOR THE YEAR 1990-91 TO 1997-98 AND PROJECTED 1998-99**

(Rs. in Million)

<u>Unit Name</u>	<u>1990-91</u>	<u>1991-92</u>	<u>1992-93</u>	<u>1993-94</u>	<u>1994-95</u>	<u>1995-96</u>	<u>1996-97</u>	<u>1997-98</u> <u>(Un-audited)</u>	<u>1998-99</u> <u>(Projected)</u>
Mustekkam Cement	47.44	81.86	170.77	242.85	229.38	54.28	(189.52)	(190.15)	(379.77)
Javedan Cement	(50.63)	86.25	55.57	68.00	130.00	(104.36)	(91.60)	(31.43)	(182.77)
Thatta Cement	(149.83)	(117.78)	37.06	79.76	29.83	10.03	(51.97)	(60.47)	(37.14)
Associated Cement, Rohri	(8.90)	(7.55)	(117.43)	37.07	58.68	12.41	(51.70)	(41.96)	(74.07)
<u>Total</u>	<u>(161.92)</u>	<u>36.95</u>	<u>245.97</u>	<u>427.68</u>	<u>447.89</u>	<u>(27.64)</u>	<u>(384.79)</u>	<u>(324.01)</u>	<u>(673.63)</u>

\* Note: - Losses are indicated within brackets.

48. \* Mr. Habib Jalib Baloch: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the procedure and process of privatization of government assets?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: Privatisation Commission generally adopts different transparent procedures for the Privatisation of different state Owned Entities. Real estate and small/medium size industrial units are privatised through an open auction/sealed bidding process, in which participation is open to all. Bigger industrial units and small size financial Institutions have been/are privatised by auction through open sealed bidding process involving prequalified parties. In utilities, infrastructure, transportation and large size bank. Financial Advisors have been/are appointed for selling a strategic stake with management control to pre-qualified bidders in an auction through open/sealed bidding process.

49. \* Mr. Habib Jalib Baloch: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet division be pleased to state the details of development package for District Chaghi announced by the Prime Minister of Pakistan during his visit to Chaghi after nuclear tests?

Minister Incharge for the Cabinet Division: The Minister during his visit to Dalbandin (Chaghi) Balochistan on 19-6-1998, was pleased to announce the following development package for Chaghi district:-

- (i) Provision of Rs. 70 million for installation of Tube Well, delay action dams and under ground water channels (Kareez)
- (ii) Provision of Rs. 25 million for construction/rehabilitation of dam-aged dams/bunds through tractors/bulldozers.

(iii) Provision of 40 VHF PCOs.

(iv) Preparation of a special plan for export of fruits/vegetables from Chaghi to Middle Eastern Countries through special cargo flights.

(v) Expenditures completion of codal formalities to start work on 132 KV transmission line to link Noshki, Dalbandin, Chaghi Section with the National Grid.

50. \* Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the amount deposited by the local Pakistanis and foreign residents, separately, in the National Self Reliance Fund Account Nos. 1 and 2 so far?

Reply not received.

51. \* Dr. Safdar Ali Abbasi: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the number of units privatized since February 1997 indicating also the sale value of each unit;

(b) the base price fixed for privatization of these units, separately, and

(c) the amount recovered from the sale of each of the said unit so far?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: The relevant information is enclosed as Annexure.

**Government of Pakistan**  
**Finance Division**  
**Privatisation Commission**

... STARRED SENATE QUESTION NO. 51 DUE FOR ANSWER ON  
LIST OF UNITS PRIVATISED FROM FEBRUARY 1997

Rs. in million

S.No.	UNIT NAME	SALE VALUE	BASE PRICE/ REFERENCE PRICE APPROVED BY CCOP	AMOUNT RECOVERED	REMARKS
1	Habib Credit & Exchange Bank Ltd	1,638.000	1,680.000	1,638.000	Management transferred
2	First Women Bank Ltd.	285.600	163.200	10.000	The transaction not finalised because of case in Lahore High Court, Lahore.
3	Associated Hotels of Pakistan Ltd. Cecil Hotel	201.000	330.000	185.950	Possession handed over.
4	Associated Hotels of Pakistan Ltd.- Deans Hotel	364.000	185.000	10.000	Possession will be handed over after full payment is received.
5	Federal lodges 1 to 4	40.200	82.311	35.300	Possession will be handed over after full payment is received.
6	Federal lodges 5	8.500	No reference price	4.250	The buyer has requested for extension of one month to pay balance sale price. The possession will be handed over after full payment is received.
7	Federal lodges 6	14.100	No reference price	7.050	
8	Dargal Vegetable Oil	33.000	80.954	26.220	The management has been transferred. The difference of sale value and receipt is due to audit adjustment.
9	Gulshan e Iqbal Roti Plant	20.200	16.900	20.200	The management transferred.
10	International Advertising (Pvt) Ltd.	5.178	5.178	1.000	The management will be transferred after receipt of full payment.
Total:		2,604.600	2,543.543	1,936.970	

52. \* Dr. Jamiluddin Aali: Will the Minister for Commerce be pleased to state the impact of devaluation of Pak Rupee, each year, on exports and bugetary expenditures during the period of devaluations between the last five financial years?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: During the last five years, the impactof devaluation on exports and imports has largely been as desired *i.e.* exports registered an increase and imports declined during the next 4-5 months subsequent to each devaluation. The details are given below.

Exports registered a monthly average increase of 2.9% during the next 4 months following the devaluation of 5.69% on 2-7-1993 whereas imports declined by 3.0% during the same period.

Subsequent to devaluation of 7% on 22-10-1995, export registered a monthly average increase of 7.1% during next 4 months whereas imports increased by 0.56% during this period.

Subsequent to devaluation of 3.6% on 10-9-1996 and 7.85% on 22-10-1996, exports registered a monthly average increase of 2.5% during next 5-6 months whereas imports declined by 2.1% in this period.

During November-March 1997-98, exports registered a monthly average increase of 2.1% following the devaluation of 8.9% on 15-10-1997, whereas imports in this period declined by 5.9%.

Following the devaluation of 4.2% on 27-6-1998, the exports have registered a monthly average increase of 2.1% during August-September, 1998 whereas imports declined by 1.7% in this period.

Detailed regarding devaluation exports and imports are annexed.

The dates of devaluation during last five year is as under:

Date	Rupées per US\$	% Change
22-7-1993	29.85	5.69
28-10-1995	34.25	7.00
10-9-1996	36.97	3.65
22-10-1996	40.12	7.85
15-10-1997	44.05	8.9
27-6-1998	46.00	4.2

#### MONTH-WISE EXPORTS

Month:	Value in Million US\$					
	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	1996-97	1997-98	1998-99
July	451	555	519	576	662	592
August	556	562	553	664	692	624
September	557	593	554	675	666	617
October	465	622	545	666	713	
November	505	637	628	657	771	
December	664	746	717	801	838	
January	570	636	824	650	604	
February	552	567	718	642	706	
March	556	622	871	766	790	
April	570	736	811	684	700	
May	614	794	857	714	696	
June	738	975	1110	792	750	

## MONTH-WISE IMPORTS

	Value in Million US\$					
	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	1996-97	1997-98	1998-99
July	720.7	833.7	815.3	846.4	399.3	692.5
August	658.6	700.7	687.2	883.4	794.7	710.5
September	689.2	733.3	910.4	942.9	946.7	659.0
October	678.6	790.0	980.1	1118.3	1024.0	
November	698.5	777.9	969.6	967.3	860.6	
December	646.9	844.5	963.0	1042.1	947.0	
January	723.1	977.1	930.5	1018.3	769.3	
February	667.1	873.3	981.9	845.9	777.2	
March	661.6	906.7	1183.7	1085.3	753.5	
April	790.8	939.9	964.3	960.0	671.9	
May	726.5	917.7	1005.2	1007.0	693.6	
June	727.1	1100.6	1233.7	916.8	960.3	

53. \* Dr. Jamiluddin Aali: Will the Minister for finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to refer the Senate question No. 54 replied on 7th October, 1998 and the time by which the requisite information will be provided?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: The information is being collected from Banks and DFIs. Due to voluminous nature, the collection will take more than two weeks. As soon as it is received, the reply will be placed on the table of the House.

54. \* Mr. Bashir Ahmad Matta: Will the Minister Incharge of the Establishment Division be pleased to state whether any action has been taken on the recommendations of the Cabinet Committee formed on 12-12-1997 for the reinstatement of the retrenched officers of the United Bank Limited, if so its details and if not its reasons?

Minister Incharge of the Establishment Division: Action by the Cabinet committee in terms of Cabinet decision was due in respect of employees of UBL who had not received any early retirement benefit or golden handshake and above case did not rest subjudice. Initially this number was stated to be 288. Of them 276 appeared before the Selection Committee headed by acting chairman Banking and Finance Services Commission for processing. During interviews another 35 were excluded as payees of dues. Of the remaining 241, the absorption/adjustment position is as follows:-

(i) Recommended to be absorbed in PICIC

IDBP, PSPC AND SBFC

75

(ii) Decided to be absorbed in Sales Department

of CBR

86

Total of i, ii & iii 236

Efforts are on to adjust the remaining five.

55. \* Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division pleased to state whether it is a fact that Air Conditioning and sanitation system, telephone exchange and lifts are not working properly in the Parliament House, Islamabad and the carpets have also become dirty and give bad smell, if so, the steps being taken by the Government in this regard?

**Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division:**

*Air conditioning.* - presently Air conditioning system is working properly except one chiller out of the two chillers if idle due to defective chiller motor which has been sent to Karachi for repair and is expected to reach back within 15 days. After fixing the chiller motor the second chiller will also be operational.

*Sanitation System.* - the sanitation system in the Parliament House is working properly, however, the complaint if any, received are attended promptly by the maintenance staff available at site.

*Telephone Exchange.* - There is no fault in the telephone exchange. Only the Operator's Console was defective, dued to which in coming calls were not connected to the officials. These Operator's consoles have been purchased from telephone department M/s TIP and installed and now there is no problem.

*Lifts.* - The lifts in Parliament HOse are working properly however, during operation, if some defect is noticed it is attended by the maintenance staff which remains available in the building.

*Carpet.* - Carpet in certain area is dirty and in some places needs

replacement. The "dirty carpets" is shampooed as and when required, because all the dirty carpet of the building cannot be shampooed/replaced due to paucity of funds.

The smell was observed from the woollen carpet in the ablution area the mosque due to wetness, for which chattai has been laid over the carpet to avoid dampness of carpet and smell.

56. \* Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the increase made in the salaries of employees of government and semi government institutions, banks and judiciary during the last three years indicating also the percentage of the said increase; and

(b) the names of the government institutions where no such increase has been made during the said period and whether there is any proposal under consideration of the government to increase the salaries of the employees of such institutions, if so, when and if not, its reasons?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: (a) The salaries of government servants were last revised in 1994 and there has been no increase since then excepting the grant of ad-hoc relief of Rs. 300 per month from 1-3-1997 to government employees in Basic Scales 1 to 16 and also to the employees of autonomous/semi autonomous bodies in Basic Scale 1 to 16 or equivalent.

Under Section 10 of the Bank (Nationalization) Act, 1974, (as amended), the Board of Directors of the Banks are competent to determine the remuneration of their employees. The government does not determine or increase the salaries of the employees of Banks. The information regarding percentage increase in

salaries allowed by the Banks is being collected and will be placed at the Table of the House.

The salary of the Superior Judiciary increased under President's Order No. 1 of 1998, notified on October, 3 1998 is given in (annex. I)

(b) In view of the financial stringency the salaries of government employees and of the employees of autonomous/semi autonomous bodies have not been increased. The Government would consider revision of salaries when the present state of financial stringency is over.

(annex. I)

PERCENTAGE INCREASE IN THE SALARY  
OF SUPERIOR JUDICIARY

<u>Superior Judiciary</u>	<u>Salary before P.O.1 of 1998</u>	<u>Salary after P.O.1 OF 1998</u>	<u>Percentage</u>
1. Chief Justice of Supreme Court	Rs. 20250/-	Rs. 42,000/- P.M.	112.34%
2. Judge of Supreme Court	Rs. 19170/-	Rs. 40,000/-	108.65%
3. Chief Justice of High Court	Rs. 19900/-	Rs. 39000/- P.T.	105.34%
4. Judge of High Court	Rs. 17100/-	38,000/-	122.22%

57. \* Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the sanitation system in Sector G-9/2, Islamabad is out of order, if so, the time by which it will be put in order?

Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division: No. The sanitary sewerage system in sector G-9/2, Islamabad is functioning satisfactorily. Any complaint of blockage in sanitary sewer lines, whenever received is attended promptly.

60. \* Mr. Sajid Mir: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet division be pleased to state the total expenses of the President's House and Prime Minister's House, Islamabad, separately, for the years 1995-96 and 1996-97 with year-wise and head-wise break-up?

Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division: Head-wise details of expenditure on the President's House Prime Minister's House during 1995-96 and 1996-97 may be seen at Annex-I and Annex-II, respectively.

PRESIDENT'S SECRETARIAT(PERSONAL)

Annex-1

STATEMENT SHOWING THE DETAILS OF EXPENDITURE DURING THE YEARS 1995-96 & 1996-97

S.No.	Object Classification	Expenditure during 1995-96	Expenditure during 1996-97
1)	01100 Officers(Pay)	Rs. 3,050,973/-	Rs. 2,967,041/-
2)	01201 Other Staff(Pay)	Rs.11,386,370/-	Rs.11,961,481/-
3)	02000 Regular Allowance	Rs. 8,006,564/-	Rs. 7,837,702/-
4)	03000 Other Allowance	Rs. 1,693,000/-	Rs. 1,787,560/-
5)	10000 Purchase of Durable Goods	Rs. 3,315,107/-	Rs. 117,000/-
6)	40000 Repair & Maintenance of Durable Goods	Rs. 1,064,552/-	Rs. 1,619,417/-
7)	50000 Commodities & Services	Rs.13,466,634/-	Rs.12,970,764/-
8)	60000 Transfer Payments	Rs. 4,789,463/-	Rs. 4,478,991/-
Total:		Rs.47,372,663/-	Rs.41,739,956/-

STATEMENT SHOWING THE DETAILS OF EXPENDITURE INCURRED  
ON THE PRIME MINISTER'S HOUSE DURING YEARS 1995-96 & 1996-97.

<u>S.No.</u>	<u>Head of Account</u>	<u>Expenditure during 1995-96</u>	<u>Expenditure during 1996-97</u>
1.	0000-Establishment Charges	9,824,200	19,739,300
2.	10000-Purchase of D/Goods	225,000	-
3.	40000-Repair & Maintenance of Durable Goods	1,931,000	1,796,500
4.	50000-Commodities & Services	14,790,500	14,709,100
5.	60000-Transfer Payments	11,509,500	8,461,900
	Total :	<u>43,250,000</u>	<u>44,706,900</u>

61. \* Mr. Sajid Mir: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the names of soap factories in Gadoon and the amount of the Custom duty paid by them from 1993-94 to 1996-97 with year-wise break up? Reply not received.

62. \* Haji Gul Afridi: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division be pleased to state whether there is any proposal under consideration for the government to take legal action against illegal Motor vehicles workshops, if any established in the commercial areas of various sectors of Islamabad, if so when?

Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division: The government has taken a very serious notice regarding establishment of illegal Motor Vehicle Workshops and other encroachments made by various traders. To resolve the issues it was decided by the government to sale the plots to the owners of Automobile Workshops through Restricted auction during 1995. According the "Restricted Auction" was arranged by the CDA in-collaboration with ICCI on 25-9-1995. Total 109 plots were auctioned for Automobile Workshops in I-10/3, Islamabad.

63. \* Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Commerce be pleased to refer to the Senate unstarred question No. 9 replied on 7th October, 1998 and state:

(a) The names, designation and BPS of the employees of the Ministry of who qualify for appointment as Commercial attache abroad;

(b) The steps being taken by the Government to transfer the commercial attaches posted abroad who have completed three years period of

posting; and

(c) the steps being taken by the Government to appoint persons having domicile of Balochistan as Commercial Attache?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: (a) Names, designations and BPS of the employees of the Ministry of Commerce including C & T Group who qualify for appointment as Commercial Attaches (Commercial Secretaries and Commercial Counsellors) abroad cannot be indicated at this stage, as their cases along with the other groups of regularly constituted services of the Government, are under process at present.

(b) The process of transferring the Commercial Attaches *i.e.* Commercial Counsellors and Commercial Secretaries who are abroad and have completed tenure of their posting of three years, are underway. As a result a number of candidates belonging to various groups of regularly constituted services of the Government, from the Ministry of Commerce, Ministry of Establishment Division and other Government Departments have been given written test and interviewed by the DSC. The finalization of selection of these candidates is being done by the Special Selection Board headed by the Minister of Commerce.

(c) There are no quotas for these posts and postings are done purely on merit.

64. \* Haji Gul Afridi: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet division be pleased to state whether C.D.A. has given permission and issued NOC for the hotels established in the Blue Area, Islamabad, if not, whether there is any proposal under consideration to take legal action against such hotels, if

so, when?

**Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division:** Blue Area Islamabad is the Central Business District of Islamabad. The northern part of Blue Area is reserved for multi-storey building meant for offices, cultural and recreational buildings, and in this area 5-Star Hotels are permissible on designated plots. The southern part is meant for low-rise commercial buildings having shops, display centre, etc.

The existing situation in Blue area is that there are a number of non-conforming uses with reference to the allotment letters for which notices have been issued. The question of what uses should be permissible is presently under review in the Authority.

65. \* **Mir Nabi Buksh Domki:** Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the number and names of stenographers (BPS-15) working in the Ministry whose services have been confirmed so far, and

(b) the particulars of the said stenographers according to the seniority list?

**Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs:** (a) Presently services of 50 Stenographers (B-15) working in this Division have been confirmed. (Names given in the attached statement at Annex-A).

(b) A list showing the particulars of such Stenographers according to seniority is enclosed at Annex-A.

LIST OF STENOGRAPHERS (B-15) OF FINANCE DIVISION  
WHOSE SERVICES HAVE SO FAR BEEN CONFIRMED.

S.No.	Name	Date of Birth	Date of Entry into Govt. service	Date of Appointment as Steno-Grapher in Fin. Div.	Remarks
1.	Muhammad Farooq	24-04-50	27-05-70	09-07-73	Permanent S/E
2.	Raja Fazal Dad	18-11-44	21-05-62	18-03-74	Permanent S/1
3.	Muhammad Sultan	01-10-41	19-10-60	27-08-74	-do-
4.	Nazir M. Malik	01-02-43	02-02-73	25-11-74	-do-
5.	Noor H. Zia	17-02-45	09-03-73	25-11-74	-do-
6.	M. Afsal Khan	15-03-45	02-12-69	30-01-75	-do-
7.	A. Sattar Khan	13-03-55	01-08-72	31-05-75	-do-
8.	Muhammad Ismail	08-02-51	15-07-71	29-11-75	-do-
9.	Euboor Hussain	11-11-44	20-09-60	20-11-75	-do-
10.	Munir G. Siddiqui	08-04-52	07-07-71	20-11-75	-do-
11.	M. Hussain Malik	02-12-50	22-03-72	01-12-75	-do-
12.	Abdul Muhi	20-10-43	21-02-73	19-02-76	-do-
13.	Sunayd M. Javed	17-10-50	27-07-71	24-05-76	-do-
14.	Javed Jabal	01-05-54	23-02-72	17-11-76	-do-
15.	Ahmed Hamid	14-07-59	29-08-72	17-11-76	-do-
16.	Zia Waleh	15-10-47	01-09-72	17-11-76	-do-
17.	M. Inam Ajmal	15-05-43	01-09-70	17-11-76	-do- 10m LPR till 05-09-77
18.	Muhammad Anwar	17-12-52	03-02-74	18-05-77	-do-
19.	Rashid Ali	23-12-50	06-02-73	18-05-77	-do-
20.	Ali Shah	10-02-54	21-02-73	08-11-77	-do-
21.	Shahidul Rehman	05-10-54	23-02-73	10-02-79	-do-
22.	Muhamd Sarwar	25-10-50	24-05-71	10-02-79	-do-
23.	M. Hameed-11	11-11-52	07-02-74	19-05-79	-do-
24.	Sardar Hussain	21-10-53	03-02-75	10-02-79	-do-
25.	M. Yusuf-1	02-02-55	07-10-74	20-01-79	-do-
26.	Aftab A. Gureeshi	15-02-46	29-10-61	14-10-79	Permanent S/1
27.	Abdul Qayyum	04-02-49	12-05-74	27-05-81	-do-
28.	Farooq-Uddin	00-01-48	24-02-73	07-05-81	-do-
29.	Amir Akhtar	18-07-55	07-02-74	01-02-82	-do-
30.	S. Iqbal A. Shah	24-11-47	20-10-67	01-02-82	-do-

S.No.	Name	Date of Birth	Date of Entry into Govt. Service	Date of Appointment as Steno-grapher in P.S.D.	Remarks
31.	M. Sharif	11-03-50	01-10-74	01-02-82	-do-
32.	M. Sarwar Paritque	15-01-54	24-12-75	29-05-82	-do-
33.	Qazi M. Usman	12-05-54	01-04-75	24-05-82	-do-
34.	Nasir-uz-Zaman	28-08-54	07-01-75	27-05-82	-do-
35.	M. Nasir Qureshi	17-12-48	24-07-75	29-05-82	-do-
36.	M. Hanif Rehman	04-06-46	04-10-74	22-07-82	-do-
37.	Masood Hussain	12-12-50	10-10-75	22-02-82	-do-
38.	Muhammad Hanwar	15-04-53	23-10-75	22-09-82	-do-
39.	Sarfraz Ahmad	08-04-58	10-11-75	22-03-82	-do-
40.	M. Munir Shafiq	06-07-55	25-09-74	22-03-82	-do-
41.	M. Sharif-ji	18-04-50	13-02-73	22-03-82	-do-
42.	Ch. Abdul Aziz	02-05-52	13-03-75	01-05-82	-do-
43.	Malik M. Ashraf	15-04-50	12-12-75	21-05-82	-do-
44.	Muhammad Bashir	12-11-51	02-04-76	31-05-82	-do-
45.	Lakshoo Ahmad	25-12-51	09-10-76	20-04-82	-do-
46.	Muhammad Firdous	21-10-57	25-05-74	20-02-82	-do-
47.	Muhammad Nawaz	11-02-54	12-10-74	20-02-82	-do-
48.	Qadir M. Khan	09-02-53	25-10-76	25-02-82	-do-
49.	Abdul Siddique	25-04-59	02-09-76	25-02-82	-do-
50.	Mahmood-ul-Hasan	25-12-22	02-02-73	09-02-82	-do-

66. \* Mir Nabi Buksh Domki: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be please to state the date on which the last meeting of D.PC. was held for the promotion of English Stenographers (BPS-15) in the Ministry and the time by which its next meeting will be held?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: The last meeting of the DPC to recommend names of Stenotypists (B-12) for promotion to the post of Stenographer (B-15) was held on 16-01-1996. Since then, no posts of Stenographer in the promotion quota have become available. The government has since imposed a ban on all kinds of recruitment either by initial recruitment or by promotion. Consequently, no meetings of the DPC could be held.

The next DPC meeting will be held after the lifting of the ban on recruitment by promotion and on the availability of posts.

67. \* Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state the details of foreign degree courses/training programmes, including MBA, M.Sc and MA available to CSS & PSP Officer, during 1997-98 and 1998-99?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: 41 Officers of Federal Government including PSP officers were sent for foreign training for MA, MBA and M.Sc. during 1996-97 and 1997-98( Details are Annexed).

**Statement showing details of Foreign Degree Courses/Training Programme for MA, MBA and Msc during 1996-97 and 1997-98 of Federal Government including PSP Officers.**

S.No.	Name	Grade	Domicile	Present Posting	Year	Name of Prog	Country
1.	Khawaja Shaukat Ahmed	18	Punjab	D.S. Chief Minister's Secretariat, Punjab.	1996-97	I.L.M	U.K
2.	Khawaja Farvir Ahmed	18	Sindh	Secretary CBR Islamabad	1996-97	MBA	U.K
3.	Miss Naghmata Roohi	18	Sindh	Auditor General's Deptt. Karachi	1996-97	MBA	U.K.
4.	Mohammed Zahir Ali Khan	17	NWFP	DSP Police Service Peshawar.	1996-97	I.L.M	U.K
5.	Ms. Mahbooba Razaq	18	Punjab	Dy Commissioner CBR.	1996-97	Msc Human Resource Mgt.	U.K.
6.	Khan Imtiaz Ahmed (Comd)	17	FATA	Asstt. Commissioner Muzaffargarh	1996-97	MA Management	U.K
7.	Dr. Irian Tariq (DMG)	18	Islamabad	ADC(G) Jeldum	1996-97	Msc Human Resource Mgt.	U.K
8.	Elsan Sadiq (PSP)	17	Punjab	ASP Sindh Police Karachi	1996-97	MBA Public Service Management.	U.K.
9.	Asif Ali Khan Durrani	17	Baluchistan	S.O. M/o Foreign Affairs, Islamabad	1996-97	MA International Study & Diplomacy	U.K.
10.	Ayaz Muhammed Khan	17	Sindh (U)	do-	1996-97	-do-	U.K.
11.	Dr. Shouib Dustgir (PSP)	18	Punjab	SP Sangodha	1997-98	Msc Human Resource Mgt.	U.K.

S.No.	Name	Grade	Domicile	Present Posting	Year	Name of Trg	Country
12.	Mian M. Benyamen	18	Punjab	Dy. Director M/o Labour Manpower	1997-98	LLM	U.K.
13.	Dr. Mohyimed Saqib Aziz (DMG)	18	Baluchistan	O.S.D.	1997-98	Msc Management	U.K.
14.	Mr. Khalid Mahmood (PSP)	18	Punjab	ASP Islamabad	1997-98	Msc Human Resource Mgt.	U.K.
15.	Mr. Nasir Masroor Ahmed	19	Punjab	Addl. Commissioner CBR.	1997-98	MA Corporate Strategy & Governance	U.K.
16.	Dr. Syed Tauqeer H. Shah (DMG)	18	NWFP	Dy. Secretary Chief Minister, Punjab	1997-98	Msc Human Resource Mgt.	U.K.
17.	Mr. Rafiqzaman Siddiqui	17	Sindh	S.O. M/o Foreign Affairs	1997-98	Msc International Study & Diplomacy	U.K.
18.	Mr. Tasawar Khan	17	Punjab	M/o Foreign Affairs Islamabad.	1997-98	do-	U.K.
19.	Ms. Summat Ihsan	17	Punjab	S.O. EAD	1997-98	Msc in Applied Development Study	U.K.
20.	Mr. Tasaddaq Hussain	17	NWFP	Finance Division	1997-98	Msc in Dev. Mgt.	U.K.
21.	Mr. Qammar Sarwar	17	AJ&K	S.O. EAD	1997-98	MA in Development Administration	U.K.
22.	Mr. Irfan Saleem	18	Punjab	Finance Division	1997-98	Msc in Micro Eco Policy & Planning	U.K.
23.	Mr. Nasir Jamal	18	Punjab	S.O. M/o Industry	1997-98	Msc in Dev. Mgt.	U.K.
24.	Mr. Musharaf Rasool (DMG)	18	NWFP	C.M. Secretariat NWFP	1997-98	Msc in Development Admn. & Planning	U.K.
25.	Mr. Mushtaq Ahmed Mahar (PSP)	18	Sindh		1996-97	LLM	U.K.
26.	Ali Amir Malik (PSP)	18	Punjab	SP Karachi	1997-98		U.K.

S.No.	Name	Grade	Domicile	Present Posting	Year	Name of Trg	Country
27	Farkhanda Hussain	18	Punjab	Dy. Director, Dir General of Education	1996-97	Public Policy & Admn (MA Programme)	Netherland
28	Mr. Ajmal Waheed	18	Punjab	Instructor, NIPA Peshawar	1996-97	-do-	Netherland
29	Mohammed Zubair	18	Punjab	Engineer, WAPDA Lahore.	1996-97	MSc Sanitary Engineering	Netherland
30	Shehbaz Asif Kazi	18	Punjab	-do-	1996-97	MSc Hydraulic Engg.	Netherland
31	Ms. Seema Jilani	18	Sindh	Demonstrator NED Univ. of Karachi.	1996-97	MSc Environmental Science & Tech.	Netherland
32	Qasim Durrani	17	NWFP	Jr. Engg. WAPDA Peshawar.	1996-97	MSc Land & Water Development	Netherland
33	Shahid Mahmood	17	Punjab	WAPDA Lahore	1996-97	MSc in Water Quality Management	Netherland
34	Azhar Hussain Qureshi	18	Sindh	Jr. Executive P.N.S.C, Karachi.	1997-98	MSc in Professional Shipping	Norway
35	Dr. Bushra Nazir	17	Punjab	Medical Officer Mayo Hospital, LHR	1997-99	Graduate Diploma Primary Health Care	Australia
36	Dr. Raheela Muhammad Ali	17	Punjab	FGSH, Islamabad.	1997-99	-do-	-do-
37	Mr. Ataullah Khattak	17	NWFP	Research Officer EAD.	1996-97	MBA	Commonwealth Secretariat
38	Mr. Masood Hassan	17	Sindh	Research Officer P&D Division	1996-97	MA	World Bank
39	Syed Anwar ul Hassan	18	Punjab	Privatization Commission	1996-97	MA	World Bank
40	Mr. Rafatullah Burki	18	FATA	Assistant Chief	1997-98	MBA	Commonw Secreta
41	Mr. Khurshid Swati	18	N.W.F.P	S.O. M/o Local Govt. & Rural Development	1997-98	MBA	World Bank

68. \*Haji Gul Afridi: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the services record of the Government employees has not been completed by AGPR on the relevant service books, if so, its reasons;

(b) the steps being taken by the government to make service record of the Government employees upto date; and

(c) whether there is any proposal under considering of the government to computerize the said record?

Reply not received.

69. \* Haji Javed Iqbal Abbasi: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division be pleased to state briefly the policy of the government regarding installation of cement plants in federal Capital Area?

Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division: The Master Plan of Islamabad with reference to which development in the Islamabad Capital Territory is being undertaken does not contemplate installation of heavy Industry such as Cement Plant.

70. \* MR. Khuda-i-Noor: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the number of officers working on deputation in ADBP with province-wise break up;

(b) whether it is a fact that the said officers lack the qualification/experience required for the posts held by them, if so, the reasons for making these appointments;

(c) whether it is also a fact that the deputy directors cannot be posted as regional managers as decided by the board of directors on 31st July, 1994, if so, the reasons for posting a number of deputy directors as regional managers; and

(d) whether it is further a fact that the promotions of the employees of ADBP are not being made for the last three years, if so, its reasons?

Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs: (a) Presently six (06) Officers are working on deputation in ADBP. The names and province-wise break-up is as under:-

- |     |  |        |
|-----|--|--------|
| (1) | Mr. Shahid Rafi,<br>Sr. Executive Director.    | Punjab |
| (2) | Mr. Feroze Bashir Anshari,<br>S.E.D.           | Punjab |
| (3) | Mr. S.M. Awais,<br>Sr. Director.               | Punjab |
| (4) | Mr. Manzoor H.S. Memon,<br>Executive Director. | Sindh  |
| (5) | Mr. Allah Wadhayo,<br>Dy. Director.            | Sindh  |
| (6) | Mr. M. Rafique Qazi,<br>Assistant Director.    | Sindh  |

(b) No.

(c) It is a fact that Deputy Directors cannot be posted as Regional Managers as per decision of Bank's Board of Directors.

However, 5 Deputy Directors are posted as Regional Managers for the following reasons:-

(i) 4 Deputy Directors are posted as Regional Managers in Balochistan due to shortage of suitable officers.

(ii) One Deputy Director is posted in Rawalpindi as R.M. *w.e.f.* 23-8-1997. However he is presently continuing due to stay order granted to him by the Court.

(d) It is a fact that promotion of employees of the Bank is not being made for the last two years due to ban imposed by the SBP.

#### UNSTARRED QUESTIONS AND THEIR REPLIES

11. Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch: Will the Minister for Commerce be pleased to state whether it is a fact that an agreement for trade Via Quetta has been signed between Iran and Pakistan, if so its details?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Pakistan and Iran have signed the following two Agreements:

(i) *Transit Trade Agreement, 1975.* - This Agreement provides freedom of transit to and from the territories of both the countries and facilities of passage of goods and means of transport and regulation of traffic in transit.

A copy of the Agreement is at Annex-I.

(ii) *Pak-Iran Long Term Trade Agreement, 1982.* - This Agreement is aimed at facilitating and increasing trade between the bordering provinces of the two countries. The current financial ceiling of the trade is Rs. 100 million each way.

A copy of the Agreement is at Annex-II.

(iii) *Memorandum of Understanding between Chambers of Commerce of Zahidan and Quetta.*- The two chambers signed at MOU in Quetta on 26-6-1998 to enhance mutual trade through land by removing impediments and establishing institutional arrangements.

A copy of the **MOU** is at Annex- III.

(Annexure have been placed in the Senate Library).

12. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister for Finance and Economic Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) the details of collection of General Sales Tax from brick kilns during the last five years with year-wise break up; and

(b) the details of the principles for levying General Sales Tax on a commodity and how it works?

Reply not received.

13. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister Commerce be pleased to refer to the Senate starred question No. 202 replied on 22nd October, 1996 and state:

(a) the details of the cases admitted and tried by the SPEEDY TRIAL COURTS established in collaboration with the Export Promotion Bureau since 1st January 1996;

(b) the details of the case pending with these courts; and

(c) the philosophy and objectives expected to be achieved from establishment of these courts?

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: (a) No such speedy trial

courts exist.

(b) None.

(c) None.

14. Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha: Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division be pleased to state:

(a) the number of CHEER PHEASANTS, males, females and chicks, separately, in stock with Capital Development Authority;

(b) the efforts made by CDA since 1st January, 1996, to get eggs of this pheasant from abroad; and

(c) the efforts made by CDA for getting assistance from Brig. (Retd.) Mukhtar Ahmad, Chairman World Pheasant Association Pakistan, Lahore, since 1st January 1996 for getting eggs of this pheasant from abroad?

Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division: (a) Detail of CHEER PHEASANTS is as under:-

Male = 16 Nos.

Female = 10 Nos.

Poult. = 6 Nos.

(b) Further release of Cheer Pheasant in Margallah Hills is not being attempted due to very low survival of the released birds and their failure to breed in nature. No outside assistance from W.P.A. and other agencies is therefore, being sought since 1991. Presently CDA maintains its own captive flock and is expanding it mainly for captive breeding only.

(c) Further release of Cheer Pheasant in Margallah Hills is not being attempted due to very low survival of the released birds and their failure to

breed being in nature. No outside assistance from W.P.A. and other agencies is therefore, expanding it mainly for captive breeding only.

15. **Mr. Saifullah Khan Paracha:** Will the Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division be pleased to refer to the Senate starred question No. 139-C replied on 31st December, 1996 and state the details of the steps taken by the PARC, NARC and Pakistan Forest Institute since 1st January, 1996 to reduce pest species specially crows in Islamabad?

**Minister Incharge of the Cabinet Division:** As a result of CDA's efforts NARC has agreed to take up a joint vertebrate pest Control Programme with CDA. All details have been worked out and the control being taken up in Shakarparian area as a pilot programme during the operational work in this area, Technical Assistance will be provided by the Vertebrate Pest Control Laboratory NARC as well as before initiating the operation training will be imparted to CDA Staff. This demonstration will be provided practical experience for controlling Wild Boar and Crows in other area of Islamabad by the Environment Directorate pesticides *i.e.* Recumin Powder which is not available locally is being procured for the purpose.

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Point of order sir.

**Mr. Presiding Officer:** Yes. Mian Raza Rabbani.

**Mian Raza Rabbani:** Sir, it is most unfortunate, I am compelled to say what Mr. Matta said yesterday,

ایک سیشن ختم نہیں ہوتا اور اگلا سیشن ہم requisition سے شروع کرتے ہیں اور اس میں کچھ issues دیتے ہیں۔ اس سے پہلے نئے issues آجاتے ہیں لیکن یہاں تو اب ایسی صورتحال ہے کہ ایک دن ختم نہیں، دوسرا دن شروع ہو جاتا ہے اور نیا issue آ جاتا ہے۔ جناب

the privilege of the members of this House has been breached, contempt of the Senate of Pakistan has been committed by the Prime Minister.

جناب پریڈائیٹنگ آفیسر، اگر آپ کی اجازت ہو تو میں leave application پڑھ لوں۔

### LEAVE OF ABSENCE

جناب رضا ربانی، جناب آپ پڑھ لیں۔

جناب پریڈائیٹنگ آفیسر، قاضی محمد انور صاحب نے نجی مصروفیات کی بنا پر مورخہ ۵ اور ۶ نومبر کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا آپ ان کی رخصت منظور فرماتے ہیں۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب پریڈائیٹنگ آفیسر، حاجی عبدالرحمان صاحب نے ذاتی مصروفیات کی بنا پر مورخہ ۳ اور ۵ نومبر کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا آپ ان کی رخصت منظور فرماتے ہیں۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب پریڈائیٹنگ آفیسر، جناب محمد طاہر بزنجو صاحب نے اپنے ایک قریبی عزیز کے انتقال کے باعث مورخہ ۳ تا ۶ نومبر کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا آپ ان کی رخصت منظور فرماتے ہیں۔

(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

### POINT OF ORDER

i) RE: PRESSURE ON SENATORS FROM PM.

Mr Presiding Officer: Yes, Mr. Raza Rabbani.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, I was saying that a breach of privilege of

the members of the Senate and a contempt of the Senate of Pakistan has been committed by the Prime Minister of Pakistan Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif in the statement or the speeches that he made yesterday in two public meetings. In those speeches the Prime Minister has once again, you will recall that immediately after moving the 15th Constitutional Amendment Bill in the National Assembly he addressed an Ulema's Convention and for the first time in the history of Pakistan, may I would say for the first time in the history of any civilized democratic country, did a chief executive incite the people to violence, call upon the people to lock up in their houses and physically assault those members of the Senate and the National Assembly and those holders of public opinion who do not agree with making him 'Amir-ul-Momeneen' , who do not agree with abrogation of the Constitution of 1973 , who do not believe that foetus should be placed on the superior judiciary. Who do not believe that the rights of minorities and women should be trampled and done away with. Now once again sir, the Prime Minister has incited the people to violence , to physical violence against those Senators and the Senate at large and I quote to you from his speech which is in inverted commas and it is in all the newspapers but I am quoting to you from " The News", of today which says; Nawaz seeks public pressure for adoption of Shariah bill.

We do not consider it a Shariah Bill. It is a bill to vest all powers in the person of the Prime Minister in the garb of Islam. It is a bill which misuses the name of Islam. It is a bill which is parallel to the referendum held by the political mentor of the Prime Minister.

Sir, he goes on to say that the Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif said on Wednesday that he would go to the masses to force Senators to pass the

Shariah Bill, to force Senators that means in violation of their conscience, in violation of all democratic norms, in violation of the oath that they have taken to preserve, protect and defend the Constitution of Pakistan. It further goes on to say within inverted commas " you must make them pass the Bill", you must make them, he is telling the people that those who dissent, the Senate does want to pass, you have to compel the Senate to pass the bill against its conscience, in violation of the Constitution.

This is being preached by the Prime Minister of Pakistan. The he goes on further sir, he does not end here, he goes on further, if the Senate, now here is the warning, if the Senate does not pass the bill, the people would make the Senators pass it. He has given the warning that what will happen if the Senate does not pass it, if the Senate does not want to give him arbitrary powers, if the Senate Wants to preserve the Constitution, if the Senate wants to preserve provincial autonomy, if the Senate wants the character of the federation, if the Senate wants to preserve the trichotomy of powers in the 73 Constitution, then what is the consequence for that, the consequence is that the people will force them. If this is not telling the people to take up arms against those who have a different political thought than that of the present regime what more can you ask for.

This is a clear cut expression of the facist tendency of this regime. But let the world be clear from floor of the Senate that regardless of the consequences, the Senate will not barter away its conscience, the Senate will perform its duty of defending and preserving and protecting the Constitution of 73.

Mr. Chairman, there is a Privilege Motion that we have moved and I believe that there is another Privilege Motion which has also been moved. This

Privilege Motion has been moved by more than 14 Senators and we would like to submit the Privilege Motion.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, sheikh Sahib.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Sheikh: Mr. Chairman, I have already deposited the Privilege Motion in the Senate office and this is also in the same term. I adopt all the arguments that have been advanced by Senator Raza Rabani. I will read that portion of "Jang Akhbar". This is the part of the privilege motion that I have moved before the Senate.

ہم نے قومی اسمبلی سے شریعت بل پاس کرا لیا ہے۔ اب یہ بل سینٹ سے منظور ہو گا۔ اب یہ قوم کی ذمہ داری ہے کہ سینٹ شریعت بل کی منظوری کے لئے اپنا کردار ادا کرے۔ کردار جو قوم ادا کرے گی، وہ ایک ایک سینیٹر کا گھیراؤ کرے گی۔ This is what he said کہ وہ اپنا کردار ادا کریں۔ انہوں نے کہا کہ یہ ملک اللہ کے نام پر حاصل کیا گیا تھا کہ نہیں، masses سے یہ سوال کیا۔ عوام کی طرف سے جواب آیا۔ اللہ کے نام پر حاصل کیا گیا تھا۔ وزیر اعظم نے پوچھا، کیا نعرہ تھا، عوام کی طرف سے جواب آیا، پاکستان کا مطلب لا الہ الا اللہ محمد رسول اللہ۔ تقریر کا متن یہ ہے کہ اب آپ کو اپنا کردار ادا کرنا ہے ان تمام سینیٹرز کے خلاف جو شریعت بل کے خلاف ہیں یا اس کے حق میں ووٹ نہیں دینا چاہتے۔ جناب چیئرمین! یہ تقریر ایسے علاقے میں کی گئی ہے جو سوات کا ایک حصہ ہے۔ جگہ کا نام مہرین ہے۔ وہاں پہلے ہی شریعت کے معاملات پر اور دوسرے اس نوعیت کے معاملات پر خون خرابہ ہوتا رہا ہے۔ جان بوجھ کر اس علاقے کو چنا گیا اور جن کر وہاں لوگوں سے اپیل کی گئی کہ پاکستان کو جس نام پر حاصل کیا گیا ہے وہ ہم آج فرض ادا کرنے جا رہے ہیں۔ چونکہ ہم نے نیشنل اسمبلی سے یہ بل پاس کرا دیا ہے اور اب یہ بل سینٹ میں ہے۔ وہاں سینیٹر ہمیں ۵۸ ووٹ نہیں دے رہے ہیں۔ عوام اپنا کردار ادا کرے۔ مطلب یہ کہ سینیٹرز کا گھیراؤ کیا جائے۔ ان کو گھروں میں بند کیا جائے۔ ان کے ساتھ زیادتی کی جائے۔ ان کو مارا پیٹا جائے۔ انہیں مجبور کیا جائے کہ وہ اس بل کے حق میں ووٹ دیں۔ اس لئے جناب

چیئرمین-----



جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ، میں نے بارہ بجے دن کو دیا۔

جناب پریزائیڈنگ آفیسر، چیئرمین صاحب نے ابھی اس کو نہیں دیکھا۔ میرا

خیال ہے اس کو کل رکھ لیں۔ کل چیئرمین صاحب اس کو دیکھ کر۔۔۔۔۔

میاں رضا ربانی، جناب، کیوں چیئرمین کی کیا بات ہے؟ چیئرمین نے تو ابھی

ایک adjournment motion kill کیا ہے۔

He will not come tomorrow. He knew this matter will be raised. He has not come.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Anybody will come here.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, this is an urgent matter. Why can't you take it up under the proviso to 61.

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is an urgent matter. But that is always with the consent of the Chairman.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Yes, it is with the consent of the Chair, you are the Chair.

Mr. Presiding Officer: I am presiding at the moment.

Mian Raza Rabbani: So, apply the proviso of 61.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Raza Rabbani Sahib, that will make no difference. You may talk on it tomorrow.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Why tomorrow? Why are you not taking it up?

Mr. Presiding Officer: The Chairman will himself come and see it tomorrow and you may talk on it tomorrow.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Why will the Chairman himself come? For all practical purposes you are the Chairman, you are the Presiding Officer. You

have all the powers under the rule. You do not want to protect us. You do not want to protect the rights of the Senate. Under Rule 14 you have all the same powers. You either refuse,

(interruption)

Mr. Presiding Officer: Let it be seen by the Chairman and it may be taken up tomorrow. Order please.

(interruption)

ڈاکٹر صفدر علی عباسی - جناب میں یہ عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ جیسا کہ آفتاب شیخ صاحب نے point out کیا ہے اس علاقے کے اندر پہلے ہی ایک ایم پی اسے کو اسی بنیاد پر murder کر دیا گیا تھا۔ آپ کیا چاہتے ہیں he is putting the lives of entire Senate, lives of all the people who are opposing the Bill, on line discuss اور آپ کہتے ہیں کل according to proviso of insist ہم we want to discuss this today کریں۔ - rules. This should be discussed today Sir,

(مداخلت)

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ وزیر برائے پارلیمانی امور۔ خواجہ صاحب عباسی صاحب تعریف رکھیں۔ جی وٹو صاحب۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو۔ جناب والا، میرے فاضل دوستوں نے جو تحریک استحقاق پیش کی ہے اسکا ہمیں بھی گورنمنٹ کی طرف سے نوٹس ہونا چاہیے۔ ہمیں اس کے بارے میں کوئی نوٹس نہیں ہے اور ابھی انہوں نے بات کی ہے۔

دوسری میں یہ بات کروں گا کہ وہ اعتراض کیا فرما رہے ہیں۔ اعتراض یہ فرما رہے ہیں کہ وزیر اعظم نے قوم کو کیوں اپیل کی ہے کہ آپ سینیٹر صاحبان کو استعما کریں۔ آج وزیر اعظم صاحب نے قوم کو عوام کو کیوں استعما کی ہے کہ آپ ممبر صاحبان کو استعما کریں کہ وہ بل پاس کر دیں۔ یہ خدا کے لئے۔۔۔

(مداخلت)

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو - یہ سارے اعتراضات جو وہ فرما رہے ہیں وہ کہاں ان الفاظ میں فرما رہے ہیں وہ کہاں ان الفاظ میں شامل ہیں - وہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ ہمارے دوست کہ گھیراؤ اس میں آجاتا ہے، اس میں لڑائی اور جھگڑا آجاتا ہے - کہاں ہے - یہ تو جناب والا، یہ نہیں ہے - ہم اگر عوام کے ذریعے، دونوں ایوانوں میں سے کسی ایوان کے ممبر ہو جائیں تو ہم رائے عامہ سے بالکل آزاد ہو جاتے ہیں - عوام کو پھر بھی حق حاصل رہتا ہے - آخری عدالت سیاست میں، جمہوریت میں عوام کی عدالت ہے اور عوام کی عدالت کو اپیل کرنا کسی سیاستدان، کسی صاحب کا کس لحاظ سے ناجائز ہے -

(مداغت)

Mr. Presiding Officer: Primary thing is that we are not discussing the motion now.

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو - جی میں بھی یہی تیسری بات عرض کرنے والا تھا - آپ نے کل کے لئے فرما دیا ہے - ہمارے دوستوں کا کہنا یہ ہے کہ ہماری غلط باتوں کو مانا جائے اور وہ آپ کی بات کو بھی مانتے کے لئے تیار نہیں -

(مداغت)

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر - جی اجل خٹک صاحب -

جناب محمد اجل خان خٹک - جناب میں اس بحث میں اس وقت پڑنا نہیں چاہتا - آپ سے صرف ایک سوال ضرور کروں گا - آپ یا کوئی اور یہ بتا سکتا ہے کہ جب اس کرسی پر کوئی بیٹھا ہوا ہو تو اس کا یہ کہنا ٹھیک ہے کہ میں کسی اور سے مشورہ لوں گا جو آج یہاں حاضر نہیں ہے - مثلاً جیسے آپ کہتے ہیں کہ آپ یہاں تشریف فرما تو ہیں لیکن آپ کے سامنے جو مسئلہ پیش ہو اس پر رائے نہیں دے سکتے، فیصلہ نہیں دے سکتے تو یہاں بیٹھے کیوں ہیں - ہم تو یہ سمجھتے ہیں - اگر آپ یا کوئی یہ بتائے کہ آئین اور قانون کے تحت باقی کارروائی تو کر سکتا ہے لیکن ایسا معاملہ آ جائے جس سے ملک کی کسی شخصیت پر حرف آتا ہو یا وہ زیر بحث ہو تو پھر یہاں بیٹھے ہوئے شخص کو اس بات کی اجازت نہیں ہے کہ کسی اور سے پوچھے - یہ کوئی بتا دے تو ہم مان جائیں گے - نہیں تو آپ بہت بڑے قانون دان ہیں - پارلیمنٹیرین ہیں - آپ

بتائیں کہ یہاں بیٹھے ہوئے آپ کو یہ اختیار نہیں ہے۔ کس قانون کے تحت، کس دفعہ کے تحت، کس رول اینڈ ریگولیشن کے تحت نہیں ہے، ہم سمجھ جائیں گے کہ یہ قانون ہے۔ اگر قانون نہیں ہے اور آپ بھی اپنے تمام علم سے، اپنی سوچ سے، اپنے ماضی سے اس کو نظر انداز کر کے صرف یہ کہتے ہیں کہ کل پر بھوڑوں گا، برسوں پر بھوڑوں گا، فلاں سے پوچھوں گا، فلاں سے پوچھوں گا۔ اگر یہ ہے تو آپ اپنے ماضی کے ساتھ اور اپنی دانش کے ساتھ بھی اچھا نہیں کر رہے ہیں۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر۔ میں یہ عرض کر دوں۔ let me clarify the position. پوزیشن یہ ہے کہ ایک تو میں نے خود یہ موشن نہ دیکھا نہ مجھے دفتر میں یہ بتایا گیا ہے کہ چیئرمین صاحب نے دیکھا ہے نہ اس کا نوٹس گورنمنٹ کو گیا ہے۔ اس لیے ہر روز یہ ہوا کرتا ہے کہ موشن اگلے دن پر پٹے جاتے ہیں۔ میں کوئی دس دن کے لیے اس کو ایڈجرن نہیں کر رہا ہوں۔ میں صبح کے لیے ایڈجرن کر رہا ہوں۔ کل صبح کو آپ کا سیشن ہو گا۔ کل صبح کو سیشن میں یہ موشن آپ کے سامنے ہو گا۔ ہاؤس کے سامنے ہو گا اور آپ اس پر جو بھی بحث ہو وہ کر لیجئے گا۔ میں تو صرف یہ کہہ رہا ہوں کہ نہ میں نے دیکھا ہے نہ چیئرمین صاحب نے دیکھا ہے نہ ان کو نوٹس ہے۔ یہ تمام چیزیں cover ہو جائیں گی اور کل صبح اس کو کر لیں گے۔ کل صبح تک میں adjourn کر رہا ہوں۔ میں کوئی لمبے عرصے کے لیے نہیں کر رہا۔ So it is deferred for tomorrow. زاہد خان پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ شکریہ جناب۔ یہ جو موشن ہے جس پر رضا ربانی صاحب نے بات کی اور شیخ صاحب نے بات کی۔ سوات میں وزیر اہم نے تقریر کی جو میرا علاقہ ہے۔ پورے ملاکنڈ ڈویژن سے نہ ان بیٹھوں پر کوئی سینٹ کا ممبر ہے نہ ان بیٹھوں سے سینٹ کا ممبر ہے۔ واحد میں سینیٹر ہوں وہاں سے۔ میں آپ کو سنوری جاتا ہوں کہ وہاں ہے کیا۔ اس کو اتنا نہیں چتا۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر۔ یہ کل بتائے گا۔ کل جب موشن آنے گی تو آپ کو موقع ملے گا۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ کل کس نے دیکھی ہے۔ کیا گارنٹی ہے۔ آپ مجھے کیا

گارنٹی دے رہے ہیں۔ آپ سے میں پوچھتا ہوں کہ کیا آپ مجھے گارنٹی دے سکتے ہیں کہ میں گھر جاؤں تو صوفی محمد توپ کا گود میرے گھر پر نہیں بھینکے گا۔ آپ کیسے بات کر رہے ہیں۔ آپ یہاں بیٹھے ہیں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ نہیں یہ بات غلط ہے کہ آپ یہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ آپ کیسے بات کر رہے ہیں۔ یہ بات غلط ہے۔ یہاں ڈیکورم موجود رہنا چاہیے۔ میں آپ کو نہایت ادب و احترام کے ساتھ کہہ رہا ہوں، میں یہ بات کہہ رہا ہوں کہ کل یہ موشن آئے گا، اس پر آپ کو موقع ملے گا آپ بات کیجیے گا۔ ضرور کیجیے گا۔ میں آپ کو یقین دلاتا ہوں کہ آپ کو ضرور موقع ملے گا۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ مجھے آپ کل کی assurance تو دلا سکتے ہیں کہ کل آپ کو موقع ملے گا لیکن کل کی کیا گارنٹی ہے کہ میں زندہ رہوں گا بھی کہ نہیں۔  
جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ اللہ خیر کرے گا۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ اللہ تو شکر کرے گا۔ اللہ تو خیر نواز شریف کے لیے بھی کرے کہ کہیں اس کا بیٹی کا پٹرن نہ گرے یا اس کے گھر پر گولی نہ چلے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ Let him complete now. آپ complete کریں۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ میں عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ وہاں سوات میں اس نے ایسی جگہ جہاں کہ جہاں پر پہلے ہی elected MPA کو اسی گورنمنٹ کے اندر مارا گیا اور اس علاقے میں جہاں کے لوگوں کو کچھ پتہ نہیں ہے، وہ جا کر کہہ رہا ہے اور صرف اسلام کے نام پر ان کو غلط راستے پر ڈال رہے ہیں۔ وہاں پر ایک ایسا ایشو کھڑا کروانا چاہتے ہیں کہ وہاں خانہ جنگی ہو۔ میری بات سنیں۔ اس سے اس فیڈریشن کو بھی تباہ کر رہے ہیں جس کے اوپر وہ مطلق النہایت اور شہنشاہیت قائم کرنے کے چکر میں ہے اور وہ خواب بھی پورے نہیں ہو رہے ہیں۔ عوام کو برباد اور تباہ کر رہے ہیں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ شفقت محمود صاحب، آپ بات کرنا چاہتے ہیں۔ نہیں آپ کل کیجیے گا ناں۔ آپ پھر اسی موشن کو ڈسکس فرما رہے ہیں۔ زاہد خان صاحب کل کیجیے گا۔

جناب محمد زاہد خان۔ جناب والا میں آپ سے یقین دہانی لوں گا کہ صبح آپ مجھے  
سب سے پہلے تقریر کرنے کا موقع دیں گے۔

## RE: GOVERNMENT POLICY ON SIGNING

### OF CTBT FMCT AND NPT

جناب پریذائیڈنٹ آفیسر۔ ٹھیک ہے۔ آپ تشریف رکھیں۔ شفقت محمود صاحب۔

Mr. Shafqat Mehmood: Sir, I wanted to raise a point of order on a different matter. I think, it was five or six days ago that a statement attributed to the Foreign Minister of Pakistan was published in newspapers particularly in "The Nation" and "Nawa-e-Waqt", in which the Foreign Minister with reference to the non-nuclear proliferation regime said that our scientists have assured us that we have no problem in signing the CTBT. But he did not stop at that, he went further. He said our scientists have assured us that there is no problem in signing the CTBT, FMCT and NPT. Now sir, if you recall, that is about two months ago when we were given a briefing both by the honourable Foreign Minister and by various scientists, in that briefing the Foreign Minister had said that as far as the CTBT is concerned, we are giving our views on the matter and we are agree able to the signing of the CTBT. But he said as far as FMCT and NPT and if I recall it very correctly, he said that this is not a matter that is going to be taken up very soon. This will come up much later and in any case we are not talking anything about FMCT and NPT. Sir, Infact, NPT was not even referred to as a possibility of signing.

Now, sir this statement of the Foreign Minister is a huge policy departure from what has been said by the government before that. It is such a huge policy

departure that the newspaper for example "The News" wrote an editorial on this subject that why very quietly there has been this huge policy shift that we are now not only ready to sign CTBT but also FMCT and NPT. In other words we are ready to roll back our nuclear programme. I don't want to give any views on the subject because before I give any views on the subject I would like to know from the honourable Foreign Minister, who happens to be present here today, that has there been a grand reversal of policy or shift of policy in this matter? Has this been done in anticipation of the Prime Minister's visit to Washington that even before the visit a certain ground is being prepared for --- what could only be called a sell out in Washington. Has this been the mandate given to the Foreign Secretary, who is today in Washington talking to the Deputy Secretary of State Mr. Talbot, in this very surreptitious manner something very big is happening and somehow or the other is escaping the notice and attention of a lot of people. So, I would like to ask Mr. Sartaj Aziz, Foreign Minister, what is the policy of the government? Are you sticking to the old position of CTBT or are you going further than that and talking about signing the FMCT and NPT. Thank you sir.

Mr. Sartaj Aziz: Mr. Chairman, as you know the discussion on foreign affairs is not complete and we can take up this issue at that time. But I can answer briefly, the question that has been raised. First of all there is no change in our policy on these issues and this was clarified within 24 hours of the story appearing. Secondly, the story was full of misquotations because there was no formal interview. I was talking to Mr. Majid Nizami and one of the persons was sitting there who was the deputy editor not a reporter and the discussion was not at all on the subject. I said there are four issues CTBT, the Fissile material, restrictions on deployment and export of nuclear technology. On all these issues

there are different pre-requisites and different policies which have already been announced. In reporting he forgot the fourth item because he took no notes, there was no recording and instead of using the word 'restraint on deployment' he could not remember these words, he used nonproliferation. The word 'treaty' was not there and "Nawa-e-Waqt" where the original was published, when it was translated into 'Nation' the sub editor who was editing the headlines, he added the word "Treaty" from himself, although the word "treaty" does not exist in the whole text. So, NPT infact was never discussed, there is no question of signing the NPT and we have said that Pakistan is now nuclear power, therefore, the question of NPT does not arise. So, that was one mistake committed by the person who made the record, the other who edited it compounded the mistake.

On the CTBT I have already said in the statement that the statement which the Prime Minister has made in the General Assembly is the policy. Similarly, an FMCT, we have started a negotiation and as I have briefed the members of the Opposition during the parliamentary debate that when the treaty is concluded, one year, two years, whenever is concluded, we will then abide by it, right now there is no question.

The fourth issue which is the export control, there we have always said that Pakistan has no intention of exporting nuclear technology to anybody. We are now working out the administrative orders and rules under which this thing can be safeguarded by that mistake.

So, our policy on this subject has been stated very clearly in the Parliament by the Prime Minister, there is absolutely no change, that was the case of total mis-reporting which was clarified in two statements within 24 to 48 hours and I am sure, honourable members must have seen my contradiction and

clarification. So, I can assure that our national interests, our security interests are supreme. There is no question of rolling back, in fact, in my second statement I have said categorically that Pakistan has become a nuclear power and no power on earth can roll back our deterrent capacity in this respect. *Insha Allah*, we will fully protect our national interests and our discussion in these matters will take into account.

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ رضا ربانی صاحب میں ایک بات دریافت کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔ میں نے پہلے بھی ایک دفعہ یہ بات کی تھی لیکن شاید وہ محسوس کی گئی تھی کہ ہر پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کے بعد پارلیمنٹری پروسیجر کے تحت ایک فیصلہ دینا ہوتا ہے۔ ہر پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کا جو ریز ہو گا۔ اس کا Chair ضرور فیصلہ دے گی۔ پوائنٹ آف آرڈر یہاں تو ویسے ہی جاتے ہیں یعنی جو بھی لیڈر آئے گا وہ بھر کے گا کہ یہ بھی پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر بات آئی ہے، یہ بھی پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر بات آئی ہے، 'کلارن پالیسی کی بات بھی پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر آئی ہے،' نیوکلیر پالیسی بھی پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر آئی ہے۔ تو کیا یہ مناسب نہیں ہو گا، اگر آپ محسوس نہ کریں تو میں اس لئے کہتا ہوں کہ وہ debate درست رہے کہ پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کو آؤٹ آف آرڈر رول کرنا پڑے گا۔ بات تو ہو گئی۔ بات پر تو ان کا جواب آ گیا لیکن یہ پوائنٹ آف آرڈر بنتے نہیں ہیں۔ اس طرح سے پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کو رول آؤٹ کرنا پڑے گا کہ پوائنٹ آف آرڈر ruled out میرا خیال ہے کہ یہ پریکٹس ---

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ جناب والا! جو پریکٹس رولز کو خود ہی تبدیل کرتی ہے اور رولز کو اور ضابطوں کو عمل کا پیرا بن پھرتی ہے وہ پریکٹس کھلتی ہے۔ جناب! آپ کے پاس بہت traditions ہیں۔ ضروری نہیں ہے کہ آپ کسی کے پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کو strike یا announce کریں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ ویسے میں عرض کروں کہ پریکٹس اور رولز conflict ہو جائیں گے۔ آپ رولز amend کریں۔ آپ رولز amend کر لیجئے، 'why to resort to the practice.'

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ میں آپ سے ایک گزارش کروں گا، اس سے پہلے کہ آپ یہ کریں، آپ ضرور کریں جو آپ مناسب سمجھتے ہیں ویسے ہی کریں لیکن میرے خیال میں بہتر ہے کہ اس کو چیمبر میں discuss کر لیں۔ روز کو سامنے رکھ لیں۔ پریکٹس جو پچھلے دس بارہ سال کی ہے اس کو سامنے رکھ لیں اور اس پر کیا ہوتا رہا ہے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ چیئرمین صاحب نے کئی دفعہ یہ فرمایا ہے۔

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ جناب! میں آپ کو عرض کروں کہ دنیا میں بہت سارے ایسے قوانین اور ضابطے ہیں اور خاص کر برطانیہ کہ میں جو کنونشن سے براہ راست متصلا ہوں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ وہاں یہ بات درست ہے۔ وہاں درست ہے۔ یہاں نہیں ہے۔

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ جناب! ہم وہی traditions اور وہی روایات یہاں لاتے ہیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: But we have enacted the rules.

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ میں عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ وہاں بھی روز ہیں 'rules of business of parliament' لیکن جب ان کی تشریح ہوتی ہے اور تشریح ہو کر ان پر عمل ہوتا ہے تو ضروری نہیں ہے کہ وہ بالکل ان سے مطابقت رکھتا ہو۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: It is a bigger issue, when it is a bigger issue, we will discuss it.

چوہدری اعتراز احسن۔ اس پر بحث کے لئے آپ سے رہنمائی لیں گے چونکہ آپ کا تجربہ سب سے زیادہ ہے۔ جناب! آپ کا تجربہ مشرقی پاکستان اسمبلی سے بھی ہے۔ میری ایک رائے ہے کہ اب چونکہ tradition ہے۔ اس میں ہر دفعہ ruled out of order, ruled out of order ہوتا رہا۔ اب لوگوں کی دوستوں کی یہاں ایک ایسی توقع بن گئی ہے کہ مجھے اختیار ہو گا یا موقع دیا جائے گا کہ میں پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر اپنے دل کی بات کر دوں۔ جس طرح آج ہمارے ڈاکٹر عبدالجمنی صاحب نہیں ہیں وہ ہر وقت کرتے ہیں۔ اس کے بعد out of order آپ ہر دفعہ کریں گے تو دلاڑاری ہو گی، ہو گئی بات ہو گئی۔ اب میرے خیال میں ہم اس کو آپ کی

راہنمائی سے Chamber میں discuss کر لیں گے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ ضرور کریں گے شیخ صاحب کچھ فرمانا چاہتے ہیں۔ جی فرمائیے۔

شیخ رفیق احمد۔ یہ بڑا آسان راستہ ہے۔ اُس طرف سے جواب آ گیا ہے پھر تو آپ یہ

علم دے سکتے ہیں کہ اب اس پر فیصلہ کرنے کی ضرورت نہیں ہے۔ out of order declare کرنے کی کیا ضرورت ہے۔ انہوں نے اعتراض کر دیا، انہوں نے جواب دے دیا اور آپ یہ ارشاد فرما سکتے ہیں کہ اب اس پر فیصلہ کرنے کی ضرورت نہیں رہی۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ جی اقبال حیدر صاحب۔

سید اقبال حیدر۔ بہت دیر بعد آپ نے میری جانب توجہ دی، میں نے شور مچائے بغیر صرف ہاتھ کھڑا کر رکھا تھا آدھے گھنٹہ سے۔ گزارش یہ ہے کہ یہ جو issue point of order کے سلسلے میں ہے اس پر چیئرمین صاحب کے ساتھ ہماری understanding ہو چکی ہے کہ question hour کے بعد آدھا گھنٹہ جس کو آپ کہہ دیں zero hour یا جتنا بھی مناسب وقت ضروری سمجھا جائے وہ اہم معاملات جو کہ اس دن قوم کو درپیش آئے ہیں ان کے اوپر بات کرنے کا موقع دیا جائے۔ اس کو zero hour بھی کہا جا سکتا ہے اور بہت سی Parliaments میں zero hour کا rules میں بھی موجود ہے۔ اس بنیاد پر چیئرمین صاحب نے خاص طور پر ہمارے adjournment motions کو kill کرنا شروع کر دیا کہ ان نکات کے اوپر zero hour کے درمیان میں بات چیت ہو سکتی ہے۔ میرے کہنے کا مطلب یہ ہے کہ گو کہ rules ابھی باقاعدہ تبدیل نہیں ہوئے ہیں لیکن ایک understanding جاری ہے اور اس روایت کو جاری رکھتے ہوئے یہ موقع دیا جائے کہ ہمیں مناسب وقت ملے کہ ہر روز کوئی نہ کوئی نیا فساد، کوئی نہ کوئی نیا ہنگامہ، کوئی نہ کوئی نیا دھماکہ اس قوم کو face کرنا پڑتا ہے۔ اس پر اگر چیئرمین صاحب ہم نہیں بولیں گے تو پھر عوام کو ہم مایوس کریں گے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ میں تو یہ نہیں کہہ رہا ہوں کہ نہ بولیں۔

سید اقبال حیدر۔ نہیں، اس پر کچھ کہنے کی ضرورت ہی نہیں ہے out of order

یا in order رکھنے کی ضرورت ہی نہیں ہے بس خاموشی ہی کافی ہے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ میں تو یہ عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ رضا ربانی صاحب سے بڑی دفعہ چیئرمین صاحب نے یہ فرمایا کہ zero hour کی جو amendment ہے وہ لے آئیں تاکہ وہ قواعد کے مطابق ہو جائے۔ جی جاوید اقبال عباسی صاحب۔

حاجی جاوید اقبال عباسی۔ جناب چیئرمین! اسی سلسلے میں جو ابھی آپ بات کر رہے تھے میں نے points of order raise کئے تھے کہ پٹاور سے اسلام آباد اور پٹاور سے مانسہرہ تک آئے دن شریف لوگوں کی بے عزتی کی جا رہی ہے مختلف ایجنسیوں کے ذریعے۔ آپ نے رولنگ دی تھی کہ توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیں۔ میں نے تین توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیئے ہوئے ہیں۔ یکدم ایک سو روپے فی بوری، فی یگ سینٹ بمپ کر کے 250 روپے تک پہنچ گیا۔ اس پر میں نے تین توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیئے ہوئے ہیں، پچھلے سیشن میں بھی میں نے دیئے تھے اور اس سیشن میں بھی دیئے ہیں اور ابھی تک وہ نہیں لائے گئے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ عباسی صاحب مجھے یہ بتایا گیا ہے کہ آپ کے نوٹس چیئرمین صاحب کے پاس ہیں۔ آپ چیئرمین صاحب کے ساتھ chamber میں discuss فرمائیں۔

حاجی جاوید اقبال عباسی۔ ٹھیک ہے جی۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ جی جہانگیر بدر صاحب۔

جناب جہانگیر بدر۔ شکریہ Mr. President آپ نے ابھی یہ -----

Mr. Presiding Officer: I am not the President.

جناب جہانگیر بدر۔ جناب چیئرمین، پہلے بھی ایک دن اس پر بحث ہوئی تھی کہ جب چیئرمین صاحب موجود ہوں تو جتنے بھی صاحبان یہاں پر preside کرنے کے لئے آئیں they are the Presiding Officers. They are for the purpose of holding the proceedings

either they are of the meeting, they are Chairmen سے اعتبار ہے۔ Chairperson or they are President. Any how اس پر کبھی بحث کرنا چاہیں تو کر لیں۔ جناب چیئرمین اگر آپ یہی کہتے ہیں تو میں آپ کو کہہ دیتا ہوں جناب چیئرمین آپ کا شکریہ۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر۔ پریذائٹنگ آفیسر ہی کہہ دیں۔

جناب جہانگیر بدر - چلیں میں آپ کو چیئر میں ہی کہہ دیتا ہوں۔ جناب چیئر میں آپ کا شکریہ - یہاں پر جو جناب شفقت محمود صاحب نے point of order raise کیا ہے۔ جب یہاں پر CTBT پر بحث ہوئی تھی تو تمام ہاؤس کی ایک کمیٹی کو فارن منسٹر صاحب نے briefing دی تھی، یہ سوال وہاں پر بھی پیش کیا گیا تھا کہ کیا موجودہ گورنمنٹ کی جو foreign policy ہے اس میں کوئی shift آئی ہے۔ یہ جواب انہوں نے وہاں پر بھی پیش کیا تھا لیکن تمام اپوزیشن نے متفقہ طور پر ان کے ساتھ dis-satisfaction کا اظہار کیا تھا اور یہ کہا تھا کہ ہم اس بات کو تسلیم نہیں کرتے کہ گورنمنٹ کی same policy ہے، گورنمنٹ کی فارن پالیسی میں shift آئی ہے۔ میں یہاں پر یہ عرض کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ انہوں نے یہاں پر جو بات کی ہے اس کو خواہ پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کے طور پر take up کیا جائے یا اس پر بحث کر لی جائے۔ میں تیار ہوں اس پر۔ میں کہتا ہوں کہ گورنمنٹ کی فارن پالیسی میں shift آئی ہے۔ اگر فارن منسٹر اس پر بحث کرنا چاہتے ہیں تو ابھی کر لیں۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، جہانگیر بدر صاحب، جب فارن پالیسی کا آئیٹم اجنڈے پر آئے گا تو اس پر فرما لیجئے گا۔

جناب جہانگیر بدر، بتایا تو جائے کہ اس پر بحث کب ہوگی۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، یہ اجنڈے پر ہے جب آجائے گی، آجائے گی۔ جی آفتاب شیخ صاحب۔

جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ، میں آپ کی توجہ اس بات کی طرف دلانا چاہتا ہوں کہ ایک تو privilege motion آپ نے کل کے لئے رکھ لیا۔ آج میرا دوسرا موشن بھی ہے۔ کیا وہ بھی آپ کل کے لئے رکھیں گے۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، کیا وہ بھی privilege motion ہے؟

جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ، جی ہاں، میں پڑھ لوں۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، نہیں کل پڑھ لیتا۔ کل take up کیا جائے گا۔

جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ، کل، O.K. Sir، یہ بھی آج ہی میں نے move کیا ہے۔

دونوں ساتھ move کئے ہے میں نے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، کل کے تھے۔

جناب آفتاب احمد شیخ، بہتر ہے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، جی حسین شاہ راشدی صاحب۔

جناب حسین شاہ راشدی، جناب چیئرمین! جب سے مسلم لیگ کی یہ حکومت آئی ہے، ہم دیکھ رہے ہیں کہ زیادہ تر وقت اس ایوان کا ضائع ہوتا ہے۔ وزیر اعظم صاحب جو بلا سوچے سمجھے ایسے بیانات داغ دیتے ہیں۔ اس وقت اور اس سے پہلے جو سیشن ہوئے تھے اس دوران میں بھی وزیر اعظم صاحب عالم مدہوشی میں کچھ کہہ ڈالتے ہیں جن کی کوئی نہ cabinet نے sanction دی ہوتی ہے اور نہ وہ کوئی عقل کے مطابق ہوتے ہیں۔ میں یہ حکومت سے پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ کبھی انہوں نے یہ سراغ لگایا ہے کہ وزیر اعظم صاحب کو کیا مرض لاحق ہے کہ وہ اس طرح کے بیانات دیتے رہتے ہیں۔ میری رائے یہ ہے کہ کوئی ایسی صورت اگر نکال دی جائے کہ جو بیانات وزیر اعظم صاحب نے اب تک دیئے ہیں ان پر بحث مکمل ہو تب تک ان پر کوئی زبان بندی کا قانون نافذ کیا جائے۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، مسٹر عاقل شاہ۔

## RE: UNNECESSARY CHECKING FROM DIFFERENT AGENCIES FROM PESHAWAR TO ISLAMABAD.

Syed Aqil Shah: Sir, this is a very important fact that I want to bring to

your notice. وہ نے پہلے بھی ایک پوائنٹ آف آرڈر اس کے اوپر کیا تھا۔ وہ یہ ہے کہ The people travelling between Peshawar and Islambabad. ان کو مختلف جگہوں کے اوپر مختلف ایجنسیاں روک لیتی ہیں۔ یہاں پر وزیر داخلہ صاحب تشریف فرما تھے انہوں نے کہا تھا کہ اس کے متعلق ہم آپ کو جواب دیں گے مگر جواب کوئی نہیں آیا۔ جناب ہوا یہ ہے کہ تقریباً

۱۰، ۱۵ روز پہلے وہاں پریکٹس والوں نے ایک خاتون جو پشاور سے کوئی سالانہ لاری تھی اور کسٹم والے افسران نے اس لڑکی کو ریپ کیا ہے۔ اس سے پہلے یہ ہوتا تھا کہ پتہ نہیں چلتا تھا کہ یہ ایجنسیاں ہیں کیا۔ ہماری اطلاع یہ ہے کہ پیچھے بیٹھے ہوتے ہیں ایکسٹرا والے یا فارسٹ والے آگے، ٹھیکے کے لوگ رکھے ہوئے ہوتے ہیں۔ وہ تلاشیاں لیتے ہیں مثلاً ایک ٹرک آ رہا ہے اس میں بھری ہے یا ریت ہے۔ اس کو یہ کہا جاتا ہے کہ اس کو unload کریں۔ وہ کہتے ہیں کہ جی ہم تو ان لوڈ نہیں کر سکتے ہیں۔ اس پر اتنا ٹائم لگے گا اتنے پیسے لگیں گے تو ۵۰۰ یا ۱۰۰۰ روپے لے کر چھوڑ دیتے ہیں۔ یہاں تک کہ وہ جو پوسٹ ہے ان کو ٹھیکے پر آگے دیا جاتا ہے۔ اس سے عوام کی جان چھڑانی جائے۔ ایک نہیں ہیں جگہوں پر روکا جاتا ہے۔ ہر ۱۰ کلومیٹر کے بعد ایک ایجنسی کھڑی ہے۔ آپ سے یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ یہاں پر جب ہم پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کرتے ہیں تو اس کے اوپر کوئی عمل بھی ہوتا ہے یا صرف بات ایک کان سے سن کر دوسرے کان سے نکال دی جاتی ہے۔ میں یہ بات آج پھر آپ کے سامنے کر رہا ہوں۔ اس کے متعلق میں چاہتا ہوں کہ آپ مہربانی کر کے ان کو ہدایت کریں کہ بہتری کی کوئی صورت نکل آئے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Mian Sahib this point has been raised again and again.

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جناب والا! اس پر کہا تھا کہ وہ کچھ کارروائی کریں گے تو وزیر داخلہ اس وقت موجود نہیں ہیں، میں ان سے رابطہ کر کے ان سے استدعا کروں گا کہ --- جناب پریزیڈنٹنگ آفیسر، لیکن میاں صاحب میں یہ عرض کروں کہ عاقل شاہ صاحب نے عباسی صاحب نے کئی دفعہ یہ point raise کیا ہے اور پھر ایک دفعہ تو فاضل وزیر داخلہ بھی موجود تھے، ان کی موجودگی میں بھی یہ بات ہوئی تھی، اس کو ایک دفعہ طے کر کے ہاؤس میں کوئی statement دی جائے تاکہ ہر روز یہ معاملہ نہ اٹھے۔ انہوں نے توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس بھی دیا ہوا ہے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، اگر انہوں نے توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیا ہوا ہے تو میں کوشش کروں گا کہ اس کے جواب میں ساری چیز آجائے۔

سید عاقل شاہ، جناب والا! میں یہ کہتا ہوں کہ اگر یہ سمجھنا روکتے ہیں تو یہ بارڈر بند

کریں، جنہوں نے سمجھنا کہ وہ تو اب بھی کر رہے ہیں، ٹرکوں کے ٹوک جا رہے ہیں جناب۔ عام عوام کو تنگ کیا جا رہا ہے۔ جناب والا! اس کا جواب تو نہیں آیا ہے۔  
 جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، میں انہوں نے کہا ہے کہ فاضل وزیر داخلہ صاحب سے بات کر کے statement ہاؤس میں دیں گے۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جناب والا! عباسی صاحب کا توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس ہے تو اس کے جواب میں، میں محکمہ سے تفصیلات منگواؤں گا۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، وہ تو میں نے ہدایت کی ہے کہ بیٹھیں صاحب سے رابطہ کر لیں تاکہ وہ ایجنڈے پر آجائے، اسی میں یہ ساری statement آپ دے دیں۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جناب والا! پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر بات تو وقتی طور پر ہوتی ہے۔ توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس پر باقاعدہ بات ہو سکتی ہے۔

سید عاقل شاہ، جناب والا! یہ بات نہیں، یہاں پر دس مرتبہ یہ discuss ہو چکا ہے، ہر مرتبہ یہی جواب دیتے ہیں کہ کل کر دیں گے، پرموں کر دیں گے۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، جناب والا! میں یہ عرض کروں گا کہ اس توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس کو بیٹھیں صاحب سے discuss کر کے fix کریں، میں بھی ان کی خدمت میں یہ گزارش کروں گا کہ اس کو fix کر دیں، اس میں ان کی statement آجائے گی۔ واضح طور پر statement آجائے گی۔

سید عاقل شاہ، جناب والا! اتنے پوائنٹ آف آرڈر جو ہم نے کئے ہیں وہ کدھر گئے ہیں۔  
 میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جناب والا! پوائنٹ آف آرڈر کی بجائے آپ توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیتے، اس کا جواب ہم آپ کو دے دیتے۔

سید عاقل شاہ، جناب والا! توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس کے بارے میں بات کرنا چاہوں گا۔ عباسی صاحب نے تین توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس دیئے ہیں، ان پر تو کچھ نہیں ہوا ہے اب تک۔

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، لیکن میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ اس پر واضح statement آئے گی۔ میں نے ان کو ہدایت بھی کی ہے، 'policy statement اس پر آئے گی۔ جی مٹ صاحب۔

جناب بشیر احمد مٹہ، جناب والا توجہ دلاؤ نوٹس پر بھی statement کی ضرورت نہیں ہے، ہمیں remedy کی ضرورت ہے، آپ ہمیں اس سے چھٹکارا دلائیں۔ یہ وزراء صاحبان یہاں پر بیٹھے ہیں، اس پر ذرا سوچیں، یہ خود بھی وہاں سے گزرتے رستے ہیں، آتے جاتے رستے ہیں تو اس کی طرف خصوصی توجہ دیں۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر، جی جناب خواجہ قطب الدین صاحب۔

Khawaja Qutabuddin : This is not a small matter. I would like to support the point of order of Aaqil Shah. Not only that but this thing is going on throughout the country wherever there are octroi posts because it is the sum total of overall activity. It should be to provide safety, to provide protection to the people of Pakistan and we do not want to sit here with indifferent attitude that the point of order has been raised by the other side.

I think, this is a genuine problem. It should not be brushed aside, it should be discussed in depth and we should know about it that what we are going to do together because we move from one place to another and there are barricades, there are stops and people are extorting money, extortion is going on, people sit at the post with Kalashnikov and things are going on like that which is part of the administration. I am sure the Ministers here are also concerned about it.

Mr. Presiding Officer : Mian Sahib, should we not fix it on Tuesday? I think, we are specific about that, it should not go on indefinitely.

Mian Muhammad Yasin Khan Wattoo : For Call Attention Notice?

منگل وار کے دن۔ ٹھیک ہے جی۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر، اور معاملہ اس پر policy statement بھی آئے گی، جو

remedies ہیں وہ بھی ساری آئیں گی، یہ سارے معاملات وزیر داخلہ صاحب کو فرما دیجئے گا اور وہ تیار ہو کر آئیں۔

میاں محمد یسین خان وٹو، جی میرے خیال میں اسے بدھ کو کر دیں۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، جی wednesday کو دیں، ٹھیک ہے جی، بدھ کے

دن۔ جی بلیدی صاحب۔

ڈاکٹر اسماعیل بلیدی، جناب والا! عکریہ گو بہت دیر کے بعد آپ نے مجھے یاد کیا۔

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، بلیدی صاحب آپ کو بھلایا تو نہیں ہے، یاد تو رکھا ہے۔

ڈاکٹر اسماعیل بلیدی، جناب والا! دو مہینے پہلے وزیر داخلہ نے بلوچستان میں ایک

میٹنگ کی تھی۔ وہاں جتنے بھی وزراء تھے اور وزیر داخلہ صاحب کی موجودگی میں، انہوں نے باقاعدہ

یہ ایف سی خضدار کے متعلق کچھ notification بھی کمشروں کو جاری کئے۔ اس وقت آئی جی

ایف سی تھے، وہ بھی موجود تھے، خضدار کا کمانڈر بھی موجود تھا۔ انہوں نے کہا کہ ایک مہینے

کے اندر ان پر عملدرآمد ہو گا اور آپ لوگ ان کے اثرات دیکھیں گے۔ پوس کونڈ میں ایک

delegation مجھے ملا تھا کہ چاغی کے بارڈر پر ایف سی والے باقاعدہ طور پر فی گاڑی پندرہ ہزار روپے

لے رہے ہیں جو کہ پھوٹی پھوٹی چیزیں لاتے ہیں، جیسے فریج، کسبل لے جاتے ہیں، ان کو

گولی مار کر ہلاک کر دیتے ہیں اور باقاعدہ وہ monthly کروڑوں روپے کما رہے ہیں۔ اس دن جب

وزیر داخلہ کے notification کا حوالہ دیا اور کہا کہ اس طرح لوگوں کو تنگ کرنا بند کر دیں تو

انہوں نے کہا کہ who is وزیر داخلہ، وزیر داخلہ کون ہے؟ اس سے یہ ظاہر ہوتا ہے کہ وزیر داخلہ

اس خرد برد میں شامل ہے۔ اگر وہ شامل نہیں ہے تو ایسا کیوں ہے، جب اس ملک کا وزیر داخلہ

ہمارے سامنے کہہ رہا ہے کہ اگر اس پر عملدرآمد نہیں ہوتا ہے تو میں ان کو سزا دوں گا، تو آج

تک وہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ وزیر داخلہ کون ہے؟ ہم تو یہ غلط کام کریں گے، یہ خرد برد کریں گے، یہ

کرتین کریں گے۔ ہم لوگوں کو تنگ کر رہے ہیں۔ لہذا یہاں statement دینے کے بعد یا

یہاں پوائنٹ آف آرڈر پر بات کرنے کے بعد اس پر عمل در آمد نہ ہونے سے ہمارا استحقاق بھی

مجروح ہوتا ہے اور اس ہاؤس اور قوم کا استحقاق بھی مجروح ہوتا ہے۔ خدا را! اس پر جو وزراء بات

کریں وہ عملدرآمد بھی کرا کے دکھائیں۔ یہ خواہ مخواہ کی تسلیاں ہمیں کب تک دیتے رہیں گے۔

ہذا بلوچستان میں بھی بارڈر پر بہت مسئلہ ہے، اس سلسلہ میں بھی وزیر داخلہ صاحب کو نوٹس دے دیں کہ وہ اس پر بھی بیان دے دیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: We now move on to the next item No. 3.

Yes Mr. Rizvi please.

جناب مصطفیٰ کمال رضوی، جناب والا! تحریک اتوا جو move کی گئی تھی، حکیم

سعید صاحب کی ہلاکت پر، اس پر بحث ہو رہی تھی ہاؤس کے اندر I would like that discussion to continue, if you don't mind کل اس پر بحث ہو رہی تھی، سندھ میں Governor Rule کے بارے میں بات ہو رہی تھی۔

#### ORDINANCES TO BE LAID

جناب پریذائٹنگ آفیسر، جی وہ آئے گا ابھی، آپ تشریف رکھیں، ابھی اس

کے بعد اس کی باری ہے۔

Yes, Mr. Khalid Anwar to move it.

Mr. Khalid Anwar: Sir, I beg to lay before the Senate the Anti-terrorism (Amendment) Ordinance, 1998 (IX of 1998), as required by Clause (2) of Article 89 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Anti-terrorism (Amendment) Ordinance, 1998 is laid before the House.

Now we have to resume the discussion on Karachi.

Mian Raza Rabbani: Then again you have to suspend the rules.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Had you not suspended it yesterday?

Mian Raza Rabbani: Suspended them yesterday for yesterday.

Today they should have given it on the orders of the day. But they have not

given it on the orders of the day.

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is right.

آپ اہی تشریف رکھیں ذرا تشریف رکھیں۔

(مداعت)

### MOTION RE: SUSPENSION OF RULES

Mian Raza Rabbani: Sir, I beg to move under Rule 236 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Senate that the provisions of Rule 27 be dispensed with and the adjournment motion be taken into consideration.

*(The motion was adopted)*

Mr. Presiding Officer: The motion is carried.

We will now resume discussion on the Karachi situation. Yes, Mr. Rizvi.

جی گل آخری مقرر کون تھے، بشیر منہ صاحب تھے، جی راجوانہ صاحب اس کے بعد آپ ہیں۔

Mr. Rajwana now.

### FURTHER DISCUSSION ON KARACHI SITUATION.

جناب محمد رفیق راجوانہ، رضوی صاحب کے ساتھ معذرت کے ساتھ

Sir, the issue which has been discussed here and there are far and against arguments and speeches from both the sides on such an important topic that whole of the nation is looking at their steps, what do we resolve here and who dowe say with regard to the law and order situation in Karachi and the imposition of the Governor's Rule. Actually the imposition of the Governor's Rule is being criticized by the other side. It's not the main thing, actually the issue is the law and order in Karachi and the steps taken by the government in that regard.

According to the preamble of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, where the will of the people had been discussed and it is the will of the people according to the preamble to have peace and prosperity and law and order in the country. This is the paramount duty of the government to safeguard the lives, liberties, property and fundamental rights of the citizens of the country. Sir, the people of Pakistan want that they should have a prosperous country and they should lead towards the road of progress, not to the road of sorrow. Sir, unfortunately after independence and after the death of the founder of Pakistan most of the politicians have dragged this country to the negative side. They have caused damage to the nation, to the country, to the economy of this nation, that everybody knows. Sir, the law and order situation in Karachi which was in every session discussed here in the Senate and in the National Assembly and every worthy Senator of this House had been showing his concern and that was rightly shown that was a justification as being member of the this august House. All the time our friends on the other side have been accusing that the government has failed to maintain law and order in Karachi and I am sure without any fear of contradiction that the government in Karachi means at that time, our friends, the people of MQM who were the partner with the government and were responsible for maintenance of law and order in the city.

Sir, unfortunately the politics of our country is such that the yesterday's enemies have become today's friends and the living example is in our House today and even before that, sir with this reference I would submit that today again those people who joined with People's Party in 1988 and that marriage of convenience was broken later and again an action was taken against them and they had been crying for that, that a political victimization has taken place and

that marriage was broken. Later with the passage of time ultimately in this regime they had joined with Pakistan Muslim League. Again that was their paramount responsibility to maintain law and order situation because they claim themselves and positively they were representatives, rather blue eyed representatives of the Karachi city. They all with their inefficiency which they have shown with regard to the failure of maintenance of law and order in Karachi. Those were the situations and I put a question to the august House rather it is approved or thought that why every time is the MQM with whom the marriage of convenience is broken, with whom the alliance is broken and all the time when the action is taken MQM steps out of that alliance and starts saying that they are being victimized.

Actually I would submit that they have failed to discharge their responsibility with regard to this important issue, sir. Now my submission is that any action which is taken for the betterment of the people, we never judge of that situation, we may discuss this constitutionalities, we may discuss legality, we may discuss all other issues but the submission is that the best judge are the people. The best judge are the people of Karachi and I assure you and everybody knows that after this action, the people of Karachi have taken sigh of relief. They are happy that after all at a certain stage, the government has realized that they have to do something with regard to the maintenance of peace, with regard to maintenance of law and order situation in Karachi. So, the best judge are the people who have voted for their representatives. So, when people at large and common man is happy for this action, I say, we have to look after and we have to pay respect to their thinking and their will that they have appreciated this action of the government whereby the action is being taken against the culprits, not

against any political group. Sir, with all these characteristics of our politics in our country, the Karachi situation where the numerous people have been killed, the dacoitees have taken place, car snatching, "bhatta" and all such like illegal activities have made the lives of the Karachi people miserable, that was the compelling circumstances which led to the imposition of the Governor Rule in Karachi.

Sir, the persons who claim themselves the champion of democracy, who had been the soldiers of fortune for some time, who have been the ministers in that city, who have been in charge of so many lucrative offices there and when they fail, they can't say that now when the government has taken an action because all the machinery has failed, that this is an illegal action. The action is very much within the ambit of the constitution and in accordance with the provisions of the constitution. Sir, the Karachi is bleeding, the whole of the nation is bleeding, the Karachi is burning in the wild fire sir, and the wild fire is also spreading all over the country. If somebody adds fuel in the fire, he is not discharging his duty rather he is walking against the interests of the common man.

Sir, the cold blooded murder of Hakim Saeed, everybody knows that he was a noble soul and this was the murder of a saintly human being who had a vision for the future of the child of this nation, who had devoted everything of his efforts for the betterment of this nation and killing of that man sir, is a brutal act and that has added flames to the situation of Karachi, I would say, and I would submit that his honesty and integrity was beyond reproach sir, and I pray to Almighty Allah that we may get a lesson from his blood, we may get lesson from his teachings and here with heavy heart and sorrow which we have faced after the murder of Hakim Saeed, I remember and I recall the quotation of Mauze Tung that we have gained

strength from sorrows and we have gained strength from these sorrows that what is happening in Karachi, that's why this action has been taken sir.

Sir, this is an issue on which much can be said by everybody but I would humbly submit and I would make a request in the shape of an appeal to all the political parties, to all the leaders, to all the friends that let us forget the game of question of our vested interest. Let's forget that we have gains in joining a party or losing a party or leaving a party. We owe a lot to the nation. So, collectively sir, we have to take the steps whereby we can lead the nation towards the road of prosperity and happiness and not a road of sorrows. So, sir, in the end, I would request again to all of the honourable members of this august House that despite all political differences amongst us, despite all political affiliations, let us join our hands whereby we can be able to deliver the goods to the nation for which the nation has sent us here because we owe a lot to the nation and if, we at this juncture fail to discharge our responsibilities, fail to discharge our duties then the next generation will never forgive us. So, sir, I just conclude my submissions in this august House that if somebody is murdered in Karachi, it is a murder of a Baloch, it is a murder of a Sindhi, it is a murder of a Punjabi, it is a murder of a Pathan because we as a nation, as a whole are one. So, nobody can say that this is the issue of Karachi alone. It is the national issue and the economy which is suffering because of this law and order situation, everybody is aware of this thing. So, my submission would be that let us develop consensus on it, let us do something collectively. We have so many other things where the political differences can be agitated where we can oppose each other. It is not the stage, it is not the time. It is not the issue where we can say that this action is wrong, this action is right. Here we have to take a

collective step sir. In the last sir, just --

یہ دو اشارے ہیں۔

بھوڑیں صوابیت وطن سے کریں پیار  
لے کر محبتوں کے علم اپنے ہاتھ میں  
اپنے وطن سے پیار ہو جذبے اگر ہوں سچ  
کوئی بھی کامیاب نہ ہوگا نفاق میں

جناب چیئرمین۔ مسٹر مصطفیٰ کمال رضوی۔

جناب مصطفیٰ کمال رضوی۔ جناب والا! شکریہ۔ آپ نے مجھے دیر سے موقع دیا،  
مگر دیا۔ میری خواہش تو یہ تھی کہ حکومتی بیچر سے منسٹر صاحب نے جو کل تقریر کی تھی اور  
میں نے ان سے کہا تھا کہ آپ آج ضرور تشریف لائے گا چونکہ وہ بہت کچھ کہہ گئے تھے۔

But he should be present here to also hear what we have to say about him and  
the whole situation. It is a shame that he is not here. But I hope my message  
gets to him and to the rest of the people here.

پہلے تو میں حکیم سعید صاحب کی جو ہلاکت سندھ میں ہوئی ہے اس کی مذمت کرتا ہوں اور باقی  
جتنی ہلاکتیں اور بھی ہو رہی ہیں یا ہوئی ہیں، آج بھی ہلاکتیں ہوئی ہیں جبکہ وہاں گورنر رول  
ہے، کل بھی ہوئی ہیں اور میں ان سب کی مذمت کرتا ہوں۔

ایک کہاوٹ ہے کہ شاہ سے زیادہ شاہ کے وفادار۔ کل حلیم صدیقی صاحب نے ایک  
plead کرنے کی کوشش کی۔ کیونکہ ظاہر ہے کہ نک کو حلال بھی کرنا ہے۔  
وہ حکومت میں ہیں انہوں نے نک بھی حلال کرنا ہے اور آگے ترقی بھی لینی ہے۔ اب ترقی  
کہاں ہوتی ہے وہ اللہ ہی جانتے۔ جناب والا! میں یہ کہنا چاہوں گا کہ سندھ میں جو گورنر رول لگایا  
گیا ہے اس سے ایک سیاسی نظام کو ختم کیا گیا ہے۔ اس ملک کی وہ جگہ جہاں سے اس ملک کا  
revenue generate کر کے پورے ملک کو مہیا کیا جاتا ہے اور جو سیلانی لائن ہے اور  
وہاں سے revenue آتا ہے۔

You have hit a province when the third largest political party belongs from that

province. You have hit the province where the second largest political party belongs from that province and you have imposed Governor rule in that place.

اگر آپ نے حکیم سعید کا کس یا تھا تو اسی دن عبداللہ صاحب کی ہلاکت اسلام آباد میں ہوئی تھی۔ تو میرا موقف یہ ہے کہ صدارتی رول اسلام آباد میں لگایا جائے اور اسی مہینے کے اندر لاہور میں پنجاب کے بہت اہم شہر میں ہمارے ایم این اے صاحب ہلاک ہوئے، ہمارے ایم پی اے وہاں ہلاک ہوئے تب گورنر رول پنجاب میں بھی لگانا چاہیے تھا۔ یہ کیا کر رہے ہیں آپ چیئرمین صاحب۔ میں تو حیران ہوں کہ اب تک پرنسز ڈپانہ کی ہلاکت کا موجب ایم کیو ایم پر کیوں

نہیں ڈالا گیا - I am surprised not to find out that there is a movie now a days

showing "Titanic" Film, Chairman sahib اگر نہیں دکھی ہے تو دکھینے کا اچھی مووی ہے مائینٹیک جس میں جہاز ڈوبتا ہے آخری وقت میں۔ اب تک حکومت نے یہ allegation کیوں نہیں لگایا کہ Titanic کو ڈوبنے میں بھی ایم کیو ایم کا ہاتھ ہے۔ مائینٹیک جا کر دکھینے کا پتلے آپ۔ Every single allegation is levelled on the third largest political party. اگر آپ

کو کراچی سے زبردستی سینٹیں چاہیے ہیں

and you want to take control of the most important city of the country then this is what you have to do what you are doing today by pushing the law enforcement personnels to go into that city to create another sort of operation in that city, Mr. Chairman.

آپ زبردستی کچھ نہیں چھین سکتے۔ اگر چھین سکتے ہوتے تو الیکشن کے یہ نتائج نہ ہوتے جو آج ہیں۔ The people of Urban Sindh are with Altaf Hussain and with MQM آپ جتنے

آپشن کرنا چاہتے ہیں آپ ضرور کریں مگر the result will be the same, 0+0=0 حکیم سعید صاحب has been used for this purpose to control Karachi. تاکہ جناب عالی! وہاں پر آپ ہدیہ کے یا local bodies کے الیکشن کرائیں تو میئر زبردستی آپ اپنا لے کر آئیں جیسے ہمارے حکیم ہیں۔ پتہ نہیں کون سی دیگ پکاتے ہیں۔ حکیم صاحب نے جیسے کہا کہ جی the Mayar will be from Muslim League. یہ خواب دیکھنا بھائی دن میں پھوڑ دیں۔ یہ چھ سال کا آپ کے پاس

that the political party which exists in Urban Sindh is only MQM and ہے proof

For the people are with MQM. instance, the Minister said that let us bring the agreement in front, that we have fulfilled all the agreements. that not a single clause صاحب گا چیئر مین of that agreement has been fulfilled which Mr. Haleem Siddiqui and other Ministers signed on behalf of Pakistan Muslim League. The no go areas still remain. The compensation to the shaheeds still remains. The Governor, which they have promised to MQM that would be the nominee of MQM still remains and the rest of the clauses of agreement still remain. جہاں چاہیں بیٹھ کر جہاں چاہیں compare کر لیجئے گا نوٹس۔ انہوں نے کہا کہ جناب عالی! ہم نے 50% seats ان کو دے دیں۔ because the Prime Minister wanted seats in the province. Chief Ministership کو رکھنے والوں کو 14 seats رکھنے والے 28 seats رکھنے والے Chief Ministership دے دیں۔ یہ کہاں کا political دستور ہے۔ نہ یہ کہیں ہوا ہے۔ but only for the stability and of democracy to prevail in the province needs sacrifice of the chief ministership سیٹ اپنے شہیدوں کے خون پر ہم نے قربان کر دی صرف democracy اور ملک کی سلامتی کے لئے۔ We let it be and we did not argue on that point. 50% seats ان کو دے دیں۔ آپ نے بڑا احسان ہم پر کیا۔ آپ کو ہمیں 50% seats سے زیادہ دینا چاہیئے تھا۔ because even the chief ministership belongs to MQM. کیو ایم والے حکومت میں رہتے ہوئے strike کی calls دیتے ہیں۔ Why you are still in the Government, MQM calls for strikes? Where in democratic countries, it says that you cannot call for strikes, but if your people are being killed in that same city. More than 280 people were killed while we were in power with Pakistan Muslim League. ہمارے لوگ مریں اور آپ کہیں کہ آپ احتجاج بھی مت کرو۔ ہمارے لوگ ہلاک ہوں ہر کے اندر اور ہم احتجاج بھی نہ کر سکیں۔ اور بات چھوڑیں اگر یہ ہلاکتوں کی بات کر رہے ہیں تو یہ گورنر رول لگا ہوا ہے۔ and everyday people are dying in that city. پھر انہوں نے کہا کہ جناب عالی! 400 یا پتہ نہیں کتنی گاڑیاں بند کر دیں جب strike call انہوں نے کی اور

پھر گاڑیاں چھینیں گئیں۔ تو بھی اخبارات last week کی اٹھا کر دکھیں تو بیس بیس گاڑیاں آج بھی کراچی شہر میں چھیننی جا رہی ہیں۔ Who are the people who are doing this while the Governor's rule has been imposed in that city. یہ ماہر، ماہر سے متحدہ قومی موومنٹ پر آگئے۔

Let me tell you sir, that the people who migrated, our forefathers who migrated from India were divided into different political parties. The biggest thing which could happen to MQM was that it has brought them on one platform of recognition.

کم از کم حلیم صاحب کو یہ شوق تھا کہ وہ پچاس سالوں سے اپنے آپ کو تکیئر بھیا، مٹرو اور جو جو نام یہ لوگ جانوروں کے لئے کہتے تھے اگر یہ ان کو پسند تھا تو پھر وہ اب تک اپنے نام جانوروں کے ناموں پر کھلوائیں مگر We are called Mohajirs because our forefathers migrated from India and we are proud to be called as the Mohajirs. کیوں کہ جس کی

شناخت نہیں ہوتی، اس کا کچھ نہیں ہوتا، حدیث میں بھی ہے کہ قومیتیں شناخت کے لئے بنائی گئی ہیں۔ جب آپ پنجابی، بلوچی، پٹھان ہیں، سرائیکی ہیں تو ہم مٹرو، بھیا، تکیئر سے تو بہتر ہیں کہ ماہر ہیں۔ ان کو تو یہ بھی نہیں پتا کہ الطاف حسین نے انہیں ایک شناخت لے کر دی ہے۔ وہ شناخت that stands for the people who made Pakistan. اس کے بعد when we made that platform recognition ہو گیا اور دنیا نے recognition کر لیا کہ ماہر is a nation in Pakistan, then we moved ahead and we said that let us spread message

of brotherhood, of unity for eradicating the feudal system from the country and

give message اور اسے آگے صوبوں میں پھیلاؤ اور لوگوں کو جگاؤ کہ پچاس سالوں سے جاگیرداروں کی زنجیروں کو توڑ کر باہر آؤ، تو پھر اس سے متحدہ میں convert کئے گئے ہیں because we wanted a broader base of a political system اس وقت تک ہمیں نہیں چاہیے تھا we wanted to be united on one platform ان کو کہیں کہ اگر وہ ابھی بھی مٹرو کھلوانا چاہیں تو آج بھی کھلوائیں اپنے آپ کو، کیوں کہ آپ تکیئر اور بھینے سے کم کچھ نہیں ہیں۔

I would go on to say Mr. Chairman that he levelled an allegation yesterday that we

the MQM did not go for 14 days to Hakeem Saeed Sahib's house.

کل جو میں اٹھا تھا تو میں اس point پر اٹھا تھا لیکن جمالی صاحب نے مجھے زبردستی بٹھا دیا because this was the point which I wanted to point out for information. I wanted to say that we were there in the burial, Farooq Sattar, a Senior Minister was there , Wasim Akhtar was there , Sheikh Bukhari was there and another Rabta Committee member was there on the day of burial and the day of "Soaim" also, our Rabta Committee members were there.

اگر آپ کی information ایسی ہے اور آپ Minister بن کر Treasury Benches پر بیٹھے ہیں تو میں گزارش کروں گا کہ ایسے لوگوں کو اپنی جگہ سے بٹھائیں because they are trying to fuel fire with the people who are with you اور ایسا message دینا چاہ رہے ہیں تو میں I wanted to point it out there, that he or you are wrong what you are saying , you don't have enough information. we represent Karachi. یعنی تم اپنے گھر سے ووٹ لے کر ہمیں box دکھا دینا، تمہارے تو گھر کا ووٹ بھی تمہارے ذبے میں نہیں ہو گا۔ یہ سیٹ جس طرح تمہیں ملی ہے ، پوری دنیا جانتی ہے۔ جس طرح 1994 ، 1995 ، 1996 میں ان کی constituency میں جلی ووٹ بنائے گئے ، صرف ان کو جتوانے کے لئے اور اعجاز شفیق کو جتوانے کے لئے جو کچھ کیا گیا اسے دنیا جانتی ہے۔

جناب عالی ! میں یہ کہنا چاہوں گا کہ جب وہ conclude کر رہے تھے that what has

MQM done for Karachi in the last 15 years, I am glad Hakeem is here, he said that

what they have done in Karachi in the last 15 years, میں نے پہلے کہا کہ الطاف حسین نے اپنی قوم کو ایک شناخت دے دی that is all اس سے بڑھ کر ہمیں کچھ نہیں چاہیے because atleast today I can stand and say and defend that I am Mohajir and my political party is MQM نے اپنی قوم کو اور الطاف حسین نے اپنی قوم کو پندرہ سال میں شناخت دی۔ جناب عالی let me come back to another thing جو دوسرے colleague تھے ' I would like to come back to him quickly and انہوں نے کہا کہ جی

they had more than 60 , پوری دنیا باقی ہے , MQM is responsible for law and order  
 meeting ہوئی تھی تو اسی ہاؤس میں میں کھڑا ہو  
 law and order meeting has been conducted and not one political کہ  
 person who represent Urban Sindh is being called in those meetings. Not one  
 elected representative from Urban Sindh is available. Mr. Haleem Siddiqui has  
 been elected but he does not represents Urban Sindh. I told you that not a single

person from MQM which is your ally law and order کہ ہم کو یہ  
 ہی پتہ نہیں کہ آپ اندر کر کیا رہے ہیں۔ چلنے پنی رہے ہیں یا کوئی پتہ نہیں کون سی  
 planning کر رہے ہیں جو آج سامنے نظر آ رہی ہے۔ انہوں نے کہا کہ

marriage , MQM is the only political party which bridges the marriage of  
 convenience , not bridge the marriage of convenience. What did ANP do to you?

They supported you in every respect for the last 14/15 years every single step of  
 the day ANP had to leave because you did not honour your commitments. You

did not honour the commitment of the people of NWFP and the same with the  
 BNP. Why did they leave you? Because you did not honour the commitment you

made to the same people of Balochistan and they left you. What about JWP, the  
 same joke with JWP, what is happening to the people of treasury benches, have

they gone? I don't know where are they getting their messages from? The allies  
 which are supporting you, you are placing them away. Each political party is

going away from you because you do not honour neither your written  
 commitment nor your verbal commitment. And then MQM record

پر ہے کہ وہ آخری وقت تک support کرتی ہے اپنے کو اور principle پر کبھی سودا  
 نہیں کرتی۔ نہ کسی سے negotiate کرتی ہے۔ میں نے آپ کو بتادیا کہ

MQM is one political party like the rest of my brother here which do not  
 compromise on issues, whether the Shariat Bill or any other Bill. Whether be a

Bill of Terrorist Law which was passed the other day. We stood and we say even being an ally that we will not pass that Bill because we are totally against those situations which you have provided in it. We have abstained or either we do not pass that law.

ہمارے میں اتنی courage اتنی boldness ہے۔ جناب ہم ٹھیک تو جو ہوں گے وہ وقت اور تاریخ بتائے گی۔ - we will tell you and history will tell you جناب عالی

main issue, let me get this newspaper here today. Advocate General said that no confession under umbrella has been recorded. Was the Prime Minister having

two third majority, جناب والا میں نے ایک دفعہ اپنے ساتھیوں کو کہا تھا کہ دکھیں یہ جو mandate آپ کو ملا ہے۔ زندگی میں نہ تو پہلے کسی کو ملا ہے نہ اب ملے گا۔

please stand on the ground very carefully. Do not listen to your so called advisors who are keeping you in a place like Heelium Baloon

غبارہ جو helium سے بھرا ہوتا ہے۔ جب اس کو بھر کر اوپر پڑھایا اور helium gas اس میں اتنی بھری نہیں ہے اور وہ نیچے آ گیا۔ جناب عالی

the newspaper of today's "News" completely contradicts everything the Prime Minister has said on television. The Prime Minister levels allegations on behalf of the people of the police which holds investigations in CIA cell and he said that all the plan was prepared at 90 by MQM. Can you imagine what you are doing? You are levelling 3 crore people as terrorists of urban Sindh because we represent more than those people here

جب آپ ہمارے ہیڈ کوارٹر پر allegations لگاتے ہیں تو آپ سمجھتے ہیں کہ آپ کیا کر رہے ہیں۔ What you say something that you will get away with it آج کے اخبار نے غبارے سے ہیٹیم گیس نکال دی ہے and they have come down like this آپ نے ہمارے ساتھیوں کو بھی ایک ایک کر کے نکال دیا ہے اور آپ اکیلے پاکستان کو چلانا چاہتے ہیں تو چلا کے دیکھ لیجئے گا۔ ضرور چلا کے دیکھئے گا اگر آپ کو موقع ملے run کرنے کا۔ Let me tell you again, Mr.

Chairman that confession which was made, it was not made before the judge, it

custody میں was made in the police custody کہ پولیس کی میں confession کے اوپر اتنا بڑا allegation لگا دیا جائے۔ کچھ تو kindly خیال رکھیں ادھر۔ جناب عالی! اگر ایسی بات تھی تو آپ کو یاد ہو گا کہ شہباز شریف صاحب exile میں چلے گئے تھے اور اسی پولیس نے ان پر allegations لگائے تھے اور وہ بھاگ کے exile میں چلے گئے تھے۔ Prime Minister Sahib پر بھی allegations لگے تھے اور اس وقت بھی پولیس یہی تھی جنہوں نے

- Why did he leave the country, why did Shehbaz Sharif go on exile? کہا

Mr. Presiding Officer : Please conclude now.

Mr. Mustafa Kamal Rizvi : I would like to conclude in the moment, give me time because

کراچی کا issue ہے، بہت بڑا issue ہے۔ چیئرمین صاحب! آپ نے دیکھا جتنے لوگ جو ۹۲ کے آپریشن میں موجود تھے اس وقت وہ ایک ایک کر کے سارے واپس لے آئے ہیں کراچی کے اندر So I would like to ask the government what was the motive of bringing those officials who were responsible and involved in extra-judicial killings after 92,

what was the purpose of bringing those official back into urban Sindh اور بات یہ ہے جناب عالی! کہ اب تو خیر غبارے سے ہوا نکل گئی ہے مگر میں یہ کہنا چاہوں گا کہ جناب وزیر اعظم نے تو چھ آدمیوں کے نام لئے تھے کہ چھ آدمی involved ہیں اس میز کے اندر تو آپ نے چھ سے آٹھ سو ہزار آدمی کس لئے اٹھائے اور کس لئے بند کئے۔ چھ آدمیوں کے آپ چھ ہزار آدمی اٹھائیں گے؟

جناب عالی! بات گھوم پھر کے وہیں آتی ہے کہ all this is being done in order to pass the Shariah Bill, The Shehnsahiat Bill and the second thing my great

friend, if he wants the Mayorship of Karachi, Haleem Sahib, then آپ کو آپریشن کراچی میں کرنا پڑے گا اور اسی طرح آپ ایم کیو ایم کو ڈنڈے کے زور پر سیاست سے باہر اگر رکھ سکتے ہیں، رکھیں گے تو یہی کچھ ہو سکتا ہے اور آپ manipulate کر سکتے ہیں اس کے بغیر

I can challenge you کہ کونسل کی سیٹ پر لڑ کے دکھ لیتے گا اور کونسل کی سیٹ پر بھی لڑ کے دکھنے کے وقت let those people come who can monitor that this is properly done, manipulate نہیں ہونا چاہیے۔ جناب عالی! کراچی کی جو سوچ، مسلم لیگ کا view, we talk about the federation, we talk about the integrity of Pakistan, we talk about solidarity of Pakistan and we say that if you want to take Pakistan into the 21st Century then you must take the rest of your smaller brothers with you. I keep saying that divided we will fall, together you will stand, if you keep smaller provinces away because you want to colonize the rest of the provinces into a Punjab State or a colony of the Punjab then I am sorry, Chairman Sahib

یہ ہم لوگ جتنے یہاں بیٹھے ہیں یہ ہونے نہیں دیں گے۔ سندھ کے مفادات کو ہم protect کریں گے۔ دوسرے ساتھیوں کو ہم support کریں گے۔ یہ جو total scenario create کیا گیا یہ Titanic کا تو دنیا کے سامنے آ رہی ہے بات کہ how it was handed اور پھوٹی موٹی چیز جو ہے

levelled against the third largest political party. I think time is there that we must reconcile. If your advisors are not there, if they are not competent enough then take some advisors from the other people you feel who can guide you on the right track and specially Chairman Sahib

میرمی پنجاب کے میڈیا سے request ہوگی کہ خدا کے واسطے اپنے لکھنے کے وقت honesty کریں کیونکہ آپ لوگ وہ ہیں جو دنیا کے اندر messages دیتے ہیں۔ جب بھی کراچی کے ساتھ بہت بڑا سانحہ پلان کیا گیا ہے تو پنجاب کو اس سے پہلے mentally prepare کیا گیا ہے۔ پنجاب ہمارے ملک کا حصہ ہے ہمارا بڑا بھائی ہے۔ مگر خدا کے واسطے do not try to push your other brothers away because atrocities کرنے کا نتیجہ ہمیشہ خراب ہی رہا ہے اور تاریخ نے prove کیا ہے کہ عوام کے اندر جن کا ہیڈیٹ موجود ہوتا ہے۔ let it be any political party. If they have the mandate with the people then no atrocity of this world can take powers from them. اور حکیم سعید صاحب کی جو ہلاکت

Prime Minister should come on اور ان کے actual killers کو پکڑنا چاہئے اور stage, television and apologise to the country and say it was a wrong presumption. He must apologise to the country. I don't care about جو کچھ بھی ہے مگر آپ آئیں جس طرح پہلے آئے تھے۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please take your seat now. Mr. Jamiluddin Aali.

Mr. Mustafa Kamal Rizvi: Mr. Chairman Sahib

ٹی وی کے اوپر میڈیا کے اوپر ہمیں بھی اتنا ہی موقع دیں۔ جتنا آپ آج کل دوسرے لوگوں کو دے رہے ہیں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, Haleem Siddiqui on point of personal explanation.

Capt. (Retd) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: Thank you very much for giving me this time and privilege to answer this. I was not here. I really missed the initial beginning of what the honourable Senator said but I heard him later when I walked in. This is what is happening exactly in Karachi. They don't want to accept the reality. If I, Haleem Siddiqui and Ijaz Shafi, got elected and they deny that and they accuse people who got elected by their constituencies. Sir, you can see the attitude of the people. The tolerance is not there. I would like to put it on record while I am talking on my explanation.

In 1988 and 1990 elections when the MQM was all in all in Karachi, in my constituency, in 1993, they boycotted National Assembly elections. I got elected as MNA in 1993 from my constituency which is 191. They can claim whatever they feel like. But in 1997, they got only 40 % of their votes and what they got in 1988 and 1990, they should see the attitude of the people, they have been rejected. Who

is liked by the masses, sir, that speaks by itself. Sir, they got 40% of their votes what they got in 1988 and 1990. I would like to put their record right.

The other thing sir, they talk of mandate. They think that they have only got the mandate. I have got the mandate. Like Ijaz Shafi has got the mandate and five other MPAs from Muslim League have got a mandate and if they don't have any respect for them what do they expect.

*(interruption)*

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes, this is his personal explanation.

Capt. (Retd.) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: Yes, sir, it is point of personal explanation. They are humiliating sir.

*(interruption)*

Mr. Presiding Officer: This is his personal explanation.

Capt. (Retd.) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: Sir, let me tell you he mentioned about local bodies election and pointedly telling me that Mr. Haleem Siddiqui you take the local bodies elections.

Mr. Presiding Officer: No, no.

Capt. (Retd.) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: Sir, he mentioned my name.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please be brief.

Capt. (Retd.) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: Sir, I would like to challenge and I would like to ask a question through you, sir, why did they beg and plead to postpone the elections of local bodies? Why did they make a request if they were so sure?

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is not part of the personal explanation. Please confine yourself on the personal explanation.

Capt. (Retd.) Haleem Ahmed Siddiqui: He mentioned me, sir. You Haleem Siddiqui you are trying to get the local bodies through rigging the elections and he wanted an answer that I have to give sir. I did not rig any election. The record speaks for itself. You can go and check it sir. They are 50% in Government of Sindh and still they are begging.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Now Jamiluddin Aali.

*(interruption)*

Mr. Presiding Officer: Please take your seat. That was personal explanation. Mr. Jamiluddin, now.

*(interruption)*

Mr. Presiding Officer: No, no. This is not a debate. This was personal explanation. He was referred in the speech and he has explained himself his position. Mr. Abbasi, please take your seat.

Shaikh Aftab Ahmed: As to whether this debate will end today or will it go on for tomorrow also.

Mr. Presiding Officer: I think, I do not know the agreement. But the list I have, there are 19 speakers from the opposition side, 6 from the government party 1 was the independent. There are all 26 people. This is upto the Leaders. Mr. Jamiluddin Aali.

Dr. Jamiluddin Aali: Sir I am ready to speak but Mr. Bashir Matta is suggesting that I should speak tomorrow.

Mr. Presiding Officer: No, no I have given him the floor. He is an independent member. He is independent in the list. He is in 3rd column. First is government party, then opposition. Since he is the only member who is included in the list of independent members.

Dr. Jamiluddin Aali: Thank you sir, Actually sir I am the first to move a call attention notice for a discussion first by the Minister concerned against the imposition of governor's rule in Sindh under section 232 of the Constitution and then came several adjournment motions. Then afterwards Mr. Chairman, I was asked to combine myself with them and become a mover which I did not chose to be and I said, it is a very simple thing, I am going to read the statement of objects. I am not fond of making emotional speeches and so on and he did permit me to read out unwillingly. So I read out my statement on the basis of which I was opposing the governor's rule and said a few words and for that matter that was enough for me because I do not like to be emotional and accuse. I would like to be precise as much as I wish to be. Now it is very kind of you, I thought I would not be allowed to make this speech because I had told the Chairman that if you wish and if you let me state even as a little. I would come into picture later on. But it is very sweet of you to have allowed me few minutes and I would confine myself to the following sir.

I have heard, and I have been hearing both the sides accusation and cross-accusations and that is actually I am afraid of, I beg my colleagues, they may excuse because of my age and so on, that we have been very irrelevant to the subject Sir most of us. I find the dead body of Hakeem Saeed lying somewhere in the oblivion. The main reason that had been given in the

proclamation of the imposition of Governor's RaaJ, is the murder, the (Shahadat) of Hakeem Saeed and I find that instead of focusing our attention on that matter, focusing our attention on the greatest of losses that this country has suffered and actually making much part of the debate, a reference for Hakeem Saeed, we have been accusing each other and the various political parties have been talking about various stories. Question is that, more than 14 days have passed sir and not one person has been arrested. Not one person is directly accused in any court of law in Karachi for the murder of Hakeem Saeed. Not one person has been promised to be produced on the TV and that programme was abandoned same day we waited all the day, we waited all the evening, time was changed and they said that they will read out a confession, the man will come out and read out the confession, he never appeared.

Then there comes in a story of Kamran Khan in "The News" which Senator Mustafa Kamal Rizvi haphazardly mentioned, he should have read it out, he should have mentioned this in detail. Then comes the story that no confession as Senator Aftab Ahmed Sheikh said yesterday. Sir, I am not accusing the government and you see its not a question of accusation. The question is as to what happened, what happened then and what happened afterwards. A great man, a great son of this land was murdered and he was made a reason for imposition of Governor Rule and nothing happens about the mans murder and a follow up. There is no follow up, a follow up is that several arrests are being made and so on. I protest against all those arrests. That is not the focus of my attention. So sir is it going to be lost like the Shaheed Liaquat murder again, again on 16th October and then 17th October. Two days have again come in and one day has been added and this is a very tragic day in our

history again.

Sir I would now beg your indulgence to give few minutes to go back to the main issue. Sir, this question, I am sorry I think many colleagues will certainly have different views but this thing, the Sindh situation where the compromises and the agreements between the various parties take place every day and are broken the second day, it is mainly due to the non existence of an honest spirit of one nation in the entire country and particularly now in Sindh. I have been writing as a humble writer for the past 36 years against nationalities, the creation of nationalities and in favour of the synthesization of one nation and looking at the issues through the philosophy of the class struggle. An exploiter in Punjab is as good or as bad as an exploiter in Sindh. Actually as bad an exploiter in Sindh and exploiter in Balochistan is as bad as the exploiter in Frontier. And an oppressed in Sindh or Karachi or Punjab or Balochistan is as good an oppressed, or as humble an oppressed as pitiable an oppressed, as any where else. We have our intellectuals and our politicians who have been dividing this nation in order to avoid the main issues, they have been dividing this nation into nationalities and nations with the result that when we talk of four nationalities, there is a fifth to show up and they showed up which Senator Mustafa Kamal Rizvi was mentioning to. That is only a phenomenon of the past 15 or 14 years and that is a natural and compulsory and a very sad but now factual reaction to the four nationality theory. Why did the people in power then and their intellectuals very popular and in power then including, I want name of a great poet who also cited that thing, created the theory of nationality instead of synthesization of one nation. We had our class struggle, we have rich we have poor, we have our great industrialist, and we have our great landlord and so on,

they should have been called that way. No they were called Punjabi, Balochi, they were called Sindhi, they were called everything else in Sindh and now a class comes, a class consisting of three crores. Oh, we cannot call you Sindhi because then the quota question comes. You are crawling creatures, so go and get murdered somewhere in the mud of Sindh.

I will not be in this House very soon sir, I intend to leave this House for good. I am quite fed up of this thing. I am not fit for this House. This is a House of great politicians and I am a very humble writer and ex-poet of this country. But I have been writing for the past 30 years. I am on record I am not a politician to change the speeches, it is not a question of a speech. It is not a question of spoken word. It is a question of written word that I have been saying that if you talk of four, there will be a fifth, and there will be a sixth and they will claim their rights and there they are. Now, when they have stood up, you don't give them their rights because you are not used to giving rights. The people who have been ruling all the people of course, barring one or two, all the establishment type of people and by establishment I don't mean the army, my definition of the establishment is those who are pillars of power or seekers of power. All those have been denying their rights. So, the result is that slowly the poison has been spreading and things have come to that pass that nationalities after nationalities come, emerge and stand up and ask for their rights and then the powers who rule crushed them. So, the point of crushing becomes not the class, not the injustice, not the exploitation but the nationality that Muhajirs are being crushed by non-Muhajirs and Balochis are being crushed by so and so. This is not the case. This is not the question but this has become the fact unfortunately in this country. Even I concede that we are now five or may be six,

Siraekies are coming. So, do we want this to go on even after this and during the Governor rule that is also the question.

Of course, I challenge and I dispute the imposition of Governor rule in Sindh for the reasons I have given and that has been published in the press. But I want to link up this question for your kind consideration sir and for the consideration of this House if this House has any power. I am sure they have power to think but I don't think they have any power to convey their wishes effectively to the people who really matter. I don't know. We all talk and we debate and it is a debating society. I have recalled my college and I am recalling of my university and I feel very happy about it oh, I got my university back I am debating as one. But it is a pity that I am doing this sir. We should be effective and so through you sir, I appeal to this House once again to take a chance with history. This is just taking a chance whether we can go back to the spirit of 1947, or spirit of 1946 and the spirit of 1940 and the spirit of 1930 when we were one nation and the Hindues were other nation and when we were trying to get our land. We were one nation trying to get a land, now there is a land as somebody said without a nation. Can we reconsider this on these lines that were given to us by our elders and if we did, then very soon there will be no Karachi issue and there will be no Lahore issue. There will be issue of class of rich and poor, of haves and havenots, only those issues.

So let me take up this opportunity to linkup, while others have spoken very well on the legal aspect and the other aspect, let me also beg to throw before them the question of the future, emanating problems from the situation of Sindh. What are they seeing, I would expect the other speakers from any side to forecast before me and before this House what do they see in the next 6 months

and the next 5 years. Things emanating from Sindh are affecting all the country including economy. I would expect and request anyone from this side and anyone from that side particularly the law minister and Yasin Watto Sahib, for whom I have had the highest regard in my life, I have served under him and I am very proud that I served under him. He is a kind person, he is an intellectual. He thinks. He is a patriotic Pakistani, I would particularly expect even now that he is leading the House I would expect him to say something about what he sees about the future? What is going to come out of this Karachi - Sindh, tragedy, the tragedy starting not from Hakeem Saeed but from the four nationality question and the introduction of the 5th nationality which is a fact, which cannot be denied and then clashes and clashes, I am sorry that I am admitting it in this House that there is a fifth nationality. I am very sorry, but it is a fact, I wrote against it, I worked against it, but it is a fact that you created it. You pushed the people to the wall and then they stood up and got together and now they are demanding their rights.

So, apart from that, what is going to happen now after this Sindh situation, this will go on to Section 232. What ensures three months. There is no question of three months, there is no question of six months, as would have been under Section 234 which I pointed out in my speech. So, possibly it is going to be indefinite. Indefinite, sort of a year, or two, or something. So, what do they foresee? One thing of course was foreseen by Mr. Haleem Siddiqui which was aggravated by my dear friend Mustafa Kamal Rizvi that they would rig the election of the Corporation and then the Provincial Assembly and so. He is predicting that and many people are predicting that. Alright, that is the political side. Alright, suppose they get more seats and they get others also in the

provincial Government. Then what? Are they going to convince the majority of the people of Karachi and Urban Sindh that right things happened? Are they going to convince the next generation that any rigging or any manipulation was a right thing? I don't think they will consider so. This will be a perpetual thing.

One Dr. Nishat Malik, I think he is an MNA, I remember, he had said about 10 days back that Karachi is suffering from cancer. I don't wish Karachi to suffer from cancer, sir and would not really agree that this is a cancer which is incurable but I feel afraid that if it is so, then what is going to happen to Pakistan, that cancer will spread to Pakistan. It has already spread in Pakistan.

So, I don't have much to say, things which have been said, and this is actually in your rules also, which we do not follow, forbid repetition of arguments, they specifically forbid repetition of arguments. So, avoiding those, I am again putting my question to the other speakers, through you, sir, and to the nation, if anybody, has to report me. Of course, I like my column, but if who cares for that, but, if somebody reports effectively as to what is going to come out of this? Do they see positive things coming out of the Governor Raj in Sindh? Is there no other alternatives just now? Is it really impossible for the people in Sindh, Peoples Party people, Muslim League people, MQM people and others to sit together once for all, forget their differences for a while, for a year, for two years and develop Sindh economically and spiritually. Am I talking just as a stupid idealist? If it is so, I don't mind being called a stupid idealist. After all this is the Upper House and I think there should be some room for stupid people like me talking, I mean the idealist, the dreamer and so on, there should be some place for dreamers and some idealist people.

So, I am taking this opportunity, I am taking that advantage, I am

begging to say that , perhaps, there is still time and the Prime Minister will do very well if he really takes that chance and comes to Karachi and gets the people and say, I have been saying that many many times, in writing, in speeches, the other day I mentioned the Peace Committee, before that I have been talking of Peace Commission and committees and the local police and the metropolitan Government. Sir, I have moved a motion which is there, which is not coming up. Every time of course it comes up but did not come for discussion before the House and I don't know whether it will come. But you should have a metropolitan Government in Karachi, if you have a metropolitan Government as I have proposed, in every city which has a population of more than a million, a million and more. Possibly much of these differences will be self-governed, will be pruned, will come to some pause where people do not hate each other so much and do not wish to exploit each other so much, as we do now. Exploitation is in the nature of human beings, I don't trust it ofcourse, it is the legacy of what you called the reptile brains, reptilian complex, that is a part in the brain which is going on since past billion of years but this research is a part of that and showing itself slowly millions and millions of years but it will take a million or two years before my this dream comes true and I don't like you to waste two million years sir, if it is so, I am not waiting for that now ; but the question is that in this very civilized world , intellectually at least , we have got all the books, we have got all the lessons, we have got all the information, can't we just manage one city and one province to the degree it is possible that has been in so many countries. So , with this question about the future, I would like to end up with the question as to the future of this governor's raaj in the eyes of the speakers that will follow me. Thank you sir.

Syed Iqbal Haider: Sir, it is being repeatedly asserted about the Mohajir Qaumi phenomena that no longer exists because MQM has changed its name from Mohajir Qaumi Movement to Mutahida Qaumi Movement, so now they have no right to say that Mohajir is a "Qaumiat" because they themselves surrender and they should accept that.

Mr. Presiding Officer: Yes Mr. Rizvi.

جناب مصطفیٰ کمال رضوی - جناب میں ان کو یہ بتا دوں کہ قومیت basic phenomena ہے کسی چیز کا، یہ چاہے مائیں یا نہ مائیں۔ یہ تو حدیث بھی کہتی ہے کہ ہم نے لوگوں کو فرقوں میں بانٹ دیا، قرآن میں بھی ہے کہ ہم نے فرقوں میں بانٹ دیا تا کہ آپ کی پہچان ہو۔ اگر ہم نے اپنی پہچان کروائی ہے اور internationally مانا گیا ہے تو متحدہ قومی موومنٹ is a political phenomena۔ بھائی۔ مہاجر تو ہماری ثقافت کا ایک حصہ بن چکے ہیں۔ We are a nation as Mohajir.

Mr. Presiding Officer: That is all, Raja Aurangzeb now. Order please, no talk, no more discussion on that, please resume your seat. Raja Aurangzeb now.

راجہ اورنگ زیب - جناب چیئرمین صاحب! میں آپ کا شکریہ ادا کرتا ہوں کہ آپ نے مجھے وقت دیا بولنے کا۔ کراچی کے مسئلے پر دونوں طرف سے خاصی بحث ہوئی اور اپنی اپنی طرف سے دونوں سائیڈ سے دلائل دیئے گئے۔ گورنر راج پر بات ہوئی، Law and Order کے مسئلے پر بات ہوئی، قومیت پر بات ہوئی، مہاجروں کے ساتھ زیادتی کی بات ہوئی اور بات چلتے چلتے حلیم صدیقی اور اعجاز شفیق کے الیکشن پر ختم ہوئی۔ جناب چیئرمین! میں صرف یہ عرض کر دینا چاہتا ہوں کہ سیاست میں دوستی اور دشمنی جمہوریت کا ایک امر ہے۔ ہمیں اس بات کا سخت افسوس ہے کہ ہمارے Prime Minister of Pakistan جو گزشتہ الیکشن میں پاکستان کی تاریخ میں ایک بہت بڑا مینڈیٹ لے کر کامیاب ہوئے اور اس مینڈیٹ میں ہمارے ساتھ چند ایک دوسری چھوٹی چھوٹی گروہی پارٹیاں بھی شامل تھیں، گروہ چند آدمیوں کو کہتے ہیں۔ جناب والا! میں گزارش کروں گا

کہ وہ پارٹیاں جو کبھی اپنے حلقوں سے ، اپنے علاقے سے ، اپنے صوبوں سے elect ہو کر اسمبلی میں داخل نہیں ہوئیں ، آج وہ میاں محمد نواز شریف وزیر اعظم پاکستان اور پاکستان مسلم لیگ کی بدولت اور ان کے ووٹروں کی وجہ سے اس ایوان میں تشریف فرما ہیں۔

جناب والا! ہم یا ہمارے دوست جمہوریت کی بات کرتے ہیں تو میں ان سے گزارش کروں گا کہ میرے بھائیوں اور دوستوں سے کہ نہ تو قومی اسمبلی اور سینٹ کا دروازہ توڑ کر آپ داخل ہونے اور نہ ہی ہم لوگ داخل ہونے۔ ہم بھی عوام کا ووٹ لے کر ، عوام کا اعتماد لے کر اس ایوان میں آئے ہیں اور آپ بھی اپنے اپنے حلقوں سے عوام کا اعتماد لے کر قومی اسمبلی اور سینٹ میں تشریف فرما ہیں۔ مجھے آج یہ کہنے میں بڑا دکھ محسوس ہو رہا ہے کہ جناب والا ، محمد نواز شریف صاحب نے جو دینی طبیعت کے ہیں اور بڑے سوچ سمجھ کر فیصلہ کرنے والے قومی لیڈر ہیں انہوں نے اہتمامی کوشش کی۔ بڑے سوچ و بچار کے بعد اور اپنے دوستوں سے مشورے کے بعد جبکہ ان پر پارٹی کا اندرونی پریشر اور پارٹی کے ورکروں کا ان پر پریشر تھا کہ یہ گروہ اپنی سیاست جھکانے کے لئے آپ کو ، پاکستان کو اور پاکستان مسلم لیگ کو بلیک میل کر رہا ہے لیکن ہمارے وزیر اعظم پاکستان میاں محمد نواز شریف نے اس بات کی پرواہ نہ کرتے ہوئے بڑے ٹھنڈے دل سے ان لوگوں کو موقع دیا اور کوشش کی کہ ہم ان کو پاکستان کے قومی دھارے پر لا کر چلیں۔ سیاست پر لے کر چلیں اور ہم نے کوشش کی کہ کراچی کے اندر لاء اینڈ آرڈر کے مسئلے پر یہ ہمارے ساتھ تعاون کریں۔

یہ قسمتی سے یا خوش قسمتی سے آپ جو بھی سمجھ لیں یا سوچ لیں کہ جناب والا چیف منسٹر پاکستان مسلم لیگ سے تھا لیکن عملی طور پر میں دعوے سے یہ کہتا ہوں کہ حکومت MQM کی تھی اور MQM یہ دعویٰ کرتی ہے کہ وہ ایک قوم ہے۔ جناب والا میں آپ کی وساطت سے ان دوستوں سے یہ گزارش کروں گا کہ پاکستان میں صرف ایک ہی قوم ہے جس کا نام پاکستانی ہے اور ہم سب پاکستانی ہیں۔ ہمارا کوئی علاقائی مسئلہ نہیں ہے لیکن مجھے افسوس اس بات کا ہے کہ جب انہوں نے یہ بات کی تو ان کے قائد جناب الطاف حسین صاحب جو کافی عرصے سے اس ملک سے باہر ہیں اور اپنی اس جماعت کے ، گروہ کے ان دوستوں کو وہاں سے ڈائریکٹیو جاری کرتے ہیں جس قسم کے بھی ہوں۔ میں عرض کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ میں ان ماہروں کو سلام پیش کرتا ہوں کہ جنہوں نے اپنے گھر بار لٹا کر ، اپنے مال و دولت لٹا کر ، اپنی عزتیں

لہا کر پاکستان کو قبول کرتے ہوئے اپنے ملک ہندوستان کو بھوڑ کر پاکستان میں آئے۔ اگر کوئی یہ کہے کہ وہ ماہر دہشت گرد ہیں۔ میں کبھی بھی نہیں مان سکتا کہ جنہوں نے پاکستان کے لئے قربانیاں دی ہوں۔ جنہوں نے پاکستان کے لئے اپنا تن من لٹایا ہو وہ پاکستان کا دہشت گرد نہیں ہو سکتا۔ میں ان سے یہ سوال کرتا ہوں کہ یہ بتائیں اس ایوان میں کہ کراچی کے اندر اتنے قتل کیوں ہوئے اور بوریوں کے اندر لاشیں کیوں ملیں۔ میں ان سے یہ سوال کرتا ہوں کہ لاء اینڈ آرڈر اور اس قتل و غارت کو ختم کرنے کے لئے آپ نے کون سے اقدام اٹھائے۔ آپ نے حکومت کے ساتھ کیا تعاون کیا اور حکومت نے ان کو رد کیا۔ ہماری حکومت 'ہم نے اور ہمارے لیڈر نے' پاکستان مسلم لیگ کے صدر اور پاکستان کے منتخب وزیر اعظم میاں محمد نواز شریف صاحب نے کراچی کے کروڑوں عوام جن کو ایک گروہ نے یرغمال بنا رکھا تھا، اس گروہ کی یرغالی سے دور کرنے کے لئے، ان کے دماغ سے یہ ڈر ہٹانے کے لئے، ان کے دماغ کو صحیح کرنے کے لئے، جناب والا! اگر اپنی حکومت کی قربانی دی اور گورنر راج قائم کیا تو وہاں حکومت ختم نہیں ہوتی ہے، وہاں پر صرف transfer of power ہوتی ہے، ایک Chief Executive سے دوسرے Chief Executive کو powers منتقل ہوتی ہیں جو کہ حکومت پاکستان کے مرکز کا وہ اجنٹ ہے، جو گورنر کہلاتا ہے، اس کو صرف powers دی گئی ہیں، باقی حکومت intact ہے، وہی آئی جی، وہی ڈی آئی جی، وہی ایس پی، وہ ہی سارے کے سارے کام کر رہے ہیں، ایجنیز وہی کام کر رہی ہیں، اسپلی اسی طرح سے ہے، لیکن ان کے وزراء کی وہ چوہدرائت ختم ہو گئی ہے۔ جس کی وجہ سے آج ان کو دکھ اور تکلیف پہنچ رہی ہے، لیکن گورنر راج نافذ ہونے سے پہلے ہمارے (مارشل لاء کا لفظ آ گیا ہے، ہم نے اس کو کبھی خوش آمدید نہیں کہا ہے، یہ آپ لوگ ہی کہتے ہیں)

جناب والا! میں کراچی کے حوالے سے یہ کہوں گا کہ اگر ایم کیو ایم یہ کہتی ہے کہ اس کا پوری کراچی کے اوپر عدالت خواستہ راج ہے یا اس کا پوری کراچی پر کنٹرول ہے، تو میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ they are living in the fools paradise، وہ احمقوں کی جنت میں لستے ہیں۔ کراچی میں وہ لوگ بھی رستے ہیں جو پاکستان کے وفادار ہیں، جو قوم اور ملک کے وفادار ہیں، جو کراچی کے شہریوں کے وفادار ہیں، جو کراچی کے اندر امن قائم کرنے میں حکومت کا ہاتھ بنا رہے ہیں۔ چند علاقوں کو رنگی، چورنگی، ناظم آباد یا چند اور علاقوں میں اگر ان کی چوہدرائت ہے تو اس کو انشاء اللہ تعالیٰ ہم ختم کریں گے۔ وہاں پر ہم عوام کی چوہدرائت کو قائم کریں گے اور عوام جس نے

گورنر راج نافذ ہونے کے بعد سکھ کا سانس لیا ہے، تمام صوبوں سے آج پوری قوم گورنر راج کو خوش آمدید کہہ رہی ہے۔ سوائے ان کے کسی طرف سے گورنر راج کی مخالفت نہیں ہو رہی ہے، وہی لوگ گورنر راج کی مخالفت کر رہے ہیں، انہی کے پیٹ میں درد ہو رہا ہے کہ جنہوں نے گاہریں کھائی تھیں۔

جناب والا! میں یہ ضرور کہوں گا کہ کراچی پاکستان کا دل ہے، کراچی پاکستان کی معیشت کا بیڈ کوارٹر ہے، کراچی پاکستان کے عوام کا آبادی کے لحاظ سے جی ایچ کیو ہے، لیکن مجھے بہت افسوس ہے یہ بات کہنی پڑتی ہے کہ اکثریت کو انہوں نے اقلیت میں تبدیل کرنے کی کوشش کی۔ اس میں وہ اللہ اور رسول کے فضل و کرم سے کامیاب نہیں ہو گئے اور کراچی کے عوام جن کے دماغ پر خوف قائم تھا، اللہ کے فضل و کرم سے اب ان کے دماغ سے وہ خوف ختم ہو گیا ہے۔ یہاں میں یہ بات کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ اگر اب انتخابات ہوئے تو انشاء اللہ تعالیٰ آزادانہ طور پر ہوں گے، چاہے وہ بلدیاتی انتخابات ہوں، خواہ وہ قومی اسمبلی کے ہوں، خواہ وہ صوبائی اسمبلی کے ہوں اور وہ انتخابات یہ ثابت کر دیں گے کہ ساتھ انتخابات میں اور ان آزادانہ انتخابات میں کتنا فرق ہے۔ جب عوام بلا خوف و خطر پولنگ شیٹوں پر ووٹ ڈالنے کے لئے جائیں گے تو پھر ان کی مرضی ہو گی کہ وہ ایک گروہ کو ووٹ دیتے ہیں یا ایک پاکستان بنانے والی جماعت کو ووٹ دیتے ہیں۔

جناب والا! میں یہ ضرور کہوں گا کہ انہوں نے یہ بات کر کے مجھے بڑا دکھ پہنچایا ہے، مجھے ذاتی طور پر دکھ پہنچا ہے کہ انہوں نے علاقائی بات کی ہے، علاقائی بات کر کے انہوں نے پاکستان کے عوام کو دکھ پہنچایا ہے، جو لوگ پاکستان کے لئے درد رکھتے ہیں لیکن افسوس یہ کہتے ہیں کہ پاکستان کے اندر مہاجر پانچویں قوم ہے، میں کہتا ہوں کہ آپ کو یہ بات کہنے پر مجھے سخت افسوس ہے، آپ کو یہ بات کہنے سے پہلے سو بار سوچنا چاہیئے تھا کہ آپ کی تین نسلیں جو اس پاکستان میں موجود ہیں، آپ اب بھی اپنے آپ کو اگر مہاجر کہتے ہیں تو یہ بڑے ہی شرم کی بات ہے آپ کے لئے۔ آپ کبھی بھی یہ بات نہ کہیں، آپ مہاجر نہیں ہیں، آپ پاکستانی ہیں اور اپنے آپ کو پاکستانی کہیں۔

(مداغت)

جناب پریذائیڈنگ آفیسر، آرڈر آرڈر پلیز۔

راجہ اورنگزیب، جناب والا! میں پنجابی نہیں ہوں، میں پاکستانی ہوں، مجھے پاکستانی ہونے پر فخر ہے، میں نہ کبھی ہندوستان کی بات کرتا ہوں، نہ جتھوں کی بات کرتا ہوں، میں پاکستان کی بات کرتا ہوں۔ آپ لاکھ کوشش کریں، try کر کے دیکھ لیں۔ گورنر راج نافذ کرنے سے پہلے اور گورنر راج نافذ ہونے کے بعد کراچی کا آپ موازنہ کریں، آپ عوام سے پوچھیں، ایک ریڑھی والے سے پوچھیں، ایک دوکاندار سے پوچھیں، ان کا ایک کارکن اگر کسی ذاتی بنیاد پر قتل ہو جاتا تھا تو یہ پوری کراچی میں ہڑتال کی call دیتے تھے، لیکن میں آج ان سے یہ سوال کرتا ہوں کہ حکیم محمد سعید شہید ہوئے، ان کو قتل کیا گیا اور آپ نے کراچی میں ہڑتال کی call کیوں نہیں دی؟ اگر آپ یا آپ کی جماعت کے کارکن یا آپ کی جماعت کے اہلکار گھسے ہوئے دہشت گرد اس کام میں ملوث نہیں تو آپ کا فرض تھا، اور مجھے تو یہاں تک بھی اطلاع ہے کہ ہڑتال تو بڑے دور کی بات ہے، جناب والا! ان کے جنازے میں ان کا ایک کارکن بھی شریک نہیں ہوا، اور ایک ایسے شخص کی موت جو کہ ہمارے لئے بہت بڑا سانحہ ہے، جس نے اس ملک کی خدمت کی، قوم کی خدمت کی اور ہمیشہ انسانیت کی خدمت کی اس شخص کو دن دیناڑے بے رحمی سے قتل کر کے، میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ ان دہشت گردوں نے بہت بڑا ظلم کیا ہے۔

جناب والا! ہمارا ایم کیو ایم کے ساتھ کوئی جھگڑا نہیں ہے، ہماری ایم کیو ایم کے ساتھ کوئی لڑائی نہیں ہے، کوئی احتجاجی کارروائی نہیں ہے، ہماری اگر جنگ ہے آج تو جناب والا! ان دہشت گردوں کے خلاف ہے، اگر ان دہشت گردوں کا تعلق مسلم لیگ سے ہے، ان کا تعلق اگر ایم کیو ایم سے ہے، ان کا تعلق اگر پیپلز پارٹی سے ہے، جماعت اسلامی سے ہے، یا کسی بھی جماعت سے ہے تو ہماری جنگ ان کے ساتھ ہے۔ میرا خیال ہے کہ یہ سمجھ گئے ہوں گے کہ میں کیا کہہ رہا ہوں۔ جناب میں بیمار آدمی ہوں۔۔۔۔

جناب پریذائڈنگ آفیسر، اسی لئے تو میں عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ conclude

فرمائیں۔

راجہ اورنگزیب، جناب والا! میں چونکہ بیمار آدمی ہوں، دل کا مریض ہوں، میں ان کی طرح زور سے تو بول نہیں سکتا کہ میں پورے پاکستان کو سناؤں لیکن اس حالت میں آدھا دل ہونے کے باوجود میں ان کی طرح بولوں گا، انشاء اللہ پاکستان کے لوگ سن رہے ہیں۔

اب آخر میں میں جناب عرض کروں گا کہ کراچی کے حالات بگاڑنے والے بھی وہی لوگ ہیں جو آج بیچ و پکار کر رہے ہیں۔ میں ان سے اپیل کروں گا، میں ان سے درخواست کروں گا، پاکستان کے نام پر ان سے درخواست کروں گا، پاکستانی قوم کی بھلاہ اور پاکستانی قوم کی سلامتی کے لئے ان سے درخواست کروں گا کہ خدا کے لئے آپ تھوڑا سا سوچیں کہ آپ کدھر جا رہے ہیں، آپ کہاں جا رہے ہیں؟ آپ سڑک کے انتخاب کے سلسلہ میں غلطی کر رہے ہیں، آپ سیدھی سڑک کی بجائے پھرنڈی کو کیوں استعمال کر رہے ہیں؟ آپ کو انشاء اللہ سڑک پر چلنے میں کوئی تکلیف، کوئی دکھ نہیں ہو گا۔ جناب والا! میرے پاس کہنے کے لئے بہت کچھ ہے اور اللہ تعالیٰ نے مجھے پھر موقع دیا تو پھر انشاء اللہ میں گزارش کروں گا۔ آپ کا مشکور ہوں، ان بھائیوں کا مشکور ہوں جنہوں نے میری بات کو تحمل سے سنا اور میں اپنے دوستوں کا بھی مشکور ہوں کہ جنہوں نے میری پذیرائی کی، اسی کے ساتھ میں ختم کرتا ہوں۔

Mr. Presiding Officer: The last speaker for today, Maj. Mukhtar Ahmad.

Maj. (Retd.) Mukhtar Ahmad Khan: Thank you Mr. Chairman, and it so happens that at every time I have spoken, you are always in the Chair. So, that is a good fortune for me sir. Sir, as far as Karachi is concerned and this debate is concerned, it was initiated with a reference to the assassination of Hakim Saeed. Sir, we condemn that. It is a regrettable tragedy. We condole with his kith and kin. We lost in him a man, a personality, an institution and I think, the whole country is grieved over it. About that there is no doubt. Sir, but if you go in the context of Karachi where Hakim Saeed had its place at the National and International levels. We had these poor people for whom many tears were shed also. Throughout the period since Karachi has been having this trouble, there are people who have died in Karachi, their bodies were brought, they were from some remote village, may be in Bunair, may be somebody belonged to a

village somewhere in the interior of Jhelum. We grieve for them also sir, because in Karachi, though we saw Mr. Rizvi and Mr. Haleem Siddiqui, well, there were sort of contending for the representation of Karachi but Karachi by nature, Karachi by its cultural aspects, sir, every man in this country has a stake in Karachi, why have they forgotten our stakes. Look at us, look at the Pakhtoons, Karachi is our biggest city because nowhere have we such a population, such a big population as in Karachi. So, we all carry stakes in it, some, similarly, whether it is Punjab, whether it is Sindh, whether it is Balochistan. Everybody is represented in Karachi. The matter may be difference of stakes. Some may be having bigger stakes, some may be having smaller stakes but the point is that concern is there, for each and every individual as far as Karachi is concerned, there can be no doubt and sir, as far as we are concerned, since this problem has started, I regret to say that no matter who was there, Karachi has not been dealt with properly. It is a classical example of history if you go to Rome when it was said that Rome was burning and Nero was fiddling or something of that sort, that has been the case with Karachi and it has come to that point that today this realization has only come after so many years that some solution has to be taken out for Karachi.

Rather late sir, rather late, I must say but then again the question arises that, is the solution in imposition of the Governor's rule? Sir, we disagree, we condemn the governor's rule also because it is not in accordance with democratic traditions. It is not in accordance with what we think in terms of a federation, therefore, we condemn that. We feel that the options available have still not been exhausted. This could have been done when all the options were exhausted and that one option that we thought was there that this should have been offered to



ان کو ابھی تک وہ یاد نہیں ہے کہ فیصل آباد میں جب انہوں نے لوگوں کو پکڑا تھا اور ہتھکڑیاں پہنائی تھیں ٹی وی پر آئے تھے I say do we expect the Prime Minsiter to be doing  
 یہ تو طریقہ تھا ٹھیک ہے this, this is incorrect

we are not for terrorism Sir because the second thing is linked with this. No sane person no sane society no society on earth today would support terrorism. No body does that so if that was not the case legal force was there, the Prime Minister should have used it because what has happened now. He has accused them right on the Prime Time and today what comes in the Newspaper that confession of Amirullah, as the A.G says that he never made a confession. So where does he stand now, it is a matter to apologize now, I mean it would be in the correctness of things to apologize for this behaviour. At the same time though it is unbecoming of him it is expected of him. Why expected of him because basically what my friend of the Senate was talking before me that mandate Mr. mandate what I call, you have to have a person who can handle a mandate. He is one who just cannot handle a mandate, he may be able to handle a farm, he may be able to handle a foundary if it becomes a foundary but that mandate is off with him. I think Mr. Watto would have handled it better. Sir he has become a graber in the sense that he wants to grab everything and this is the result he would go on. Sir, look at what he has done, all his allies that were sitting this side are today sitting this side. The only exception is my friend who are not present that is FATA WALAS. Now sir, why this has happened.

ایک کے ساتھ تو چلو ہماری غلطی تھی ، دوسرے کی بھی غلطی تھی ، تیسرے کی بھی غلطی تھی تو کیا سب کی غلطیاں تھیں ۔ He is correct all the time and we are wrong all the time. - کیونکہ گل یہ بات چل رہی تھی کہ ان کے ساتھ حکومت میں بیٹھ کر اور پھر دوسرے دن حکومت سے جا کر یہ اس کے خلاف باتیں کرتے ہیں ۔ Sir, the unfortunate thing is in this country that

every ruler doesn't expect that anybody should disagree with his policy. یہ مسئلہ

ہے کہ ہم پارٹیز ہیں، ہمارے اپنے مقاصد ہیں لیکن ہمارے مقاصد قومی مفاد کے ساتھ

They are within the national interest but you see our ways are a little

different ہم جب ان کے ساتھ بات کرتے ہیں، -

When parties enter into coalitions, - when parties enter into governments with them, it is based on good faith. It is

based on the faith - That - جب ان کے ساتھ حکومت میں ہیں حکومت چلاتے ہیں۔

is of a national thing. ہمیں نہیں دیا ہم اسے کیا کریں - ہمارا کالاباغ ڈیم کا مسئلہ تھا - اس نے

He went away from that - ہمیں نہیں دیا ہم اسے کیا کریں - ہمارا کالاباغ ڈیم کا مسئلہ تھا -

ہم کیسے اس کے ساتھ رہیں گے - اسی طرح ان سب کے ساتھ ان کا مسئلہ ہوا ہے، چاہے وہ

جمہوری وطن پارٹی تھی، چاہے وہ بی این پی تھی، چاہے وہ ایم کیو ایم ہے، ان سب کے ساتھ

The man actually has lost credibility and this was his biggest - اس طرح تھا

problem. Now, - اس کی وجہ سے یہ ساری کولیشنز ٹوٹی ہیں تو کل ہم آواز نہیں اٹھائیں گے۔

looking at this -- there are two angles of looking at this--

He might look at it like this that he has outmanoeuvred us. - پہلے تقریر کر چکے ہیں۔

It is not an outmanoeuvring--- کو ایک درجہ دیتے ہیں سیاسی شعور کا لیکن ہمارے خیال میں

and the net ہمیں تو it is a matter of bad faith جس پر وہ واپس چلے جاتے ہیں

result is کہ اس کے کوئی اتحادی ساتھ نہیں جاتے۔ یہی مسئلہ اب ایم کیو ایم کے ساتھ ہے۔

one of the reason انہوں نے اس کے ساتھ بات کی تھی - اب جیسے انہوں نے بتایا ہے کہ

was not supporting the Shariat Bill, it is the C.A. 15 and C.A. 15 would mean

15 because that is the importance I give it. In anyway it is not a Shariat Bill. It

is just to accumulating as he wants to have some powers so that he would become

a Khalifa but he does not know that there are contenders . کس کا بنے گا - جہاں کل

اس نے جملہ کیا وہ تو صوفی محمد کی domain ہے

Nawaz Sharif آپ کا کیا خیال ہے کہ صوفی محمد نواز شریف کو ادھر بیٹھنے دے گا -

Why shouldn't go for him. - rather going himself, let him do it. قندھار

میں بیٹھا ہوا ہے۔ ٹھیک ہے اس نے اس سے پہلے کام شروع کیا ہے۔ ہم اسے قبول کر لیں گے۔

Why should accept this man . A man who has no credibility. A man who is not believed by his people. A man in whom the people have lost confidence. A man who talks of Ehtesab. A man who talks of default . But a man who himself is a defaulter. A man who should be standing himself before the Ehtesab. because people think that he will not be able to deliver . If he cannot deliver, he has got no right. حکیم سعید کا قتل rightly a very sad tragedy-- لیکن آیا یہ صرف وہاں ہوتا رہتا ہے یا اور بھی کہیں ہوتا ہے۔ پنجاب میں کتنے قتل ہوئے ہیں۔ لاہور میں کتنے ہوئے ہیں۔ مولانا کا قتل ہوا، اس سے پہلے ایک مولانا صاحب کا قتل ہوا ہے۔ اب وزیر داخلہ صاحب کو دکھیں، جب باہر ہوتے ہیں تو غود تو کیسا بلا نکالیں بیٹھے ہوتے ہیں۔

I don't know what is he doing about terrorism there. But you have an Interior Minister whose district Gujrat is worst, the crime ridden district, adjoining Sheikhpura, the second, adjoining Gujranwala, it competes with the two, Faisalabad, Lahore--

آپ کو تو پتہ ہے -----

and you know every thing and they are the worst crime ridden districts in Pakistan.

اب یہاں پر جتنے قتل ہوئے ہیں، وہ s.p ان کی اپنی برادری کا تھا، تو اگر وزیر اعظم صاحب ایم کیو ایم سے پوچھتے ہیں کہ آپ ہمیں hand over کریں ان قاتلوں کو یعنی یہ clear cut alleging ہے کہ آپ نے یہ کام کیا ہوا ہے تو یہ شہباز شریف سے کیوں نہیں پوچھتے ہیں کہ hand over us those قاتل جو یہاں پر اتنے لوگ مرے ہیں۔ یہ کیوں نہیں کہتے ہیں شہباز شریف کو۔ But no he uses double standards and these double standards are something that he has been using right throughout. He has one listening for the other provinces and ill-intention he has got one for Punjab۔ نہیں اس سے تو یہاں پر۔

Mr. prove ہو جاتے ہیں۔ Ill-intention تو prove ہو جاتا ہے کہ imposition جو ہے وہ جیسے

Raza Rabbani pointed out rightly, he just wants to keep the minority

Government in place, سندھ میں۔ پہلی بات یہ ہے جی، یہ باتیں کرتے ہیں۔ کوئی کہتا ہے کہ criticism for the sake of criticism etc. یہ لفظ عموماً ہمارے لئے استعمال ہوتا ہے لیکن

جناب آپ اس کو دیکھیں کہ جب حکومتیں بنتی ہیں تو کیا یہ ایک معمولی روایت نہیں ہے کہ

You see is awkward to the party in majority. ہو یا نہ ہو۔

whether it belongs to the party in power or it does not but if it is a majority

party in the province, it is not the first choice? یہ کیوں ان باتوں میں جاتے ہیں کہ جی

آپ ادھر minority میں ہوتے ہوئے اپنی حکومت بنانا چاہتے ہیں اور دوسرے صوبوں میں بھی

کرنا چاہتے ہیں تو کیا باقی لوگ اس ملک کے اس پاکستان کے کیا یہ حکومت نہیں چلا سکتے ہیں یا

باقی پارٹیاں حکومت نہیں چلا سکتی ہیں۔ اگر یہ سب فیل ہو گئے ہیں تو اس دفعہ ایک اور ٹرائی کریں،

ہم کو تو وہ ایک بھونکا گروہ کہتے ہیں، ہمیں حکومت دے دیں پھر ہم انہیں بتائیں کہ کیسے

حکومت چلا تے ہیں۔ حکومت تو یہ نہیں چلا سکتے ہیں، ہمیں ذرا دے دیں حکومت ہم انہیں بتائیں کہ

کیسے چلا تے ہیں حکومت۔ ہم تو آپس میں بھائی بندی اور بھائی چارہ اچھی طرح رکھتے ہیں۔ But he

he is sort of broken up every atmosphere کو یہ سارے is the man who had actually

thing, he has broken up the institution, he is breaking up the institutions and

there is no likelihood as yet, کہ یہ کسی چیز کو سنبھال لے گا۔

جناب جہاں تک کراچی کا تعلق ہے، you must not forget one thing, you must

not forget that Karachi کی ایک representation ہے جناب۔ ٹھیک ہے اور بھی بیچ میں ہوں

سے لیکن ایک majority urban representation کی جو ہے اس کا آپ نے خیال رکھنا ہے۔

You have to ask them. After all there are people who they represent, after all

people have voted for them. یہ کوئی آسمان سے تو نہیں اترے ہیں۔ یہی لوگ ہیں جو اس

شہر میں رہتے ہیں، for whom that city is a matter of life, for whom that city,

that city is bleeding. ان لوگوں سے آپ جناب، you have to keep them in mind, یہ تو

نہیں ہو سکتا ہے، how can he do that, regardless of what is happening, you have to

یہ بات consensus کی بنتی ہے۔ آپ بیٹھیں، آپ استعمال کریں، if you have got any more of peace یہ ذریعے آپ کے پاس ہیں، please do it, but do not take a unilateral action, do not try to be as he is trying to be Sir, this cannot go on. یہ ٹھیک ہے۔ اور جتنی باتیں ہیں کہ بس میں جو کہتا ہوں وہ ٹھیک ہے، یہ ٹھیک ہے۔ یہ اپنے لئے بناتے ہیں اس میں یہ خود پھنستے جائیں گے، this I assure you. اب جیسے انہوں نے بات کی تھی، he was correct، ہم تو اسی ملک میں پیدا ہوئے ہیں اور ہمیں اپنی بیس تیس generations یاد ہیں، ہم بھی ایک generation میں گزر جائیں گے اور ہمیں کہہ دیں گے کہ یہ 28 تھا یا 29 تھا یا جو بھی تھا، we will be buried here، ہم ہمارا کچھ ہے کہ ہم باہر چلے جائیں، یا پارک لین چلے جائیں، پکاڈلی چلے جائیں، we don't have those، we have to die here، but we really feel for this thing. Because of these that we have to die here، we are here. اللہ نہ کرے کہ کوئی ہوائی حادثہ ہو جائے، اس سے بڑے ڈرتے ہیں کیونکہ ایک ہوا ہے اور this is our end and therefore، we are concerned and we are really concerned about Karachi and we feel that the Prime Minister should do something. Because the only thing that has happened is that its credibility has been questioned by this today اور جو ابھی اخبار میں آیا ہے کہ امیر اللہ نے confession نہیں دیا ہے۔

That is the only thing that has happened in between that and this and today even people were killed in Karachi. So، how do you expect a man with credibility to ensure that there is peace and prosperity in Karachi، sir. I do not think so، and we do not categorically، I say، support the imposition of Governor's Rule in Sindh. Thank you، sir.

Mr. Presiding Officer: The House is adjourned for tomorrow to meet at 10.00 A.M.

*[The House then adjourned to meet again at ten of the clock  
in the morning of 6th of November, 1998.]*

---