

SENATE OF PAKISTAN
SENATE DEBATES

Thursday, June 12, 2003

The Senate of Pakistan met in the Senate Hall (Parliament House) Islamabad, at ten minutes past five in the evening with Mr. Acting Chairman (Mr. Khalil-ur-Rehman) in the Chair

Recitation from the Holy Quran

اعوذ بالله من الشيطان الرجيم

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

الم يقسمون رحمت ربك نحن قسمنا بينهم معيشتهم في الحياة الدنيا و
رفعنا بعضهم فوق بعض درجات ليتخذ بعضهم بعضا سخريا و رحمت
ربك خير مما يجمعون

ترجمہ: کیا یہ لوگ تمہارے پروردگار کی رحمت کو بانٹتے ہیں؟ ہم نے ان
میں ان کی معیشت کو دنیا کی زندگی میں تقسیم کر دیا اور ایک دوسرے پر
درجے بند کئے تاکہ ایک دوسرے سے خدمت لے۔ اور جو کچھ یہ جمع
کرتے ہیں تمہارے پروردگار کی رحمت اس سے کہیں بہتر ہے۔

(سورة الزخرف ۳۱ تا ۳۲)

جناب بابر خان غوری، پوائنٹ آف آرڈر۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، فرمائیے۔

FATEHA

جناب بابر خان غوری، جناب چیئرمین، ایک افسوسناک واقعہ کل کراچی میں پیش آیا اور سندھ اسمبلی کے سابق ڈپٹی سپیکر کو نامعلوم دہشت گردوں نے شہید کیا۔ میں چاہوں گا کہ یہ ہاؤس ان کے لئے دعا گو ہو۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، نورانی صاحب! آپ ان کے لئے دعا پڑھ لیں۔

(اس موقع پر جناب نورانی صاحب نے فاتحہ کروائی)

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Mr. Acting Chairman: Leave applications:

جناب مشاہد حسین سید نے ملک سے باہر ہونے کی وجہ سے مورخہ 10 تا 13 جون کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا یہ ایوان ان کی رخصت منظور کرتا ہے؟
(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، سیفینت جنرل (ریٹائرڈ) جاوید اشرف نے ذاتی مصروفیات کی بنا پر مورخہ 12 تا 13 جون کے لئے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا یہ ایوان ان کی رخصت منظور کرتا ہے؟
(رخصت منظور کی گئی)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، منظور ہے۔ جناب طارق عظیم صاحب نے بعض ناگزیر وجوہات کی بنا پر آج مورخہ 12 جون کے لئے ایوان سے رخصت کی درخواست کی ہے۔ کیا یہ ایوان ان کی رخصت منظور کرتا ہے؟

(آوازیں، نامنظور)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، نامنظور کر دی آپ نے، کیا کوئی خاص وجہ ہے؟

(مداخلت)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، جنرل صاحب! آپ خفیہ طریقے سے آگے ہیں۔

(تائیاں)

Lt. Gen(Rtd.) Javed Ashraf: Let me clarify. I had to give a talk to NIPA. I delivered my talk in the morning and I am back.

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، تو پھر آپ اسے cancel کر دیتے۔ جی اسحاق ڈار

صاحب! فرمائے۔

POINTS OF ORDER

1) RE: VISIT OF A MINISTER TO NUCLEAR CLASSIFIED AREA

Mr. Muhammad Ishaq Dar: Mr. Chairman, first of all let me wish you well. It is the first day and first time you are performing the duties of Senate Chairman. We are lucky and happy that today in Pakistan at least the duties are presently being performed by non-uniform gentleman. The Chairman of Senate is acting as President.

جناب چیئرمین! اپوزیشن کا ایل ایف او پر موقف ایک اصولی موقف ہے، آئین اور پارلیمنٹ کی بالادستی کے لیے موقف ہے اور ہم نے دیکھا کہ اس ایل ایف او کی وجہ سے ہمارے state institutions gradually کمزور سے کمزور تر ہوتے جا رہے ہیں۔ تمام اختیارات فرد واحد میں اکٹھے ہو چکے ہیں۔ اسی ایل ایف او کی وجہ سے آج ہماری judiciary independent نہیں ہے۔

(Interruption)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، دیکھئے، ان کو کہنے دیں جو کہتے ہیں۔

جناب محمد اسحاق ڈار، بڑی مہربانی آپ کی۔ میرا خیال ہے آپ ہماری سنا کریں۔ اچھا ہو گا۔ اسی ایل ایف او کی وجہ سے اس قوم کو اعتماد میں نہیں لیا گیا۔ پارلیمنٹ وجود میں نہیں آئی تھی۔ کوریا کے بعد سب سے بڑا آپریشن پاکستان سے ہوا۔ War on terrorism کے نام پر

افغانستان کے خلاف operation enduring freedom جس میں پاکستان نے پانچ airbases provide کیے۔ پسنی میں ان کے آٹھ ہزار Marines اور تمام equipment اترے، پھر افغانستان میں قدمہا تک گئے اور نہ صرف یہ کہ اس کی compensation ہمیں claim کرنی چاہئے تھی جو بارہ سے تیرہ بلین ڈالر ہے۔ وہ ہم نے صرف ڈیڑھ بلین claim کر کے ایک ارب ڈالر کے loans write off پر اکتفا کر لیا۔

یہ ایل ایف او ہمیں کس طرف لے جا رہا ہے۔ عام خبر ہے، reports ہیں آپ بھی پاکستانی ہیں، ہم بھی پاکستانی ہیں کہ nuclear programme freeze ہو چکا ہے۔ ایک بڑی دلچسپ خبر ہے، اور افسوسناک بھی ہے کہ ایک Federal Minister نے nuclear classified area میں recently visit کیا ہے۔ اس سے پہلے کبھی کسی وزیر کو وہاں جانے کی اجازت نہیں دی گئی۔ جناب! آپ کو یاد ہو گا کہ جو پچھلا US President تھا، اس کا ایک ہی agenda تھا اور وہ تھا Non-Proliferation Treaty, NPT اور ہم نے اس کو suffer کیا۔ چار دسمبر 1998ء کو پاکستان کی نمائندگی کرتے ہوئے نائب وزیر خزانہ لیری سمر سے جب میری economic and financial issues پر بات ہو رہی تھی تو گورنر سٹیٹ بنک اس وقت موجود تھے، پاکستان اسمبلی جو واشنگٹن میں ہے، Economic Minister اس وقت موجود تھے، ان کی موجودگی میں وہ مجھے کہتے ہیں، NPT کے متعلق آپ کیا progress کر سکتے ہیں تو میں نے کہا کہ it is none of your business. یہ پاکستان کا internal معاملہ ہے۔ آپ میرے ساتھ economic and financial affairs کی بات کریں اور اس کے بعد جو بات ہوئی وہ minuted ہے۔

ہمیں یہ ڈر ہے کہ اس ایل ایف او کے تحت nuclear roll back کا پروگرام تو کہیں شروع نہیں ہو رہا کیونکہ ہمارے دوست، جس وزیر کا نام اخباروں میں انہوں نے نہیں لیا ہماری اطلاع کے مطابق جناب شوکت عزیز صاحب اس nuclear classified جگہ پر visit کر کے آئے ہیں جہاں اس سے پہلے کوئی Federal Minister، کوئی چیئر مین سینیٹ، کوئی سپیکر اسمبلی، آج تک نہیں گئے۔ میرا خیال ہے کہ یہ قومی امانت ہے۔ اس میں نہ treasury benches کو نہ اپوزیشن کو کوئی اعتراض ہونا چاہئے۔ جناب شوکت عزیز صاحب اس ہاؤس میں

clarify کریں، حکومت clarify کرے کہ آیا کسی Federal Minister نے اس classified area میں recently visit کیا ہے یا نہیں، جیسا کہ رپورٹ آئی ہے اور اگر کیا ہے تو اس کی وجہ کیا تھی اور یہ کیوں تھا؟ یہ ایل ایف او ہی کا نتیجہ ہے کہ ہم اس direction میں جا رہے ہیں۔ خدا کے لیے ایک ہو کر اس پر ہم fight کریں اور اس کو ہم روکنے کی کوشش کریں۔ اپوزیشن ایل ایف او کی وجہ سے ہاؤس کی آج کی کارروائی کا بائیکاٹ کرتی ہے۔ (اس موقع پر اپوزیشن کے اراکین نے ڈیک بجائے اور "No LFO" کہتے ہوئے ہاؤس سے باہر چلے گئے)

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، جناب ڈار صاحب اس کا جواب تو سن کر جاتے جو آپ نے کہا ہے۔

There is get back to the normal routine and business of the House

جناب وقار احمد خان، پوائنٹ آف آرڈر جناب چیئرمین۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، جی فرمائیے وقار صاحب۔

II) RE: COVERAGE OF SENATE PROCEEDINGS BY PTV

جناب وقار احمد خان، جناب چیئرمین! میں آپ کی توجہ PTV کی نشریات کی طرف دلانا چاہتا ہوں۔ اگر آپ نے کل کے خبرنامے کی نشریات دیکھی ہوں تو آپ نے ضرور نوٹ کیا ہو گا کہ ایوان بالا کی proceedings نیشنل اسمبلی کی proceedings کے بعد دکھائی گئیں۔ نیشنل اسمبلی کی چھت کی نمائش اور آرائش ضرور دکھائی گئی لیکن سینیٹ کے اراکین جب تقریر کر رہے تھے تو ان کے صرف نام بولے گئے اور تصویریں چلتی رہیں جبکہ نیشنل اسمبلی کے اراکین جب تقریر کر رہے تھے تو ان کو باقاعدہ ٹائم دیا گیا۔ میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ یہ بات غلط ہے، موزوں نہیں ہے، میں صرف اپنی self projection یا اس ایوان بالا کے بارے میں بات نہیں کر رہا، میں سب سینیٹرز کے behalf پر یہ بات کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ ہم لوگ عوام کے نمائندے ہیں اور عوام کی نمائندگی کرتے ہیں، ہماری آواز عوام تک پہنچنی چاہیے، جو ہمارے عوام کے لئے احساسات اور خیالات ہیں اس کی proper ترجمانی ہونی چاہیے۔ ڈائریکٹر نیوز شکور طاہر صاحب کو

بتایا جائے کہ what is the proper protocol and precedence of protocol جس میں ان کو یہ خبریں لگانی چاہئیں۔

جناب! دوسری بات میں اخبارات کی بھی کروں گا کہ ہم یہاں پر اپنے خیالات کا اظہار کرتے ہیں لیکن مجھے افسوس ہوا کہ ہماری PIO جو اکرم شاہدی صاحب ہیں وہ اپنا کردار صحیح طور پر ادا نہیں کر رہے۔ جب ہمارے صحافی دوست اپوزیشن کے ساتھ جاتے ہیں اور ان کے نظریات لینے کی کوشش کرتے ہیں تو یہاں پر ہمارے خیالات کی coverage کرنے کے لئے کوئی موجود نہیں ہوتا۔ اس بات کو دیکھا جائے اور ہماری representation اخبارات میں بھی ایک سلسلے کے مطابق طریقے سے ہونی چاہئے۔ شکریہ جناب چیئرمین۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین: یہ نکتہ کل بھی اٹھایا گیا تھا اور وسیم سجاد صاحب نے اس کے متعلق کچھ کہا تھا اور جہاں تک صحافیوں کا تعلق ہے تو میں دیکھتا ہوں وہ ہمیشہ یہاں موجود ہوتے ہیں اور میرا point of view لیتے رہتے ہیں I am sure they must be publishing it too. وسیم سجاد صاحب

I think, yesterday he said something about the TV coverage.

Mr. Wasim Sajjad: I had spoken to the gentleman who was representing the television department here and they have assured me that the Senate would get appropriate coverage. But I will now again talk to the people concerned and I will also talk to the staff of the Prime Minister to ensure that the TV does give proper coverage to this honourable House. I feel sir, it is a loss to the nation, if the Senate is not given proper coverage. We have seen over the last two days, some very good and excellent speeches being made, representing the experience and the dignity of the Senate of Pakistan. Hence the loss to the nation if they are not properly represented. So, I would be talking to the, not only to the

people concerned, I will personally also bring this matter to the notice of the Prime Minister and the Minister of Information.

Mr. Acting Chairman: There is no mysterious hand. Yes Mr. Thahim.

III) RE: OPPOSITION'S WALK OUT

Mr. Justice (Retd.) Abdul Razaq Thahim: Mr. Chairman! I am grateful to the Leader of the House

کہ جو بائیکاٹ ہو رہا ہے، ہم بار بار جا رہے ہیں، لیڈر آف دی ہاؤس شریف آدمی ہیں، کوشش کر رہے ہیں، ابھی میں نے دیکھا کہ دو منسٹر صاحبان گئے ہیں۔ ابھی روایت ہے مگر اس ابھی روایت کو ہماری کمزوری سمجھا جاتا ہے۔ اس کو نوٹ کیا جائے اور میں اپنے منسٹر حضرات کو عرض کروں گا کہ اس پر guarded رہیں۔ میں آج کے نوائے وقت کی خبر پڑھ رہا ہوں، مولانا فضل الرحمن نے کہا کہ حکومت میں اختلاف کا اس سے پتا چلتا ہے۔ انہوں نے کہا کہ حکومت میں اختلاف ہے، ان کو منانے کے لئے وزیر جاتے ہیں اور پھر آگے چل کر کہتے ہیں کہ سینٹ کے قائد ایوان Opposition کو منانے گئے ہیں، قومی اسمبلی کے قائد ایوان، قومی اسمبلی کے Opposition کے ارکان کو منانے نہیں آئے۔ اس کا تاثر یہ ہوتا ہے کہ شاید ہم میں کوئی نااتفاقی ہے۔ میں کم از کم اپنی طرف سے کہتا ہوں اور House کو بھی عرض کرتا ہوں کہ ہم سب یک جا ہیں، support کر رہے ہیں، coalition partner یا اس government میں کوئی اختلاف نہیں ہے، ہم میں کوئی اختلاف نہیں ہے۔ اس کا غلط تاثر لیا جاتا ہے۔ میں اپنے Leader of the House کو عرض کروں گا۔ Minister صاحب تو ابھی چلے گئے ہیں، اس کا مجھے بڑا دکھ ہو رہا ہے، آئندہ یہ منتیں چھوڑ دیں، ہم اپنا اصولی موقف اختیار کریں۔ Thank you very much.

اور جناب! دوسرا point یہ ہے کہ ہمارے reporters کچھ غلط reporting بھی دیتے ہیں۔ سات تاریخ کو بجٹ speech ہوئی ہے، اس میں زیادہ نہیں جاؤں گا، چھوٹی موٹی غلطی ہوتی

رہتی ہے مگر میں نے وہاں عرض کیا تھا کہ دعائے مغفرت پڑھی جائے ۲۷ موصوم بچے، عورتیں اور DIG سبی کا قتل ہو گیا تھا مگر ہمارے رپورٹر صاحب دیکھتے بھی نہیں ہیں، پڑھتے بھی نہیں ہیں، سنتے بھی نہیں ہیں۔ میں ان کو condemn نہیں کرتا مگر ان سے عرض کرتا ہوں کہ آئندہ کے لئے محتاط رہیں۔ مجھے جو text ملا ہے اس میں point of order پر کہنا چاہتا ہوں، میرا نام ہے، کہ کونڈہ میں جو المیہ پیش آیا ہے اس کے لئے صرف سورہ فاتحہ پڑھی جائے، یہ صحیح ہے میں نے کونڈہ کا بھی نام لیا لیکن بڑا المیہ کینجھر Lake میں ہوا جہاں موصوم بچے مرے ہیں، ان کا نام بھی نہیں ہے، اپنی reporting میں نہیں ہے۔ اخبار والوں سے تو ہے کہ انہوں نے تو نام بھی کسی کا نہیں دیا ہے کہ ہم نے بھی بجٹ میں کوئی بات کی تھی۔ پہلے ہی جیسے وسیم صاحب is taking care میں تو یہ correction سمجھوں گا مگر reporters کو کہا جائے جو یہاں بیٹھے ہوئے ہیں، کم از کم minutes تو صحیح لکھیں۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین۔ آپ کیا چاہتے ہیں کہ ان کے لئے دعا پڑھی جائے۔

جناب جسٹس (ریٹائرڈ) عبدالرزاق قصیم، میں یہ عرض کرتا ہوں کہ فاتحہ جو پڑھی

گئی تھی میری proposal تھی ۲۷ موصوم بچے، عورتیں کینجھر Lake میں ڈوب گئے، boat کے crash میں اور DIG کا بہیمانہ قتل، چار پولیس والے اور گیارہ جن کو کونڈہ میں مارا گیا تھا، سب کے لئے فاتحہ پڑھی گئی تھی اور یہی ہمارے مولانا شاہ احمد نورانی۔۔۔۔۔ مگر ہمارے minutes اٹے لکھے گئے۔ یہ minutes صحیح کئے جائیں اور میں پریس کو عرض کرتا ہوں کہ

تینوں کے لئے فاتحہ پڑھی گئی۔ Thank you.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Tahir Kheli sahiba, you wanted to say something.

Miss Aneesa Zeb Tahir Kheli: Thank you sir.

Mr. Acting Chairman: General sahib.

Ltd. Gen. (Retd.) Javed Ashraf: Sir, I like to point out that from the Opposition a speech was made

ہم نے ہر دفعہ یہ دیکھا ہے کہ LFO کی آڑ میں کافی اور چیزیں کہی جاتی ہیں۔ Nuclear programme ایک بہت sensitive subject اور important ہے اس کی اجازت نہیں ہونی چاہیے کہ hear, say پر base کر کے کسی قسم کے الزامات گورنمنٹ پر عائد کئے جائیں کہ programme freeze ہو گیا ہے یا freeze نہیں ہوا یا whatever it is? میں یہ پوچھنا چاہوں گا کہ ان کی کیا source of information ہے جس پر base کر کے انہوں نے یہ بدگمانی اور غلط فہمی حکومت کے بارے میں پھیلانے کی کوشش کی ہے۔ میں نے کسی اخبار میں کہیں یہ رپورٹ نہیں پڑھی۔ And I am sure, nobody else has read it either۔ لیکن حکومت کو بدنام کرنے کی ایک deliberate effort ہے۔ اگر اس طرح ہر چیز کا سلسلہ what is LFO, what to do with Nuclear programme, جوڑنے لگیں۔ کل کہیں کہ برازیل میں flood آ گیا، یہ LFO کی وجہ سے ہے کہ floods آنا شروع ہو گئے ہیں تو ہر چیز LFO پر تصویب کر کے what are they achieving۔ دوسری بات یہ ہے کہ ان کو یہ اجازت دی جاتی ہے کہ آپ یہاں تقریر کریں تو دوسری side سے بھی یہ اجازت دی جائے کہ ان کو جواب دیں اور پھر ان میں جواب سننے کی ہمت ہونی چاہیے بجائے اس کے کہ وہ حکومت پر الزام تراشی کر کے اور walk out کر کے غائب ہو جاتے ہیں۔ اسی طرح انہوں نے ایک Minister صاحب پر الزام لگایا کہ انہوں نے visit کیا ہے یا نہیں کیا ہے اور اس سے پہلے کبھی کسی نے visit نہیں کیا۔ وہ خود Minister رہ چکے ہیں اور ان کو پتا ہونا چاہیے کہ کون کون وہاں پر visit کر سکتا ہے اور کون کون نہیں کر سکتا ہے، کس area میں جا سکتا ہے اور کس area میں نہیں جا سکتا ہے۔ یہ جان بوجھ کر بدگمانی اور غلط فہمی پھیلانے کی کوشش میرے خیال میں ایک مذموم حرکت ہے۔ خاص کر Nuclear programme کے بارے میں جو ہم سب کو بہت عزیز ہے اور بہت sensitive subject ہے۔

RECOMMENDATIONS ON BUDGET-2003-04

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، میں نے تو موصوف کو کہا تھا کہ رک جائیں، شوکت عزیز صاحب بھی آگئے ہیں،

he could have answered him. Back to the business of the House. Now we come to item No. 2 regarding further consideration of the following motion moved by Mr. Shaukat Aziz, Minister for Finance and Revenue on 7th June, 2003. "The Senate may make recommendations, if any, to the National Assembly on the Finance Bill, 2003, containing the Annual Budget Statement, under Article 73 of the Constitution."

As announced earlier, today we will consider recommendations given by the honourable members on the Finance Bill, 2003, containing the annual Budget Statement. Some of the members have given notices of their recommendations which were circulated to the members at their local addresses and the same list has also been placed on the table of the house.

First recommendation is of Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon and others. I will request Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon to move his proposed recommendations standing at serial No. 1 of the list. Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon will move the following motion.

Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon: Mr. Chairman, in order to have balanced infrastructural development in all the regions of Pakistan, the Senate recommends that WAPDA be asked to review WAPDA PSDP of Rs. 31.15 billion to increase allocation for Sindh, since only Rs. 10 million has been identified for Small Hydro Power Project on Canal Falls in Punjab and Sindh. I quote, no new project allocations have been made nor details of the on going distribution of Power have been identified.

2. WAPDA should also identify details of village electrification allocation of Rs.100 million.

3. WAPDA should also ensure system improvement of KESC Network and reduction of T&D losses in 2003-04 for which Rs.3672 million have been provided in PSDP Karachi being the mega city of Pakistan. additional resource allocation should also be made towards providing the needed services for economic growth of Pakistan. I will propose this recommendation that has been presented be passed by the House. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Minister for Finance, would you like to say anything, please go ahead, about this amendment, about this proposal which Mr. Nisar Memon has proposed. Would you like to say anything?

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: I'll go through all of them and then say something.

Mr. Acting Chairman: All right, fine. So, now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation at serial 2 of the list is also in the name of Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon and others. Please move your motion. Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon will move the following motion.

Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon: Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Government must be appreciated for its focus on HRD...

Mr. Wasim Sajjad: Point of order. I just want to clarify that this recommendation was not only in the name of Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon but several other members of the House and I assume that all this will be taken as a motion in the name of all these honourable members.

Mr. Acting Chairman : It is ascertained that they are agreed to it.

Mr. Wasim Sajjad: The motion is in the name of all honourable members.

Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon: The Government must be appreciated for its focus on Human Resource Development and by providing increased education and higher education PSDP. The Senate recommends now, that all PSDP allocations in each of the Federal Division and Organization or Federal Government be reviewed to ensure equitable allocation for providing equal opportunities of development to all regions of Pakistan. The total amount of PSDP for HRD be clearly identified after review and any needed adjustment be made within the given PSDP of the division so that the people of Pakistan can clearly see the commitment of converting human resource to human capital for economic growth of Pakistan. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I presume that all other members are in agreement. Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

The proposed recommendation at Sr. No. 3 of the list is also in the name of Mr. Nisar Ahmed Memon and others. Please move your motion.

Mr. Nisar Ahmad Memon : Thank you Mr. Chairman, government has announced number of measures to reduce the economic burden of people of Pakistan. All poverty reduction schemes under implementation and the one being introduced are meant to provide the much needed relief to common man. One additional area which has impact on citizens is high electricity bills. The citizens have voiced their concern time and again on the repeated increases in the electricity tariff. The Senate, therefore, recommends that Federal Government should provide all its financial support to WAPDA linked with the firm commitment from WAPDA and KESC that they shall not increase their tariff to consumers in 2003-04 and any needed increase that they may feel necessary should be made for improvement in the high line losses and the recovery of their outstanding accounts receivable. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I assume that all agree. Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Next proposed recommendation at Sr. No. 4 of the list is in the name of Mr. Babar Khan Ghauri and others. Please move your motion Mr. Ghauri.

Mr. Babar Khan Ghauri: Thank you Mr. Chairman. So I am going to move my motion and on behalf of:

Ch. Muhammad Anwar Bhinder, Miss. Anisa Zeb Tahirkheli, Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Mr. Mouhim Khan Baloch, Mr. Justice (Rtd.) Abdul Razzaq Thahim, Mr. Kamil Ali Agha, Mr. Muhammad Ali Durrani, Mr. Ilyas Ahmad Bilour and some other movers. We need your permission to add some new movers Professor Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui, Mrs. Bibi Yasmeen Shah, Mrs. Kulsum and Mrs. Gulshan Saeed.

Sir, the recommendation is that the budget proposal tabled in the House include the subsidy and loans to WAPDA and KESC to the tune of Rs. 53 billion during financial year 2003-2004. This is a substantial amount and if WAPDA and KESC can put their house in order, the same amount can be utilized for development programme, which will not only help in reducing the poverty but will also improve the basic infrastructure.

"The Senate of Pakistan recommends to the National Assembly that the both WAPDA and KESC be asked to formulate their firm plans to improve their financial position to stop drain on the budget. The Ministry of Water and Power must take stock of the situation and take appropriate measures to correct the situation so that the Government may utilize the huge resource towards development of backward areas and improvement of infrastructure".

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Next proposed recommendation at Sr. No. 5 of the list also is in

the name of Mr. Babar Khan Ghori and others. Please move your motion.

Mr. Muhammad Anwar Bhinder: Sir, with your permission, I beg to move this motion on behalf of Mr Babar Khan Ghori, Miss Anisa Zeb Tahirkheli, Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Mr. Mouhim Khan Baloch, Mr. Justice (Retd.) Abdul Razzaq Thahim, Mr. Kamil Ali Agha, Mr. Muhammad Ali Durrani, Mr. Ilyas Ahmed Bilour and Mrs. Nighat Mirza. Sir, the motion is:-

"It has been provided in the budget for the year 2003-2004 to withdraw the exemption from withholding tax on the National Savings Scheme. The majority of the account holders in National Savings schemes are poor pensioners, widows and small savers. It would be unjustified to levy withholding tax on the small savings. It will amount to penalizing their profits and reduce their income for such schemes. The Senate of Pakistan therefore, recommends to the National Assembly that the exemption of the withholding tax on National Savings Schemes may not be withdrawn."

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now, I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation at serial No. 6 of the list is also in the name of Mr. Babar Khan Ghauri and others. Please move your motion.

Ms. Anisa Zeb Tahirkheli: Mr. Chairman, this

recommendation is on behalf of Mr. Babar Khan Ghauri, Ch. Muhammad Anwar Bhinder, Ms. Anisa Zeb Tahirkheli, Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Mr. Mouhim Khan Baloch, Mr. Justice (Retd.) Abdul Razzaq Tahim, Mr. Kamil Ali Agha, Mr. Muhammad Ali Durrani, Mr. Ilyas Ahmed Bilour and three more movers are added into it, Mrs. Nighat Mirza, Mrs. Abida Saif and Mrs. Yasmin Shah. It is regarding the Apprenticeship/Internship programme that there are a number of educated unemployed youth. They face a lot of difficulties in finding job because of lack of practical experience. "The Senate of Pakistan recommends to the National Assembly and the Government to initiate a programme whereby it may be made compulsory for the firms, major entrepreneurs, financial sectors to provide internship to fresh graduates holding the relevant degrees in the respective fields. This will facilitate the youth to gain experience and develop their skill that they can utilize both in self-employment or market themselves in the foreign market. It will go a long way in developing the human capital."

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now, I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: The proposed recommendation at serial No. 7 of the list is in the name of Mrs. Razina Alam Khan. Please move your motion.

Mrs. Razina Alam Khan: Thank you Mr. Chairman.

جو تحریک ہیں سب سے پہلے میں ان میں سوائے تحریک نمبر ۲ اور ۴ کے باقی واپس لیتی ہوں۔
تحریک نمبر ۲ آپ کے سامنے پیش کرتی ہوں۔

”میں تحریک پیش کرتی ہوں کہ سینیٹ آف پاکستان نیشنل اسمبلی کو معاش کرے
کہ قومی بجٹ پر بحث کرنے کے لئے ہر سال مئی کے مہینے میں pre-budget session ہوں
تا کہ عوامی نمائندوں کی معاشات پر بحث ہو اور ان کو بجٹ میں جگہ دی جاسکے۔“
تحریک نمبر ۴ ہے۔

”یہ یقین دہانی کرائی گئی ہے کہ اس سال جولائی میں بجٹ کی سوشل سیکٹر کی ۴ فیصد
اور non human development کی ۴۰ فیصد رقم ادا کی جائے گی۔ ہماری معاش ہے کہ آئندہ
سال ۵۰ فیصد رقم جولائی میں باقی ۵۰ فیصد بعد میں release ہو۔“

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now, I will put the motion before the
House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation at serial
No 8 of the list is in the name of Mr. Ilyas Bilour and others. Mr. Ilyas
Bilour, please move your motion.

Mr. Ilyas Ahmed Bilour: Mr. Chairman, I on my and on behalf
of Mr. Hameedullah Jan Afridi, Syed Sajjad Hussain, Mr. Muhammad
Ajmal Khan, Mr. Tahir Iqbal, Hafiz Abdul Malik Qadir move that the
Senate propose and appreciate the decrease in the cars duties over 1800
cc. However, in order to provide relief to poor and middle class, smaller
cars prices must be reduced so that burden of increased prices is
contained and the poor and the middle class can improve quality of life
too.

No.2. The local manufacturers must be asked to reduce prices of their car or allow import of used cars. Thank you very much.

Mr Acting Chairman: Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr . Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation is at serial No.9 in the name of Dr. Nighat Agha . Dr. Nighat Agha, please move your motion .

Dr . Nighat Agha: I beg to move that the Senate of Pakistan recommends to the National Assembly that No . 1 , all private schools should admit 5 percent of their student body on full scholarship which means full tuition & books purely on merit and income basis . No.2. All reputable institutions should help in teachers training , so that students from all stratas can benefit from good enlightened education . All reputable institutions should help in teachers training by taking 2-3 teachers for Teaching Practicum for 6 months . Teachers are to be sent on rotational basis for three months each . This will bring a tremendous boost to the quality of teaching . No.3 . All pensioners who retired prior to 1992 are getting very little pensions . As a special incentive for old age , all pensioners must be brought at par with the present day pensions . It will not burden the exchequer for too long , as we are old in our 70s , 80s , 90s and God knows how many days and years we have more on this earth . The Shariat Court had passed a rule/decreed that all pensions must be

brought at par with the present . The government took the case to the Supreme Court and so far nothing has been done about it. Kindly help and make the last few days, months or years of us, old people, comfortable.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: The proposed recommendation at serial No. 10 of the list is in the name of Mr. Wasim Sajjad and others. Wasim Sajjad Sahib, please move your motion.

Mr. Wasim Sajjad: Sir, a very important recommendation is being moved on behalf of the Senate of Pakistan. In order to bring transparency in the working of Ministry of Finance and the Central Board of Revenue, it is being recommended that any SRO, which may be issued either by the Ministry of Finance or by the Board of Revenue, which alters tax, abolishes tax or changes any tax structure should be placed on the table of the House in the National Assembly and the Senate. But I would suggest that this, being moved by Mr. S.M.Zafar, I would request Mr.S.M. Zafar to move this recommendation.

Mr.S.M.Zafar: Sir, that this House recommends to the National Assembly that any SRO issued by the CBR or Ministry of Finance, which has the effect of altering, abolishing or imposing of any tax or duty or charges shall be laid, as soon as may be, on the table of the National Assembly and the Senate for information.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation at S.No. 11 of the list is in the name of Mr. Dilawar Abbas. Mr. Dilawar Abbas, please move your motion.

Syed Dilawar Abbas: Thank you Mr. Chairman. This is a commendation on taxation that on personal taxation it is recommended "that due relief should be provided to professional experts who are drawing salaries of more than the threshold of Rs. 600,000 (Six hundred thousand) only per annum"

Second recommendation to the National Assembly is that Federal Government still provide different subsidies to achieve socio-economic objectives. Allocations for subsidies in the Budget have been kept at Rs. 64.5 billion as compared to Rs. 49.8 billion in the revised estimates for 2002-2003. Subsidies include Rs 7 billion allocated to refineries which should have been eliminated as the refineries are now operating on import parity basis. Similarly, a provision of Rs. 11.70 billion to pick up cash shortfall of KESC is extra burden on national exchequer. Steps should also be taken to reduce shortfall required in offsetting liabilities of private sector enterprises for which a huge amount of Rs 21.50 billion has been kept in the Budget. No details of such liabilities have been produced and

provided. So, I would like that it should be provided. [***]

Ch. Muhammad Anwar Bhindar: Point of order. So far as the clarification is required, I think the "Clarification" should not be part of the recommendation.

Mr. Acting Chairman: This is an expert's opinion.

(Interruption)

Syed Dilawar Abbas: As I mentioned in the recommendation that "Clarification is required". It should not be part of the "recommendation".

Mr. Acting Chairman: We shall delete that and delete it out of the record.

(The motion was carried)

Next proposed recommendation at Serial No. 12 of the list is in the name of Mr. S. M. Zafar and Mr. Wasim Sajjad. Please, both the gentlemen can move their motion or any one of them.

Mr. S. M. Zafar: W. T. O regime is moving inexorably and is surely coming to knock on our doors by 2005. And so there is one of the recommendations which is of the great and vital importance of which we both are the co-movers, Mr. Wasim Sajjad is the other co-mover with me, and it recommends "that a National Body, of course, consisting of the people from all walks of life, be established by the Federal Government to make recommendations to meet the challenges and avail from opportunities

[*** Words expunged by the orders of the Acting Chairman.]

as and when the W.T.O Regime comes into full effect after 2005.

(The motion was carried)

Mr. Acting Chairman: Next proposed recommendation at serial No.13 of the list is in the name of Mr. Zafar Iqbal Chaudhary. Mr. Zafar Iqbal Chuadhry, please move your motion.

Mr. Zafar Iqbal Chuadhry: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. " New Powers of Collector, Sales Tax Under Section 40-B" that in the finance bill 2003-04 introduced in the National Assembly/Senate, the Collector Sales Tax has been empowered with new powers under Section 40-B of Sales Tax Bill. It has been provided in the proposal that the Collector, Sales Tax can appoint any officer at any factory any time. This is in fact, sweeping powers which give too much discretion to the Collector. Sales Tax. This procedure would definitely lead to corruption and bribery in the process because if the Collector is allowed to appoint any officer for sale tax collection then there is every possibility that the competition for getting "lucrative" slots and postings would ensue.

Therefore, it is suggested that this proposal should be done away with and old procedure should remain in practice. I would indeed be very thankful to you for sympathetically considering the request.

Ch. Muhammad Anwar Bhinder: Sir, I move that the last sentence should be deleted.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Are you willing to do that?

Mr. Wasim Sajjad: Here my submission to the House is, as your honour have seen sir, that many of the recommendations as originally tabled before the House have been changed in the course of their move and also sir, the language of some of the recommendations may need to be modified to conform to Parliamentary Practice and the Procedure. So, I would suggest to the House and with the approval, place this, before your honour that the language may be amended by the Secretariat conforming to its spirit and object without, of course, compromising on the object and meaning. What I am trying to say, the language can be modified. Is that acceptable to the House? Your honour may put.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I shall now put the motion before the House.

(The motion was adopted)

Mr. Acting Chairman: The motion is adopted and the recommendations stand approved by the House.

The proposed recommendation at Serial No. 14 of the list is in the name of Mrs. Tanveer Khalid.

Mrs. Tanveer Khalid: Thank you very much. Sir, I beg to move that the Senate recommends that fund should be allocated to popularise Technical Education and the value of skilled workmanship through media especially from TV, so that more youth join such institutions, instead of going to the academic institutions only.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now I will put the motion before the House.

(The motion was adopted)

Mr. Acting Chairman: The motion is adopted and the recommendations stand approved by the House.

Next proposed recommendation at Serial No. 15 is also in the name of Mrs. Tanveer Khalid.

Mrs. Tanveer Khalid: I beg to move that a Committee was formed to look into the problems of Senior Citizens of Pakistan. Report was almost finalized. It is proposed that this report be entrusted to a Senate Select Sub Committee to go through the report and finalize its recommendations for discussion in the Senate and subsequent advice by the Government.

ii) In the meantime, it is suggested that senior citizens be given concession in rail and fares to the tune of 50%.

iii) PIA ticket for air travel: Taxes be reduced to bring down cost of travel and also to decrease the fare Karachi-Islamabad-Karachi. PIA fare is Rs. 7440 plus 2540 government levies and taxes, so taxes may be reduced.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I will now put the motion before the House.

(The motion was adopted)

Mr. Acting Chairman: The motion was adopted and the

recommendation stands approved by the House.

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: Mr. Chairman, point of order.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Yes, go ahead.

STATEMENT OF THE MINISTER ON A POINT OF ORDER
RAISED EARLIER BY SENATOR MR. MUHAMMAD ISHAQ DAR

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: Mr. Chairman, while I was away from the House, I believe the honourable member Senator Muhammad Ishaq Dar, made some statement about Pakistan's peaceful nuclear programme. I would say that this is strongly denied and the programme is not being altered in any way. Also, let me state Mr. Chairman, that Pakistan's national security, sovereignty, integrity will never be compromised in any way. I want to assure the House. And I would also, for the record say that on such sensitive subject, all honourable members should first get the fact before making any statement which can be misconstrued. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I hope that Mr. Dar is listening to it in the cafeteria. Yes. Mr. Shaukat Aziz.

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: With your permission Mr. Chairman. In the last few days, I heard a lot of honourable Senators speeches regarding the budget and they expressed their views very frankly and very constructively. Let me take this opportunity to thank each and every one of them for being here, for being supportive to the policies and philosophy behind the budget. Every member's comments were duly noted and I will

try to respond to them when I do my closing statement in the National Assembly. I also would have liked the Opposition to be a party to this discussion because we can benefit from their comments but unfortunately, they are not here. I would, however, like to take this opportunity to particularly thank the two members, Mr. Asfand Yar Wali and Mr. Ilyas Ahmad Bilour for taking part in the budget discussion. They have shown tremendous spirit in participating the debate and giving us some very good suggestions and comments. I would like to assure the House that as the process of budget approval goes forward in the next few days, we will do our best to incorporate, to amalgamate and to consider some of the very excellent suggestions made in this House during this debate. Pakistan, Mr. Chairman, I believe, is set on a path of economic improvement, economic recovery and economic take over. We all need to work together to make this dream a reality. And *Insha Allah* with everybody's support here and your support sir, there is no reason why we cannot achieve our goals. I thank you sir.

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، مسز گلشن سعید صاحبہ! آپ کچھ کہنا چاہ رہی تھیں۔
 مسز گلشن سعید، جناب چیئرمین! میں یہ کہنا چاہتی ہوں کہ مسٹر اسحاق ڈار نے دو دفعہ اس ہاؤس میں یہ کہا ہے کہ بارہ بلین ڈالر امریکہ سے ہمیں claim کرنے چاہئیں۔ انہوں نے یہ اطلاعات ایک ویب سائٹ سے لی ہیں۔ یہ انہوں نے پہلے بھی کہا تھا اور آج پھر اس ہاؤس میں کہا ہے۔ اس وقت میں نے ہاتھ کھڑا کیا تھا کہ بات کروں جب وہ واک آؤٹ پر جا رہے تھے۔ ان کو یہ چاہیے کہ ویب سائٹ کو دیکھنے کی بجائے اور ہماری حکومت پر اس قسم کے الزامات لگانے کی بجائے وہ نواز شریف سے کہیں کہ بلین ڈالرز وہ جو پاکستان سے باہر لے گیا ہے وہ واپس

لئے۔ یہ بہت غلط ہے کہ ہر دفعہ وہ الزام لگانے کے بعد باہر چلے جاتے ہیں اور ویب سائٹ سے انہوں نے یہ information لی ہے اور اس کو دو دفعہ دہرا چکے ہیں۔ مجھے اس پر بہت اعتراض ہے۔ شکریہ۔

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، پروفیسر سعید صاحب۔

Mr. Acting Chairman: Mr. Shaukat Aziz Sahib.

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: With your permission, Mr. Chairman, may I respond to this. There is talk about a centcom website which talked about ten billion dollars or so, I don't know what is exact amount. Sorry, its gone up to 12 billion dollars. First of all I believe, I have not seen the website but it was there advertently and then removed after three days. But, Mr. Chairman, we, as Pakistanis, should have the capacity to think for ourselves. We don't need a foreign website telling us what was the impact of 9/11 on our economy. As you know, Mr. Chairman, Pakistan's GDP, at that time, during that year, was about roughly 60 to 65 billion dollars depending how you want to look at it. Let us say 60 billion dollars. If we did lose 12 billion dollars as a result of 9/11, our GDP would have contracted well over 15%. Any country where the GDP contracts 15%, you are talking catastrophe and a melt down.

In the financial year when 9/11 took place, Pakistan posted up GDP growth of 3.4%. So, unless you are misrepresenting facts, unless you are fudging the numbers, unless you are creating imaginary numbers, how can you go to anybody and say we lost 15% of our GDP. When your official numbers show that the growth rate was 3.4%. So, I would like to

put this issue back and say that we, as Pakistanis, can think for ourselves. We don't need any website to tell us what the impact of the 9/11 war was. We did have some impact and we have said that repeatedly at that time and later but it was nowhere any other numbers were quoted and simple basic numbers will tell us that a 15% to 16% reduction in GDP really, it creates a melt down in an economy and certainly we all have lived here. We did not see that impact. The over all growth rate in that financial year was 3.4%. So, I hope the honourable Senators also take note of this. Because this has been said more than once and I am glad our colleague raised it because otherwise, I wouldn't have known that this was discussed. Thank you, sir.

Mr. Acting Chairman: I also hope that the media is caught up with both the statements and your explanation and how they are able to clear the issue in tomorrow's paper. Prof. Saeed Sahib.

Prof. Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui: With your permission, sir, I want to make a recommendation which does not call for funds allocation or changes in the figures of the budget but it would create austerity and fund serving. It will plug the wastage and leakage. So, I request, you may allow me to present that recommendation.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Prof. Sahib, if I did that I will break a lot of hearts. Because a lot of people had come later on but because the list was closed, we couldn't do it. But why don't you just say and I think the Minister is here, he will listen to it any how and put it in his mind.

Prof. Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui: Sir, as I mentioned it does not call for the funds allocation. Unfortunately, the Finance Minister has just left, I would love if he is back and he is here to listen.

جناب قائم مقام چیئرمین، وہ یہیں ہیں، کھڑے ہیں یہاں پر۔

I am not begging anybody to move anything. Not at all. In fact, I just told him, I will be breaking your heart certainly, if I did that.

Prof. Muhammad Saeed Siddiqui: Sir, I move that the Senate recommends the National Assembly that Educational Institutions, all over the country, should not be allowed to hold any function in hotels or rented premises and serve lunch or dinner in their functions. So, this is the recommendation which may lead us to save funds and use it more to the academic activities.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Thank you very much. I think the Finance Minister has heard it.

Mr. Shaukat Aziz: I will duly note it, sir.

Mr. Acting Chairman: Now, since there is no other business, the House is adjourned to meet again on Tuesday, the 17th June, 2003 at 11.00 a.m. Thank you very much.

[The House then adjourned to meet again on Tuesday, the 17th June, 2003

at 11 O'clock in the morning.]
